

# ***The Mystery Arts Box Project: A qualitative exploration of the experiences, benefits, and challenges of participating in a remotely delivered art and craft project for British veterans with visual impairment***

## ***Abstract***

### *Introduction*

The clinical application of the arts amongst military personnel and veterans has been well-documented, particularly in relation to service-related mental health difficulties. However, the impacts of engaging recreationally with arts activities on general well-being remain underexplored, and even more so amongst those living with visual impairment (VI). This pilot explored the artistic experiences of veterans with VI participating in a remotely delivered art and craft project during continued COVID-19 restrictions in Spring/Summer 2021.

### *Methods*

Six participants received a *Mystery Arts Box (MAB)* containing a selection of materials, collated to encourage experimentation with unfamiliar techniques. Participants were asked to journal their process as they developed a final piece/-pieces. They were invited to join group video calls to share work and ideas and seek guidance. Semi-structured interviews were run with participants at the end of the project. Journal and interview data were thematically analysed.

### *Results*

Analysis identified 11 themes relating to initial and ongoing responses to the *MAB* and creative and journaling process. Several benefits were identified, including artistic learning, trying something new, and social, cognitive, and emotional experiences. The value of the activity to participants' lives within the context of the ongoing pandemic was also considered. Challenges were associated with the use of unfamiliar materials, impacts of sight loss, and the limitations of remote delivery.

### *Conclusions*

This pilot brings to the fore the everyday artistic experience of veterans living with VI, and considers the benefits, challenges and well-being implications of a remotely delivered arts activity. Findings illustrate the importance of ensuring accessibility of artistic activities to those for whom disability might limit participation, and highlight the

ongoing role that remotely delivered arts activities might play in meeting the social and recreational needs of individuals beyond the COVID-19 pandemic.

***Key messages***

- Literature documents the role that art therapy has played in the clinical treatment of military personnel and veterans.
- The recreational artistic experiences of military personnel and veterans remain underexplored.
- It is important to represent veterans with visual impairment (VI), and the wider population of people living with VI, in visual arts research.
- Remote arts interventions might help to achieve and maintain positive emotional, social and cognitive outcomes in veterans with VI.

## ***Introduction***

Literature documents the therapeutic application of activities such as drawing, photography, painting, quilting, crocheting, sculpting, and mask-making to meet the clinical needs of military personnel and veterans.[1-3] Outcomes relating to increased self-awareness, emotional expression, communication, self-regulation, problem-solving, and shared experience have been demonstrated.[4] However, there has been little consideration of the artistic experiences of these groups outside the clinical context. This is despite evidence of the well-being benefits of recreational arts participation in general populations.[5-7] Activities such as textile-craft, pottery, and painting have been associated with a sense of achievement and personal growth, self-expression, the development of both physical and cognitive skills,[6, 7] stress reduction,[8] and social benefits.[9-10]

The artistic experiences of those living with visual impairment (VI) have also been overlooked, which may be partly explained by the problematic assumption that art making is undertaken to produce visual articles and, thus, is the domain of sighted individuals.[11] Yet, art therapy research has found that clients with VI have utilised “visual” arts methods to achieve a variety of outcomes.[12-13] Art’s physical and tactile aspects may supplement, or supplant, the importance of visual perception for those with VI.[14] However, few individuals with VI are completely blind, and activities such as textile/e-textile design,[15] photography, sculpture,[11] and painting,[16] remain accessible to many who retain some vision. These activities offer opportunities to take ownership of an artistic process and product, think and work independently, demonstrate persistence and problem-solving, spend time with others, and develop creative skills.[15]

## ***The current project***

Originally planned for face-to-face delivery, *The Mystery Arts Box Project (MAB)*, was redesigned for remote delivery during the COVID-19 pandemic. Ethical approval was granted by [redacted] (reference redacted). The pilot sought to generate knowledge surrounding the artistic experiences of military veterans outside the therapeutic context, and to represent individuals with VI in visual arts research. This article addresses three questions:

- 1) What were the benefits of participation in the *MAB Project* for veterans with VI?

2) What were the challenges associated with participation in the *MAB Project* for veterans with VI?

3) What impact did VI have on participation in the *MAB Project*?

Designed as an exploratory pilot of an inherently subjective phenomenon, the study adopts a phenomenological view of arts engagement, acknowledging the subjectivity and qualitative diversity of human experience.[17]

## ***Methods***

### *Participants and recruitment*

All six participants (mean age 73.6, ranging from 52-89 years) were members of [redacted], which provides support to military veterans living with VI equivalent to “blindness”/severe sight impairment. Participants were recruited via an advert in the charity’s magazine, and direct contact from the [redacted] art and craft team.

### *Procedure*

Participants engaged with four activities: art making, journaling, group calls (*Creative Circles*, CCs), and semi-structured interviews. Participants received a mystery box of art and craft materials and were asked to develop piece/-s and journal their creative process over 12-weeks. Four CCs were run via Teams by the lead researcher with a member of the [redacted] art and craft team, offering opportunities for participants to seek assistance, share ideas, and connect with other participants. At the end of the project, participants took part in a semi-structured interview which was audio recorded and transcribed (using NVIVO Transcription with manual quality-checks).

### *Data and analysis*

Data were de-identified using pseudonyms, allowing journal and interview data, and artwork, to be matched for each participant. Thematic analysis offered a practically and theoretically flexible tool with which to analyse journal and interview data.[18] Whilst themes were inductive, the researchers acknowledge the active role taken during the research process, and the interpretation inherent in the identification of patterns within qualitative data.[17] Initial coding was undertaken independently by three researchers to increase intercoder reliability; the lead researcher collated data and organised codes and themes using NVIVO software. Artwork was not analysed,

with the focus being on participants' creative process and experiences, not the output itself. Final pieces acted as prompts during interviews.

### *Materials*

The content of the *MAB* was developed with the lead member of the art and craft rehabilitation team. The materials sought to encourage experimentation and tactile engagement. Materials included: papers of different textures and thickness; paint pads, to encourage dipping/printing; and sponges, skeleton leaves, and paper straws. Participants received an A3 sketchbook, resources for journaling (yellow journal pad or audio recording device), an ideas sheet, and journaling guidance.

An interview schedule was used flexibly to guide discussion and ensure key topics were explored, including reasons for participating, enjoyable or challenging aspects of the project, and reflections on the *CCs* and materials, their creative process, and their final pieces.

### **Results**

Five out of six participants contributed journal data, with one participant forgetting to journal; this individual did not appear hugely interested in journaling and, due to personal circumstances, missed two of the *CCs* which would have acted as reminders to journal. Another participant (P5) agreed for personal correspondence with the lead researcher to be included in the data set. All participants took part in a semi-structured interview. *CC* attendance varied due to participant availability. Table 1 provides an overview of themes and subthemes derived from journal and interview data.

#### *1) Benefits of participation*

##### Creative benefits

Participants enjoyed the opportunity to experiment using unfamiliar materials. This was an opportunity to approach art making in a new way.

*P1 journal: It reminds me of a program I used to watch called Ready Steady Cook, where they gave them a big bag of food, they emptied the bag out on the table and then said, have five minutes to look at it and then make your mind up what you're going to cook.*

The emphasis on experimentation led to a focus on “giving it a go”, rather than on how a final piece looked, along with the development of artistic skills and techniques.

*P2 interview: When I've got something to do, to draw, or got an idea, I've now got more ways of doing it*

With unforeseen challenges came unexpected positive outcomes, including the resourceful use of “waste” products.

*P4 interview: Newsprint should be able to take the ink, but this basically goes straight through it. Well guess that was good actually... the cardboard became a piece of work*

### Cognitive and emotional benefits

The project was viewed as a creative challenge, which pushed participants out of their comfort zone. This provided a welcome distraction during COVID-19: an opportunity to escape from negative thoughts or emotions, and a positive focus at a time where usual activities were restricted.

*P6 interview: It's given me something to do I suppose which you do need at this time... I think that is necessary otherwise I don't know what, you'd just go quietly crackers*

The arrival of the *MAB* offered excitement and a break from routine, whilst art making itself was cathartic and a means to achieve affective change.

*P1: It puts you in a good mood... you'd say right we're going to get something done today and once you'd started... I found it was really relaxing*

The therapeutic benefits of participation were perhaps most apparent for P5, who had struggled with his mental health and was open about using the project to address therapeutic goals.

*P5 journal: I told you that all my work will all be connected with a story, well it is my struggle with [details of mental health difficulties]. The Mask is what I wore all happy and smiling on the outside but behind is what is really going on the real me. I know I'm probably taking liberties here but I'm using it to heal and sort of Art Therapy.*

### Social benefits

CCs provided opportunities to learn from each other and members of the [redacted] art and craft team.

*P2 interview: I find the chats quite interesting because you pick up tips from other people*

Within the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, the opportunity for a shared experience may have been particularly important. Three out of six participants lived alone, and P6 highlighted the impact of isolation at this time, 'I think I was getting depressed... I was alone 24-hours a day'.

*P1 interview: Listening to other people as well... there's only a couple of people that phone me in normal times and it's usually doom and gloom, you know... I looked forward to them [CCs]*

## 2) Challenges associated with participation

### Concerns over mess and managing materials at home

Whilst new materials provided creative possibilities and opportunities to hone new skills, they also resulted in challenges. There were concerns over mess, and managing materials, particularly where space was limited or there was another person living at home. Exploring new techniques might generate greater mess than familiar activities.

*P1 interview: I've got a wee bench of sorts and mess doesn't matter as long as I clean myself down afterwards... its different outside, if it was inside in your kitchen or something, I do a lot of painting in my kitchen, but the painting's different*

Concerns over mess resulted in "giving up" on materials, or complete avoidance from the outset.

### Initial responses to the MAB and feeling overwhelmed

Whilst there were feelings of excitement associated with receiving the MAB, some participants felt initially overwhelmed by the task at-hand.

*P2 interview: I was afraid to use them [some of the materials] quite honestly...it does intimidate you when you're faced with something totally outside your comfort.*

**Table 1.** Overview of themes derived from journal and interview data.

<b>New or unfamiliar materials</b>	<b>Expectations</b>	<b>Responses to the MAB</b>	<b>Sight change</b>
Adding to the materials provided	What's in the box	Positive reactions	'Accessible' materials
Familiar materials	Expectations of researcher or others	Excitement	Assistance from others
Putting other art activities on hold	Feeling encouraged	Surprise	Change in/limited colour perception
Benefits of unfamiliar materials	Expectations of self	Negative reactions	Not wanting to experiment
Adaptability	<b>Creative Circles</b>	Disappointment	Past leisure activities
Experimentation with materials	Social	Lack of motivation	Positive impact on MAB experience
'Giving it a go', a new way of working	Sharing of art	Overwhelming	Tactile nature of materials
Skill development	Wanting feedback or help	Not enough guidance	Technology making art accessible
Negative reactions to new materials	A social outlet	No clear end point	VI as a limiting factor
Concern over mess	Learning from others	Not sure what to think or do	<b>Participants' artwork</b>
Giving up	Shared experience	Importance of time	Feedback from others
Intimidated by new materials	Overwhelming	Not enough/too much time	Meaning attached to piece
Limited by physical space	Beliefs about own and others' abilities	Right amount of time	Positive self-assessment
When things go wrong	Feeling judged	Thinking time	Aesthetically pleasing
Walking away/waiting a while	Limitations of virtual delivery	Initial reactions to MAB	Colour, shape, composition
<b>Positive impacts on the individual</b>	Logistical and technology challenges	Planning and progress over project	Doesn't need to be aesthetically pleasing
A challenge	<b>Mood</b>	Comparison to others' progress	'At ease' with medium
A new experience	Impact of art making on mood	Engagement changing over time	Negative self-assessment
Therapeutic	Expectations of researcher's understanding of mood	<b>What is art?</b>	Quality, 'bad'
Inspiring other creative activities (and vice versa)	Mental health	Art experience and knowledge	Sources of inspiration
Freedom	Depression	Colour	Artists and other artwork
Keeping busy (COVID-19 context)	<b>Journaling</b>	How is art talked about	Nature
<b>Negative impacts of participation</b>	Unsure what to journal	Imagination	What's in the box
Regret	Methods of journaling	Individual	Instructions
		Self-expression through other art forms	The artistic process
			Planning sessions

In contrast, P5 reported positivity on the arrival of the *MAB*, but soon felt unsure of how to proceed. A lack of creative guidance may inhibit some.

*P5 journal: After first feelings of excitement I now feel nothing. I don't know what I'm going to do*

#### Negative social impacts of Creative Circles project design

P5 felt that the CCs had not provided the support he sought, leading to negative self-comparison due to what he viewed as his own artistic inadequacies

*P5 interview: He [another participant] did his classes and doing all this, and I sat there thinking, I can't live up to that, I can't*

This, alongside his comparative younger age and ongoing mental health difficulties, led to feelings of exclusion, 'I was probably the youngest one... I just felt from the onset I felt like an outsider'. P2 came to the project with a similarly low level of artistic experience, but his response to the achievements of others was driven by admiration, rather inadequacy, 'They were blooming clever, a lot cleverer than I was'.

P4 highlighted that without equal participation across the group, learning may be limited, 'I didn't learn much from the others... [they] had the box for a month and hadn't even looked at it'. Again, the flexibility afforded to participants may not always benefit their engagement.

#### Technological challenges and limitations of remotely delivered arts activities

To ensure accessibility of CCs, participants were able to join by video call or by phone. However, this limited the engagement of those who joined only by phone.

*P6 interview: I did wonder what these things looked like I think one man had made a model or something or rather and you said oh yes, those little stick man and he said, no they're trees*

Across the group, the virtual delivery of the sessions was perceived as less effective and less enjoyable than activities run in-person; the lack of instant feedback was a limiting factor.

*P1 journal: I wouldn't mind having somebody in the house to knock ideas about with, but unfortunately that's not the way it is*

Furthermore, after over a year of social restrictions and altered service provision, P4 felt saturated in remotely delivered projects.

*P4 interview: There's been so much remote sort of stuff in the last year and a half, it's alright doing this, but obviously we like to have instant feedback*

### 3) Impacts of VI on participation

#### Art making with a visual impairment

Participants reflected on the negative impacts of sight loss on art making, including a loss of ability to see detail, and difficulty drawing, cutting out and differentiating colours. P1 noted that VI may make the risk of “mess” much higher, particularly when working alone.

*P1 journal: [Ink] it's messy for somebody with a sight problem who hasn't got anybody here to see and point out where I've dripped a bit*

Participants had found solutions to some of their difficulties, including the use of alternative techniques and magnification technology to enlarge details. P2 sought assistance from his partner, although this support was not always available.

*P2 interview: If I wanted to use some particular colours then I would I call my partner to pull them out for me... Of course they're not available all the time, I mean she's got her own life to lead... I didn't like to bother her too much*

#### Positive impacts of sight loss on the MAB Project experience

Despite the challenges, participants utilised various new materials and techniques. P5 even suggested that the initial experience of exploring the materials may have been heightened by having a VI.

*P5 interview: What I think is the most magical thing about it, is if I was sighted, and I know this is a point of it, is it would have been completely different... it makes it a bit more exciting, you can't see it for what it is*

Some items were viewed especially useful to art makers with a VI. P2 highlighted the benefits of tactile items such as bamboo straws and corrugated paper, the latter of which had provided a solution to difficulties that multiple participants reported with cutting out.

*P2 interview: It was tactile, that was the main thing with it... I could actually feel the shape I wanted to cut... I knew roughly how big I wanted it, and after a bit of trial and error, I could count the ridges in the corrugated paper*

Activities which encourage tactile engagement with art materials may offer opportunities for individuals with VI to find solutions to challenges experienced during art making.

### **Discussion**

Participation was associated with emotional, cognitive, and social benefits. Findings reflect those of existing literature, which highlights the well-being outcomes associated with arts participation amongst both the general population and specific groups,[6] including older adults and those living with chronic illness and/or disability.[19-20] The psychological benefits of participation may have been particularly important during the COVID-19 pandemic, with this period being associated with increased psychological distress for many.[21] Other research carried out at this time found that activities such as drawing, textile art, and photography, provided individuals with a positive distraction from current events, and a sense of purpose.[22] Similar to the current study, Armstrong and Ross provided art boxes to parents and children during lockdown to promote connection through playful, creative shared experiences.[23] Whilst the current pilot did not allow for participants to make art together, the activity offered a shared artistic experience, and opportunities to learn from others and feel socially connected. Vogelpoel and Jarrold suggest that art making opportunities may be a driving factor in renegotiating experiences of inclusion and social participation for individuals with VI,[24]. This may be increasingly important during a return to “normal” recreational life following the pandemic.

Regardless of sight loss, participants experimented, to some degree, with unfamiliar materials. There was even a suggestion from one participant that VI might increase enjoyment of using unknown, tactile materials. Research suggests that tactile materials may be more useful to individuals with VI than techniques such as painting or drawing,[14] although techniques such as larger-scale working, avoidance of fine visual/motor work, and use of additional sensory elements such as scent, might increase the accessibility of art and craft activities for individuals with VI.[15, 25] These factors may be valuable considerations for the design of future projects.

Participants also experienced challenges, both related and unrelated to their VI. Experimentation and the use of unfamiliar materials led to mess, which for individuals with VI, especially those living alone, may be a particular concern. Whilst a lack of goal-setting, and an emphasis on creative freedom offered autonomy, some felt unsure of how to proceed. There was also reflection on the practical and creative challenges of remotely delivered art activities, including the limitations of home working (e.g., a lack of assistance or instant feedback). Art making in the vicinity of others was not only considered a social activity, but also beneficial to skill development.

### *Limitations and future research*

The current project was a pilot with six self-selected participants from [redacted]. This limits the extrapolation of findings to either the wider veteran community, or others with VI. The *MAB Project* was a product of the COVID-19 context, and it remains to be seen if the same benefits and challenges would exist beyond this. Future research is needed to consider the efficacy of both remote and face-to-face arts activities to meet the goals of participants with a wider sample of veterans, including those living with VI, beyond the pandemic. Further consideration of the social implications of art making alone, or with others, for veterans with and without VI may be particularly useful. Further qualitative and quantitative research is needed to understand the impacts of different arts activities on the health and well-being of veterans, and the influence of factors such as age, veteran status, and nature of VI on recreational arts participation.

### **Conclusion**

This article provides insight into the experiences, benefits, and challenges associated with participation in a novel, remotely delivered art and craft activity for six British veterans with VI. Findings highlight that art and craft activities may be a valuable tool to address everyday psychological needs of veterans with VI, and that remote delivery may be a useful alternative to face-to-face delivery. However, challenges may arise, particularly if working with individuals whose access to, or knowledge of, technology is limited; face-to-face delivery will likely remain preferable for many. The current study confirms Szubielska's belief that, 'By engaging in visual arts, people with sight impairments show that the artistic creative process can be altered. They prove art is not reserved for sighted people only' (p. 1535).[11] Findings demonstrate the

contribution of recreational arts experiences, including hobby groups and self-directed art making, to health and well-being outcomes.

## References

1. Castle CL, Engward H, Kersey T. Arts activity and well-being for visually impaired military veterans: a narrative discussion of current knowledge. *Public Health* 2021;194:232-37. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.puhe.2021.03.010>
2. Edwards J. Creative arts therapies provide effective support in the aftermath of trauma: Elsevier, 2019:62(1).
3. Ramirez J, Erlyana E, Guillaum M. A review of art therapy among military service members and veterans with post-traumatic stress disorder. *Journal of Military and Veterans Health* 2016;24(2):40-51.
4. Smith A. A literature review of the therapeutic mechanisms of art therapy for veterans with post-traumatic stress disorder. *International Journal of Art Therapy* 2016;21(2):66-74.
5. Davies C, Knuiman M, Rosenberg M. The art of being mentally healthy: A study to quantify the relationship between recreational arts engagement and mental well-being in the general population. *BMC Public Health* 2015;16(1):1-10.
6. Pöllänen S. Elements of crafts that enhance well-being: Textile craft makers' descriptions of their leisure activity. *Journal of Leisure Research* 2015;47(1):58-78.
7. Genoe MR, Liechty T. Meanings of participation in a leisure arts pottery programme. *World Leisure Journal* 2017;59(2):91-104.
8. Abbott KA, Shanahan MJ, Neufeld RW. Artistic tasks outperform nonartistic tasks for stress reduction. *Art Therapy* 2013;30(2):71-78.
9. Sjöberg B, Porko-Hudd M. A life tangled in yarns—Leisure knitting for well-being. *Techne serien-Forskning i slöjdpedagogik och slöjdvvetenskap* 2019;26(2):49-66.
10. Burt EL, Atkinson J. The relationship between quilting and wellbeing. *Journal of Public Health* 2012;34(1):54-59.
11. Szubielska M. People with sight impairment in the world of visual arts: Does it make any sense? *Disability & Society* 2018;33(9):1533-38.
12. DiGiulio D. The Use of Art Therapy with the Blind to Impact a Sense of Capability [dissertation]. New York: Long Island University, 2017.

13. Cashbaugh-Toth G. How Can Art Therapy Interventions Address the Specific Special Needs of Blind and Visually Challenged Individuals? Indiana: Saint Mary-of-the-Woods College, 2010.
14. Coleman MB, Cramer ES. Creating meaningful art experiences with assistive technology for students with physical, visual, severe, and multiple disabilities. *Art Education* 2015;68(2):6-13.
15. Giles, E., Van der Linden, J., & Petre, M. Weaving lighthouses and stitching stories: Blind and visually impaired people designing e-textiles. Proceedings of the 2018 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems; 2018; Montreal.
16. Axel ES, Levent NS. Art beyond sight: A resource guide to art, creativity, and visual impairment. New York: American Foundation for the Blind 2003.
17. Willig C. Introducing qualitative research in psychology. Berkshire, England: McGraw-Hill Education; 2013.
18. Braun V, Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 2006;3(2):77-101.
19. Castora-Binkley M, Noelker L, Prohaska T, et al. Impact of arts participation on health outcomes for older adults. *Journal of Aging, Humanities, and the Arts* 2010;4(4):352-67.
20. Timmons A, MacDonald E. 'Alchemy and magic': The experience of using clay for people with chronic illness and disability. *British Journal of Occupational Therapy* 2008;71(3):86-94.
21. Palgi Y, Shrira A, Ring L, et al. The loneliness pandemic: Loneliness and other concomitants of depression, anxiety and their comorbidity during the COVID-19 outbreak. *Journal of Affective Disorders* 2020;275:109-11.
22. Wilson C, Munn-Giddings C, Bungay H, et al. Arts, cultural and creative engagement during COVID-19: Enhancing the mental wellbeing and social connectedness of university staff and students. *Nordic Journal of Arts, Culture and Health* 2022;4(1):1-13.
23. Armstrong V, Ross J. Art boxes supporting parents and infants to share creative interactions at home: an art-based response to improve well-being during COVID-19 restrictions. *Public Health* 2021;193:109-12.

24. Vogelpoel N, Jarrold K. Social prescription and the role of participatory arts programmes for older people with sensory impairments. *Journal of Integrated Care* 2014;22(2):39-50.
25. Hunt K, Piper A, Worker G. The importance of sensorial empathy and the language of touch when crafting textiles for people who are visually impaired. *Craft Research* 2020;11(1):57-77.