'LOVECIRCLES'

A critical study of an emotion-based professional development programme for educators of children with special educational needs and disabilities

Submitted by

HILY ROSENBLUM

A dissertation in partial fulfilment of the requirements of

Anglia Ruskin University for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Submitted August 2015
Acknowledgments

I imagine the personal and professional voyage of my life as the water of a river, bubbling out from the sources that have brought me here, flowing in me with a combination of power and optimism. I want to express my gratitude to all those sources pumping through me – all my family, my beloved parents, children and grandchildren. Your great love, encouragement, and support leveraged the amazing voyage of my life in general and writing my Ph.D. thesis in particular.

My heartfelt thanks go to the supervisors of my Ph.D. thesis: Dr. Melanie Peter and Prof. Franz Kroath, who for seven years have relentlessly accompanied me with persistence, encouragement, and guidance; from the beginning, through consolidation of the way the study should be conducted, until accomplishment of the desired goal. Your support embodied extremely high personal and professional attention and caring. Thus, it enabled me to establish the foundation of my personal and professional development in the wonderful world of research to which I was exposed – the investigation of emotion in education.

Many thanks to Dr. Yehudit Od-Cohen for her friendship and support. Many thanks to my dear friends, who have surrounded me with a warm, supportive, and reinforcing circle of hearts. All of you consistently indicated that the flow and power of my sources assisted me to reach my anticipated destination, reminding me again and again that this study is the authentic mirror of the love circles of my life. A special 'thank you' goes to my dear Nira for accompanying me during the most significant stages of writing my thesis, for the ability to contain my creative ideas, translate them from Hebrew into English with the hand of a master and the soul of a sensitive angel, providing strength and accuracy. You have been my magical and powerful midwife, allowing this Ph.D. thesis to bridge the gap between my readers and myself.

My Ph.D. thesis is dedicated to all graduates of the 'Lovecircles' education programme of personal and professional development, and particularly to the research participants.
Dear 'Lovecircles' graduates:

Choosing to embark on a unique voyage into yourselves allowed me to reinforce, from theory into practice, my inner belief in the 'whole person' approach as a prerequisite for personal development and professional actualisation.

I personally thank each and every one of you.

I consider you full partners to my voyage of personal and professional development.
Abstract

This study critiques an original professional development programme for educators, evolved by the researcher since 2001 and entitled 'Lovecircles'. The programme was conceived in Israel as a response to challenges faced by teachers working with children with special educational needs (SEN). The education programme is grounded in holistic-humanistic theories, aiming to achieve educators’ personal-emotional empowerment within their professional development. This approach views integration of emotion in teacher education as an integral part of their overall growth, essential for creating an atmosphere of trust with the pupils as well as conducting an empathic and respectful teacher-pupil dialogue.

The gap in knowledge that this study aims to address pertains to the way in which integrating personal development within professional education programmes through facilitating emotional engagement may contribute to more holistic, inclusive practice.

The research is an evaluative phenomenological study focusing on the experiences and perception of the educators from their own perspectives. The research evaluates in depth the impact of the 'Lovecircles' programme on five educators from an original group of eleven that completed all elements of a one-year, part-time programme. The research tools are in-depth interviews, reflective diaries of the participants and the researcher, videos, and still photographic observations. The case studies are analysed individually and in comparison to one other.

The key research findings indicate that participants overcame emotional barriers during the programme, developed attention to themselves and to others, and developed self-expression of emotions by integrating arts into learning, empowering them on the personal level and professionally as educators. The main factors facilitating the participants' personal and professional development were the programme tutor’s attention to both the personal and professional dimensions, and the use of teaching methods from Expressive Art Therapy such as art, movement, and drama. The educators’ empowerment gave rise to the adoption of a positive teaching approach in their work with children with SEN.

The study may serve to inform policy, practice, and research as a robust holistic-humanistic programme. It also contributes to the debate on the place of emotion within professional development programmes and for inclusive and special education. The research has a global relevance through its readily transferable strategies, and so may influence mainstream and special teacher education beyond the Israeli context.

Key words: 'Lovecircles' Education Programme, Emotions in teacher education, SEN - special educational needs, Holistic inclusive practice, Professional development.
## Contents

**CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION**  
1. On a Personal Note  
1.1. Professional Journey  
1.2. Personal Journey  
1.2.1. ‘Lovecircles’ – a Professional Development Programme  
1.2.2. ‘Lovecircles’ – the Research Context  
1.2.3. ‘Lovecircles’ – the Framework  
1.3. Wider Context  
1.4. Aims and Structure  

**CHAPTER 2 – THEORETICAL BACKGROUND**  
2.1. Emotion as an Issue for Education  
2.1.1. Perspectives on Emotion  
2.1.2. Challenges to Emotion within Education  
2.1.3. Emotion in Educational Practice  
2.1.4. Addressing Emotion in Teacher Education  
2.1.5. Conclusion  
2.2. Professional Development in the Field of Inclusive Education  
2.2.1. Inclusion and Children with SEN – Key Definitions and Models  
2.2.2. Interactive Teacher of Children with SEN  
2.2.3. Empowerment as an Issue for Inclusion  
2.2.4. Conclusion  
2.3. Arts as Intervention  
2.3.1. Arts in Education  
2.3.2. Arts in Therapy  
2.3.3. Working Therapeutically Using the Arts  
2.3.4. Arts in Professional Development Programmes  
2.3.5. Conclusion  
2.4. Rationale for a New Approach  
2.4.1. Integration of Emotion within Professional Development  
2.4.2. Professional Development for Inclusion  
2.4.3. Holistic Humanistic Approach to Teacher Education  
2.4.4. Incorporating the Arts  

**CHAPTER 3 – THE 'LOVECIRCLES' APPROACH AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**  
3.1. Key Theoretical Tenets  
3.1.1. Focus on Emotion  
3.1.2. Holistic Perspective  
3.1.3. Exploring the Therapeutic Approach within the Educational Context  
3.1.4. Multi-Modal Working through the Arts  
3.1.5. Ethical Awareness  
3.2. Core Principles for 'Lovecircles' Approach  
3.3. Integrative ‘Lovecircles’ Tutor  
3.3.1. ‘Lovecircles’ Approach to Tutoring  
3.3.2. ‘Lovecircles’ Approach to Supervision  
3.3.3. Ethical Issues for ‘Lovecircles’ Tutoring  
3.4. Towards a Definition of ‘Lovecircles’ Graduate Educators  
3.5. Conceptual Framework  

**CHAPTER 4 – METHODOLOGY**  
4.1. Evaluative Phenomenological Research Study  
4.2. Research Questions
4.3. Research Population 102
4.4. Research Methodology 107
   4.4.1. Research Paradigm 107
   4.4.2. Case Study Research Method 108
   4.4.3. Education Case Study 110
4.5. Data Collection Methods 111
   4.5.1. Observations by Photographs and Videos 113
   4.5.2. In-Depth, Semi-Structured Interviews 114
   4.5.3. Diaries 120
4.6. Research Design 124
4.7. Data Analysis Methods 126
   4.7.1. Methodological Steps Following the Phenomenological Approach 127
   4.7.2. Visual Analysis 127
   4.7.3. Interpretative Approach 131
4.8. Ethical Issues 134
   4.8.1. Informed Consent 136
   4.8.2. Privacy and Anonymity 137
   4.8.3. Reciprocity and Partnership 138
4.9. Methodological Issues 140
   4.9.1. Validity 141
   4.9.2. Reliability 142
   4.9.3. Generalisability 142
4.10. Critical Reflection on Methodological Issues 144
   4.10.1. Critique of the Researcher's Role as Tutor 145
   4.10.2. Insider Research and Validity 147
   4.10.3. Critique of Issues within Expressive Therapy 153
CHAPTER 5 – FINDINGS 155
5.1. Findings Emerging from Research Question 1: Core Principles of the 'Lovecircles' Professional Development Programme 156
   5.1.1. The Personal and Professional Dimension 156
   5.1.2. Multi-Dimensional Tutoring—Integration of Art within Experiential Group Learning 163
   5.1.3. Summary: Findings Emerging from Research Question 1: Core Principles of the 'Lovecircles' Professional Development Programme 165
5.2. Findings Emerging from Research Questions 2 & 3: Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme 166
   5.2.1. Integration of Art—Elimination of Personal Emotional Barriers and Expressing Emotion through Metaphors 166
   5.2.2. Expanding the Teacher-Pupil Relationship 169
   5.2.3. Summary: Research Questions 2 & 3: Personal Development & Professional Development 171
5.3. Findings Emerging from Research Question 4: Is There Any Link between Personal and Professional Development? 172
   5.3.1. Enhancing Reference to the Self in the Professional-General Dimension 172
   5.3.2. Integrating Holistic Dimensions as a Tool for Professional Development 176
   5.3.3. Personal-Professional Continuum of Development 179
   5.3.4. Summary: Research Question 4: Is There Any Link between Personal and Professional Development? 182
5.4 Findings Emerging from Research Question 5 – How Might the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme Affect Their Work with Children with Special Needs? 183
5.4.1. Multi-Dimensional Attention and Multi-Dimensional Tutoring for Learners with SEN 183
5.4.2. Emotional Pedagogy with Pupils with SEN – a relational approach 185
5.4.3. Art-Based Pedagogy within SEN 186
5.4.4. Differentiated Personal and Professional Development 187
5.4.5. Summary: Research Question 5 – Professional Development in the Field of Children with Special Educational Needs (SEN) 193

5.5. Methodological Critique 194
5.5.1. Informed Consent and Coercion 196
5.5.2. Privacy and Anonymity 196
5.5.3. Reciprocity and Partnership 197

5.6. Conclusion 199

Chapter 6 – DISCUSSION 201
6.1. Research Question 1: Core Principles Leading to the Personal and Professional Development of Participants 201
6.1.1. Core Principles Emerging through the Research 201
6.1.2. Multi-Dimensional Integrative Attention 202
6.1.3. Multi-Dimensional Tutoring – Integration of the Arts within Experiential Group Learning 210
6.2.1. Using the Arts – Overcoming Emotional Barriers through Metaphors 220
6.2.2. Expanding the Educator-Participant Relationship 223

6.3 Research Question 4: The Link between Personal & Professional Development 226
6.3.1 Enhancing Reference to the Self in the Professional-General Dimension 226
6.3.2 Integrating Holistic Dimensions within Professional Development 228

6.4. Research Question 5 – The Impact of the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme on Work with Children with Special Educational Needs (SEN) 229
6.4.1. Multi-Dimensional Attention to and Multi-Dimensional Tutoring of Learners with SEN 229
6.4.2. Emotional Pedagogy within SEN – Relational Pedagogy 231
6.4.3. Developing Art-Based Pedagogy for Special Educational Needs (SEN) 234
6.4.4. Developing an Ethos of Acceptance 237

6.5. Conclusion – Towards an Integrative Holistic Humanistic (IHH) Approach to Professional Development 241

CHAPTER 7 – A NEW ‘EDUCATOR MODEL’ FOR TEACHER EDUCATION 243
7.1. ‘Lovecircles’ Integrative Approach 244
7.1.1. Origins and Principles 244
7.1.2. Integrative ‘Lovecircles’ Tutor 246
7.2. Towards a New Model for Teacher Education 248
7.2.1. Staged Models of Professional Development 249
7.2.2. Relevant Pedagogical Knowledge, Skills, and Understanding 251
7.2.3. Developing Situational Understanding 252
7.2.4. Developing Expertise in Inclusive Teaching 255
7.2.5. Holistic Reflection as a Developmental Process 257
7.2.6. Conclusion 259

7.3. ‘Educator Model’ for Professional Development 260
7.3.1. A Staged Model to Support Professional Development in Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy (IHHHP) 264
7.3.2. Educators’ Personal Development through Attention to Their Needs 277
7.3.3. Educators’ Personal Development for Children with Special Educational Needs 280
7.3.4. Integrative Aspects of Educators’ Professional and Personal Development

7.4. Conclusion

Chapter 8 – Conclusions and Recommendations

8.1. Effectiveness of the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme

8.1.1. Research Question 1: What Should Constitute the Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme?

8.1.2. Research Questions 2 & 3: What Might Be the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme?

8.1.3. Research Question 4: What Might Be the Link between Personal Development and Professional Development?

8.1.4. Research Question 5: How Might the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme Affect Their Work with Children with Special Educational Needs?

8.2. Educator Model – Implications for Practice

8.3. Implications for the Wider Policy Context of Teacher Education

8.4. Implications for Research

8.5. Contribution to Knowledge

REFERENCES

BIBLIOGRAPHY

List of Appendices

Appendix 1.a Ethics Review Checklist (1)

Appendix 1.b Ethical Principles For Art Therapists (5)

Appendix 1.c Table A.0: Syllabus and Stages of the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme (12)

Appendix 2 From data collection to the findings (17)

Table A.1: Emerging themes from data collected (17)

Table A.2: Core principles of the programme – frequency of sub-category components in the data of every participant. The core principles of the programme which facilitated the development of the participant Yafa (19)

Appendix 3 Triangulation (Yafa) (21)

Table A.3: Yafa (21)
Appendix 4  Table A.4: The four-category structure of findings with internal components  (22)

Appendix 5  Table A.5: Participant dimension  (26)

Appendix 6  Table A.6: Sub-categories in which 7-10 participants underlined II components  (29)

Appendix 7  Table A.7: Sub-categories in which 4-6 participants underlined all components  (31)

Appendix 8  Table A.8: Summary findings emerging from the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme – CORE PRINCIPLES and frequency of reference to each sub-category  (32)

Appendix 9  Table A.9: Summary of personal development findings emerging from participants’ frequency of reference to each sub-category  (34)

Appendix 10  Table A.10: Participants’ summary findings relating to work with children with special educational needs emerging from participants’ frequency of reference to each sub-category  (36)

Appendix 11  Category dimension  (38)

         Table A.11: Categories

Appendix 12  Table A.12: Sub-categories in which 7-10 participants underlined all components  (41)

Appendix 13  Table A.13: Sub-categories in which 4-6 participants underlined all components  (43)

Appendix 14  Table A.14: Components  (44)

Table A.15: Applied to Teaching (Peter, 1995)

Appendix 16  Collis and Lacey

Appendix 17  Semi-Structured Interview

Appendix 18  Detailed Explanation

Figure A.1: Art and emotions as cornerstones within the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme. A detailed explanation of Figure A.1

Appendix 19  Table A.19: Participants’ personal and professional background in art

Appendix 20  Detailed Case Histories of Participants

Appendix 21  Metaphors

Table. A.21: Metaphors analysis by development dimensions – An integrative approach

Table A.22: Metaphors analysis of emotions on a continuum ranging between unpleasant and pleasant emotions

Table A.23: Metaphors analysis by feelings, emotions, thoughts, reflection – a perception integrating emotional aspects in teaching/reflection

Table A.24: Metaphors analysis by topics in the personal and professional dimension – holistic approach: linguistic analysis and psychological aspects

Table A.25: Metaphor analysis by four main categories
Appendix 22  Yafa – Interview (Appendix 22 - 1)

Eve – Interview (Appendix 22 - 8)

Shanny – Interview (Appendix 22 - 13)

Taya – Interview (Appendix 22 - 18)

Miri – Interview (Appendix 22 - 23)

List of Photographs (supplied separately)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Photo No.</th>
<th>Name of Participant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T-4, T-5, T-6, T-7, T-8</td>
<td>Taya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y-1, Y-2, Y-3, Y-4</td>
<td>Yafa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-2, M-19</td>
<td>Miri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-1, E-2</td>
<td>Eve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stills from video</td>
<td>Shanny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanation of video excerpts</td>
<td>Researcher's reflection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disc (supplied separately)

Video excerpts
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Personal development within professional development ................................. 5
Figure 3.1: Definition of ‘Lovecircles’ graduate educators ................................................. 97
Figure 3.2: The conceptual framework of this study: An emotions and art-based integrative model of inclusive professional development ........................................... 98
Figure 4.1: Research phases .............................................................................................. 125

List of Tables

Table 3.1: ‘Lovecircles’ educational programme – Three stages ..................................... 80
Table 3.2: The therapy and education elements comprising the 'Lovecircles' integrative framework .................................................................................................................. 89
Table 3.3: The tutoring process: counselling, coaching, and mentoring ......................... 91
Table 4.1: Participants' personal details by pseudonym .................................................... 104
Table 4.2: Data analysis methods and theoretical references .......................................... 134
Table 5.1: Summary of exemplar starting points on entering the Lovecircles Programme ................................................................................................................................. 156
Table 5.2: Findings relating to attention as the core principle of the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme (including 11 participants) ......................................................... 157
Table 5.3: Summary of 'Lovecircles' tutor strategies ......................................................... 182
Table 5.4: Development through the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme ..................... 188
Table 6.1: Core principles for holistic professional development for working with learners with SEN ................................................................................................................... 202
Table 7.1: Novice-to-expert scale (1), adapted from Dreyfus (1981) ............................... 254
Table 7.2: Teaching dimensions for Integrative Holistic-Humanistic Pedagogy (IHHP) ................................................................................................................................. 261
Table 7.2.1: The Dreyfus Model (1981): Developing Situational Understanding as a Model for Professional Competence – Applied To Teaching (Peter, 1995) .............. 262
Table 7.2.2: An Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy model for development of professional situational understanding within inclusion based on Dreyfus’ model (1981) applied for teaching Peter (1995). ................................................................. 263
Table 7.3: Characteristics of 'Lovecircles' participants: professional development in Integrative Humanistic Holistic pedagogy ............................................................................ 266
Table 7.4: A model to support professional development in Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy .................................................................................................................. 276
Table 7.5: From the personal to the professional dimension.............................................. 279
CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION

1.1 On a Personal Note

Every person should know and understand that a candle is lit inside him. His candle is not like that of his friend and there is no person who does not have a candle.

And every person should know and understand that he has to toil and show his light in public and make it a torch to light the entire world.


The voyage of my personal and professional development started with passion like a river which flows strongly, watering the soil, enabling every flower to grow with a multitude of unique colours in spite of barriers that it encounters on its way. My personal and professional development in the field of education and therapy was accompanied by feelings of unease, resulting from a lack of emotional and creative aspects as opposed to the focus on external cognitive aspects such as knowledge acquisition. During the thirty-six years of my work as an educator and emotional art therapist in Israel, I have searched for ways through which I could narrow the gap between emotional and cognitive aspects and create a bridge between them as a basis for development and learning.

1.1.1. Professional Journey

As an art therapist, working within school settings in Israel since 1998, I found that the role of emotion in education was a controversial issue reflecting two poles. One pole, represented by teachers, focused on cognition; while the other pole, represented by Expressive Art Therapists, was based on emotions. Expressive Art Therapy was then (in 1998) a new profession within the educational landscape, imposed by an external decision: the policy of the Inclusion Act / Special Education Act (1998) in Israel, in response to the mandate to include children with special educational needs (SEN) in the mainstream education system. Moreover, Expressive Art Therapy was positioned in a
system anchored within the traditional, medical, and social model approaches and at the very early beginning of a more radical approach to disabilities (Mittler, 2000).

The radical school of thought was then mainly discussed at an academic level but without systematic training of teachers facing learners with SEN who filled their mainstream classes. Therefore, the atmosphere in school settings was challenging due to the introduction of a new profession—Expressive Art Therapy—raising the flag of emotions, with no adequate preparation and training for educators. This situation brought about challenging encounters in Israel between experts in both the education and therapeutic fields.

My integrative training within education as a teacher (who used the Arts) and Expressive Art Therapist was leverage for conceptualisation of the need to integrate the fields of cognition and emotion respectively. This ultimately led to my initiative to develop professional training integrating both teaching and therapeutic fields, via art, using the 'Lovecircles' educational programme for professional development.

The questions I asked myself in the course of my personal and professional development were: what inhibits and what activates my emotions? What are the feelings evoked in me in situations of unease in the spheres of my life and in my teaching? How do changes in the external dimension—within the framework of my work—affect and reverberate on my personal dimension? How do these changes affect my behaviour in practice in the field of teaching?

The ways in which I tried to answer these questions consisted of developing innovative programmes within and without the educational establishment. The first programme that I developed for pupils in Israel, “The Creative Self Centre” (1990), focused on developing personal interest, inquisitiveness, and self-creativity using artistic aids. The second programme was a rehabilitation method through art, called “ADAM - art through practice”, designed for patients with mental health needs. The innovation of this programme resided in the transition from a traditional rehabilitation concept to a concept focusing on self-expression and self-creation. This was an innovation at the time in Israel as rehabilitation then was focused on a medical model that had impacted the rehabilitation approach. This approach focused on patients' symptoms and not on
their abilities; for example, encouraging creative and unique art, and craft self-expression.

Creativity-based rehabilitation started emerging then as an innovative idea in Germany, conceived by Prof. Ammon Günter who had founded the WADP (World Association for Dynamic Psychiatry) in the late 1980s. This organisation was affiliated with the WHO (World Health Organisation). Due to my innovative approach in Israel, I was invited to become a member of the organisation, contributing to its enhancement in international conferences and leading me to initiate the enactment of the 1997 Rehabilitation Act in Israel.

The year 1998 became a turning point in the Israeli education system as well, since this was the year that the government enacted the Special Education Act. As a result, Support and Emotional Therapy Centres were established and I joined one of the educational-therapeutic teams. During this period, researchers began reflecting on the personal dimension in professional development (see Figure 1.1, first column on the left) and the integration of emotions (Figure 1.1, second column on the left).

The perception of educators' development in Israel during the 1990s demonstrated a trend towards focusing on the personal dimension of educators during their professional development. At the same time, emphasis was placed on aspects such as teaching from within: using a personal narrative, enthusiasm, flexibility, relationship between the self and the environment, theory, self-inquiry, collaboration, and essence of developmental learning—while relying on positive and transformative psychology.

Within the framework of this trend, namely, focusing on aspects of 'the personal dimension of educators', there was a growing propensity to expound the place of emotions. Towards the end of the 1990s, Hargreaves, A. (1998) indicated the need to allocate room to educators' emotions, particularly in the light of reforms in the inclusion of children with SEN (spear-headed by the United Nations Salamanca Conference, 1994). Hargreaves, A. (2004) criticised education systems that did not assume responsibility for educating professionals in accordance with the reform requirements and expectations of educators.

At the time, Emotional Support Centres (MATYA) in Israel were established as a means of implementing the reform, and I was invited to participate as an 'emotional
therapy through art' professional. During my work at MATYA (1998-2001), based on my understanding that educators were not well-versed in the integration of pupils' personal dimension, I developed the 'Lovecircles' centre in 2001 for parents and children with SEN that focused on developing relationships. The programme integrated emotional and cognitive aspects via art activities, incorporating aspects from the Expressive Therapy field based on a holistic 'whole person' approach. This programme constituted leverage for the design of the 'Lovecircles' programme (2001), a subsequent professional development programme for educators working with pupils with SEN, and which is central to this study.

During that year the interest in this issue grew generally, leading to studies in the field of developing educators' personal dimension (Figure 1.1, first column on the left; Allender, 2001) and emotion in professional development (Korthagen, 2005). In 2006, the year when I began conducting this study, research in this area intensified significantly and additional researchers promoted the study of this issue (Oplatka, 2008; Day, 2012). In the years 2010-2012 (Figure 1.1), research in this field expanded with a growing place dedicated to emotions in education.

Today, upon completion of this study, I have initiated a collaborative-empirical-theoretical-applied venture in collaboration with Prof. Oplatka, a leading researcher in the field of emotions in teaching and management in Israel.
Figure 1.1: Personal development within professional development

Figure 1.1 illustrates my progress in the field of professional development in the context of integrating personal development (first column on the left), integrating emotional aspects in the dimension of personal development (second column on the left), development of this study and the stages that propelled it (right column).
1.1.2. Personal Journey

My professional development was accompanied by attention to my own emotions, development of self-awareness, and acquisition of academic-professional knowledge that integrates emotional and cognitive aspects; for example, creative teaching, art therapy, and rehabilitation. At the beginning of my journey I focused on the emotions of pupils, parents, and therapists. This led me to pay attention to the emotions and needs of educators during their development processes. The professional process of attention to emotions has emerged from my personal holistic humanistic approach (Maslow, 1968; Rogers, 1971; Buber, 1997), which impacts on my professional practice as a sensitive, empathetic, and creative teacher. This has motivated me to develop further professionally through acquiring Expressive Art Therapy skills. Both my personal and professional processes have become synthesised, leading towards an integrative professional model.

As a daughter of Holocaust survivors, I grew up in an atmosphere whereby people around me did not express emotions, hiding them as a means of repressing memories that were too hard to bear. The place of emotions was substituted with thoughts about building safe anchors in the chaotic reality created around them. As an adolescent I tried to uncover and expose the emotions hidden behind the masks worn by the people around me. The ways by which I attempted to expose the emotions led me to an encounter with narratives that became a lighthouse in my life journey.

Narratives of people in a state of helplessness vis-à-vis an intolerable reality are illustrated, for example, by narratives of children trying to survive in the ruins of their homes that were bombed in the Second World War. These children managed to survive and to build their futures thanks to the love they received from their peers (Berto, 1948). Additional narratives were about figures who were models for me, since they helped people without any possessions and without any ability to cope with the society which had discriminated and rejected them because of their skin colour (Reynolds, 1950).

Another significant figure who had an impact on me was the humanistic philosopher Martin Buber (1878-1965). When I read his books at the age of fourteen, I encountered what I felt in my soul: the meaning of relationships, and attention to self and to others.
These experiences led me to the profession of teaching where I encountered my own emotions and those of pupils in emotional distress vis-à-vis the system's requirements from them. As a result they felt rejected, alienated, and unaccepted by society, treated as "special" not because of who they were, but as objects, part of a system, as a leaf without a branch or a tree.

Coming across narratives, poems, and art works of people living in the ghettos touched my heart and turned into a force driving me to specialise in art therapy as a tool of development. My personal experiences, my life events, and the academic knowledge joined together, leading me to this study. For me, the field of art therapy opened a dimension for working with pupils and patients, a practice focusing on attention to emotions and, by expressing them, enabling them to uncover their inner powers.

During the journey of my personal and professional development I experienced a variety of emotions that motivated me to initiate an innovative programme in education and mental health. I also felt other emotions that drove me to leave this area and embark on another way, which is focused on my own personal development. One day I received a phone call from a mother whose two sons had been suspended from school. In pain, she asked me to help her: "I was told that you help in cases where parents are in despair..." and my heart opened to her. My way back to the education system was almost decided by attention to the pain and sadness of the mother who told me that her family had recently immigrated to Israel from one of the countries under the Communist regime. She had no economic means or cultural knowledge to be assimilated in the post-modern society and, particularly, in the education system.

From here onward, my personal and professional narrative includes a meeting with a special education supervisor (1998). She drew me back into the education system, this time as a member of the art expressive therapeutic team in a Regional Support Centre in Israel (MATYA). This was a new programme developed by the education system to implement the Inclusion Act (1998). After two years of working in MATYA within the framework of the education system, I once more felt frustrated, based on my integrative background in teaching and expressive art therapy—for the third time—and a strong wish to develop an innovative programme for educators' professional development: a programme based on the approach that integrates the background and experience that I had accumulated in the field of Expressive Therapy.
I grew up with a feeling that an approach to life, in which the covert is more extensive than the overt, assisted Holocaust survivors to develop the strength to continue to live during, and particularly after the Holocaust. This feeling drove me to expose coded information especially regarding my parents, the Holocaust survivors, out of an inner belief that in this way I would be able to understand their experiences and the effects shaping their inner worlds and perceptions of reality. I believed that expanding my knowledge about them would also expand my knowledge of myself.

I believed that uncovering and understanding the hidden powers in people's soul, which they can apply during a crisis, as well as understanding the emotions motivating them, might enable them to undergo personal development. This enhances their abilities to successfully withstand challenging situations in such a way that they can also enhance other people's development, focusing on personal and professional development in their life circles.

1.2. Embarking on 'Lovecircles' – a Professional Development Programme

The "New Horizon" educational reform in Israel (Ministry of Education, 2009) defines educators' professional development as based on the concept of life-long learning. According to 'Lovecircles', as a structured part of their work, educators enrich their knowledge, enhance their insights about teaching-learning processes, develop new teaching methods, and improve competences in order to promote pupils' functioning and achievements. The progression route of educators, from the time they join the field of teaching, is supposed to consist of four stages: induction, initial consolidation, advanced consolidation, and expertise. The path of professional development at each of these stages is based on reflective elements, shared learning and self-learning, and self-assessment. The leading principles of this learning reside in integrating learners' knowledge and experience in order to develop their personal abilities and professional confidence.

The voyage of this present study lasted seven years, enabling the development of tools and additional ways for learning and deepening the understanding of the place of
emotions in educators' development. Integrating my own personal experience with professional knowledge in the field of this study has facilitated learning and conceptualisation of emotion in the spheres of life and of teaching.

1.2.1. 'Lovecircles' – the Research Context

The 'Lovecircles' educational professional development programme (see the separate booklet) was developed as a response to the challenge facing educators working with children with special educational needs (SEN) in Israel. The programme is based on holistic-humanistic theories (Frankl, 1946; Fromm, 1983) and is designed for educators' personal-emotional empowerment for the purpose of their professional development. This approach advocates that integrating emotions in teacher education constitutes an inseparable part of their overall development (Hargreaves, A., 2001a, 2001b; Korthagen, 2005), essential for creating an atmosphere of trust with the children and conducting an empathic and respectful dialogue between them (Oplatka, 2011). Thus, the 'Lovecircles' programme highlights integration of emotions in teacher education along with other professional approaches to support inclusion such as contributions from EP (Educational Psychology), SALT (Speech and Language Therapy), and OT (Occupational Therapy) (Higgs and Jones, 2008). The full programme is presented in the separate booklet, entitled: “'Lovecircles': an Emotions-Based Professional Development Programme for Educators of Children with Special educational Needs and Disabilities”.

"...Learning to live together in peace and harmony is a dynamic, holistic and lifelong process through which (shared values) are internalised and practised.... The process begins with the development of inner peace in the minds and hearts of individuals engaged in the search for truth, knowledge and understanding” (APNIEVE, 1998, p. 4), UNESCO Asia and Pacific Regional Bureau for Education (1998).

Professional development agencies have to construct their programmes in the light of the inclusion of children with SEN. This current research study evaluates 'Lovecircles' as an innovative approach for educators' professional development in the field of special and mainstream education, rooted in a new radical humanistic educational paradigm, which has profoundly influenced policy and practice. The key idea of ‘Lovecircles’ is to
let educators become attuned to the self and make their self-awareness a starting point for establishing genuine relationships with their pupils (Aloni, 2005).

This study evaluates the effect of the 'Lovecircles' educational professional development programme initially on eleven educators, but focusing in depth on the five who completed all elements of the course. The programme aims to equip educators for working with children with SEN in a holistic way, whereby educators integrate their deep attention, emotion, feelings, and cognition for understanding children. This study was conducted by me—the programme developer—who also headed the programme. Hence, the researcher is an active participant in this study. As a result, the issue of bias was prominent. Consequently, data was collected using different tools, techniques, analysis procedures, and triangulation (Yosefun, 2001).

This study stems from the belief that enhancing educators' awareness of their responsible, autonomic, and reflective role and the impact it might have on pupils, is essential for their career and outcomes for the children. This study presents a new avenue of professional development that might enhance this approach. This new approach to educators' development is grounded in the belief that it should be modified to adjust educators to work in the 21st century. Educators should be able to apply new humanistic constructivist methods of teaching, taking into consideration technology and moral dilemmas that have emerged in the wake of the September 11, 2001 attack on the Twin Towers in New York, and the global economic crisis (Brzezinski, 2005).

Studies (Ben-Zur & Zeidner, 2009) have shown these traumatic events precipitated an increase in delinquency, violence, and dangerous behaviour. This evoked the need to review decision-making relating to issues in education such as political judgments, critical thinking skills, relationships, and dialogue leading to enhancement of humanistic values within society. This reflects an approach to viewing the education system as a significant site for the development of future citizens (Education-Portal.com, 7.3.2013). In this view, the focus has shifted to self-awareness and criticism of knowledge that might jeopardise the well-being and safety of citizens in society.
1.2.2. 'Lovecircles' – the Framework

The programme evaluated here—'Lovecircles'—incorporates methods and techniques that have to do with guided imagery, meditation, creative therapy, and music. It allows the participants to pay attention to themselves and to others as well as attain a deeper awareness of their personal and professional dimensions. This growing awareness enables them to reach out to their pupils in more genuine, caring ways. The programme's approach to teacher education was especially planned for educators working with children with special educational needs (SEN) who need to be holistically regarded and educated to let their potential emerge, serving as leverage for helping them scholastically.

The programme is grounded in holistic-humanistic theories in education, aiming to achieve educators' personal-emotional empowerment for their professional development (Buber, 1958; Rogers, 1961; Frankl, 1946; Fromm, 1983; Maslow, 1998). As stated above, the programme is based as well on the Expressive Art Therapy field, aiming to develop attention to the personal dimension and expression of emotions via art modalities (Landgarten & Lubbers, 1991; McNiff, 1992; Betensky, 2001; Rubin, 2001; Moon, 2007).

The Lovecircles framework that participants undertake is illustrated in Table 3.1 and explained through this chapter. The programme is modular and consists of three main stages.

The first stage involves personal development and comprises two key subjects:

- The first subject is self-acquaintance while experiencing group processes that integrate activities from the field of body and movement, emotions, guided imagery, meditation and art. Experiencing self-expression by means of experiential tools (e.g. colour, movement) enhances acquaintance with the self, and expands inner attention and unique expression capabilities. Experiencing self-reflection processes and working together in pairs and in a group circle, includes reference to feelings, emotions, thoughts, awareness, and insights, in order to implement them in life spheres and in teaching. This subject stage encompasses attention to the participants' inner and professional world, integrating awareness dimensions: emotion, feeling, imagination, and thought as
tools of personal development, and promoting reference to the self and to others in the personal dimension.

- The second subject is developing awareness of emotional-inner barriers, uncovering new and creative options, and turning the barriers into leverage for development.

The second stage of the 'Lovecircles' educational programme is focused on professional development and is built on the processes the participants underwent during the first stage of the programme. Integrating all the awareness dimensions as a tool for professional development deepens the understanding of the relationship with pupils and reference to the self in the general-professional dimension. The experience includes developing and organising a workshop according to the 'Lovecircles' method for members of the group as part of the end-of-course assignments. The objective of this experience is implementation of the competences, tools, and methods acquired during the programme for the purpose of working with pupils with SEN.

The third stage of the 'Lovecircles' programme comprises experiencing and implementing the programme, working in practice combined with tutoring. This stage extends reference to the self and to children with SEN and facilitates understanding of the relationship between experiential-creative processes transpiring during the sessions and the field of SEN.

Developing this innovative programme constituted prominent landmarks of my professional development and shed light on my intuitive comprehension that in order to create a dimension for children's complete development we should improve educators' whole view of children. This programme demonstrates the perception that educators constitute one of three circles (parents/children/educators), creating a dimension for the integrative development of professionals, parents, and children. The programme is advertised in the newspapers, is described in the 'Lovecircles' website, and is recommended by other educators who graduate from the programme. Other educators participate in lectures and workshops on 'Lovecircles' held at schools and professional conferences.

Educational practitioners (around 300) from various areas of formal and alternative education chose to attend the programme between 2001 and 2008. The narratives of
these educators constitute the data underpinning this study, allowing comprehension of the processes and the core principles of professional development prevalent in the 'Lovecircles' educational professional development programme. This study focuses on one cohort of 11 participants, and in particular the experiences of the five who completed all three stages of the 'Lovecircles' programme, who became in-depth case studies for this research project.

All 'Lovecircles' participants went through the procedures of the programme regulations: a personal interview, filling out personal information forms relating to significant life events and professional background as well as general health. Furthermore, they were informed that the programme is not therapy but professional development based on personal development. There were some participants whom the researcher knew before they enrolled in the programme; for example, the direct supervisor of SEN and the Head of Regional Support Centre in Israel (MATYA) who enrolled in the programme due to encountering the work of the researcher as a therapist within the education system. These people are not within the cohort that is the focus of this study.

Therefore, the choice of participants for the research was based on exclusion and inclusion criteria. The inclusion criterion was that only participants who had not previously encountered the researcher before enrolling the programme were chosen as participants for the research.

1.3. Wider Context

Developing the 'Lovecircles' programme (2001) and conducting this study transpired in parallel to the debates in the Israeli education system regarding the need for systemic reform. In 2008 the "New Horizon" education initiative was introduced (Ministry of Education, 2008). The main goals of the reform were defined as enhancing teachers' status and wages; providing equal opportunities to all pupils; promoting pupils' attainments and narrowing gaps; improving school climate; and empowering and expanding head teachers' powers.
This study contends that the perception of the term 'teacher status' as expressed by the "New Horizon" reform (Ministry of Education, 2012) focused on the issue of wages. However, professional development without any reference to teachers' feelings and personal world does not consider the whole person and, hence, is not attentive to all aspects of the voices in the field. Consequently, the contribution of this study might be significant in the integration of emotional aspects of teachers' personal dimension during the professional development process. Decision-makers will, then, be able to deliberate the integration of emotions in personal development within the "New Horizon" initiative.

The National Authority for Measurement and Assessment in Education conducted a study four years after the implementation of "New Horizon" (Ministry of Education, 2012). Findings of this study illustrate that educators view individual teaching as conducive to a deeper relationship with their pupils as well as an opportunity for knowing and dealing with pupils' emotional and social world. The findings further show that individual hours strengthen pupils' commitment and motivation in class.

Nevertheless, evaluation of "New Horizon" so far has led to the conclusion that lack of distinction between individual teaching and whole class teaching causes difficulties in the implementation of differentiated approaches to meet the range of needs. The fact that there is no clear definition of essential issues in the focus areas and stated objectives of the concept "individual hours" compounds these difficulties. This concept does not mean focusing on inculcating knowledge to the pupils but rather providing teachers with space and opportunities for also giving room to pupils' experiential, emotional, and social aspects. This study argues that non-existence of definition and clarity, as well as economic cuts encompassed in the concept "individual hours", stems from differentiation between theoretical perceptions and teaching approaches. The latter concept of "individual hours" therefore comprises aspects beyond knowledge, which emanate from the personal world and emotions, and affect learning. Thus, this differentiation prevents the development of an integrative perception of teaching and learning—a perception that integrates inculcation of knowledge with development of emotional aspects.

The approach towards inclusion in Israel as perceived in the Special Education Act (1998) thus followed developments in the U.K. and U.S.A and was followed by a
further reform in Israel (2007); for example, the Salamanca Agreement, drawn up by the UNESCO 2 world conference (Spain, 1994), the NCLB declaration in the U.S.A. (1995), and inclusion legislation in the U.K. (DfE, 1993) and the Special Educational Needs and Disability Act (2001). Consequently, Israeli teachers shared mutual dilemmas, searching for the best practice and training to develop participatory and inclusive approaches. One of the reform's main goals was allocating individual teaching hours for children to recognize and attend to their educational and emotional needs.

Recent preliminary research (Shemesh–Zilberman and Oplatka, 2013) has revealed teachers' positive attitudes towards the 'New Horizon' aim of attending to children's diverse and individual needs and developing teaching based more on relational pedagogy. However, Shemesh–Zilberman and Oplatka’s (2013) research findings have highlighted the need for additional training for teachers so they can move from theory to practice.

While agreeing with the ‘New Horizon’ perspective, this study considers that the response so far has been more on the technical and practical domain of the issue, such as acquiring more pedagogical skills and providing solutions, but does not integrate the personal dimension of teachers—emotions in teaching in general, and especially within an individual teaching paradigm. Individual teaching narrows the gap between teacher and student, leading to spontaneous teaching possibilities that while encountering the child's inner world, might confront a teacher with a learner's personal issues. Hence, because the teacher is not a skilled trained therapist, the teacher lacks the professional skills to respond to these issues. This might put both child and the teacher at risk of entering the grey area between teaching and therapy, which is an issue that this research seeks to address.

Moreover, it is argued here that teachers whose training has been based on pedagogy focusing on imparting knowledge might nevertheless face a need to deal with unexpected challenging situations. This may arise as a consequence of the individual hours teaching policy, where the intensity of the context may be more prone to bringing about diverse challenging moments. However, as teaching does necessarily focus on attending to children's own personal dimension, especially when there are challenging moments in class, the teachers' response is more likely to be driven by the school’s rules regarding behaviour and discipline. This approach within individual teaching contexts is
challenged in the present research, since both teachers and students are in a one-to-one situation, which raises the need for additional personalised aspects to be considered for their successful utilization so that children's behaviour is interpreted from a psychological perspective. Hence, the present research claims that in order to apply the declared philosophical values of the new reform in Israel concerning individual hours, there is a need to integrate teachers' emotions in professional training as the basis for moving towards a more integrated, holistic approach to personalising teaching and learning.

Research findings (Dickman & Kiezel, 2012) indicate two dimensions of the impact of the "New Horizon" (Ministry of Education, 2012) initiative that support the perception of this study. One dimension is understanding the teachers' need to shift from focusing on the learned content to focusing on learners. The other dimension is a shift from seeing a group of pupils as one whole to providing a differentiated, personalised response to each pupil, allowing teachers to become acquainted with the pupils' emotional and social world and leading to teacher-pupil reciprocity (Dickman & Kiezel, 2012).

1.4. Aims and Structure

This study aimed to examine the following main issues:

1. What might be the relationship between and impact of participants' personal development on their professional development through the 'Lovecircles' programme?
2. What would be the specific effects of the 'Lovecircles' educational programme on the participants' (personal and professional) integrative development?
3. What would be transferable core principles that might enable the participants' integrative development?

This study aims to explore in what way the 'Lovecircles' educational programme might be a catalyst for professional development, by studying the processes the participants underwent during and after the professional development programme and the contribution to their work in the field of special educational needs. The current vast body of research into inclusive teaching approaches and professional education focuses
on successful pedagogy through applied techniques. However, as Ainscow et al., (2006) advocate, ‘exclusive focus on measured attainment reduces the possibilities of schools for realising their wider social purpose... based on, inclusive values. (p. 2).

Furthermore, many existing professional development programmes are based on intensive procedures aiming to acquire knowledge for the purpose of improving teaching skills (Eyre, 1997; Stein, 2003; Jones, 2003). The inclusive approach of the 'Lovecircles' educational professional development programme focuses on both the integration of knowledge as well as personal aspects and shared practice in the curriculum (Allender, 2001; Frederickson & Cline, 2002; Mittler, 2002).

The gap in knowledge that this study aims to address is understanding the way personal and professional development, through attention to the emotional dimension, can be conducive for creating a more holistic, humanistic, inclusive, and integrative approach in practice (Maslow, 1971; Gardner, 1983, 1993; Rogers & Freiberg, 1994).

The question of the place of emotion in teacher training and how this may be integrated, forms the basis of an innovative conceptual framework in Chapter 2 for the holistic development of the inclusive teacher working with children with special educational needs. This is derived from models considered within the Literature Review that focus on the uniqueness and significance of emotion within interaction (Laban, 1948; Sherborne, 1990; Peter and Walter, 2010). These have featured historically in teacher training programmes aimed particularly at working with children with special educational needs, as a counter to the popular model for professional training focused on acquisition of discipline and pedagogic knowledge in education (Dreyfus, 1981). It is proposed that the professional training model that has evolved through this research may potentially have wider relevance as a holistic developmental framework within courses for those working with and without children with special educational needs.

The teacher training models in general and special education in particular, which are considered in the Literature Review, strengthen the argument regarding the absence of a place for emotion in teacher training, even in models (Peter and Walter, 2010) that integrate techniques from the personal dimensions (such as drama, movement and guided imagery) and are based on educational and experiential theories (Bruner, 1986; Vygotsky, 1991; Gardner, 1993) and findings from neuroscience research (Iverson,
The argument is that even these approaches to professional development do not perceive emotion as an *integral* part of the training process.

Towards the end of the Literature Review (Chapter 2), the place of art in education (Moustakas, 1981; Craft, 2005) and Expressive Art Therapy (Betensky, 1995; McNiff, 1981) is presented (historic review, definitions, approaches, and applications in education as opposed to therapy), as well as their contribution as a potential bridge to integrate emotion into an educational context. The theoretical review in this whole chapter was organized as a foundation for the presentation of the innovative professional training programme, "Lovecircles", which forms the basis of the current research (Chapter 3).

This study suggests —and critiques—that educators operate on a technical level, rather than on a personal level. Therefore, integrating emotional aspects within a professional development programme is leverage for the enhancement of a deeper understanding of processes that educators undergo throughout their practice, leading towards developing an inclusive teaching approach (Allender & Allender, 2008; Kubovi, 2008) for the implementation of new reforms within the education field. From this perception of a void in professional development for educators working with children with SEN, the ‘Lovecircles’ approach evolved, aiming to fill in the knowledge gap in professional development concerning the personal dimension.

Perception of external reality is constructed, consciously and subconsciously, by the perception of inner reality (Sobottka, 2010). Hence, to move towards development of a new perception, exploring the inner world might pave the way for integrative understanding of the way we perceive, react, and develop. To sum up, this study might provide new practice and insights into the development of inclusive skills through practitioners' integrative personal and professional development. This might, as well, outline new angles for teaching children with and without special educational needs (Eyre, 1999; Stein, 2003; Jones, 2005).

Chapter 1 – Introduction – presents 'Lovecircles' as a new approach to educators' professional development in special and mainstream education. This chapter introduces its innovative focus as a professional development programme for special and inclusive
mainstream education contexts, shifting the emphasis from child-centred education to attention to children's voices. The idea is enabling educators to be attuned to children's voices and making their own self-awareness a starting point for establishing a genuine relationship with their pupils.

Chapter 2 – Theoretical background – reviews the perspectives underpinning the theories used for this study based on the literature concerning personal and professional development in general and in relation to special educational needs. This chapter also reflects the dramatic change I underwent in the focus of the study. At first, I assumed that the degree of personal and professional change was the most central theme. However the primary data analysis showed that the degree of personal and professional change mentioned by the participants was as dependent on the relationship between attention to and expression of emotions within the education programme. This theme became very prominent and led to further exploration of professional development literature and revisiting of data in later chapters.

Section one of Chapter 2 deals with the central subject of this study, actually examining the surprisingly relatively limited literature about emotion as an integral component in educators' personal development. This section investigates the main humanistic theories as they relate to educators' development in this study, exploring the viewpoint of emotional awareness as an essential (integral) component of personal and consequent professional development. This exploration presents the gap in knowledge in personal development of educators in teacher education programmes.

Section two discusses educators' professional development through their personal development. It explores relevant theories, issues, and debates pertaining to this study's holistic humanistic approach to inclusive teacher education for working with children with SEN.

Section three of Chapter 2 discusses the Arts as intervention in education and therapy. This discussion highlights the potential contribution of integrating principles from Expressive Art Therapy for embedding emotion in professional development programmes for inclusive teaching.

Section four of Chapter 2 presents a rationale for a new approach to address the gap in knowledge, as at the core of this study is the quest for the recognition, integration, and
balance between cognition and emotion in professional development in the education field.

Chapter 3 presents the context of this study—the 'Lovecircles' educational programme—towards a definition of 'Lovecircles' graduate educators. It adopts a critically developed understanding of the relevance embodied in the underlying theories that inform key principles. The rest of the section describes the conceptual framework of this study. The theories discussed highlight the current lack of reference to emotional aspects in the field of educators' professional development that, in turn, affects the lack of reference to educators' personal development.

Chapter 4 – Methodology – presents the considerations for the formulation of the research design and methodology derived from the research aims, questions, and conceptual framework. The next section critically discusses the qualitative-inductive-interpretative paradigm, the phenomenological research approach and the research methodology, and the various methods used for the first phase of data analysis. The research process-oriented and spiral design of this study are presented as derived from the data analysis methodology. This is followed by presentation of the validity, reliability, generalisability, and ethical considerations of the research according to Anglia Ruskin University and British Psychological Society regulations.

Chapter 5 – Findings – illustrates the development of 'Lovecircles' participants in three dimensions: the inner dimension, the professional-general dimension, and the professional-specific dimension encountered when working with children with special educational needs (SEN). This chapter relates the findings of the data analysis of the participants' development in the 'Lovecircles' educational programme and the emerging core principles that facilitated it. The findings serve as the basis for discussing their significance for educators' personal, general, and specific development within the field of SEN, in the light of the perception presented by this study regarding current issues in the development of educators working with children with SEN.

Chapter 6 – Discussion – considers the findings and develops the conclusions leading to the main argument of this study and as a basis for the further discussion and evolution of a new approach in Chapter 7. The first part of Chapter 6 characterises the participants' development and the core principles that allowed their development
through the 'Lovecircles' educational programme. It discusses the effects of the participants' personal development on their professional development and on the development of a collaborative and integrative teaching method for working with children with special educational needs.

The second part of Chapter 6 develops a narrative that interprets and assesses the findings, offering a synthesis. The last part of this chapter discusses the argument that emerged from the initial discussion of the findings. The claim is that there is a need for a new integrative-holistic teacher education model that integrates emotional aspects by means of art. Consequently, the next chapter suggests an innovative model of the new inclusive teacher in line with the 'Lovecircles' approach.

Chapter 7 – A new 'Educator model' for teacher education – encapsulates the view of this study that a new model for professional development is needed to reflect a shift in the general climate. Unlike other models, the developed tool (presented in this chapter) is based on the findings and conclusions of this study and illustrates the fundamental lines and procedure of an Integrative Holistic-Humanistic (IHH) professional development model based on the 'Lovecircles' method. This chapter (and the previous one—Chapter 6) is supported by links to theoretical concepts underlying the conceptual framework of this study.

Chapter 8 – Conclusions and recommendations – sums up the questions raised and addressed throughout this study: What tools do educators have to help them be attentive to their pupils and express emotions? Can there be attention to the pupils' emotionality without attention to educators themselves? Key points that emerged from the study express the voice of participants' dissatisfaction with the system's approach to professional development that focuses more on didactic, pedagogical, and theoretical aspects and less on the personal dimension. Conversely, the new 'Educator model' presented in this study constitutes a place for integrating the personal and the professional dimensions. The chapter indicates recommendations based on the research findings and the discussion thereof. The chapter ends with my reflections regarding my learning throughout the research process.
CHAPTER 2 – THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Chapter 2 provides a review of the broad spectrum of the extant literature pertaining to the 'Lovecircles' education programme: key elements for personal and professional development for educators working within inclusive contexts, from both education and therapy fields. Additionally, this chapter embraces a critical stance in order to develop an understanding of the promise of personal and professional development for successful inclusion as well as potential pitfalls, and a rationale regarding the need for a new approach to fill the gap in knowledge in the personal development of educators in teacher education programmes.

Professional development is discussed by establishing perspectives within the paradigm of inclusion and with a critique of training in special educational needs (SEN) in the Israeli education system. Emotional awareness emerges as a key integrative process for educators' professional development for working with children with SEN; also the potential contribution of principles from Expressive Art Therapy to participatory and inclusive attitudes and teaching approaches.

The review of theories in this chapter leads to identification of the need for an integrative-holistic approach adopted by the current research in the sphere of professional training in education (Dewey, 1938; Frankl, 1946; Buber, 1965; Rogers, 1968; Piaget, 1969; Fromm, 1983; Bruner, 1986; Vygotsky, 1991; Maslow, 1998). This literature review is guided by research aims, research questions, and the quest for a new conceptual framework. The literature review was influenced also by the need to provide a theoretical underpinning in response to possible criticism of the approach, and to increase reliability of the interpretation of the findings (Figure 4.1, p.127 summarises the data analysis methods). Art and emotion are identified as core themes, and serve as two key pillars of this literature review.

The rationale for an integrative-holistic approach in education that emerges through this review derives from the concept of the "whole person". The aim of this review is fuelled by a need to critique the common narrowly-focused approach to teacher training in Israel that is derived from cognitive-behavioural perspectives only, and which does not consider the personal dimension, particularly emotion, as an integral part of professional

As such, critical consideration of a number of theories featuring in this chapter serve to anchor the contention of this research study of the need to integrate teachers' professional development with the personal dimension of emotions experientially within training programmes. After debating the problematic concept of defining emotion in different areas (religious and meditative writings, literature, art, and neuroscience), the review focuses on the arguments in education generally and the existing challenges of how to integrate emotion into teacher training specifically. The central concepts of emotion within education that are critically considered (such as ‘emotional work’, ‘emotional awareness’, and ‘emotional intelligence’) nevertheless point to lack of space for experiencing and engaging with emotions in teacher training in comparison with a focus on theoretical aspects within courses, not least perhaps because these concepts relating to the emotional dimension in themselves are problematic and contested.

The questions with which this research study attempts to deal were derived from this theoretical perspective. Questions such as these arose: What exists and what is lacking in the area of emotion in teacher training? What and how can policy makers and teacher training programme developers do to respond to the issue of the need for recognition and integration within courses of the emotionality of both teacher and pupils, with and without special educational needs? As such, the theories that are presented focus particularly on the theme of application: integrating emotion into teacher training for the inclusive context.

This literature review raises the problematic issue of professional development of the inclusive teacher. This is a particularly prominent focus for this thesis, and the theoretical foundation is revisited and critiqued in Chapters 6 and 7. Following initial data analysis, the gap in knowledge with regard to inclusive teacher education is pinpointed and expanded upon with an innovative new framework.
2.1. Emotion as an Issue for Education

2.1.1 Perspectives on Emotion

Human emotion is a complex concept to define, leading to conflicting theories and interpretations. From a historical point of view, passions and relevant concepts such as affection, moods, and feelings constitute one of the colourful rays of emotions. There are at least 90 definitions in the scientific literature (Plutchik, 2001). A common definition of emotion is that it is a response by a whole organism, involving (1) physical arousal, (2) expressive behaviours, and (3) conscious experience. Emotion is defined in the Oxford English Dictionary as a strong feeling deriving from one's circumstances, mood, or relationships with others, and as an instinctive or intuitive feeling as distinguished from reasoning or knowledge based on historical insight.

Attempting to understand the concept of emotion and its effects on people, their development, and their relationship with their environment is a topic of reflection and research in various fields (Salmela & Mayer, 2009). For example, in the scriptures (jealousy in the story of Cain and Able), mythology (Achilles' heel), philosophy (Socrates death), psychology (emotional development processes), psychiatry (mental disorders, for example, schizophrenia), anthropology (folk rituals as a means of expressing emotions), gender (identity or emotional differences between women and men), literature and critique (the magic of children’s fairy tales), music (music for relaxation, cradle music), as well as brain and neuroscience (brain scanning).

A broader universal justification for an emotional approach to cognition maintains that emotions lie at the border between the person and society (Dante, 1555). Thus, Dante's claim is in line with my core view that study based on emotions must have a central position in all human disciplines, because being human means having emotions. Cultivating emotions and integrating them with cognition have the potential to enhance a loving and empathetic springboard for human development, based on participation and togetherness (Frankl, 1946; Buber, 1958; Rogers, 1961; Fromm, 1983; Maslow, 1998).
On the other hand, emotions are often denied at the expense of ego-cognition and awareness of the power of emotions; consequently, such a view does not see the need to cultivate emotional regulation. This embodies the risk of human destruction, even in wars between sectors of the same nation and brothers of the same parents, since using cognition-knowledge, without attributing emotions to its consequences, has shown its dreadful danger in the Holocaust during the Second World War, such as the case of Hitler who was very emotional and passionate but displayed no humanistic values. Moreover, events such as 9/11/2002 and at this very moment in the Middle East and many other suffering nations, refugees and shelter-seeking individuals remind us of the continuing need to study emotions and their role in human life spheres, leading to integration with knowledge, so it should not be based solely on cognition.

The notion of emotion is controversial and has raised problematic discourse between fields of knowledge, leading to separation and distinction between them. Fields of knowledge such as human exploration in philosophy, psychology, and brain study differ mainly in their approach to emotions either as integrative holistic or science-based perceptions. Moreover, different approaches are found within these fields. For example, developmental psychology from a behaviourist and cognitive view (Piaget, 1971) perceives development as having no reference to emotional aspects. Yet, another theoretical perception (De Bono, 1996) within cognitive psychology defines emotion as one of the different ways of thinking. However, from the perspective of psychology of the self (Freud, 1967), the focus is on the unconscious separating between emotion and cognition. The psychoanalytic tradition (Jung, 1975), considers emotions as one of the four parts of the human soul (thought, feeling, sensation, and intuition), arguing that people strive to achieve balance between these four functions.

In this light I concur with the claim that thinking is not necessarily only rational and logical (Damasio, 1994; LeDoux, 1997). Rather, it stems from the way the neurological-emotional activity transpires and it is associative, intuitive, and dynamic. This dynamic approach to emotion is sustained by Ekman (1999) who argues that emotions are viewed as having evolved through their adaptive value in dealing with fundamental life tasks. Each emotion has unique features: signal, physiology, and antecedent events. Each emotion also has characteristics in common with other emotions: rapid onset, short duration, unbidden occurrence, automatic appraisal, and coherence among responses.
These shared and unique characteristics are the product of people's evolution and distinguish emotions from other affective phenomena.

In this sense, individuals' ability to recognise themselves directs their deeds according to a meaningful objective, responsibility, and love of others. This attitude is not critical but rather accepting, enabling development and self-actualisation (Maslow, 1968). This leads to a sub-definition of emotion (Moustakas, 1981), namely positive or negative, acceptance and love, critique and fear illustrated in relationships, impacting on the development of the personal dimension, sense of autonomy, and self-acceptance. This sub-definition of emotions entails the development of attention to all layers of expressing emotions, integrating verbal and experiential aspects; for example art, drama, and music. Moustakas (1981) believes that relationships grounded in love instead of in blame, for example, endow people with abilities to generate changes in difficult life situations.

Totterdell and Niven (2012) refer to the quest of James (1884): 'What is an emotion?' Along these lines, this study stipulates that emotions shape who we are and what we do (Nussbaum, 2003).

2.1.2. Challenges to Emotion within Education

Nevertheless the perception concerning the role of emotion in teacher education has been rejected by some (Sutton, 2005) based on the claim that emotions are often considered as out of control, destructive, and primitive, rather than thoughtful, civilised, and adult. 'There is a… suspicion in Western culture that there is something wrong with emotions' (Alsop, 2005, p. 7).

Another opposing view to embedding emotions in teacher education is presented by Ecclestone and Hayes (2009), who argue that an entire culture of nurturing a topic called 'class therapy' has been created in some British schools. According to them, this approach emphasises the importance of emotions over cognition, based on the belief that it will remove all hurdles that most students face. Ecclestone and Hayes (2009) criticise this British approach, which derives its inspiration from the United States. They claim that educators should teach areas of knowledge rather than engage in group
therapy in class. They attest that the group therapy policy in British elementary schools weakens students’ coping ability and decreases their level of pursuing the learning objective (Ecclestone & Hayes, 2009). This policy might undermine the self-confidence of many students who learn that demonstrating weakness is legitimate.

Initiatives to embed emotion in education in the U.K. were critiqued by Gillies (2011). One such example is the attempt to embed emotions in the Social and Emotional Aspects of Learning, a.k.a. SEAL (Humphrey et al, 2010) in many British schools during the early 2000s, based on Goleman's (1995) theory of Emotional Intelligence. Goleman’s (1995, 1999) contribution to spreading the EI concept globally is acknowledged. He emphasised how EI has gained a significant role and recognition in different fields of academic research, in schools of education, business, and religion. Educators have implemented "Social and Emotional Aspects of Learning (SEAL)" (Humphrey et al, 2010) in schools in many districts and even entire states in the United States; the SEAL curriculum being an equivalent requirement to disciplinary subjects. In 2002 UNESCO began a worldwide initiative, and approached ministries of education in 140 countries to promote SEAL, suggesting ten basic implementation principles. In this light, Goleman (1995, 1999) refers to the new approach within schools of integrating abilities such as empathy and understanding into their agenda as well as emotional nonverbal clues to reduce problems among students and improve the school climate and, ultimately, students’ academic performance.

The SEAL (Humphrey et al, 2010) approach was criticised (Gillies, 2011) for putting at risk individualisation in education and in class. He claims that although the objective of these initiatives is to deliver the psychological role of emotions in learning by focusing on rational manipulation of emotions, and uncontainable personal and interpersonal feelings (such as power dynamics, relational struggle, hopes and fears), they keep on dominating educational settings. Consequently, the emotional tenet embodied within the SEAL initiative has particular consequences for learners who are considered as behaviourally challenging. Emotions are removed from their social and political context and assessed in terms of appropriateness. Learners who differ from approved models of expression are labelled as personally lacking and are taken out from mainstream classrooms for the purpose of receiving therapy-based interventions.
The British government's influential plan "Every Child Matters" (Kirby et al., 2003; DfES, 2001) made emotional well-being a central issue, due to concerns over horrific child-abuse cases and the resolve for a multi-agency integrated approach for all children. Its five outcomes for all children directly mirrored Maslow's (1998) humanistic hierarchy of needs, with an underpinning of feeling safe, secure, and valued and keeping the individual's self-esteem intact. According to the official website of the British Department for Education and Employment (DfEE, 1999, revised 2004), the programme does not represent government policy any more in terms of funding support. However, its legacy lives on in its influence on practices in schools in having raised awareness of holistic as well as academic outcomes for children.

Berman (2004), however, argues that educators who are regarded as trusting, supportive, and dependable become unhealthy attachment figures, influencing students to be more sensitive to and connected with their classmates' lives. He further maintains that 'class therapy' is in fact harming children. The arguments for this rejection must therefore consider the risks and benefits of empathic teaching, particularly regarding how educators can play a therapeutic role in the classroom without being therapists. This current study sees this as a key issue if generalist educators are to be empowered to address emotionality in the classroom context.

2.1.3. Emotion in Educational Practice


...good teaching is charged with positive emotion ..... Good educators are not just oiled machines. They are emotional, passionate beings who connect with their students and fill their work and classes with pleasure, creativity, challenge and joy (p. 885).

Most of the studies that examine emotions in the context of educational change, relate to emotions only as a tool assisting policy-makers to manage educators and overcome their objection to change (Hargreaves, A., 1998). They acknowledge educators' emotions as
'pain killers' but not as a 'powerful stimulating drug'. However, Hargreaves, A. (1998) made four significant claims derived from sociological and psychological literature dealing with emotions and their place in teacher-student relationships:

- Teaching – is an emotional practice;
- Teaching and learning – require emotional understanding;
- Teaching – is a form of emotional work;
- 'Educators' emotions – are inseparable from their moral goals and their ability to accomplish these goals.

Therefore, Hargreaves, A. (1998) emphasises that priority should be given to creating conditions that allow better cognitive and emotional understanding between educators and students. He maintains that the approach of educational reforms associated with the issue of educators' emotions and emotional aspects of learning should be changed and promoted, considering educators and their emotions in a serious and appropriate manner.

The perception concerning the significant role of emotions in human development and learning is sustained by contemporary discussion within the expanding literature on emotion in education, psychology, and neuroscience. Findings indicate that positive strength-based approaches help to increase levels of dopamine and serotonin, both of which influence the emotional state by creating a calm but open mind (Hasler, 2010). Recent neuroscientific research (Matto et al., 2013) refers to stress hormones such as adrenaline and cortisol, secreted by the body when it is being pressured by things like learning failure and tense home situations, creating substantial barriers to learning because they slow down the connectivity of the brain.

Epstein-Jannai (2001) stipulated that educators should develop awareness of the quality of dialogue in the class as the framework within which teaching and learning takes place. Another aspect of emotion in the educators' role is developing attention to themselves and their students, raising their own self-awareness to facilitate development of awareness of this process later in their students. Both elements invoke a type of silence, a type of willingness for momentary availability and reflexive stop (Zembylas, 2003, 2004; Caranfa, 2004), which allows, as a first step towards change, understanding the assumptions interwoven into current practice.
Ratner (2000) in referring to Vygotsky's (1987, 1993, 1997) view, upholds that emotions are integrated with cognition and are formed by cultural processes. This approach takes into consideration the effect of inter-personal exchange on intellectual development. It offers educators the opportunity to develop an approach that does not rely on knowledge and class management ability, but on establishing an atmosphere based on feelings of trust, co-operation, listening, and understanding, emphasising that the student-educator interaction and dialogue are of vital importance throughout the learning process.

2.1.4. Addressing Emotion in Teacher Education

Oplatka (2007) takes the view that educators’ emotional management is a discretionary, voluntary-based role rather than a prescribed one. This view is linked to the term 'emotional work' (Hargreaves, A., 1998; Hochschild, 1983), relating to situations where employees personally choose to manage their emotions. This approach considers that educators and students interact within the framework of personal and social constructs that they bring into the classroom. Educators as well as students bring feelings such as frustration, compassion, interest, competence, anger, joy, pleasure, satisfaction, pride, excitement, enthusiasm, happiness, confidence, self-assurance, and passion (Emmer, 1994; Hargreaves, A., 1998), anger, frustration, anxiety and sadness, and uncertainty (Sutton and Wheatley, 2003), which may be triggered by the school system itself. For instance, an educator may feel supported as a member of an emotionally literate culture, or fearful of criticism within an authoritarian one.

According to emotional intelligence (EI) theory (Goleman, 1995), home educators, pre-service educators, or tutors, who do not emotionally and cognitively process their complex attitudes towards children and/or another person, will fail to implement any intervention programme effectively (Gilat, 2007; Gidron & Barak, 2007; Gidron, 2009).

Waterhouse (2006) claimed that there are problems with EI theory that remain unresolved. Researchers have argued that EI cannot be considered a scientific theory (Landy, 2005) because some databases proposing evidence for EI cannot be evaluated as they are privately owned and research has not been published. Most available EI research has clearly identified a lack of conclusive supporting data for EI, either as a
single construct or as a defined set of specific abilities. The problems of EI theory identified by Matthews et al., (2004) include no unitary EI paradigm, inadequate differentiation of EI from personality traits plus IQ, and no evidence that EI predicts job or life success, and have not been resolved.

However, interpretation of popular evidence from unscientific ideas such as EI from the literature and/or the classroom and programmes from the 1990s (Goswami and Bryant, 2007) aimed to support links between neuroscience and education. Therefore, researchers (Goswami and Bryant, 2007; Weisberg et al., 2008) claim these can become evidence for popular neuro-myths too and therefore should be scrutinized for the extent and limitations of that evidence.

The search for links between evidence about the brain and concepts involving educational technology also leads towards new myths (Waterhouse, 2006). This critique concerning the new myths claims that evidence derived from functional imaging experiments based on technology is still limited in capturing the rapid and detailed changes that characterise brain activity during even the simplest tasks, and that involve environments very different from everyday contexts such as classrooms.

However, less appreciation and therefore reduced awareness has been turned on studies concerning positive influence of brain plasticity (Eysenck, 1994) as changed by experiences affecting personal development (factors such as self-image and academic ability). Such examples are found in the brains of musicians that have shown enlargement of the corpus callosum (Schlaug et al., 1995), auditory regions (Schneider et al., 2002), and motor regions (Amunts, 1997). Hence, neuroscience on the brain offers sustainable evidence concerning the influence of practice and experience on learning in contrast to notions of biology as destiny (Stewart and Williamon 2008).

Quasi-brain theories such as Gardner’s (1983) Multiple Intelligence Theory (MI) and Goleman’s (1995) Emotional Intelligence (EI) theory are not supported by sound or consistent validating empirical evidence. In addition, these theories do not respect the constraints provided by cumulative empirical evidence from cognitive neuroscience research; hence, these theories should not be taught without providing the context of their existing empirical support. Enthusiasm for their application to classroom practice should be tempered by awareness that their lack of sound empirical support makes it
likely that their application will have little real power to enhance student learning beyond that stimulated by the initial excitement of something new. However, future research may shed light on these theories, and students, teachers, researchers, and theorists should remain open to new evidence. Therefore, incorporating these theories with a critical awareness can be justified as underpinning paradigms for training programmes that address emotionality.

Likewise, other researchers (Emanuel, 2010) uphold that emotional barriers might undermine and delay educators' professional development processes. Hence, social-psychological support is essential. Yet Berger & Thorn (2010) found that educators who mentor pre-service educators, also lack suitable skills for engaging in emotional support.

Rosiek (2003) considered that acquiring tools for embedding emotional awareness in teaching should take into consideration educators' own needs for emotional support in the process of their development and practice. Thus, the intensity of professional development and teaching should be structured accordingly. Educators' knowledge must allow them to consider the nature and timing of emotional support (Sconiers & Rosiek, 2000; Dibble & Rosiek, 2001; Rosiek, 2003).

Researchers suggest a variety of ways for integrating emotions within professional development. Korthagen (2005) suggests the 'onion model' as a self-awareness process, which enables educators to focus on inner and outer levels, such as the environment, affecting the inner levels. Other researchers (Arnold 2005; Intrator 2006; Schutz and Zembylas, 2009) advocate that experiential processes such as workshops, simulations, imagination tools, and case studies, documented on video clips, all enhance educators' perception that teaching is an emotional arena, by developing sensitivity together with acquisition of applied tools. Peter (2013) identified mentoring strategies appropriate to a staged model of professional development and the development of reflective conversations based on trainee's focused observations and evaluations of their own practice, and engagement with their emotional responses within the teaching and learning process as starting points for reflection.

Moreover, contemporary literature on educators' professional development asserts that emotions may influence professional development in teacher education for educators as

... you keep thinking about yourself, the way you function as a teacher... makes you face up to a side of yourself you didn't know ... about interventions, decisions, remarks and feelings...(Korthagen, 2001, p. 263).

In this light, the 'Social Cognitivism' (Dweck & Leggett, 1988) approach emphasizes the role of motivational and personality variables of learning and performance. Based on psychological processes, Dweck and Leggett (1988) indicated the impact of underlying personality variables, patterns of cognition, affect, and behaviour on the professional dimensions of learning and performance. Yun and Sternberg (2004) considered that in relying on current knowledge regarding integrated understanding of intellectual functioning and development, it is necessary to treat cognition, emotion, and motivation as inextricably related. Hence, they represent the new direction in theory and research on intellectual functioning and development by integrating inter-individual, intra-individual, and developmental variability in actual intellectual performance.

Zimmerman (2008), as well, indicates the significant impact of emotion within the personal dimension of workers on variables within the professional dimension such as satisfaction and performance. Hewitt (2008), too, indicates that teachers’ integrative professional development impacts children’s effective learning (DfES, 2001). One of the resulting implications is the need for a change in teacher education programmes to incorporate attention on professionals’ emotionality (Wolansky, 2009).

2.1.5 Conclusion

A number of researchers (Hochschild, 1983; Ashforth & Humphreys, 1993; Morris & Feldman, 1996) advocate that in the western world, there is a decrease in emotional rules and therefore there should be an increase in the place attributed to educators’ personality in the management of emotions in the classroom. Leading researchers in the fields of educational psychology and educational thought (Bandura, 1977; Noddings, 1992; Vygotsky, 1997; Iran-Nejad, 2000) maintain that conscious thinking and emotions cannot be separated and cannot be considered as two different occurrences. This fact is important particularly when teaching in inclusive classes is concerned,
because of the complex special needs those students may have – social, emotional, cognitive, and behavioural.

Leading contemporary researchers have located the issue within teacher education (Korthagen, 2001; Korthagen & Vasalos, 2005; Korthagen, 2012; Schutz and Zembylas, 2009; Oplatka, 2011; Hargreaves, A., 2011; Hargreaves, D., 2012) and claim emotion has a significant role in teachers' professional development, by indicating the connection between educational change and educators' emotions. Whilst historically most studies hitherto have focused on viewing the duties of and expectations from educators in the context of assisting and supporting students' emotional development, relatively few studies have focused on the expression or curbing of emotions by pre-service and in-service educators.

This is particularly significant for practitioners working with children with special needs, in order to enhance their grasp of the holistic implications for their inclusion.

2.2. Professional Development in the Field of Inclusive Education

One of the controversial topics in the field of professional development in education today stems from the search for an effective approach to teaching students in the 21st century (Quigney, 2010). A discussion of the merits of the approaches to educators' professional development has also been compounded by issues relating to legal mandates such as the 'highly qualified teacher' provision of the "No Child Left Behind Act" (proposed by President George W. Bush on January 23, 2001, Public Law PL 107-110, the No Child Left Behind Act of 2001, U.S. Department of Education) and labour market realities, including the shortage of educators in Israel and abroad in key instructional areas, one of them being special and inclusive education.

For years, research into learning disabilities has been part of education and psychological sciences (Shaul, 2006). It has mainly engaged in their behavioural and educational aspects but has not provided knowledge about the basic source of the disabilities (Collins & Rourke, 2003; Blakemore & Frith, 2005; Shaul, 2006). Numerous studies of the human brain have made it easier to comprehend the brain of
the learning-disabled (Shaul, 2006). Researchers claim, though, that it is difficult—despite advanced technology and tools—to diagnose the different disabilities (Blakemore & Frith, 2005). Updated knowledge of educators' professional development such as progress made in neuroscience, along with innovations in teaching approaches within the context of special education, can inform teacher education programmes that implement the 'No Child is Left Behind' approach.

2.2.1. Inclusion and Children with SEN – Key Definitions and Models

A discussion is presented here concerning the shift of approaches within education of children with special educational needs (SEN), towards their inclusion in mainstream education and implications of its impact for educators' professional development.

Conceptualising intelligence

The traditional notion of 'intelligence' contrasts with a more recent view rather than perceiving it as a unitary concept. Gardner (1983) considers there are many kinds of intelligences and that a wider perception should be enhanced by considering other impacting factors such as cultural and situational variables (Neisser, 1979). Sternberg's (1984) 'triarchic' theory proposed a need for relating to the external world and internal world of the individual.

The concerns about the difficulty of defining and measuring intelligence highlight the problem of the definition also of giftedness and the significance of creativity. This perception focuses on concept rather than skill learning, while models such as the Enrichment Triad Model (Renzulli & Reis, 1997) are designed to expose students to a wide variety of disciplines and influences, beyond the regular curriculum. Recently, Renzulli shifted his emphasis toward the background factors in his models; the personality and environmental factors influencing gifted behaviour (Giger, 2006).

Mönks (1992) regarded the meaningful influence of Renzulli and Reis (1997), whose perception generated a change in the current approach to the identification of pupils who need special services. They brought about flexibility in the perception of learners
and their capabilities through the environment in which children grow up, the implication being that teachers should nurture the children, as well as the effect of the teachers' personality qualities (Renzulli and Reis, 1997). This approach differs from models that define learners' capabilities and disregard the place and function of the interaction with the pupils and its impact on their development. Hence, according to Renzulli and Reis (1997), we need a multi-dimensional approach, including personality and social components.

Mönks' (1992) multifactional model of giftedness is grounded in developmental psychology as well as in social and personality-oriented aspects. He uses terms that encompass emotional factors such as capabilities and motivation. The practical meaning of this wide perception of the definition of fundamental terms associated with learning, (for example, intelligence, giftedness, and creativity) and the way we identify learners' capabilities, is the development of teaching approaches that focus on teachers' personality and teaching methods rather than on technical and organisation aspects such as learning in a specific space and not within the class framework.

Thus, the most effective approach for understanding and developing learners' capabilities is seeing the individual child in the light of Vygotsky's (1978) developmental-cognitive theory. Vygotsky's theory advocates the meaningful place of the environment, namely the teacher who enables children's development as opposed to Piaget (1983) who underscored the specific stage of children themselves and who saw their development as dependent on prerequisite maturation processes and concepts of 'readiness'. The work of Sherratt and Peter (2002) highlight the significance of the affective dimension as a generative condition within the teaching context, and illustrate the key role of educators in attuning to the child with autism, and the sensitively judged modulation of emotional arousal levels in order to sustain their engagement within activity.

The implication is that there are students with and without special educational needs (SEN) who are perceived as underachievers despite the fact that they may have hidden talents and abilities. Hence, they should receive more attention, and multi-dimensional interventions and educators should develop intervention strategies that cater to the specific needs of all pupils. When we implement various holistic interventions that take
account of the totality of influences to meet the needs of weaker students, we might more effectively address the problem of underachievement within our schools.

This approach can be illustrated by the successful examples of educational programmes with autistic savants such as Stephen Wiltshire (artist) and Derek Paravicini (pianist) who both have severe learning difficulties in other respects and high support needs (Wiltshire, 2013; Paravicini, 2013). This claim sustains the next sub-section on conceptualising "need".

**Conceptualising 'need'**

Disability studies conducted during the 1990s and 2000s were critiqued by sociology and disability movements. These movements have impacted education concerning the oppressive attitudes from a deficit perspective, stating that 'disabled' people are not 'disabled' but they have impairment and they are disabled by attitudes of the environment and barriers that exclude them.

The definition of SEN as presented in the 2001 SEN Code of Practice (DfES, 2001) specified the following broad umbrella areas of needs: communication and interaction; cognition and learning; behavioural, emotional, and social difficulties; sensory and physical impairments, and an additional category of medical needs:

"Children have special educational needs if they have a learning difficulty which calls for special educational provision to be made for them. Children have a learning difficulty if they have a significantly greater difficulty in learning than the majority of children of the same age or have a disability' "and... "students with SEN are said to require something 'additional to' or 'different from' that offered to other students" (DfES, 2001, SEN Code of Practice: Session 1, Inclusion—the Individual and the Environment Development and Diversity).

Areas of SEN have been modified recently under the SEND Code of Practice (DfE and Department of Health, 2014), whereby behaviour has been removed and mental health now linked within a category of emotional and social difficulties.

The 2005 Disability Discrimination Act attempted to clarify the distinction between a SEN as impacting on learning, and a disability that impairs long-term on the ability to lead an ordinary life. There is currently a rapidly changing demographic underway and a
new acronym has been proposed: CLDD (Complex Learning Difficulties and Disabilities) (DfE, 2012; Carpenter et al., 2012). This is due to more children surviving medical treatments and premature birth, many with new and rare conditions (at 32 weeks, the survival rate of premature birth is now 96 for every 100 births, of which one third will probably have a disability. At 26 weeks, the survival rate is as high as 87%, Wells et al., 2012). This is relevant to the increased incidence of challenging behaviour in children, with some linked to possible attachment disorder following months in incubators and invasive treatments.

Changing patterns of need also reflect social issues such as the recent recognition of Foetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder as a result of drinking during pregnancy and genetic abnormalities possibly due to pesticides and chemicals in drinking water (Shattock & Whiteley, 2002, 2010). This means that the new generation of children with SEN may have very complex medical conditions. Hence, mainstream classrooms are becoming increasingly diverse, as those with less severe SEN are now included in mainstream schools. This highlights all the more the potential relevance of the need for more holistic intervention in relation to children with SEN in mainstream and specialist contexts.

*Conceptualising inclusion*

There are major differences between the concepts of mainstreaming, integration, and inclusion. Each concept has fundamental assumptions, applied local guidelines, history, and distinguishing points from other concepts. From 1975 until the end of the 20th century, political reform relating to the population of children with SEN engaged in a gradual acknowledgement of this population's right to education within mainstream settings. The mainstreaming model refers to children with minor disabilities who study in mainstream classes, according to their capabilities. The integration model refers to holistic placement of children with SEN in the mainstream but where they may be engaged in activity that is totally separate from their peer group. It mainly relates to the proximity and options of social interaction between children with SEN and their peer group without SEN. This tended to be the case following the 1981 Warnock Education Act in Britain and the growth of the rights movement regarding school placement.
The inclusion concept, on the other hand, advocates that disabled children and those with learning difficulties cooperate and learn together with their peers group at all levels (Sailor, 1991). Inclusion globally is generally regarded as stemming from the United Nations Salamanca Agreement in 1994. Inclusion is the most historically updated model and advocates that all children—both those with and without SEN—should be part of the mainstream education system (Marom et al., 2006). 'Inclusion' is commonly perceived therefore as the co-location of children with SEN learning alongside and with their peers. However, recent legislation (SEND Code of Practice, 2014) has removed the pressure for mainstream inclusion and given parents a choice within a more personalised approach so that the least restrictive environment may be offered to the child according to changing needs of time across a flexible range of provision (Tutt, 2007).

From being used interchangeably with ‘integration’, ‘inclusion’ is now regarded as a multi-dimensional concept that has to do with a participatory culture and ethos of acceptance, as well as processes of differentiation and personalisation (SEND Code of Practice, 2014). It is no longer necessarily about everyone being under the same roof: technological advances and increased staffing levels in schools mean that all children can have the opportunity to spend time out of class, working in small groups or individually with a member of staff.

The National Curriculum in England (DfEE and QCA, 1999) identified three principles by which teachers have to adjust their practice to ensure they enable all their pupils to achieve their potential: adapting learning objectives, varying teaching and learning styles to ensure multi-modal approaches are available, and providing access strategies to enable certain children to overcome specific barriers to learning.

"Inclusion in education involves the processes of increasing the participation of students in and reducing their exclusion from, the cultures, curricula and communities of local schools. Inclusion is concerned with the learning participation of all students vulnerable to exclusionary pressures, not only those with impairments or categorized as SEN. Inclusion is concerned with improving schools for staff as well as for students." (CSIE, 2002, Index for Inclusion: Developing learning and participation in schools, p.286).

The inclusion movement in Israel was developed following the civil rights argument and an act of legal enforcement by parents of disabled children together with professionals, designed to amend and improve education for the disabled population
(IDEA – Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, 1975). The Special Education Act in Israel (1988) gave preference to including disabled children in mainstream educational institutions, examining each case on its own merits. Moreover, it extended the rights of exceptional individuals in several key areas (Marom et al., 2006). The goal (Ministry of Education 1988) was stated as to promote and develop the skills and capabilities of children with SEN, to improve and enhance their physical, cognitive, emotional, and behavioural functioning, provide knowledge, competences, and habits, and teach them a way of conduct that is acceptable in society. This is to facilitate these children's inclusion in society and the workplace and enable personal fulfilment of their potential. According to the Special Education Act (Ministry of Education, 1988) in Israel, the State is responsible for providing free special education to those who need it.

‘Inclusion’ in Israel still tends to be in the sense of viewing school as a place that brings together the entire community—students, families and other community members—providing all their services (educational, health, social, and others) under one roof or in the vicinity of school (Pollard, 2002). This raises key issues regarding the perception of the child with difficulties, potential stigma experienced, and impact on their self-esteem and sense of identity (Pollard, 2002) without an appropriate ethos of acceptance and celebration of difference. The risk is that children are expected to fit in with systems rather than structures changing to fit the child, and teachers ‘coping’ is seen as an indicator of successful inclusion rather than children with SEN being enabled to flourish.

**Partnership**

Tutt (2007) advocates a flexible continuum of provision to recognise children's dynamic changing needs, from residential special schools, part-time residential schools, day special schools, mainstream schools with enhanced additional provision, and fully inclusive mainstream schools. This means that educators working with children with special educational needs (SEN) have to be prepared to work across a range of settings and to liaise with other professionals to meet children's needs.

New legislation in England is placing the parents’ aspirations for the child at the centre of meeting needs (DfE, 2011; DfE and Department of Health, 2014), with involvement
of multi-agency professionals and the family from the outset. This has led to changing models of partnership working, a focus away from the child alone, and diagnosis by expert professionals giving their advice, to a more collaborative and personalised family-focused approach and the empowerment of the child and family within the decision-making process. This is based on Bronfenbrenner's (2001) more ecosystemic view of interacting influences on and of the child across systems and identifying where to target support and intervention.

Lacey and Lomas (1993), and Lacey, P. (1997) explore the changing models of collaborative working in schools to meet the diverse needs of pupils. The current preferred approach advocates collaborative working and a ‘negotiating’ model (Dale, 1996) towards a shared vision between teacher, therapist, and families, as illustrated in the number of government supported Sure Start programmes (ESRC, 2010) implemented in the United Kingdom. These programmes perceive that family support with an emphasis on outreach and community development might give children the best possible start in life.

In Israel, the approach to teacher-parent cooperation underwent a change in the mid-1970s: from seeing the parents as interfering in school to perceiving them as partners. This perception was reinforced in the last two decades due to the enhanced concept that parents have something to say about their children's education. School's failure to deal with various populations, and more severe social problems as well as vandalism and violent incidents have reinforced a perception that no education system is suitable for all learners, and intervention in school life that offers parents an opportunity to manifest personal urges, leadership, power, and prestige (Glick, 2007).

However, Therapy Centres are directed such that art therapists work only with children and not with their parents. This results in a difficulty to realise a systemic perception of working with these children. It inhibits development of programmes based on interactive approaches that involve the family in the acquisition of tools for understanding the children and developing a communication of wellbeing with them as an integral part of their development.

Manor (2009) considers that cooperation between professionals and parents of children with SEN is one of the challenges that researchers and professionals face in the 21st
century. According to Manor (2009), the importance attributed by researchers and professionals to this challenge and their response stems from two reasons. The first is the changed socio-demographic profile of school populations around the globe. The second is the solid empirical foundation of the assumption that cooperation with parents benefits the children, parents, professionals, and the education system.

Moreover, research conducted in this field illustrates that parents' involvement and cooperation provide an empirical basis to the question: How can professionals collaborate with parents of mentally-challenged children from different cultural backgrounds? This is particularly relevant to societies where residents shift from nomadic life to permanent settlements and as a result these societies undergo considerable transformations.

This means focusing on the personal and not only the professional dimension of teachers and attending to emotional aspects of children's and family's narratives.

*Changing professional perceptions on the child with needs – ‘personalisation’*

The field of special educational needs has shifted from a child deficit – medical approach to an environmental social approach; this shift can also be seen in changing perceptions of their families. The 'social model' ascribed families of children with SEN with emotions such as sadness, blame, self-criticism, and suffering due to social stigma (Leff & Vaughn, 1985). This was considered the cause of difficulties in dealing positively and empathetically towards siblings. Moreover, these emotions held risk of alienation within the family using behavioural patterns such as denial and rationalization. The social model based on developmental theories, such as Attachment Theory (Bowlby, 1969), pointed to the possible impact between the development of disabilities and the pattern of relationships with caregivers being the source for the development of social relations patterns (Bartholomew, 1990). Moreover, parents reported feeling isolated due to change in their way of life and the need to take responsibilities as claimed by the social model.

This shift of focus was already underway during the 1980s prior to the Salamanca Conference (1994), which aimed to further the objective of 'education for all' through
the celebration of differences, support for learning and families, and response to individual needs. During the beginning of the 21st century, it shifted further to a radical model (McKee & Witt, 1990; Mitchell, 2010), focusing on the challenges that the structures of society are facing.

The radical model suggests that educational organisations have to develop professional development programmes, so that educators can adapt to the dynamics of rapid change, rather than focus on students and their disabilities (Rodgers and Scott, 2008). The move to 'personalisation' (DfES, 2001) requires structures to flex for the child, not the other way round; it represents an attempt to reconcile tensions between the philosophy of inclusion and the deficit approach to the identification and assessment of SEN. In schools, this equates to a child-centred approach for all pupils, with a focus on target-setting and aspirations, rather than a return to random child-led approaches popular in the 1960s. Whilst in mainstream this may present practical challenges in large classes, the principles of personalisation are intended to be applied to all: children’s rights to respect, self-determination, fostering of relationships, and inclusion.

There is an appreciation of the complexity of factors that impact the child and vice versa, and professionals need to understand how within-child and environmental factors interact in influencing the child (Bronfenbrenner, 2001). It is recognised too that the child is engaged in transactions across spheres in which he or she moves (Kubovi, 1992, 2008). Hence a more transactional approach is taken to understand the child and its interactions across contexts, and consequent impact.

This has led to considerable research concerning the shifts of educational models in relation to learning as well as teaching strategies (Eyre, 1997, 2000; Frederickson & Cline, 2002). Literature has examined the pressures, incentives, and encouragement for individuals and services to develop and adapt their skills, knowledge, ways of working, and organisation (Miller & Watts, 1990). In this context, the current approach to educators' professional development has been based on the acquisition of additional knowledge and intervention strategies (Beane, 1991; Stoehr & Buckey, 1997), administrative functions (Bredeson, 1992; Page, 1994), and organisational climate (Osborne, 1993).
This view is relevant but it risks a possible narrow perception of stakeholders. For example, following their diagnosis of SEN, some children were found to be gifted and intelligent (Eyre, 2000). Assessments by practitioners from different disciplines may use different frameworks and may draw different conclusions. For example, a diagnosis by a health professional according to the traditional medical approach may indicate the child's deficits. Conversely, educators or therapists may focus on pragmatic aspects of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1993) and creativity and emotional engagement, and may discover students' talents and inclinations. The system is required to pay attention to the nature of the diagnosis and identification of need as determined by the way children and their families are perceived.

**Professional Development of the Inclusive Teacher**

Inclusive education imposes wide-ranging responsibilities on educators, since there is a need to consider personal and academic dimensions of the child's SEN to 'cover' a set curriculum (Nind et al., 2003). These responsibilities apply pressure on the educators, especially if they have not been trained in special educational needs. As a result, educators confront challenging situations from their own personal dimension and from social interaction in mainstream classes (Lehohla & Hlalele, 2012).

Working with children with SEN in an education system is in line with an ecosystemic framework, defined as a blend of ecological and system theory views of human interaction between individuals and between different levels of social context (Bronfenbrenner, 1979, 2001; Donald et al., 2010; Kalenga & Fourie, 2011). This framework enables the understanding of the individual child's person-environment relationship and the theoretical perspectives that support it. Lehohla and Hlalele (2012) stipulate that inclusive education is a move away from segregated education that encouraged separate relations between people with and without disabilities. Inclusive education encourages widening the perception beyond the limitations of the disability and concentrating instead on who that person is and what they can do.

In this light, in England, the SEND Code of Practice (DfE and Department of Health, 2014), contains concepts referring to the personal dimension of learners and are highlighted as *views, wishes and feelings of the child, family participation in decisions*.
choice and control and collaboration. However, as Morewood (2014) states, under this new framework introduced in September 2014 (Axcis Education Recruitment on June 27, 2014), fewer pupils fulfil the criteria for additional support. This raises a key issue regarding how teachers can be prepared to take responsibility for meeting the needs of all their pupils—including the majority with SEN that now fall under one general category of ‘SEN Support’.

2.2.2. Interactive Teacher of Children with SEN

Interactive models of curriculum and pedagogy were developed in England in the context of the National Curriculum in the UK following the Education Act (1988) and attempted to respectfully empower children through active learning situations, as well as providing social and communicative contexts, whereby they were entrusted with responsibility and their metacognition promoted (Collis & Lacey, 1996). These approaches were a counter-response to the medical model and behaviourist approaches prevalent during the 1980s in special education. Developers of interactive approaches maintained that professionals should learn to understand when, where, and how to apply interactive competences and not merely children to acquire them.

Researchers (Smith, 1987; Jeffs & Smith, 1990; Lacey, H., 1996) concurred that issues such as assessment, record-keeping, curriculum, and teaching approaches might benefit from the interactive approach as it focuses on the process that learners undergo rather than only on their products (Smith, 1987; Jeffs & Smith, 1990). Consequently, they suggested focusing on a combination of facilitating support and problem-solving competences for which pupils gain intrinsic rather than extrinsic rewards such as food or stickers as in behavioural approaches (Deci et al., 1999). Moreover, these researchers agreed that children need an interactive environment that encourages inner capabilities and where people talk, listen, and encourage any attempt made by the children to communicate.

An important component to the interactive approach is that teaching takes place in a positive rather than judgmental experience of good/bad. Interactive teaching underscores the need for adapting the teaching to children’s development, while balancing between knowledge inculcation objectives and the challenging experience
embodied in learning (Bruner, 1996). Pedagogy based on interaction and a relationship approach to professional development in SEN, both focus on the role and impact of the relationship between educators and learners on the latter's development. This approach stems from psychological developmental and learning theories, which highlight the role of emotions in relationships (Bowlby, 1969; Winnicott, 1971; Vygotsky, 1997; Aloni, 2005). This approach was innovative in special education as it changed the focus from the child as 'disabled' to the emotional aspects within the relationship between educators and learners.

In contrast, a more recent Interactive Learning (Buehl, 2013) approach aims at delivering practical, research-based strategies in the context of today’s classrooms. Buehl (2013) focuses on the instructional shifts taking place to tap into students’ background, build new knowledge, and teach through a disciplinary lens. According to this research approach, today’s technology-rich environments impact education processes by reducing the focus on teacher-student relationship within the learning processes. Hence, ‘interactive learning’ based on current day technology presents activities such as conversation and role-playing group exercises in class through technology and not on interactive dialogue between educator and learners.

This ‘interactive learning’ approach based on technology nevertheless highlights learning aspects such the development of analytic reasoning and learning how to make decisions. It also encourages parents to communicate with children via asking open-ended questions along with online learning games and activities as additions to school learning. Though modern ‘interactive learning’ advocates children’s collaboration in groups, it still focuses on the professional dimension between educator and learners, and not on the personal dimension of the teaching context.

One particularly seminal approach for working with children with SEN, especially those with severe and profound multiple learning difficulties, remains Intensive Interaction (Nind & Hewett, 1994), which is process-based learning (Collis & Lacey, 1996; Nind & Hewett, 2001; Hewett, 2006; Imray et al., 2010). According to this approach, it is not the outcome of the task that is important, but the interactive process driving the task that is the focus, aiming at celebrating learners’ behaviour and looking for communication moments as a basis for interaction and teaching.
Intensive Interaction sees any movement or sound as a form of communication and an opportunity to establish contact with another individual. Consequently, a mutually enriching and supportive relationship develops. It is very important as a way of understanding behaviour that has traditionally been understood as “challenging”. Intensive interaction has gradually become popular amongst people working with those with complex disabilities. Numerous studies have examined the different intensive interaction techniques and their use in the UK (Firth, 2006; Zeedyk, 2008; Nind, 2009; Rhodes & Hewett, 2010; Firth et al., 2010).

Research findings (Graham, 2006) indicate effectiveness from small group studies of children with complex disabilities, learning disabilities and autism, dementia and trauma. Nevertheless concerning professional training, it seems that this approach might teach some of the basics, but professionals struggle to use the whole range of approaches and it gets mixed results from the people who receive the services. It is possible that this is an approach that is best carried out by people who are very committed to using it. This might sustain the research claim that the personal dimension should be an integral part of professional development, especially with inclusion of learners with special needs.

Graham (2006) reviewed studies and practice that have been published in a generally recognised academic journal of Intensive Interaction, indicating increased social responses of people with severe, profound, and multiple learning disabilities. In this light, Graham (2006) calls for further systematic research to enhance the evidential base of the approach since evidence is still limited in its generalisability due to the methodologies employed (small scale or single case studies without experimental controls and by advocates of the approach, generally from an explicitly educational clinical psychologist’s perspective).

The role of professionals as ‘respondent’ rather than ‘initiator’ of social interactions might raise tensions between the perception as a provider and the learner as a partner and decision-maker. According to Nind & Powell (1999), this interaction is a way of operating rather than content that should be delivered. The professionals’ role is to enhance the communicative potential of learners through rich interpretation. The difference between conventional interventions focusing on assessing learners against a checklist or curriculum is that Intensive Interaction is based on learners’ strengths and
thus, whilst conventional teaching focuses on the role of the teacher or therapist and is based on predicted outcome, Intensive Interaction professionals are not dominant: rather, interaction is based on mutuality and reciprocity.

Lacey, H. (1996) stipulated that interactive teaching starts with the professionals’ experiential acquaintance with the learners by means of virtual games that learners seem to prefer. Later on, while focusing on empowering learners more in the activity, the professionals’ role is to modify children’s reactions, adding elements of expressive communication such as facial expressions and sounds, while demonstrating attention that invites children to be active. The professionals' reaction to the children includes expression of the professionals' thoughts, emotions, and intentions, so that in fact all their activity is meant to contain communicative messages to the children.

This approach is based on areas of psychology focused on early caregiver-infant interaction. Like the 'Lovecircles' approach, it integrates the professional and personal dimensions of both professionals and pupils. [See Appendix 16: Collis and Lacey, p. 47.] The principles of interactive approaches are that learning is dependent on interpersonal relationships that foster respect and negotiation as well as participation, motivation, and sensitivity to learners. Nind and Hewett (1988) framed the principles of interactive teaching by perceiving learners as active and learning as an activity that is intrinsically rewarding and motivating. Learners, according to this approach, share control of the activity together with teachers.

Lacey, H. (1996) emphasised that in order to teach in an interactive way, teachers need training that differs from education focused on delivery of knowledge. Pre-service teachers need to learn about their own self and that of others, as well as assimilate the meaning of their impact on others and their development. Professional development programmes in Intensive Interaction focus on flexibility and awareness of ways in which learners can put into practice and, thus, develop interactions (Lacey, H., 1996). However, this approach still focuses on learners and not on the professional’s personal dimension, such as the variety of emotions accompanying this kind of extreme sensitive attunement to an individual.

A combination of intelligent reflection and intuitive processes suggests that professionals adopt a whole interaction that is both facilitating and that develops
problem-solving competences. Interactive approaches, which have their roots in cognitive and developmental psychology, highlight the development of learning and abstract thinking that originates in an active sensory motor base (Piaget, 1983). The interactive approach in teaching combines this knowledge with an approach that encourages the playfulness of professionals in their interactions with children. For example, Peter and Walter (2010) introduced movement experiences and relationship play based on the work of Veronica Sherborne (1990) as an inclusive pedagogy with Early Years trainee teachers in a comparative study in England and Israel, as a vehicle for developing their ability to engage in child-led learning and to attune to others. Hence, the interactive approach puts an emphasis on the process and not only on the outcome.

Herein resides a similarity to the fields of therapy that establish contact with children through play and art to enhance their development. According to Chesner (1995), there are core therapeutic principles that can be safely used by educators without specific training in therapy (see Appendix 18, Figure A.1, p. 51). These include: a) patience change is possible, needs time; b) trust 'being there', reliable; c) space – cosy contained place or freedom outside; d) containment – security from structure; e) boundaries of doing and being – balance of demands and space; f) shared language – regard through interaction; g) timing – sensitivity over a new departure (Chesner, 1995).

Therapeutic principles for the classroom include attuning to a child's level of development and needs—cognitive and emotional—using a multi-sensory approach in teaching, for example, visual, kinaesthetic and body language, combining integration of imagery and action into the language in order to express oneself and communicate (Chesner, 1995). Other researchers (Mahoney & Wheeden, 1999), observing through the lens of constructivist educational practices, found that teachers' affective involvement impacts positively on children's attention and initiations. It indicates the potential value of an interactive teaching approach being responsive to their individual interests and capabilities (Sherratt and Peter, 2002).

The conclusion derived from this section implies that integrating therapeutic aspects in teacher education programmes may lead towards an inclusive and participatory approach by practitioners towards children with SEN.
2.2.3. Empowerment as an Issue for Inclusion

*Voice of the Child with SEN*

Inclusion raises problematic discussion within different sectors in education. From the viewpoint of children's rights, participation of children should be a key issue when evaluating inclusion models (Te One, 2007). This approach points to a possible risk that participation is prescribed by adults, such as educators, without perceiving children as autonomous and, therefore, listening to their voice:

"You need to want to listen in the first place and no amount of bullet points will help you if you don't have a culture of listening" (Moss, 2006, p. 30).

Hence, listening to children's personal dimension is dominant for the enhancement of a participatory and inclusive teaching approach. This is further sustained by Freire's (1985, 1986, 1995) call for deepening awareness of the role of citizens in democratic society.


*Voice of the Educator*

Theorists and researchers from the fields of sociology and social anthropology critiqued child development and family studies' paradigms, particularly within the UK. Critics claim that these paradigms are based on a traditional approach, perceiving children as
passive and dependent (Mayall, 2002) instead of active, autonomous, and having their own voice (Tisdall & Bell, 2006; Percy-Smith & Thomas, 2010). Furthermore, criticism is voiced against the use of terms such as children's welfare and protection (Wells, 2009), as mantras aiming to promote global childhood perception (Pupavac, 2000; Bentley, 2005; Wells 2009).

Another criticism against understanding inclusion in the light of developmental psychology (Piaget, 1969; Vygotsky, 1993) is its universal construct that tends to focus on one dimension such as cognitive development and a 'stages' paradigm. This universal perception lacks other significant aspects from the humanistic lens, such as relationships, and ecological and cultural theoretical perspectives.

The complexity of the teaching process is recognised in more recent studies. For example, a guideline presented by Parker-Jenkins et al., (2007) for teachers’ strategies integrates professional dimension aspects (explaining, instruction, content cognitively) with personal dimension aspects such as learners’ encouragement, developing self – confidence, challenging activities, free choice, self-expression of their voice, as well as promoting family role with the learning process. This approach focuses on the impact of teachers constructing a supportive environment for learning. Moreover, as Parker-Jenkins et al., (2007) recognise, "… the teacher today has to respond to the concept of diversity in its widest sense…” (p. 1); hence, developing the integration of personal and professional dimension of an educator in order for him or her to perceive the learner in its widest sense. There has to be greater focus on the impact on children's educational learning of teachers’ personal and professional development (Hewitt, 2008).

**Evaluating Empowerment**

The above discussion has served as the framework for formulating the research questions aiming at understanding the implications of listening to the child's voice within professional development programmes. Inclusion of children's perspectives in academic discourses has become a problematic key issue (Ruddick, 2007; Holt, 2011; Tisdall & Punch, 2012) regarding the complexities and ambiguities of applying theoretical ideas in practice (Vanderbeck, 2007), particularly when social realities are complex and contradictory.
Children's rights are now central to all fields of professional practice with children. Leading researchers (Jones & Walker, 2010) aim at enhancing a professional view of inclusion, based on children's rights. Moreover, they aim to bridge the gap between policy and practice with children by including the fields of education, health, social care, and welfare. Thus, the search for valid evaluation of inclusive programmes confronts the research discipline with methodological issues as well. Debatable issues, which have been raised in the UK, include the choice of participants—children or adults (Punch, 2002a; Lewis et al., 2004; Christensen & James, 2008; Tisdall et al., 2009); ethical issues (Thomas & O’Kane, 1998; Alderson & Morrow, 2011); innovative methods and tools (Punch, 2002b, 2007; Van Blerk & Kesby, 2007; Thomson, 2009); and the role of participants in the research process (Kirby et al., 2003; Ennew et al., 2009; Gallagher, 2009; Tisdall et al., 2009).

An 'ethics of care' emerging from feminist critiques (Gilligan, 1982; Arneil, 2002), highlights responsibility and relationships for moral development, rather than rights and rules. These dilemmas raise an important question concerning the possible contribution of research from an adult perspective.

### 2.2.4. Conclusion

The traditional approach to professional development is grounded in academic knowledge in teaching as well as in systematic pedagogical knowledge, and is based on acquaintance with various educational and social theories (Laczko-Kerr & Berliner, 2002; Hoffman & Niederland, 2010). An alternative approach to professional development (Evans, 2010) is a more humanistic alternative approach (Furlong and Oancea, 2005; Webb et al., 2004), emphasising additional aspects; for example, collaboration, support, and shared experiences, as dominant elements (Cohen-Vogel & Smith, 2007; Hoffman & Niederland, 2010).

These two contrasting perceptions of teaching underpin the essential debate about the figure of a 'good' or 'worthy' educator (Korthagen, 2005) and reflects the central theme of this study. Hence, shifting the focus from teaching of knowledge and teaching strategies to the educators themselves and their professional development is a more extensive concept of the role of educators. It concentrates on educators' personal growth.
as the basis and leverage for their professional development, especially contributing to their work with children with SEN included in mainstream schools and their empowerment.

Focusing on educators' personal growth results from an extended perception of their professional role as promoting, supporting, and assisting students' overall development. This concept brought about research into and development of education curricula through inquiry of the self, experimental and experiential learning, and integration of emotional awareness to improve the educator’s overall development as a person (Korthagen, 2005). However, the emphasis has been on the professional development 'outer layers of the onion model' (Korthagen, 2005), while the role of personal dimensions 'the inner layers' was almost dismissed. This study stipulates that both dimensions should be perceived as interrelated, as Hoekstra & Korthagen (2011) state:

...it is pivotal to consider all aspects of educators as whole human beings, in whom cognitive, behavioural, emotional and motivational aspects are interwoven in their teaching and learning practices…. should not separate the personal from the professional (p. 89).

### 2.3. Arts as Intervention

Art is a natural and primal tool through which people can express their individuality and uniqueness (Marcuse, 1978). Art allows the expression of emotions and thoughts (Langer, 1953) and critical scepticism through the use of artistic tools such as configuration of signs and shape. Moreover, this expression via art leads towards becoming personally connected, opening windows of communication, and emotional identification with others. For those who have special educational needs (SEN), the Arts create a space for development (Ling, 2000; Smith, 2001), whether the context happens to be within therapy or education. The reason is that these two fields consider people's personal dimension as the basis for their growth.
2.3.1. Arts in Education

Studies based on the contribution of art to children’s holistic development claim its relevance to professional development, especially within the field of SEN (Craft et al., 2008; Peter & Walter, 2010) by highlighting the significance of emotion for cognition and learning. Findings from neuroscience (Iverson, 1996) propose that emotionally coloured experiences are more readily etched in the memory, through integrated processing of emotionally charged activity, unlike the disconnected experiences of those with autism, where brain functioning impairs evaluation of feelings (Damasio, 2004). Bruner (1986) highlighted the importance of analytical and paradigmatic thinking and that education systems should be promoting both logical types of activity and also narrative, holistic activity as in creativity.

Integrating the Arts in schools (Flowers, 1998; Gould, 2000; Schramm, 2002), through collaboration with art teachers and specialists (Tunks, 1997; Burnaford et al., 2001), has been shown to bring multifaceted rewards. For example, increasing creativity and higher-order thinking skills in students (Burnaford et al., 2001; Brown, 2007); higher levels of student interest and motivation (Flowers, 1998; Burnaford et al., 2001; Schramm, 2002; Brown, 2007); higher academic achievement and standardised test scores (Tunks, 1997; Gould, 2000; Burnaford et al., 2001) and greater levels of community involvement (Gould, 2000; Burnaford et al., 2001).

This approach is in line with Dewey's (1934) belief that having an experience such as art leads to curiosity and inquiry. Influenced by Dewey (1934), Eisner (2004) stressed the importance of creating conditions for students to have experiences in the classroom. In addition, Witkin's (1974) work relates to knowing through the senses and to ‘aesthetic learning’ as to do with sensate knowledge through direct experience.

In developmental psychology (Eyiah, 2004), it has been found that art as a subject can cater for all types of knowledge and is central to life. Art helps people manage personal resources to achieve optimum satisfaction and fulfilment (Maslow, 1968). Moreover, art, music, dance, and drama help people to form their own opinions, applying aesthetic ideas to their own situation. Thus, they may become self-reliant economically, socially, philosophically, and culturally (Eyiah, 2004). Art promotes creativity through its interdisciplinary approach to learners' development (Alexenberg, 2010).
Gardner's (1983) theory focused on alternative ways of thinking, leading to a broad vision of education as it involves opting for depth over breadth. According to Gardner (1983), people who create art apply their multiple intelligences: manual skills, physical intelligence, intelligence of their heart, competency of thinking, and literacy; which, in turn, enhance the informed experience (McNiff, 1993; Peter, 1995; Elliott, 1998; Robinson, 2006, 2010; Craft et al., 2008).

Gardner (1999) maintained that effective arts education presupposes two conditions: a mind/brain that is capable of mastering the Arts, and a supportive environment. His theory of Multiple Intelligences (MI), although contested, provides a common-sense basis for education in the Arts. According to this theory, all human beings possess a number of intellectual potentials. Schools have generally addressed the linguistic and logical intelligences, but other institutions and situations can encourage the nurturance of at least six other intelligences: spatial, musical, naturalistic, interpersonal, intrapersonal, and bodily-kinaesthetic.

The majority of recent cognitive psychology, cognitive neuroscience, and evolutionary psychology research programmes on human mental abilities have focused on three core explanatory paradigms for human cognition (Waterhouse, 2006). These are general intelligence, multiple information processing systems, and adapted cognition modules. These quasi-theories of the brain are significant for the learning process as they guide the practice of teaching, integrating all dimensions of the learner. Waterhouse (2006) claims that three theories—Multiple Intelligences (MI) theory (Gardner, 1983), the Mozart Effect (ME) theory (Rauscher et al., 1993), and Emotional Intelligence (EI) theory (Salovey & Mayer, 1990)—have impacted the education field but generated serious problems as they lack empirical evidence support. MI theory has no validating data, the ME theory has more negative than positive findings (Waterhouse, 2006), and EI theory lacks a unitary empirically supported construct (Waterhouse, 2006). This is in contrast to cognitive psychology and cognitive neuroscience that have better empirical support.

The claim concerning the lack of empirical evidence support of MI theory is defended by Chen (2004) stating that “intelligence is not a tangible object that can be measured” (p. 22). She suggests that the novelty of these intelligences requires new measures and that MI theory has already been validated through its successful classroom application.
Chen (2004) further claimed that MI theory better accounts for cognitive skill profiles in both brain-injured and typical individuals than do IQ measures. Both Chen (2004) and Gardner (2004) hold that evaluating the positive outcomes of applying the MI theory in a range of educational settings can be viewed as empirical support. According to Waterhouse (2006), none of Chen’s five arguments can serve to exempt MI theory from the need for validating empirical data lack of empirical evidence for MI Theory.

However, nothing in the Kuhn vs. Popper debate (Fuller, 2004) suggested that theories should be tested by experimental methods. Although Gardner (2004) admitted that “it is important to identify defining features” (p. 214), he stated that he has not proposed testable components for the intelligences because his “basic paradigm clashes with that of psychometrics” (p. 214). Without defined components the intelligences cannot be tested for validity (Allix, 2000; Fuller, 2004).

Gardner claims that “it is difficult to specify how multiple intelligences work synergistically on complex tasks” (Gardner & Connell, 2000, p. 292) and concluded that EI could successfully be measured by self-report scales.

According to Gardner (1999), each intelligence can be mobilized for the Arts. Moreover, Gardner argues that the Arts should be framed as motivational, and as a way of learning a variety of disciplines, "Parts of the brain are dedicated to the Arts, and it's a shame not to develop these parts," (Hildebrand, 2004, p. 59). Therefore Gardner calls for a broader vision of education, as an environment that stimulates creativity within both personal and professional dimensions of learners (Waterhouse, 2006).

Art integrates learners’ perception of experience contrary to the linear logical thinking defined by narrow boundaries, leading towards a united image of experience by connecting its varieties. Hence, art may create a dialogue between outer expression and inner feelings and the internal mind/body dichotomy (Bruner, 1963). The developmental process within personality through art and creativity is inspired by cognitive psychology, personality, and developmental theories (Vygotsky, 1997; Steiner, 2003).

In the second half of the 20th century, the shift towards a child-centred pedagogical and curricular approach paved the way for embedding art and creativity within educational pedagogy (U.S.A. National Curriculum, 1989, 1999; Salant, 2008-2012). The fact that
the Arts are not included in educational policy reflects governments' more recent concerns with global economic functioning and preparation of the workforce with skills in numeracy, literacy, and computing. Hence, the Arts are not seen as a priority in initial teacher education nor in continuing professional development of in-service teachers. However, there is a need for creative, flexible, life-long thinkers who can be problem-solvers, negotiators, and adaptable within fast-changing systems, as demonstrated in NACCCE 'All our Futures Report' (DfEE, 1999) and Craft's view on 'possibility thinking' and the importance of creativity (Craft et al., 2008).

Peter (1998) raises the question whether Leonardo was an artist or a scientist, arguing that one cannot distinguish between art and science, particularly with the development of culture and technology. According to her, art includes an option of integrating pupils’ knowledge, skills, and comprehension of themselves and of their unique forms of expression. In fact, art allows practice and combinations of meanings and interpretations and encourages attention to oneself and to others. Creating the inner experience – thought and emotions – provides a tool that embodies the inner experience, forming it so that it creates a bridge to the communication between oneself and others as well as empathy for others (Rosenblum, 2010).

Art is a natural means of self-expression, and so there is an argument for increasing the awareness of the contribution of the Arts to pupils with and without special educational needs (SEN). Research findings indicate the significant role and contribution of non-verbal modalities for working with children with SEN. These findings highlight the impact of play, drama, and movement (Sherratt & Peter, 2002; Peter, 2003; Peter and Walter, 2010) and art (Knill et al., 2005; Moon, 2007; Atkins & Williams, 2007; McNiff, 2009) as enhancing communication, social interaction, imagination, creativity, and flexible thinking. According to Carter (1991), Peter (2003), and Park (2010), this creative combination of non-verbal and verbal channels of communication is significant for children with SEN as a tool for building their social competence and social understanding.

Using the creative arts in teaching in higher education can engage and empower individuals who learn in different ways (Gardner, 1983), and who may have been excluded from traditional forms of learning that value cognitive and verbal means of learning and assessment (Simons & Hicks, 2006). Evaluation of a creative arts module
in higher education (Simons & Hicks, 2006) using drama, movement, music, and visual art as teaching methods, indicates its positive influence on students' learning. Therefore, Simons and Hicks (2006) argue that, given the current emphasis on inclusive education, an opportunity exists to use the creative arts as a bridge to facilitate inclusion and open doors to those previously disenfranchised in the education system.

Dunn-Snow & D'Amelio (2000) suggest four ways by which educators can enhance the therapeutic aspects of their lessons through the use of art: (1) recognise the similarities between the therapeutic and creative processes; (2) empathetically talk with students about their artwork; (3) understand the Expressive Therapies Continuum (ETC); and (4) work in collaboration with faculty and staff members.

2.3.2. Arts in Therapy

The Arts used in therapy involve expressing emotions and thoughts via the creative process of producing arts to improve a person's physical, mental, and emotional well-being. Art therapy enables both release and containment of feelings by helping to create order out of chaos (Naumberg, 1950, 1966). Use of the Arts in healing does not contradict the medical view of children with SEN in bringing emotional, somatic, artistic, and spiritual dimensions to learning. Rather, it complements the biomedical view by focusing on not only sickness and symptoms themselves but the holistic nature of the person.

Stuckey and Nobel (2010) advocate that creative engagement contributes to many aspects of physiological and psychological conditions typically associated with improved health status. When people are invited to work with creative and artistic processes that affect more than their identity with illness, they are more able to "create congruence between their affective states and their conceptual sense-making" (p.53). Through creativity and imagination, one may find identity and one's own reservoir of healing. Therefore by enhancing the understanding of the relationship between creative expression and healing, the more the healing power of the Arts will be discovered.

The field of art therapy in the US has developed two concepts: a) art psychotherapy and b) art as therapy. Both concepts have guided the definition of the profession for the past
40 years. The concept "art as therapy" refers to art-making as therapeutic and the creative process leading to development. Art as therapy has goals and objectives that resemble art education; for example, in relation to children with SEN. Hence, it raises issues concerning the difference between art as education and art as therapy.

**Expressive Art Therapy**

Throughout history, humankind has exposed personal expression in ways that were not experienced by dialogue alone such as visual expression, which has been found as having healing power as well (McNiff, 1981, 1992). For example, the first cave drawings of hunting; the Egyptians' encouragement to engage in artistic activity (Fleshman & Fryrear, 1981); the Greeks' performance of drama and music (Gladding, 1992); and the healing music of King Saul in the Bible. This primal modality of expression evolved into a licensed profession: the Expressive Art therapist. In this light, Malchiodi (2013) refers to the integrative, healing power of the Arts in the 21st century, especially in a world that is overwhelmed by hi-tech.

Art therapy emerged as a profession around the 1940s and uses the creative process of art making to improve and enhance the physical, mental, and emotional well-being of individuals of all ages. The Expressive Therapy field is defined as the use of different modalities of expressions such as art, music, dance/movement, drama, poetry/creative writing, play, and sand tray for psychotherapy, counselling, rehabilitation, and health care and educational settings (Malchiodi, 2005).

These definitions change by different groups describing identifying themselves either based on a theory or the particular context of their practice (Jones, 2005). For instance, in Europe, Waller (2006) discussed the changes in definitions of art therapy, and in the United Kingdom, Karkou & Sanderson (2006) noted the change in definitions over the years.

These changes reflect the professionals' debate regarding the question of whether art therapy is a form of psychotherapy or an artistic modality (Karkou & Sanderson, 2006). Comparisons within the art therapy domain (Karkou & Sanderson, 2006) reveal that while art therapists tend to emphasize psychological and psychodynamic theories, much
like music, dance, and movement therapists, the orientation of those who deal with drama therapy is more humanistic and places more emphasis on artistic/creative practices. All art therapies are characterised by an eclectic/integrative approach.

The National Coalition of Creative Arts Therapies Associations (NCCATA, 2013) considered theses modalities as 'creative arts therapies'. The British Association of Art Therapists (BAAT, 2014) defines art therapy as the use of art materials for self-expression and reaction aiming at personal development via art in a safe and containing environment. The American Art Therapy Association (AATA, 2005), highlights the belief that the creative process involved in artistic self-expression enhances the development of intra-and interpersonal skills and increases awareness of the self and others, leading towards self-actualisation in all life spheres.

**Art as Psychotherapy**

Expressive Art Therapists working within education contexts aim at helping students express and contain their internal conflicts, while facilitating their ability to implement change (Frostig & Essex, 1998). Moreover, therapists contribute to counselling staff as well as parents, establishing treatment goals and objectives for both individuals and groups that are appropriate within a school system. Art therapy in schools focuses on working through and overcoming emotional barriers to learning for students who have learning disabilities, behaviour disorders, emotional disturbances, or physical disabilities. Art therapists contribute to learners who require further assistance than that which can be provided by a teacher in a large classroom setting. Children may have been rejected by their peers and may suffer secondary symptoms of low self-esteem, depression, or acting-out behaviours as a result of a primary learning disorder; even if they are taken out for 'special treatment' as they may experience stigma through being perceived as different.

The inclusion of Expressive Art Therapies in the school system is slowly increasing in Israel due to the Education Act in 1983, as it has become necessary to meet the rising needs of students. Questions related to trauma might be more present in Israel than in the U.K. due to the tension of the Middle East political unrest. Art therapy has been found (Lerner & Berger, 2009) by NATAL (Israel Trauma Centre for Victims of Terror...
and War) as assisting children to communicate and process traumatic experiences. Similarly, other researchers (Eaton et al., 2007) indicate the efficacy of art therapy as a method for treating traumatised children.

The main benefit of therapy sessions taking place at school, beyond the advantage of availability and accessibility, resides in the communication with the school staff and the possibility of working in a systemic and focused way that improves the child’s functioning as a pupil. Moreover, therapy carried out at school is more available and accessible and incurs low economic expenses. It is usually given to children and their parents free-of-charge, and is conducted in the children’s natural environment. This entails lesser stigma about the children and their parents so that psychopathology is perceived on the continuum of norms. The environment is known to the children and so helps establish the trust that is required for the therapeutic relationship (SHEFI – Educational-Psychological Service, 2014).

This has raised a few problematic issues in Israel (Keil, 2013) as well as in the U.K. (Carpenter et al., 2012). For example the growing concern that funded professional provision for learners' disabilities (such as visual impairment) is in fact in decline, due to the global economic recession. While the role of these therapies may be valued, the reality is that schools cannot afford any additional staff. Thus, it is all the more important to equip teachers with therapeutic strategies that they can incorporate into their teaching.

**Arts as Therapy**

In the United States, Margaret Naumburg and Edith Kramer pioneered the Arts as therapy. Unlike Hill (2006), Naumburg pursued the notion of using art and aspects of image-making (Frostig & Essex, 1998; Malchiodi, 2007) to release the unconscious via free association, leading to interpretation and analysis of the artistic creation. This interpretative and analytical approach impacted the development of my own clinical work, leading to an understanding of the similarities but more precisely the differences and limitations between the role of art in therapy and education.
Cognitive processes and their measurement, along with emotional aspects such as positive creative imagery, have long been the interest of the Expressive Therapy field (Moreno, 1923; Goodenough, 1926; Vick, 2003). Observation methods for understanding psychosocial aspects of development were originally conceived by sand tray and play therapists (Lowenfeld, 2013). Therefore, the Expressive Therapy field won recognition in the 1930s and 1940s as non-verbal methods, both in itself and as an addition to other existing modalities for self-expression and overcoming cognitive and emotional barriers for improving overall quality of life and wellness (Malchiodi, 2005; Dokter, 2011).

Findings indicate that Expressive Art therapy techniques make a significant contribution to successful inclusion of children with SEN. Researchers in Israel (Freilich & Shechtman, 2010) indicate the contribution of art therapy to the adjustment of children with learning disabilities in academic attainments by focusing on emotional exploration and development of their insight. This was in contrast to other interventions that focused only on improved learning aims. Other research findings in the U.K. (Lu et al., 2010) illustrate that using modalities such as sand play with children with autism spectrum disorders can be a complementary approach to behaviour/social skills-based interventions for successful inclusion of children with SEN, leading to increased verbal expression, enhanced social interaction, and increased symbolic spontaneous play, all essential skills for learning.

The professional role of the art therapist is supportive; witnessing and building relationships and setting a safety net that can contribute to the role of educator especially those working with children with SEN; for example, the contribution to developing relationships (Stonach-Buschel, 1990; Ulman, 1992; Osborne, 2003; Walker & Shaffer, 2007) between learner and educator/therapist. There are other examples of integrating expressive and creative programmes within formal academic programmes, highlighting the contribution to learners' enrichment and skill development (Edens & Potter, 2007) through specific classroom projects (Schramm, 2002) or full arts-integrated curricula in schools (Burnaford et al., 2001).

Aside from the cost of more elaborate technology, arts-based therapies can be an affordable alternative to more traditional therapies. Though certainly appropriate for individual use, Expressive Arts therapies can be very group-oriented by nature. Clients
may learn vicariously from one another, while the cost is kept lower by fitting several people with similar issues into a single time slot (White, 2008).

Definitions from the field of therapy lead to a distinction that sets a clear boundary between teachers/therapists who use art in their work. During their training, Expressive Art Therapists acquire tools and a licence in the field of developmental psychology, personality, and psychopathology as well as practical, clinical, and empirical psychotherapeutic tools of treatment and rehabilitation. Conversely, teachers themselves are supposed to expand their educational and practical perception, as they receive limited input on this during their training. According to this perception, teachers should be aware that emotions are an integral part of the teaching and learning process and that art is another channel – non-verbal – which enables self-expression and in particular helps in overcoming inhibitions and learning difficulties.

The Expressive Art Therapy field highlights the role of emotions and its integration with cognitive aspects of development. It therefore sustains this study’s integrative approach to personal and professional development by using a variety of channels of expression within a humanistic setting.

2.3.3. Working Therapeutically Using the Arts

In England, Hill (2006), one of the pioneers in the field, advocated that the art therapist role should hold a non-interventionist position, encouraging creation of art for self-expression and sharing rather than for professional psychological interpretation. Consequently, art therapy should be an integral part of the health and educational agenda, such as within professional development programmes in education.

In the early 21st century, the education field started recognising the potential of art for development and learning. This gave the Expressive Arts Therapy field a significant role as methods of evaluation, communication, and assessment and for ascribing developmental, emotional, and cognitive status. Thus, this role paved the way for embedding art in therapy not just in health organisations (hospitals, clinics, and rehabilitation centres) but also in educational settings as well (schools and creative
hobbies activities). As a consequence, it became necessary to develop professional training programmes for each of those settings.

The need to train professionals in health and educational settings raised questions frequently asked about the similarities and differences between the role and meaning of art in therapy and art in education fields. These questions challenged other aspects, such as what should be the definition and limitations of the role of art therapist and art teacher? Both art as therapy and art in education fields aim at achieving effective change and outcomes within a person's life. 'Art psychotherapy' focuses on emotional expression via art, used within mental health counselling, social work, psychotherapy, and family therapy, and requires an additional license within the context of each country. Art education focuses on acquiring knowledge about art such as aesthetics and technical skills.

Peter (1999) maintains that art should be accessible to all children in order to develop their trust and competences. Thus, education in art will contribute and complement the field of therapy. Peter (1999) believes that the debate between the two fields facilitates understanding of each field, its paradigm, and principles. Accordingly, competences – ways and tools – can be developed for each of the professionals in a way that will lead to wholeness and uniformity of both the fields.

In the field of education, art is an area of knowledge and in therapy it is the tool that leads to the professional-client relationship and the means by which the development process occurs (Peter, 1999).

The approach of the 'whole curriculum' beyond the National Curriculum is designed to promote pupils' overall development. Pupils' individual needs tend to focus on academic objectives in the school context. Art provides numerous opportunities for promoting personal and academic goals. It constitutes a bridge between the personal and academic dimension. The agenda of art therapists is establishing a relationship with patients to overcome barriers to their academic difficulties, whilst art teachers aim to provide pupils with knowledge, and competences in the expression and understanding of art.

However, Peter (1999) argues that both therapists and teachers have an identical commitment to offer experiences of art that do not cross physical boundaries or loss of emotional or personal control, and to help children find order and give form to ideas and
feelings – in some cases out of chaos. There is, however, an additional factor that is overlapping. Therapists focus on empowering patients and so do teachers, by adopting therapeutic principles (Chesner, 1995); for example, issues such as developing trust with the child, respect, tolerance for their individual pace, and sensitivity for planning work stages. Prokofiev (1994) stipulates that both fields are therapeutic since they acknowledge the creative process that may facilitate release of tension and/or containment of emotions and celebration of the individual. Similarly, Collis & Lacey (1996), claim that art in education generates interactive processes, unlike teaching according to the behavioural approach, which historically has been prevalent in special education.

The integration of experiential teaching and learning with expressive and creative therapy – using the Arts – in the field of professional development in education may contribute to the development of teachers' more extensive approach to themselves and their learners. These two fields consider people's personal dimension as the basis for their development. Consequently, they can enrich professional training in education by combining and uniting the personal and professional dimensions.

2.3.4. Arts in Professional Development Programmes

The reduced place of art in teacher education stems from a lack of regard for its potential contribution as a tool and means for teachers' personal development and not merely as a strategic tool for teaching or as an aspect of children's holistic development. Its reduced place is also due to pressures from nations’ standing in international league tables, which focus prominently on academic attainment in mathematics and literacy. Therefore art is not perceived as essential for trainees’ professional development.

In this light, considering the importance of both the cognitive and emotional dimensions (Freshwater & Stickley, 2004) over the last two decades, it has generated interest both at a social and professional level. However, the juncture of science and art is a challenging idea (Battista et al., 1995) since the field of health and therapy is often conceived as science. Therefore it prompts a more 'deficit approach', which relates to children with SEN from the medical aspect and directs professionals to amend what is 'wrong'.
Concurrent developments in the health professions are based on paradigms of interaction, professionals’ self-awareness, and reflexivity, rather than learners' educational competencies. Today there is an increase in curricula within health education, referring to the notion of an emotionally intelligent (Goleman, 1995) practitioner. Researchers (Freshwater and Stickley, 2004) advocate enhancing a model based on emotional intelligence with a model of professional education via transformatory learning.

Furthermore, in recent years, art therapy has been allocated a meaningful place not only as a therapeutic tool but also in the field of research as a methodological tool for data collection and analysis. This enables a discussion of findings in a way that combines theories of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983) and emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1995) and theoretical integration of educational and therapy fields. The discussion of emotions in both the education and Expressive Arts Therapy fields aims at enhancing the understanding of the potential integration of both fields and their contribution to the development of inclusive participatory practice. Professional training in these fields aims to promote the capabilities and skills of professionals (teachers, head teachers, therapists, nurses, or social workers). Thus they can assist, promote, support, and impact the general and specific growth of people – learners and/or service-users.

Discussion of the potential embodied in art within professional development in the area of health indicates the potential contribution also in the field of teaching. However, one should also bear in mind the damaging effects that might ensue when art is integrated in education in a way that does not consider the place of the emotional dimension. Abramson (2011, 2012) regards traditional art teaching as "militarist" versus "non-militarist" pedagogy. These powerful metaphors reflect the need to educate teachers so that they understand the place of emotions in professional development as well as the integration of the personal dimension in professional development programmes.

Like me, due to his specialism as an artist and an art teacher, Abramson (2011) defines the teacher's role as to encourage and facilitate pupils' learning by paying attention to their inner world and emotions. Furthermore, teachers should develop a space for dialogue, attention, and expansion for their pupils. All this derives from in-depth experiential learning on a personal level and through emotional expression and collaboration during training. The example of art teaching in Israel, depicted by
Abramson (2011, 2012), is pioneering and boundary breaking. It grants personal respect to both learners and teachers, collaboration and collective responsibility, which eventually turns also into a pedagogical means of thinking based on emotions, relationships, and arts.

2.3.5 Conclusion

The issue of integrating emotions in education and in professional development and teacher education gives rise to some key questions and challenges; namely, is it permissible, desirable, and acceptable for professionals to express emotions in the educational context? If so, in what way? Using which tools? There would seem to be a need to develop and investigate a professional education programme that takes the concept of emotion from theory to practice. The fields of education and therapy both touch emotional and cognitive aspects that exist in professional development and growth processes.

The place of emotion is missing from the professional training in education, unlike the fields of therapy, social work, and health (such as medicine and nursing). The fields of therapy and health encompass emotional aspects as an integral part of the professional development process, together with acquisition of knowledge and techniques. Consequently, due to the essential similarity between the field of special education and therapy and health professions, education training should adopt from these areas the approach that views emotions as an integral part of the professional development process.

2.4 Rationale for a New Approach

2.4.1. Integration of Emotion within Professional Development

At the core of this study is the quest for the recognition, integration, and balance between cognition and emotion in professional development in the education field. I have drawn support for my views and approach with reference particularly to specific theorists; some of the works are more historical, in classic literature (Hargreaves, A.,
1998), and there are also more recent thoughts/research findings (Korthagen, 2005; Intrator, 2006; Schutz and Zembylas, 2009; Oplatka, 2010) that have influenced my approach. For example, Hargreaves, A. (1998) has been vocal about emotion since the 1990s. We are now in 2015, yet only recently is this topic coming to a head as an issue to be taken seriously in education.

Hargreaves, A. (1998) argued that policy does not take into consideration educators’ needs and renders harder and harder educators’ ability to manifest practical concern and caring for students. An ethos of positivity and an upbeat mood is required: an approach that believes in the power of positive thinking, optimism, and educators' wellbeing. Other elements of this ethos concern having a solution-focused way of approaching difficulties and seeing them as rich learning opportunities for everyone. This kind of mind set filters through into the strengths-based approach, in which adults begin to actively look for ways and areas in which every child is able (Donnelly & Watkins, 2010).

A number of more recent researchers (Korthagen, 2005; Intrator, 2006; Schutz and Zembylas, 2009; Oplatka, 2010), claim that there is a need to enable educators to undergo self-awareness processes through professional development programmes. Self-awareness of the personal dimension via professional development programmes is effective when educators are attuned to their own thinking and feeling processes. These processes develop the ability to imagine how others might be thinking and feeling, and use their sensitivity and imagination to create purposeful and energising learning experiences. Consequently, developing a concept and an approach focused on attention to the personal dimension of oneself and of others can be accomplished through authentic experience. It confronts learners with emotional and cognitive aspects of their own inner dimension with the inner dimension of others.

Experiential learning promotes the integrative development – both professional and personal – of pre-service educators as well as the multi-dimensional perception of themselves and of others. Therefore, integrating aspects from personal and professional dimensions of educators such as innovative creative approaches to teaching might impact learner’s integrative development including engagement, motivation, and confidence (Hewitt, 2015).
In this light, this study advocates that educators should adopt a teaching approach that perceives emotions as one of their work components. To do that, it is necessary to develop educators' role perception and way of working from a source of information and authority through tutors who support learning and—with the students— build learning infrastructures for life.

There is a need for forging a professional development programme that is valid in its preparation of teachers for dealing with their own emotionality and that of their pupils. Integrating emotions in teachers’ education programmes might lead towards a more positive humanistic teacher-student relationship (Bless, 2000; LeDoux, 2000, 2003; Rippon & Martin, 2003; Hargreaves, A., 2005; Isenbarger & Zembylas 2006; Oplatka 2011; Hargreaves, D., 2012).

In this light, I concur with Hewitt's (2011) updated approach as stated in his inaugural lecture (December, 2011), that education is the person, not what he knows... and that teaching is dynamic, thus teachers make the most difference since they are heroes.

2.4.2 Professional Development for Inclusion

Mönks' (1992) multi-factional model shows that the existing definition of intelligence commonly excludes non-cognitive factors such as motivation and the impact of the role of motivation in influencing ability. Taking into account Gardner's (1983) theory of multiple intelligences and views on emotional intelligence such as Goleman's (1995) work, professional development should embrace in practice wider holistic approaches towards children with SEN. This means focusing on the personal and not only the professional dimension of teachers, and attending to emotional aspects of children's and their families’ narratives.

Teacher education in Israel still focuses on students and their special educational needs (SEN) reflecting a narrow 'within-child'/ deficit model (Goacher et al., 1998) rather than the professionals themselves (McKee & Witt, 1990). Whilst professional development programmes even in Britain may familiarise educators and other allied professions with the policy rhetoric on collaborative partnership working, there is an assumption that expects stakeholders will have the necessary inter-personal skills to work effectively
together to create a shared vision for the child with SEN. Hence there is still a lack of focus and preparation on understanding intra- and inter-personal psycho-social processes and practical interaction strategies – which has to stem from greater self-awareness that focuses on the emotionality of the professionals themselves.

This study suggests—and critiques—educators who operate on a technical level, rather than on a personal level. Integrating emotional aspects within a professional development programme is leverage for the enhancement of a deep understanding of processes that educators undergo throughout their practice, leading towards developing an inclusive teaching approach (Allender & Allender, 2008; Kubovi, 2008) for the implementation of new reforms within the education field.

Inclusion should be perceived as a multi-dimensional concept. It does not engage only with the place where children are taught. It is also about values of participation and acceptance as well as the processes by which they are enabled to access learning and overcome barriers (Donnelly & Watkins, 2010). Therefore, this study advocates the definition of inclusion within professional development as acceptance of children with SEN and challenging original assumptions and stereotypically held views by focusing on their holistic needs and emotions beyond teaching and learning targets (Holt & Holloway, 2006; White & Choudhury, 2010).

I argue that beyond inclusive education as social justice, each person's potential has to be revealed and developed and that diversity could be celebrated. Educators should be properly prepared through professional development programmes to explore expected responsibilities that require psycho-social understanding of processes of interaction. The focus and aims of this study concern the impact of educators' personal and professional development on learners beyond the traditional approach of delivering knowledge. For example, Chesner’s (1995) therapeutic principles highlight the similarity between the fields of therapy and education.


The perception of the importance of listening to the child serves as leverage for underscoring the necessity to integrate the personal dimension within professional development programmes towards the implementation of inclusive educational principles and practices. This integrative approach advocates that the emergence of educators' attention to their own voice, and how this might impact listening to children's voices, will lead to successful inclusion in line with children's rights (Palmer, 1998, 2007; Allender, 2001; Darling-Hammond & Bransford, 2005; Korthagen, 2005, 2010; Hargreaves, A., 2004, 2005).

Lee (2001) contends that

"...within childhood studies, there is potential to reclaim and consider ideas that incorporate change, transitions, contexts and relationships, moving beyond concepts that are unduly fixed and static, with unhelpful dichotomies and ignorant of cultural and contextual variations... (p. 15)."

Based on Lee’s (2001) view, this study suggests shifting the focus from children alone to educators as well, since they "... also have limitations placed on their abilities to act as agents in certain circumstances ... " (White & Choudhury, 2010, pp.46-7).

Therefore, I concur also with the urge (Hewitt, 2014, in foreword to Morewood, 2014) for developing new materials for supporting and equipping teachers, teaching assistants, and trainee teachers (Morewood, 2014). This calls for developing new resources for inclusive teaching rather than reactive provision for SEN. Moreover, in this light new approaches have to be explored for equipping new teachers with the skills they need to support 21st century learners, especially those with CLDD that may require a highly personalised learning pathway. For example, the Engagement Profile and Scale (DfE, 2012), that offers an approach to assessing dimensions of engagement a child may show within an activity, and for tracking progress over time.

This study advocates a shift of paradigm (Holt & Holloway, 2006) from focusing on children's development to listening to them as autonomous participants in both society and research. But this too is no longer sufficient; greater emphasis is needed on the
complexities, tensions, ambiguities, and ambivalences of children's lives within their contexts. Hence, a new educator model is needed that highlights mechanisms and processes for preparing professionals for their empowering role.

2.4.3. Holistic Humanistic Approach to Teacher Education

This study advocates that professional development within the field of SEN should be based on a holistic—humanistic approach anchored in theories of learning (Dewey, 1915, 1933; Bruner, 1960; Piaget, 1969; Vygotsky, 1978) and multiple intelligences theories (Gardner, 1983; Craft et al., 2008). Moreover, it should focus on developing holistic-humanistic attitudes of educators (Maslow, 1968; Rogers, 1971; Buber, 1997) who work with children with special educational needs (Vygotsky, 1993; Schramm, 2002; Cameron, 2004; Petrie et al., 2009).

This approach maintains that educators’ development should focus on children and their abilities instead of on their deficit and learning difficulties. Moreover, professional development programmes should focus on the radical approach within the inclusive paradigm. To successfully employ the inclusive values presented in the UN Salamanca Convention (1994) such as collaborative, collegial, and cohesive partnerships, educators have to experience these values themselves throughout their own professional development, which I contend needs to be based on a holistic humanistic approach.

I concur with Stoll (1999), who maintains that neglecting inter-personal and psychological processes leads educators to behave defensively, protecting themselves from professional development that might expose their inadequacies. Conversely, assessing individuals as people and valuing their contributions can enhance educators' self-esteem and build trust. Similarly, Seligman (2000) and Peterson & Seligman (2000) focus on the process of developing awareness of one's strengths and virtues for one's own development. Researchers refer to the need for raising awareness of professional development that considers the personal dimension through dreams (Newman, 2000) and focus on the relationship between self, others, and pedagogy (Allender, 2001).

A humanistic-holistic philosophy of education argues that the concept 'professional development' should be shifted towards an approach that views people's development
and progress through the inclusion of personality-oriented, emotional, and motivational aspects (Craft et al., 2008). The humanistic-holistic perception differs from modern perceptions that are regarded as bureaucratic (Maslow, 1968; Aloni, 2005), which are based on knowledge, effectiveness, and achievements to accomplish goals according to market requirements (Gur-Ze’ev, 1996). Thus, the holistic-humanistic perception facilitates the opening of wide perspectives for viewing educators’ professional development by including educators’ emotional aspects rather than emphasising only cognitive aspects (Oplatka, 2010). This prepares educators for working positively with challenges, such as empathetic inclusion of children with wide-ranging needs (Banks et al., 2005; Ogbu & Simons, 2005; Wang et al., 2010).

Many researchers who consider educators’ professional development, suggest the development of self-identity (Toffler, 1992; Hativa, 2003); autonomy (Aviram, 1995), thought, social commitment, and tolerance (Chen, 2004). These researchers, however, focus on the students rather than on ways of developing these qualities through educators' own professional development. Focusing on students and not on educators requires that educators develop their students' future skills, combining thought, values, self-identity, autonomy, and social conduct of accepting others (McKernan, 1991; Zeichner, 2001).

In contrast, some researchers (Harris et al., 1995) suggest developing a more holistic approach towards educator development, claiming the significant notion of 'the person' (McLean, 1999) and emphasising enthusiasm, flexibility or love of children. Tickle (1999) includes personal life, career experience, perceptions and actions as integral for developing emotional wellbeing, self-concepts, motivation and educators’ psychological state (Stoll, 1999). Hansen (1995, p. 10) and Palmer (1998, 2007) raise the issue of teaching 'from within the identity and integrity of the teacher' and not based on technique alone.

Furthermore, an ecological philosophy adopts a holistic approach to understanding professional development. The 'philosophy of life' (Keiny, 2006), focusing on experiencing educational values through all life-circles, perceives professional development as part of personal development. This approach views the connection between theory and practice and between body and mind, acknowledging people as a whole. This innovative reading on life, grounded in the dialectic relationship between
people and the environment, replaces the existing framework that is based on alienated technology (Keiny, 2006).

Along these lines, Korthagen (2005) suggests using the 'onion model' for understanding the role of the inner dimension within professional development. The 'onion model' presents the various levels of different qualities of a good teacher. The outer levels, (for example, the environment), might affect inner levels of educators' behaviour and a repeated behaviour develops the competency to use it in other circumstances. An approach is needed that is premised on participants uncovering their inner selves as a route to more effective engagement within their professional lives.

As presented in the Introduction chapter, I was trained and practised (1972-1987) as an educator in the Israeli education system and joined the educational-therapeutic programme as an Expressive therapist in the year 1998. These years influenced the development of my theoretical and practical approach, leading towards developing the ‘Lovecircles’ professional development programme (2001).

Social psychology and social neuroscience research have outlined a more complex and varied array of human social-emotional skills than the skills proposed in EI theory. The validity of EI is yet to be determined. Towards the end of the 1990s I realized that the place and role of emotions in professional development has been growing. Hargreaves, A. (1998) claimed the need to expand the focus on educators' emotions in accordance with the reform requirements and expectations from educators. This has influenced other leading researchers in the field of developing educators' personal dimension (Allender, 2001) and emotional awareness in their personal development (Korthagen, 2005).

Social psychology and social neuroscience research have outlined a complex and varied array of human social-emotional skills than the skills proposed in quasi-brain theories. Waterhouse (2006) criticized the theory multiple intelligences (MI) theory (Gardner, 1983), Mozart effect (ME) theory (Rauscher et al., 1993), and Emotional Intelligence (EI) theory (Salovey & Mayer, 1990) claiming that there is no empirical evidence to support them, and these theories do not respect the constraints provided by cumulative empirical evidence from cognitive neuroscience research. Their application to classroom practice on professional development programmes should include awareness
that their lack of sound empirical support may result in little real power to enhance student learning beyond that resulting from the initial excitement of something new. However, Waterhouse (2006) indicated that future research such as this study may shed new light on these theories, and students, teachers, researchers, and theorists should remain open to new evidence.

Review of literature on child development, thinking and learning in the primary years (Goswami and Bryant, 2007) indicate that it is socially mediated; therefore families, peers and teachers are significant factors. This is relevant especially nowadays with the advancement of technology and e-learning. Moreover, data from neuroscience indicate that learning by the brain depends on the development of multi-sensory networks of neurons distributed across the entire brain (in visual, spatial, memory, deductive and kinaesthetic regions, in both brain hemispheres). Goswami and Bryant (2007) highlight active experience, language; pretend play and teaching as well as the contributing factors for development of children’s learning.

Therefore, this implies learning in classrooms should integrate diverse experiences leading towards self-reflective and self-regulatory skills. Thus, individual differences between children in the early years should guide teachers’ attitude to children as a key influencing factor in learning, memory, understanding and the motivation to learn. This sustains that individual differences in the ability to benefit from instruction (the zone of proximal development – Vygotsky, 1978) and individual differences between children are large in the primary years. Hence any class of children must be treated as individuals. Despite contests to their empirical validity, this could suggest nevertheless that quasi-brain theories such as MI and EI may have practical application in the classroom, in offering frameworks for conceptualizing holistic differences and strengths in children and a complementary framework for developing children’s emotional awareness respectively.

In 2006, more research in this has emerged, promoting the study of this issue (Oplatka, 2008; Day, 2012). Since 2010-2012 (Figure 1.1), research in this field has been explicitly dedicated to emotion in education.
2.4.4. Incorporating the Arts

Experiential teaching and learning through arts-based pedagogy and art therapy when integrated into the field of professional development in education, may promote the development of teachers' more expansive approach to themselves and to their pupils. Hence, they can enhance professional training in education by creating a platform for integrating and combining both personal and professional dimensions to trainees' development.

Developmental cognitive and learning theories (Piaget 1969; Vygotsky 1978; Bruner 1986) including those in relation to using the Arts with those with SEN (Sherborne, 1990; Peter, 1997), and recent findings from neuroscience (Ramachandran, 2003; Rizzolatti et al., 2006), uphold the primary importance of sensory experience as an emotionally arousing learning context. Art is a natural means of self-expression, and so there is an argument for increasing the awareness of the contribution of the Arts to pupils with and without special educational needs (SEN).

The Expressive Art Therapy field highlights the role of emotion and its integration with cognitive aspects of development. It therefore sustains an integrative approach to personal and professional development by using a variety of channels of expression within a humanistic setting. The model presented by Peter (1999) of two overlapping circles elucidates the contribution and uniqueness of each field – therapy and education – and the shared grey area of the 'therapeutic'. The model relates to the context in which therapists and teachers function pursuant to the National Curriculum in the United Kingdom.

Critics of suppression of art in teachers' development argue that the result is education characterised by an experience of separation and alienation (Borge & Nordhagen, 2007). Consequently, integrating art in teacher education may promote these objectives of holistic professional development as well as the therapeutic aspect embodied in art, namely developing learners' personal self-confidence by focusing on emotional aspects within their personal development.

Using art within teacher education might evoke in teachers a variety of emotion originating from their own personal experience as students and affecting them as adult learners (Lindgren & Ericsson, 2011). This perception professes that teachers are
expected to establish friendly and informal relationships with students (Bowlby, 1969; Ryan and Deci, 2000), so enhancing the learner-teacher dialogue (Zimmerman, 1994; Gouzouasis et al., 2013).

The main shared feature between the field of education and the field of therapy is people's overall development and growth as a basis for learning. Hence, professional training in these fields should include emotional and not only cognitive aspects. This approach to professional training emphasises the development of practitioners’ awareness of and abilities to express their own emotions as a basis for paying attention to the emotions of others. Thus, professional training in education should integrate emotional awareness by means of experiential learning grounded in humanist theories (Maslow, 1968; Rogers, 1971; Buber, 1997), multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983) and emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1995). Art embodies the potential for doing that.

Abramson (2011, 2012) views teachers as true creators whose source of authority is their commitment to their field of professionalism. Only on this basis have they the right to offer learners a way to making their own decisions. Moreover, he advocates teachers' experiential rather than just theoretical acquaintance with the field they teach. Abramson's (2011, 2012) perception legitimises the contribution of integrating art in education as a means of developing a space for learning with a diverse range of teaching styles. According to this perception, art teaching can promote diversity and differentiation among learners and teachers. Abramson (2011, 2012) maintains that

... the change must transpire at the head of the pyramid in order to reach its base... I have the feeling that it is connected to my history and to the fact that I did not have authoritative teachers... (p. 2).

Based on the above, integrating art in education makes a considerable contribution to learning especially when combined with tools from the field of art and therapeutic aspects from the field of art therapy. I believe that this combination facilitates the development of a broader approach to oneself and to others, critical reflection and accountability, which stimulate learning out of inner interest and cooperation.

From this perception of a void within professional development for educators working with children with SEN, the ‘Lovecircles’ approach evolved, aiming to fill in the gap in knowledge within professional development concerning the personal dimension.
CHAPTER 3 – THE 'LOVECIRCLES' APPROACH AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This chapter presents 'Lovecircles' as a professional development programme that addresses the gap in knowledge identified at the end of the previous chapter, for the preparation of educators to work in the inclusive context, by incorporating aspects – theoretical, methodological and practical – from the field of Expressive Art Therapy. The programme is summarised in Table 3.1. The table presents the three stages (personal development, professional development, and the programme implementation) of the 'Lovecircles' professional development programme, the content, and the activities in each of the stages.

The 'Lovecircles' programme incorporates methods and techniques from the field of expressive art therapy as channels of expression. These methods and techniques allowed the participants to develop attention to the personal and professional dimensions aiming at development of an inclusive approach to pupils with SEN.

As presented in the literature review in Chapter 2, the programme is grounded in holistic-humanistic theories in education, (Frankl, 1946; Buber, 1958; Rogers, 1961; Fromm, 1983; Maslow, 1998) and on the Expressive Art Therapy field, Landgarten & Lubbers, 1991; McNiff, 1992; Betensky, 2001; Rubin, 2001; Moon, 2007).[ALP1]

Table 3.1 illustrates this modular programme, which consists of three main stages.

The first stage focuses on personal development and comprises two key subjects: self-acquaintance (experiencing self-expression, self-reflection processes, and development of attention to the personal and professional dimension) and developing self-awareness. This stage is the basic and the crucial stage of the programme as it perceives the personal development as the springboard for the next stage which is the professional development. Moreover, this stage aims at filling the gap in knowledge that this research aims to address the lack of personal development within teachers’ professional training.

The second stage of the 'Lovecircles' educational programme focuses on integrating all the awareness dimensions as a tool for professional development. This stage
provides an experiential space for the participants’ professional development due to their development and organisation of a peer-guided workshop according to the 'Lovecircles' method for members of the group. This stage aims at deepening the understanding of one’s own relationship with pupils – and reference to the self in the general-professional dimension. The participants try out peer guidance at this stage, using the skills, tools, and methods to which they have just experienced for the purpose of working with pupils with special needs.

The third stage enables the participants to implement the programme in practice combined with tutoring. This stage addresses the programme’s aim by incorporating all the previous stages of development from theory and training stages towards the real life situations –the SEN practice. The other focus of this stage is to facilitate understanding of the relationship between experiential-creative processes and the field of SEN. This stage is supervised, based on holistic reflection (see the ‘Lovecircles’ booklet), and both contains and mirrors the participants’ development in the personal and professional dimensions. Integration of theory and experiential workshops are significant for the development of an inclusive teaching approach.
Table 3.1: ‘Lovecircles’ educational programme – Three stages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STAGE</th>
<th>CONTENT</th>
<th>ACTIVITIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First stage</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>A. <strong>Self-acquaintance</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>- via experiencing group processes that integrate activities from the</td>
<td>Trainees undergo an individual process of personal development through art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- the field of body and movement, emotions, guided imagery,</td>
<td>within the group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- meditation and art.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Experiencing self-expression</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- by means of experiential tools (e.g. colour, movement) that</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>enhance acquaintance with the self, expand inner attention and unique</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>expression capabilities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Experiencing self-reflection processes</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- working together in pairs and in a group circle, includes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>reference to feelings, emotions, thoughts, awareness and insights in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>order to implement them in life spheres and in teaching.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>**Encompasses attention to the participants’ inner and professional</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>world**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- integrating all awareness dimensions:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>emotion, feeling, imagination and thought as tools of personal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>development, and promoting reference to the self and to others in the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>personal dimension.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. <strong>Developing awareness</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– of emotional-inner barriers, uncovering new</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and creative options and turning the barriers into leverage for</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Second stage</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td><strong>Integrating all the awareness dimensions</strong> – as a tool for</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Deepening the understanding of one’s own relationship with pupils</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– and reference to the self in the general-professional dimension.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Implementing the theoretical and experiential aspects</strong> in inclusive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and participatory approaches for working with children with SEN.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Experience in implementation</strong> of the competences, tools and methods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for the purpose of working with pupils with special needs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experimenting skills for personal expression based on non-verbal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>modalities based on holistic approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Integrating a variety of methods and teaching styles and procedural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Submission of a creative group project based on the on-going processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of self-development and the skills acquired throughout the training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>via peer guidance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Planning and implementation of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sessions based on integration of body soul aspects and art within</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>experiential learning for working with children with SEN, via peer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>guidance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflection within the group processes toward personal and professional</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STAGE</td>
<td>CONTENT</td>
<td>ACTIVITIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third stage</td>
<td><strong>Extending reference</strong> to the self and to children with SEN</td>
<td>Practicum stage which includes:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prog-</td>
<td><strong>Facilitating understanding</strong> of the relationship between experiential-creative processes transpiring during the sessions and the field of SEN.</td>
<td>1. Preparing sessions according to the 'LOVECIRCLES' method – comprising selection of the session objective, building processes and activation methods as well as physical organisation of the learning space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imple-</td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Organising the team for collaborative tutoring according to the 'LOVECIRCLES' method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mentation</td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Participating in tutoring sessions – comprising experiential workshop of attention and sharing the personal and group dimensions by means of the “inner circle” form</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The rest of this chapter summarises the conceptual framework of this study, with a visual representation of the theoretical foundations that are related to personal and professional development. This chapter presents a basis for understanding the choice of methodology for conducting a critical evaluative research study of a teacher education programme in the field of professional development for inclusive education.

The full ‘Lovecircles’ programme is in the separate booklet. A detailed description of the stages and activities is also in Appendix 1.c, p. 13.
3.1. Key Theoretical Tenets

3.1.1. Focus on Emotion

'Lovecircles' encapsulates a concept for educators' personal and professional development, as perceived by Hargreaves, A. (1998, 2005; Hargreaves & Shirley, 2011) and Korthagen (2004, 2005, 2010, 2012). That is, as a developmental and integrative process whereby emotion is one of the main and crucial factors. Hargreaves, A. (1998, 2005; Hargreaves & Shirley, 2011), views educators as people experiencing emotions in all teaching situations and particularly in periods of change they have to introduce, which can cause discomfort. According to this study's approach, these changes evoke in educators mixed emotions that affect their professional functioning.

These emotions are connected to the very essence of the professional challenge set by the Inclusion Act (Ministry of Education, 1998) in Israel. That is, the fact that educators are perceived as a resource of the system required for successful inclusion of children with special educational needs (SEN), but which may evoke their feelings of alienation and lack of collaboration in decision-making and objectives. Furthermore, the way of assessing educators' practice does not reflect empathetic appreciation, without any reference to what educators do in this field and the heart and emotions they bring to their education practice.

Korthagen (2004, 2005, 2010, 2012), considers emotion as part of educators' development through processes of reflection as attention to layers of their inner world and an encounter with external layers (the teaching environment), which might support their personal and professional development in an integrative way. Integration of these two approaches underpins the approach of this study, which focuses on educators' personal and professional development based on attention to their emotions, especially in the light of the challenge they have to confront in implementing the policy of the Inclusion Act (1998) in Israel.

This study concurs with the findings of Hargreaves, A. (1998, 2001a, 2001b, 2003, 2005, 2008) and Korthagen (2004, 2005, 2010) on the importance of integrating the role of emotion within teacher education programmes. This study argues that pedagogy or theory striving to attain an integral understanding of learning, should include a multi-
 dimensional vision—emotional, social, aesthetic, physical and spiritual (Read, 1954; Goleman, 1996, 1998). Hence, this study concurs also with Goldstein (1999), who developed the theory of Vygotsky (1987) to encompass the aspect of emotion. That is, expanding the theoretical and practical engagement in the field of emotion into the field of teacher education.

3.1.2. Holistic Perspective

The intermediate overlapping area between the fields of therapy and education indicates the potential for teachers to integrate both fields into practice, from having studied and engaged with theory and principles from each during professional development training programmes. Hence, teachers develop an ability to perceive the whole learner's perspectives – personal, emotional, social, cognitive and academic-based through integration of aspects from both professional fields.

This holistic philosophy enables teachers to develop inclusive participatory multi-modal practices based on holistic-humanistic theories in education, developmental psychological theories, multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983) and emotional intelligence (Goleman 1995) learning theories. This broad and in-depth integration of theories serves as a scaffolding framework for implementing inclusive practice.

Teachers' multi-dimensional attention to learners (to both personal and professional dimensions) highlights the whole person perception. This broadens the narrow approach of teachers trained through traditional routes that tends to be based solely on cognitive aspects – skills and strategies, and learning processes such as memorising. Instead, a holistic integrative approach enables teachers to identify aspects that inhibit these cognitive processes.

3.1.3. Exploring the Therapeutic Approach within the Educational Context

This study argues that the integrative approach generated through the 'Lovecircles' professional development training programme enables educators to put theoretical understanding of the whole person into practice. The 'Lovecircles' approach promotes
their ability to perceive the learner and the act of teaching through a variety of lenses, to interpret educational phenomena in different lights and to develop flexibility in interpretation of overt behaviours of learners and thus meet learners 'where they are'. This ability opens to participants a variety of teaching options based on tools from therapy fields. For example experiential learning, group processes, consideration of climate and atmosphere. This entails a wide and in-depth development, integrating cognitive as well as emotional aspects.

Within traditional teaching processes of reflection in and after action (Schön, 1983), the focus is more on cognitive aspects, while reflection based on the 'Lovecircles' approach integrates emotional aspects, sensory and tacit knowledge. This is based on inter-personal and intra-personal experiences. Teachers' ability to perceive the principles inhibiting and enhancing learning, including the emotional aspects, in fact integrates those skills and insights of therapists into their proficiency. This ability is based on the understanding of the relationship between different aspects of inter- and intra-intelligence on the learning. These aspects constitute the intermediate 'therapeutic' area between therapy and education fields.

These processes keep the border of each field clear – while exploring the same ground—enabling the development of the learner through offering a safe space that acts as a springboard for scaffolding the learning processes and outcomes. This might entail ameliorating cognitive abilities according to children's starting points within their context. Therefore, participants in the 'Lovecircles' programme engage in experiential activities based on emotions and art that promote reflection on their personal development.

Moreover, the ability to recognise this mutual area enhances the essence and base principles of each field and enables the interaction of both fields. Hence teachers and therapists function on common ground addressing mutual aims: whole learners' needs for their development and learning within the educational context. Teachers' ability to widen their perception of learners' covert aspects allows them to widen their interpretation of the phenomena of learning. This approach entails a holistic paradigm.
3.1.4. Multi-Modal Working through the Arts

Throughout the years I have worked as an Expressive Art Therapist in schools, I have found that teachers and therapists do not share a mutual professional ground of perception of children with SEN in the way they assess and work with them. This gap has served as the springboard for the development of the 'Lovecircles' education programme, which is at the core of this study.

According to the SENCO website (DfE, 2013):

> Art is an important area for pupils with difficulties and disabilities of all kinds, identifying previously hidden abilities they may possess and providing opportunities for enjoyment and achievement that can be missing from other areas of the curriculum.

The Expressive Art Therapy field can offer education a variety of modalities beyond the verbal, such as abstract thinking, metaphor and poetry as well as non-verbal: art, music, and dance. These may support inclusion of learners with verbal communication difficulties in mainstream education effectively and affectively. This is of utmost importance particularly for those learners who have limited language, whether due to developmental factors or trauma. Expression through art, music, movement, or play can be people's ways of communicating without words and may be the primary form of interaction in both therapy and education.

For example, Ulman (1992) believes that Art therapy has a place within Arts education. The personal relationship between the Art teacher and the student who is emotionally disturbed for example, has been considered one of the most important factors in therapeutic effect. This connection allows the teacher to encourage the student to delve into personal experiences and work them into a comfortable space, leading to learning based on creativity instead of worshiping some notional "right" way of perceiving, understanding and creating (Ulman, 1992; Karkou & Glasman, 2004; Waller, 2006; Malchiodi, 2007).

Based on my approach and 36 years of practical experience, I perceive people as having different expressive styles – for example visual, tactile and so forth – stemming from developmental psychology (Piaget, 1969; Vygotsky, 1993) and creativity theories (Jeffrey and Craft, 2001; Sefton-Green, 2008). In education too, pupils' different
learning styles are acknowledged, with this being one of the principles by which teachers ensure their practice is inclusive through providing multi-modal activities (DfEE and QCA, 1999).

Therefore, I agree with researchers (Waller, 2006) who claim that integrative diverse modalities in both education and therapy contribute significantly to the inclusion of pupils with SEN. The integrative multi-dimensional approach serves as scaffolding for learners' abilities to engage with shared meanings and communicate effectively and authentically, which is the holistic humanistic philosophy of this study- I uphold that the multi-dimensional aspect of each field leads to a synthesis forming a new construct model, as sustained by Knill et al., (1995).

Knill et al., (1995) stipulated that both education and Expressive Art Therapy fields can be based on one unique aspect (such as behaviour in education and art in therapy) or multi-dimensional (emotional, social, artistic and spiritual) and intermodal (art, movement, music and photography). Rachel (2010) proposed an integrative model focused on blending art therapy and art education by utilising effective strategies from both disciplines that provide students with a therapeutic process to support teaching and learning. This model is in line with the 'Lovecircles' initiative to integrate aspects of art therapy aspects within school settings.

Issues such as reflection (Korthagen, 2012) and assessment (Knill et al., 1995), when integrating the emotional dimension, help close the gap between education and therapy, leading towards enhanced personal and professional development (McNiff, 1981). Therefore, I claim that integrating more than one modality into education from Expressive Art Therapy is essential for avoiding the trap that Maslow points at: "If the only tool you have is a hammer, every problem starts to look like a nail" (Maslow 1966. p. 15).

In practice, the educational field is represented by integrating creative educational approaches such as metaphors for expressing emotions (Kupferberg & Green, 2001; Blum-Kulka, 2005) in contrast to traditional cognitive–behaviouristic approach. This is complemented by principles and strategies from Expressive Art Therapy (Chaiklin & Schamai, 1979; Levy et al., 1995; Naess, 1998; Payne, 2006), based on my integrative-holistic perception of the field (e.g. movement, art, photography, drama and music); this
is in contrast to the common approach within therapy based on just one domain of the Arts.

3.1.5. Ethical Awareness

'Lovecircles' upholds the contribution of the integration of art and art therapy aspects in education (Karkou & Sanderson, 2006). Therefore, there is a basic need to clarify the differences and similarities between the disciplines of art education and art therapy (Karkou & Glasman, 2004; Osborne, 2002) for participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme. Integration of art therapy and art aspects in education reveals advantages and disadvantages. The approach encourages innovative models while posing challenging issues such as standards and organisational regulations, for example, maintaining patients' privacy and discretion in the therapist-child relationship. Consequently, there is a need for greater sensitivity and flexibility in the school situation than in therapy that is given in private clinics or health centres.

Expressive art therapists are trained to attend to covert aspects in contrast to classical cognitive behaviourist therapists (Clark & Beck, 2010). Mentors and coaches are also trained in accomplishing targets for their clients and equipping them with skills for addressing these targets (Od-Cohen, 2010). Attending to the unspoken, hidden aspects, as expressive therapists or psychoanalytical clinical psychologists do, constitute a means and a tool on which teachers can safely lean, without transgressing the therapy field and putting anyone emotionally at risk. Teachers can harness this aspect—multi-dimensional attention—in order to enhance teaching-learning objectives. This process is sustained by understanding both child development and learning theories. This ability of teachers to integrate into their practice a variety of aspects allows them to base teaching on various perceptions and tools in order to fulfil professional aims.

The shared techniques and tools integrate personal and professional dimensions through experiential integrative activities using art. This is a practice that does not cross the declared definition of each field. There are no therapeutic ethical issues involved in this process since it is based on solid theoretical foundations, yet moves from a theoretical dimension into the real world-practice dimension. Teachers are supposed to teach the Arts and this practice entails the ethical regulations of the teaching profession.
Similarly, therapists practice within their ethical regulations in Israel, U.K. or elsewhere.

The ethical regulations of each field’s profession are interpreted according to context and professionals are expected to follow them in whichever sphere. However, there is a need to raise the awareness of ethical regulations for each profession. It is likely that in future there will be an initiative to develop ethical regulations for teaching based on emotion – this integrative area – and implications for the role of emotions should be considered within professional training in both fields.

3.2. Core Principles for 'Lovecircles' Approach

This section presents the core principles of the expressive therapy field, in dialogue with the education field, for understanding their integration and the potential contribution to the development of inclusive participatory practice through the ‘Lovecircles’ programme. The dialogue between both fields (see Table 3.2) highlights the goals, focus, duration, benefits, values and principles, activities and strategies and status within the education system and the field of special educational needs (SEN). Analysing professional development within both fields in relation to SEN through this in-depth dialogue enables definition of and differentiation between both processes, highlighting the key features of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme, which brings the education and therapy fields together.

Table 3.2 presents the expressive therapy and teaching fields’ main anchors.
Table 3.2: The therapy and education elements comprising the 'Lovecircles' integrative framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Therapy</th>
<th>Teaching</th>
<th>Integrative model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goals</strong></td>
<td><strong>Therapy</strong></td>
<td><strong>Teaching</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcoming personal problems</td>
<td><em>Traditional</em>: learning needs &amp; improving performance</td>
<td>Integrating development &amp; learning &amp; multi-dimensional dimensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-dimensional development</td>
<td><em>Alternative, ecological and integrative</em>: inter-disciplinary multi-dimensional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus</strong></td>
<td>On the person and the process</td>
<td>On end results – outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Duration</strong></td>
<td>Long-term</td>
<td>Short-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benefits</strong></td>
<td>Providing a personal dimension, psychological support, guidance and advice</td>
<td><em>Traditional</em>: Acquiring knowledge &amp; improving performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Alternative, ecological and integrative</em>: Solving problems, independent learning, non-standard thinking, and problem-solution in a team</td>
<td>Integrating personal &amp; professional dimensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Values &amp; principles</strong></td>
<td>Trust, containment, and interaction based on shared language, timing, and creativity in interaction with the student</td>
<td><em>Traditional</em>: Awareness of ethical aspects and intellectual involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Alternative, ecological and integrative</em>: Develop awareness of a variety of aspects: timing, cooperation, autonomous, creativity, ethical aspects, emotional, social &amp; intellectual involvement</td>
<td>Integrating aspects: ethical, emotional, intellectual &amp; interactive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Integrate doing and being</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities &amp; Strategies</td>
<td>Traditional: demonstrating, role modelling, alternative, ecological and integrative: modelling, inspiration, internalisation</td>
<td>Integrating multi-dimensional aspects within emotions-based attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathetic attention, echoing, containing, expressing emotions, humour metaphors, role modelling, inspiration, internalisation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development</td>
<td>Traditional: based on school regulation &amp; society-related aspects &amp; economy. Alternative, ecological and integrative: society in the future: technology, social values, demography, autonomy, relations between people &amp; environment, understanding inter-personal dynamics, dialogue, positive language &amp; ethos of belonging rather than criticism</td>
<td>Integrating organizational aspects &amp; personal &amp; professional development, emotions &amp; inter- and intra-personal approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiential, verbal or non-verbal learning, personal emotional expressive development, self-awareness and self-encounter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status professional within the education system and SEN</td>
<td>Traditional: bureaucratic hierarchical approach &amp; authority &amp; knowledge Alternative, ecological &amp; integrative: accountability, express personal practical knowledge; collective &quot;we&quot;, educators' personal feelings based on &quot;whole&quot; educator approach, express own professional voice.</td>
<td>Integrative status as an equal participant who promotes holistic humanistic approach based on the 'whole person' approach highlighting the role of emotions in personal and professional development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From outside status perceived as representing aspects other than accepted cognitive aspect – towards becoming an integral part of the staff; Embedding emotions in the learning process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Within the expressive therapy field the multi-dimensional approach of the therapy profession is highlighted as well as the values and principles rooted in the interactive approach and the integrative professional approach within the education system and SEN.

Within the teaching field both traditional and alternative approaches are presented, highlighting the significance of the development of a professional approach from traditional and narrow towards multidimensional; hence, enabling the development of an approach that integrates both the therapy and teaching fields.

The integration serves as the cornerstone of the ‘Lovecircles’ approach to tutoring and the framework of the new educator model.

### 3.3. Integrative ‘Lovecircles’ Tutor

The 'Lovecircles' facilitation strategy draws upon various disciplines: counselling and expressive therapy, mentoring and expressive therapy, mentoring and tutoring. The ‘Lovecircles' tutoring and supervision strategy focuses on enhancement of expression of emotions, balance, and resilience, and draws upon the disciplines of counselling, coaching and mentoring (O’Brien & Burnett, 2000; Pearson, 2004). In this light, working through problematic emotions or reactivity could lead to better professional work for tutors by using multi-dimensional verbal and non-verbal activities that contribute to long-term therapeutic change as within the Expressive Therapy field.

#### 3.3.1. 'Lovecircles' Approach to Tutoring

**Table 3.3: The tutoring process: counselling, coaching, and mentoring**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goals</th>
<th>Counselling</th>
<th>Coaching</th>
<th>Mentoring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Overcoming problems</td>
<td>Improving performance in specific skills</td>
<td>Learning &amp; change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>Person</td>
<td>End results</td>
<td>Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration</td>
<td>Long-term</td>
<td>Short-term</td>
<td>Long-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits</td>
<td>Provides advice and support</td>
<td>Improves performance</td>
<td>Provides career guidance and psychological support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities &amp; Strategies</td>
<td>Active listening, probing, clarifying, advising</td>
<td>Showing, demonstrating, exemplifying</td>
<td>Role modelling, gearing for client needs, inspiration, internalisation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3.3 shows Od-Cohen’s (2010) model of the interacting processes involved in tutoring: it appears as a holistic process, encompassing counselling, coaching and mentoring – processes all used in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme. Amsel and Massen (2010) highlight the differences between tutoring and mentoring. They perceive tutoring as guidance, usually individually, in a specific subject or aim, such as identifying students’ weaknesses or helping them to improve their learning. According to the Collins English Dictionary (2003), tutoring within social sciences and education means a period of intensive tuition given by a tutor to an individual student or to a small group of students. On the other hand, according to Amsel and Massen (2010), mentoring refers to the guidance of a group of students. Mentoring can offer a wide range of advice about academically-related topics and with long-term goals, such as adopting academic values, beliefs and approaches to learning.

Tutoring is the direct and clearly defined work designed to support students’ acquisition of specific academic skills. Mentoring is the more indirect work attempting to instil academic attitudes that will promote academic attainment and participation. A tutor’s goal is to help students overcome academic challenges and lead them to independent learning by offering them one-on-one attention, individualised explanations and a chance to ask as many questions as they like (Amsel and Massen, 2010).

The ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy stems from Expressive Art Therapy's methods and frameworks as the basis for focusing on emotions. Attending to and expressing emotions throughout the ‘Lovecircles’ process enhances participants’ self-awareness. This allows pursuit of more extensive empirical and practice-based evidence (Payne, 1993; Fosha, 2000; Pearson & Wilson, 2001; Pearson, 2003). ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy adheres to Pearson’s (2004) claim that elements of counselling such as efficacy, appropriateness, sensitivity and flexibility are in line with creativity and expressive therapy aspects.

Additionally, integrating creativity in professional work develops cognitive processes, for example, decision-making, (Robbins, 1980; Payne, 1993; Pearson & Wilson, 2007). Imagination is particularly significant for the learning process and empathy (Heath, 2008). The use of creative expressive verbal and non-verbal methods and activities
within the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy are in line with Rogers’ (1951) claim concerning the difference between counselling as ‘operational’ rather than just ‘verbal’.

Therefore, I uphold that the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy is a participatory and inclusive practitioner approach focusing on the personal dimension, and uses the Arts as a shared language for participants to express their voice. Hence, the ‘Lovecircles’ strategy can be perceived with reference to the counselling discipline by focusing on the personal dimension (Rogers 1951; Payne, 1993; O’Brien and Burnett, 2000; Pearson, 2004). In this light, the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy draws on mentoring and Expressive Art Therapy (Snowber, 2005). It takes inspiration from the etymology of the word ‘mentor’, which means intent, purpose, spirit or passion (online Etymology Dictionary, 2001). "One can lead with the heart, listen with the soul, analyse with the mind and attend with the gestures of the body" (Snowber, 2005, p. 351).

Additionally, the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy highlights characteristics of trust, caring and nurturing from the psychology discipline (Cohen, 1995), leading towards a successful mentoring relationship. Other characteristics embedded within the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy are the multi-dimensionality of roles, responsibilities and expectations of tutors (Cohen, 1995; Megginson and Clutterbuck, 1995; Mincemoyer and Thomson, 1998; Beech and Brockbank, 1999; Broadbridge, 1999).

Moreover, the ‘Lovecircles’ strategy focuses on learners and their development through their career or life as the aim and focus (Megginson & Clutterbuck, 1995). The ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy perceives mentors as friends to learners; they listen and question in order to widen learners’ perspectives. Responsibility for the relationship lies with learners and so the ‘Lovecircles’ mentors accept ambiguities as an exciting part of life.

The goals of the ‘Lovecircles’ tutoring strategy are learning and change, thus focusing on a long-term process, activities and strategies based on role modelling, addressing learners’ needs, inspiration and internalisation. These activities establish the ground for career guidance and psychological support (Od-Cohen, 2010).
3.3.2. ‘Lovecircles’ Approach to Supervision

In teacher education, a model of collaborative co-inquiry (Roehampton University, 2012-13) has emerged between trainee and supervisor, identifying shifting positions between understanding with the trainee through listening and showing empathy by understanding issues from the trainee’s viewpoint. The supervisor enables trainees to make connections with what they know about how children learn, from their own experiences, from training sessions and from direct observations of practice. The supervisor also plans next steps by identifying change for trainees, how success will be noted and negotiating with trainees how to proceed.

The process includes documentation and summary of the developmental processes that participants have experienced in the programme. This reflective documentation procedure focuses on practical aspects and experiential aspects—emotion and feeling (Dreyfus, 1981; Lave & Wenger, 1991; Palmer, 1998, 2007; Allender, 2001; Kupferberg and Olstein, 2005; Rodgers and Scott, 2008; Korthagen 2012).

Supervision includes a reflection process after tutoring a ‘Lovecircles’ workshop. The supervision process focuses on emotions evoked during and after the activity, defining and analysing the situation in which true emotions were expressed, verbally and non-verbally through expressive arts therapy principles (Dreyfus, 1981; Palmer, 1998, 2007; Allender, 2001; Kupferberg & Olstein, 2005; McNiff, 1993; Peter, 1995, 1998; Moon, 1995; Betensky, 2001; Craft et al., 2008) the expression of emotions, team participatory and collaborative processes and expressing empathy to learners’ personal and professional needs (Goleman, 1996; Mittler, 2000; Oplatka, 2011; Day, 2012; Hargreaves, D., 2012; Korthagen, 2012; see the separate ‘Lovecircles’ booklet).

3.3.3. Ethical Issues for ‘Lovecircles’ Tutoring

Professional training within Expressive Therapy offers various modalities and has been embraced by practitioners in the fields of psychology, psychiatry, social work, counselling and medicine over the last decade. Expressive Therapy practices have developed specific theoretical foundations, methodologies and training, through Masters or Doctoral degrees or through registration, certification, or licensure in a specific creative art therapy or Expressive Therapy globally (Haas, 2013). Art therapists are
trained in the psychology of mark-making and symbolism, in non-verbal communication, psychotherapeutic understanding of child development and family dynamics and the importance of boundaries. Their work is based on the acknowledgement that image making can be extremely powerful in helping people to deal with issues that are hard to verbalise. Thus, the implication for ‘Lovecircles’ tutors and participants is that verbal and non-verbal channels of expressions are developed throughout the programme as a bridge for intra-personal and interpersonal development.

In-depth training in an art form in order to practice creative interventions is believed to be effective for using these modalities in therapy competently and ethically. This is in line with Agell's (1982) perception that “a flirtation with materials is not enough. Only a love affair with materials can lead to a wedding of felt experience and formed expression” (p. 37), leading to development of professional skills. Therefore, experiencing art should be integrated within professional programmes; ‘Lovecircles’ trains students in non-verbal modalities of expression that will enrich their practice with children with SEN. In this light, the ‘Lovecircles’ qualification is accredited (2012) as a profession by the 'New Horizon' reform (Ministry of Education, 2008).

When using expressive therapies to complement verbal therapy, practitioners should be aware of the current ethical standards of practice in the particular modality they are using. All art therapy associations provide guidelines about ethical standards, their application and practice as a form of treatment or assessment of expressive modalities with clients and within each context (Y.H.A.T in Israel and NCCATA—The National Coalition of Creative Arts Therapies Associations, founded in 1979, represent members of five creative arts therapy associations nationwide). Since teachers are not trained and accredited as therapists, this mean that incorporating therapeutic approaches within teacher education should focus on the similarities, differences and intermediate dimension, leading to practice based on the ethical standards of each field. Thus, the programme introduces these aspects so that ‘Lovecircles' participants enhance their awareness of these issues.

Professional development programmes for therapists, as those for teachers, can be clustered based on their theoretical frame of reference. Within the therapy field there are various approaches such as the psychoanalytic (Freud, 1967; Jung, 1981); educational (Maslow, 1971; Moustakas, 1981); behaviourist (Skinner, 1970); cognitive (Neisser, 1967; Beck, 1987); and cognitive developmental psychology (Piaget, 1971). Other
clustering of professional development programmes for therapists refer to different therapeutic approaches, from one modality (such as art therapy or music therapy)—to integrative and multi-dimensional approaches (such as movement, art and drama or phototherapy and nature therapy). Therefore, the diversity of issues and ethical implications of the ’Lovecircles’ more eclectic approach is taken into consideration throughout the programme.

3.4. Towards a Definition of ’Lovecircles’ Graduate Educators

The above discussion strove to present the ‘Lovecircles’ graduate educators (see Figure 3.1) as professionals who:

(1) **Perceive** and **understand** the learner and learning in a multi-dimensional way that integrates a variety of aspects;

(2) **Balance** and **integrate** between a variety of situational aspects while being able to focus on one or another in depth according to the contextual situation leading to them to

(3) **Identify** specific aspects of the learner inhibition and/or advance factors of learning processes

(4) **Understand** the relationship and impact of varied aspects: overt and covert, in the long- or short-term

(5) **Deploy** dynamic, spiral, perceptions, changes, development processes – these are aspects that define the therapy field and are relevant to the teaching field too since they present a holistic developmental approach that differs from a linear approach such as accumulation of knowledge thus integrating these aspects into teaching practice and

(6) **Act upon** the professional ethics regulations of the teaching field.

Thus, the theoretical dimensions include situational conceptual aspects such as perceiving and understanding practice, leading towards balancing and integrating a multi-dimensional perception based on a broad in-depth theoretical framework.
This study argues that in order to develop the ‘Lovecircles’ professional approach, training should focus on teachers’ own emotions as an integral part of their development through personal and professional group processes that integrate verbal, non-verbal, and art activities.

Figure 3.1: Definition of 'Lovecircles’ graduate educators

The above review of the ‘Lovecircles’ educator profile will constitute the basis upon which professional development of ‘Lovecircles’ education programme graduates will be described and assessed. The programme views professional development as the combination of personal development, grounded in teacher-learner relationships and integrating emotional aspects as a basis for graduates' professional development.
3.5. Conceptual Framework

The underpinning theoretical perspectives of the 'Lovecircles' professional development programme presented in this review have been consolidated into the conceptual framework for this thesis. This conceptual framework provides a tool that combines the different theoretical perspectives into a unified whole. Thus, it enables and supports this study of educators’ personal and professional development by referring to their feelings – and as such, the gap in knowledge that this thesis addresses (see Figure 3.2).

![Conceptual Framework Diagram]

Figure 3.2: The conceptual framework of this study:
An emotions and art-based integrative model of inclusive professional development

The following acronyms IHHP, PD/EDU, PD/EAT in the above figure stand for

IHHP – Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy

PD/EDU – Professional Development in Education

PD/EAT – Professional Development in Expressive Art Therapy
The generalised (white) bigger circle represents the 'big theories': holistic-humanistic theories (Frankl, 1946; Dewey, 1938; Buber, 1965; Rogers, 1968; Piaget 1969; Fromm, 1983; Bruner, 1986; Maslow, 1998; Vygotsky, 1991), which serve as a wide umbrella for the smaller theories of this study.

The second circle (light blue) contains three circles (green, turquoise and pink) representing professional development (PD) in education (the green on the left) in expressive art therapy (the turquoise on the right) within the context of SEN (the pink in the middle) namely theories of inclusive education and their implications for teaching and learning (Eyre, 2000; Frederickson & Cline, 2002; Sherratt & Peter, 2002; Peter, 2003; Chen, 2004; Talmor et al., 2005).

The intermediate circle (purple) is obtained from the integration of these three circles (professional development in both fields within SEN) and illustrates the gap in knowledge regarding the relationship between personal and professional development that underpins this study’s approach.

The intermediate circle (purple) indicates the way by which this study fills the gap in knowledge, namely art in personal development within the field of expressive art therapy and education (Peter, 1995, Runco, 1996; Eisner, 2004; Craft, 2005; Robinson, 2006; Sternberg, 2006; Moon, 2007; McNiff, 2009, and others). This intermediate circle (purple) deals with the object of this thesis: the integration of personal and professional development for inclusive teaching with learners with SEN.

Each circle represents a theoretical domain. Altogether, Figure 3.2 was created to visually represent the complexity and at the same time the unity of the components of the conceptual framework of this study. This conceptual construct illustrates the way each theory interacts with the other, leading to the construction of the conceptual framework.

This conceptual construct illustrates the way the integrative model evolves via all the above circles that support “Lovecircles” as an innovative professional development programme.

Thus, this chapter presented the conceptual framework that underpinned this study. The following chapters introduce the methodological choices that guided the research.
CHAPTER 4 – METHODOLOGY

4.1. Evaluative Phenomenological Research Study

The summative purpose of this study is to critique the outcomes of the 'Lovecircles' educational programme vis-a-vis the programme postulates. The formative purpose of the study is to arrive at a more informed and evidence-based understanding of the impact on the personal and professional development of educators in the 'Lovecircles', educational programme with a view to contributing to illuminating the significance of personal and professional development of inclusive educators. These understandings will be acquired through two perspectives: the perspective of participants in the programme and that of the researcher (also the tutor), analysed using a phenomenology approach and a unique set of methods and procedures (Moustakas, 1994 Lester, 1999; Groenewald, 2004; Giorgi, 2005).

Based on the conclusions of this in-depth single case study (Sanders, 1981; Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1999), knowledge of personal and professional development and the impact of emotionality on educational interventions with children with special educational needs (SEN) could be expanded, since it is lacking in the existing literature. Hence, knowledge of integrative personal and professional development of educators may also be enhanced, which may be of significance to teacher training and related policy developments.

The rationale for my research methodology is based on the research objectives:

- To ascertain similarities and differences in possible personal and professional development gains and their inter-relationship between participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme.
- To identify possible core principles for supporting the personal and professional development of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme.
- To explore the possible impact of the 'Lovecircles' education programme on the participants' work with children with special educational needs and disabilities.
The prevalence of quantitative research in natural sciences has become an ideal situation for gaining secure knowledge, for it includes the possibilities to measure, manipulate, control and predict the variables and outcomes of the study. Similarly, Social Sciences also show a strong tendency towards quantification (Giorgi, 2005). However, many have criticized the method for lack of depth and meaning of the subjective experience, which is at the heart of this research (Michell, 1997; Michell, 1999). Furthermore, the assumption of psychological variables being quantitative has never been demonstrated (Michell, 1999). Thus, in order to discover the subjective experience in greater depth, to reveal the essence of a phenomenon, a method is needed that is essentially tuned to the qualities of humans.

The proposed qualitative research method for the current study design is a phenomenological one. Phenomenological research aims to capture and illuminate the specific, to describe reality as perceived by a person in the situation (Lester, 1999; Groenewald, 2004). Phenomenology does not explain nor reveal causes, but clarifies (Giorgi, 2005). The philosophical roots of phenomenology stem from the ideas of Edmond Husserl (1859–1938) (Groenewald, 2004). Husserl rejected the belief that objects in the outside world exist independently, and that the information about them is reliable. He argued that one must ignore anything outside immediate experience, thus, narrowing the experience description to the contents of one's own personal consciousness. The inquiring mind must address whatever appears immediately to consciousness in the manner it appears (Mortari, 2008). Hence, realities are treated as 'phenomena' and provide the only certain starting point of exploration.

Husserl and his student, Martin Heidegger (1889-1976), continued to develop the concept of phenomenology, and focused on the dialogue between a person and his or her world. Likewise, a researcher applying phenomenology is concerned with the lived experience of the people (Groenewald, 2004; Maypole & Davis, 2001). Giorgi (2005) explains that phenomenologists document the participants' perspectives of the phenomena using a natural attitude, which is the attitude of everyday life. However, this description cannot serve as a scientific valid expression, it needs to be transformed. The researcher adopts a disciplinary attitude to clarify the meaning of the everyday experience by describing its disciplinary meaning. This will allow the researcher to see the implications of the experiences and meaning contained in the description in a disciplinary light. Therefore, it might challenge core and normative assumptions
(Lester, 1999; Creswell et al., 2007). To summarize, employing a phenomenological research design will provide the essence that the participants experience about the phenomenon.

4.2. Research Questions

The formulation of the related research questions matched the process as it appears in the literature, being flexible and interpretative (Peshkin, 2000; Shkedi, 2003) and began with a problem or issue taken from the real world in which I was interested. In order to understand the issue, broad open-ended questions were firstly asked, constituting the starting point of the research. As Peshkin (2000) puts it, “interpretation has to do with the confluence of questions that are the starting point of my inquiry” (p. 9).

1. What should constitute the core principles for personal and professional development of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme?
2. What might characterise the personal development of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme?
3. What should characterise the professional development of participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme?
4. What, if anything, might be the link between the personal and professional development of participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme?
5. How might the personal and professional development of participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme affect their work with children with special needs?

4.3. Research Population

The research population comprised 11 original participants who attended the ‘Lovecircles’ professional development programme during 2001-2008. This subsequently narrowed to an in-depth focus on the 5 participants who completed all stages of the course.

The participants covered a broad spectrum of characteristics: an age range of between 25 and 56 and from both genders—nine females and two males. The 'Lovecircles'
Education Programme consisted of 28 weekly sessions, each session lasting four 45-minute units and it was self-funded by participants. The programme consisted of two personal and professional development stages with an option to add a third stage of practicum. Five of the participants completed the third stage (practicum) and subsequently worked as group instructors at the 'Lovecircles' centre. Nine of them had prior qualifications in alternative experiential areas, such as group tutoring, alternative medicine and art-integrated tutoring and teaching – for example, drama, plastic art and movement. All the participants, with the exception of two, had personal and professional experience in the field of special educational needs. Two were themselves learning-disabled. Table 4.1 illustrates the research sample using assumed names to ensure anonymity and preserve the privacy of the participants.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Seniority (years)</th>
<th>Experience in the field of special needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yafa</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>B.A. in Behavioural Sciences and drama-therapy</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanny</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>B.A. in science teaching</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6 years teaching sciences in small classes and home-class educator of 39 children with special needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.A. in special education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Animal-assisted therapy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eve</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>B.A. in education, counselling and learning disabilities therapy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taya</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>B.Ed. in special education</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7 years as inclusion educator with learning-disabled children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shiazio and massage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Group tutoring</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meron</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Certificate studies in education and therapy</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dor</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Certificate studies of assistance to children with special needs</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mor</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>B.A. in communal theatre, philosophy, biology and Arabic</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miri</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Academic studies within the framework of psychology studies and early childhood. Heike” – teaching dyslexic children to read</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13 Teaching pupils with special needs who are included in mainstream classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Or</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>B.A. in teaching biology and chemistry. 1 year of M.A. studies at the School of Medicine in the department of human microbiology group tutoring – Chirology</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3 years of teaching sciences in small classes; 1 year of teaching information studies in 2 small classes; 4 years of teaching sciences in a gifted pupils' class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koren</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>B.A. in creative education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9 years in informal education framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamar a</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Certificate studies in alternative field, Alexander method, Reiki, guided imagery; Group tutoring</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4 years counselling in &quot;Beyachad&quot; non-profit association (children with special needs)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Initially, I approached all the trainees at the 'Lovecircles' centre, asking them if they would be willing to participate in the evaluation study. This was meant to avoid any sense of bias or discrimination between them. Because I was the initiator and the professional group tutor of the education programme, all 11 participants were those who gave their explicit, informed consent to participate.
Once they were accepted to the programme, a lecture was given to present the steps in the development of the programme and the reason for conducting the research and its contribution to education. Programme participants were asked who was willing to take part in the research to avoid possible coercion. Participants expressed their consent by signing an informed consent form.

The decision to participate in the research was entirely up to them and came from a desire to convey my trust in them as a researcher. The participants had different life experiences; some were familiar with populations with special educational needs as a parent or themselves and others as professionals. They had also studied in various pathways at different institutions, majoring in varied fields. Their approach to participation in this study unanimously showed no sign of hesitation or dilemma, or a sense of being felt coerced.

The participants were aware that the programme does not offer an academic qualification, but rather a certificate of a 'Lovecircles' mentor, a fact that is recognized and publicized in the professional magazines. It has been undertaken by senior professionals such as inspectors and directors of treatment centres, who have recommended it and remunerated participants.

Therefore, in this study the population is purposive, as Stake (2000) stipulates that a case study "draws a purposive sample, building in variety and acknowledging opportunities for intensive study" (p. 446).

A purposive sample is a non-representative subset of some larger population and is constructed to serve a very specific need or purpose. A researcher may have a specific group in mind, and it may not be possible to specify the population—they would not all be known and access may be difficult. The researcher attempts to target a group, interviewing whoever is available (Weisner et al., 2001).

The study had two stages: the number of participants chosen was 11 at the start (A), but later I decided to focus on a self-selecting group of five participants (B), including only those who opted to undertake the practicum stage, as this would allow an in-depth data analysis of those undertaking the entire 'Lovecircles' education programme. The inclusion/exclusion criteria were an educational academic background and practice within SEN.
The research sample of 11 original participants contributed to the understanding of the impact of personal development on professional development in general, while the five case studies enabled this study to focus on this understanding applied within an inclusive education context. The five participants were selected as the best representatives to maximize scrutiny of the scope of the ‘Lovecircles’ approach, whereby personal development should be an integral part of professional development in general and within inclusive contexts in particular.

As this study points out, due to the Special Education Act (1988), classes are filled with many children who are diagnosed as having SEN. Consequently, all teachers might benefit from integrative training. I suggest that the diversity between the professional and personal experience of participants (Table 4.1) can serve as a basis for understanding and assessing the impact of a particular training programme on participants' development. Their diverse needs emerged while working in inclusive contexts, especially as some had no prior training or experience with children with SEN.

Most of the 11 original participants had no background in art and had not attended any prior professional training focusing on their personal dimension. One had a background in art from a functional aspect and academic studies in rehabilitation through art but no practical experience. Another participant had a background in the field of drama therapy; hence, she had attended a training course giving attention to the personal dimension of emotionality – emotions. Participants enrolled into the programme aspiring to develop professionally within an inclusive context. This was based on their understanding that the programme integrated personal and professional development through verbal and non-verbal modalities – art, movement, dance, drama, bibliotherapy, music, and phototherapy.

With regard to years of experience in teaching, most of the 11 original participants had 11-17 years of experience in teaching while the minority had 2-5 years' experience and only one had no experience at all. Hence, it seems that the 'Lovecircles' advanced training developed from a perceived need by participants to grow professionally in a different way, focusing on their personal dimension and the Arts. This highlights the need and desire to acquire a new approach to practice within the demands of the inclusive context.
The background of the second-phase, five self-selecting participants for the research is particularly important for understanding the basis from which the 'Lovecircles' advanced training has developed. The significance of their diverse prior experience (in arts, education, and mentoring) is that it may be possible to learn the impact on and contribution to the development of the 'Lovecircles' participants, and their ability to apply the method in inclusive populations. This is important as that is how accommodations can be designed for each participant, based on his or her personal professional narrative, so as to generate maximum gains from the programme. Programme participants from different worlds can enrich each other; meaning that profound insights may be drawn regarding possible implementation for participants from various backgrounds.

4.4. Research Methodology

4.4.1. Research Paradigm

The paradigm adopted as a theoretical umbrella for this study is qualitative-inductive-interpretative (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998, 2001; Cohen et al., 2003; Shkedi, 2013). This paradigm suits the research aims in that it enables an in-depth, process-oriented field study of the different aspects of educators' personal and professional development (Shkedi, 2013). This approach enabled me to understand the meanings the participants ascribed to the educational occurrence in question. The qualitative paradigm also suits the conceptual framework of this study and the theoretical concept of professional development, in that this concept is holistic, relative, developmental, and context-dependent.

Studies argue that qualitative research strives to understand occurrences as complete entities whose components are inextricably interlinked (Stake, 1995; Lincoln & Guba, 2000). This holistic approach assumes that understanding the context is essential to understanding the occurrence itself (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Miles & Huberman, 1994; Stake, 1995). The epistemology of qualitative research is characterised by its interactivity. I chose the qualitative research methodology based on the phenomenological approach that focuses on the study of occurrences and situations in a
holistic way, aiming to understand them as whole entities (Maypole & Davies, 2001; Groenewald, 2004; Mortari, 2008; Jones S., 2008b; Shkedi, 2009).

Researchers seek to understand the occurrence—what people do and say in their daily lives in their natural surroundings—from a participative interpretative viewpoint and according to meanings that they attribute to it (Charmaz, 2000; Shkedi, 2003; Bar-On, 2006). Studying an occurrence is done through observation, listening, and conversation with the participants, with careful attention to the large amount of data thus far collected, without imposing any pre-existing understandings regarding the terms of the research (Merriam, 1998). Qualitative researchers obviously start out with certain theoretical assumptions. However, in qualitative research, the theoretical perspectives are temporary and subject to on-going change due to the process of data collection and analysis and the new information it provides (Strauss & Corbin, 1994; Peshkin, 2000).

In the words of Charmaz (2000),

...grounded theorists portray their understanding of research participants' actions and meanings' and offer abstract interpretations of empirical relationships and create conditional statements about the implications of their analysis (p. 508).

4.4.2. Case Study Research Method

The chosen research method, the case study (Sanders, 1981; Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1999) is derived from the qualitative paradigm. It is defined as descriptive research of a specific case with boundaries defined by time, place, and participants. A case study is based on empirical research exploring a contemporary occurrence that comes into being; the boundaries between the occurrence and the conditions of its coming into being are not clearly distinct (Yin, 2009). A case study is not a specific technique; this is a method of organising information and social data in a way that preserves the nature of the investigated objects (Yin, 1984; Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1999).

The case study strategy used for this study enabled interpretation and discussion of the personal and professional development of participants, which then ensured the in-depth study of each of the cases separately, and the potential to draw strong conclusions. The cases facilitated crystallisation of the findings through the inductive-interpretive process of the content analysis.
A case study was chosen as the research approach, being an operative strategy where the paradigm is naturalist-inductive-interpretative. This is because the case study is anchored in and influenced by the world-view of the qualitative research paradigm and its underlying assumptions as presented above (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994; Lincoln & Guba, 2000). The choice of the case study method is based on the humanistic-democratic approach (Maslow, 1971; Rogers, 1980) that is the approach of this study. Hence, the present study's approach reflects a kind of modesty, recognising the limited understanding of human ability and of the importance attributed to the fact that anything to do with people's actions, however common, may be important to the research. This present research was conducted out of a desire to reach the world of the participants out of respect for them (Yosefun, 2002).

Many researchers (Shkedi, 2010) see case studies as a strategy or an approach rather than a method. As an approach, this strategy has a broad, overall vision of the occurrence under study in which researchers use a number of methods while conducting the research (Yin, 1989). Although the term 'case study' is defined differently by different researchers, they all concur that a case study is the observation of human activity at a given time and place. It can teach us about human behaviour, whether personal or organisational, and about processes occurring in the case being studied (Stake, 2000). Miles & Huberman (1994) define 'case' as any kind of occurrence within a defined context. Yin (1989; 1993) writes that an experimental case study seeks to explore an occurrence within the complexity of daily life; in other words, 'in the real world', where the boundaries between the occurrence and its context are not exactly clear and the researcher has no control over events. The investigation is conducted by creating personal, unmediated contact between the researcher and research participants.

I therefore sought to collect data about the thoughts and daily actions of people in the 'cases' under investigation: the way they create and structure themselves and social awareness, and the way they interpret their actions. I collected data at the research site and analysed the data in an attempt to create patterns from which in-depth understanding of the occurrence in question could be gained. A case study also makes it possible to preserve the significant, holistic features of the events in reality (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Yin, 1994). Stake (2000) adds that through case studies researchers can reach hidden features that are not initially apparent. In a case study, researchers relate to
the theoretical perspectives at a later stage of the research, once the questions have been formulated and the data has been collected (Creswell, 1998).

4.4.3. Education Case Study

The attention paid by the researcher in this study's approach focuses on trying to understand the personal and professional development of educators. This requires an understanding of educational processes, their meanings, and their interpretations by the participants in this reality (Yosefun, 2002).

Education used the case study as early as the 1920s, with John Dewey's philosophy (Nath, 2005), but it has become of growing interest in educational research since the 1960s and particularly since the 1980s as a tool for the reflective researcher practitioner (Schön, 1983) engaging in inquiry-led and evidence-based practice. One reason that the case study has become prominent as a teaching tool in recent times is that its use agrees with the most current philosophy of learning in education—Constructivism (Vygotsky, 1997). Educators find that the case study offers a way of teaching, which does not simply transfer knowledge but helps build knowledge in a contextual, social, and interactive setting. Furthermore, using case studies, student practitioner researchers are capable of generating multiple pathways for making decisions about particular situations.

Another reason for case study usage is the increased acceptance of qualitative research in the field of education in the past few decades, where researchers (Yin, 2009) realised that valuable information can be gained through rich anecdotal study—particularly when experimentation or other quantitative methods are not possible or desired. Moreover, due to extensive school demand, case study offers a number of ways to address complexities found in the educational field, including areas such as teaching and learning, administration, educational psychology, multicultural studies, special education, subject areas, and so forth.

A case study in education can: (a) be descriptive of a particular example of interest in some aspect of education, (b) be a pilot or exploratory study, (c) represent a collection with several applicable example cases, or (d) be a critical issue study (Shkedi, 2010). This particular case study is descriptive. I advocate that this study might contribute to
the gap in knowledge of professional development of inclusive educators, which hitherto has underestimated the significance of the personal dimension within training.

Thus, the particularly relevant feature of this study is that it embodies the potential value of multi-dimensional learning and construction of knowledge. Moreover, it contributes to developing a holistic overview of students with SEN that reminds us of the significance of relationships within human interactions as a counter to studies within a rapidly changing technological world, which seems to put less emphasis on the need for inter-personal communication and understanding, and the development of responsible citizens with social values.

4.5. Data Collection Methods

As customary in qualitative research, I used the main research tool – observation—believing that a human researcher can give interpretations and be capable of understanding and assessing the meanings of the various interactions in the field and knowledge hidden below the surface. This knowledge is most important since it attributes real and accurate meanings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). As a researcher who is involved in the investigated reality, I see the participants as objects of knowledge and the researcher as examining this knowledge.

The data of this study was collected mostly at the 'Lovecircles' centre in a city in the centre of Israel. Data collection was done through two different perspectives: that of the researcher and that of the participants. Data was collected using different tools—interviews, personal diaries, observations via video, and stills photographs. Interviews were conducted outside the 'Lovecircles' centre at the participants' request for reasons of accessibility. Further data was collected from participants via the internet. Collecting data by numerous techniques and methods stems from the complexity of the case study (Yosefun, 2001).

The data collection methods used in this study derived from the case study strategy, whereby the researcher was the main research tool. Lincoln & Guba (1985) coined the term 'the person as a research tool' in order to demonstrate the unique role of researchers and their great involvement in data collection and analysis. Researchers are the tool since they are sensitive and flexible enough to take in the complexity and constant
changing of the features of the human occurrence under investigation and its context. Moreover, they can revise the methods according to those changing circumstances (Merriam, 1998). The importance of researchers' wide involvement is that it enables attaining a better understanding of the participants' motives, interests, values, and beliefs, the way they perceive themselves and others, and the reasons for their actions (Woods, 1996). Bar-On (2006) goes even further, saying that a researcher's intuition plays an important role in the research process alongside the methodical scientific tools:

...I am not entirely willing to give up on the role of intuition. I believe in its importance even when it is not sufficiently clear or explicit, because our scientific situation is not so perfect... (p. 10).

In addition to the importance of researchers' involvement, there is also a methodological dilemma of over-involvement that might lead to a distorted perception of reality. Thus, one of the methodological problems for researchers is finding the balance between intimate involvement with participants and setting the necessary distance from the situation, so as to enable critical thinking and re-assessment of the significance of the experiences (Bar-On, 2006). The dilemma was resolved by two epistemologically independent perspectives or sources of data collection: my own perspective as the researcher (observation, photos, and videos) and the participants' perspective through responses to interviews and their diaries (Knoblauch et al., 2008). The conditions did not allow them to respond to my interpretation of the video (they had to be re-invited to personal sessions, which required a great deal of investment), but they did read the texts of all interviews and were invited to respond, comment, make changes and emphasize parts. All 11 original participants responded.

The complexity of case studies and holistic nature of the research require data collection in many different ways in order to reflect the validity and reliability of the case (Charmaz, 2000). The case study becomes scientific, unlike ordinary events, when the researcher uses a variety of methods in the investigation and when these methods can be judged by criteria of validity and reliability (Yin, 1989). The research methods are essentially inductive, documenting events and situations that the researcher collects through them (Yosefun, 2002). Thus, in this study project, data was collected using different methods: interviews, diaries, observations by video, and stills photographs, as explained below.
4.5.1. Observations by Photographs and Videos

The central data collection tool in this study was observations by photographs and videos. This method was chosen since in case studies it is usual to view observation as the central tool (Erickson, 1982, 1986, 2006; Prosser, 1998; Knoblauch et al., 2008). Photographs and videos are considered an effective and valuable way of studying and understanding the process of self and professional development (Rosenstein, 2002). Moreover, photographs and videos are considered a relatively new and alternative form of data collection through which experience is coded (Kacen & Krummer-Nevo, 2010), as conventional forms of data collection often constrain the data in ways that misrepresent the occurrences the researcher wishes to understand. Thus, painting, musical compositions, film documentaries, theatre, art exhibits, and multimedia projects are valid forms of data representation. Their validity arises from what Eisner (2004, p. 100) calls "referential adequacy" and "structural corroboration".

Researchers realised that photographs sharpened the informants' memory and reduced areas of misunderstanding. Collier (1957) argues that "...it has the ability to prod latent memory, to stimulate and release emotional statements about the informant's life..." (p. 858). Likewise, videotext (Rosenstein, 2000), enables researchers to distance themselves from the data. New insights can emerge from repeated viewing of the initial observation during the process of analysis. Incorporating visual data into the research offered a multi-dimensional perception of the verbal text produced through diaries and interviews and the chance for participants themselves to corroborate my interpretations.

According to Harper (2002), photograph elicitation produces a different kind of information. Harper (2002) and Collier (1957) consider photograph elicitation useful in studies that are empirical and rather conventional: photograph elicitation may add validity and reliability. Moreover, photograph elicitation offers deeper insight into a different part of human consciousness than words-only interviews. It is partly due to the way memory is evoked by photographs and partly due to the particular quality of the photograph itself: Kuhn (Weiller, 1997) indicates that a photograph can be material for interpretation in research.

On a critical note, it can be said that the researcher is selective in choosing the photographs in trying to evoke somewhat particular responses from participants. Another issue relates to the representation of the findings – it cannot always be ensured
that the visual data is used to confirm the narrative that the researcher wishes to tell. In this sense, the camera operator may be subjective in trying to capture the events within the frame of photograph and also in what is missed (Harper, 2002; Collier, 1957).

Traditionally, video recording is a method of data capture which, according to Knight & Jefsioutine (2002), acts as

...a preliminary form of data reduction and data analysis. Yet, although it has the possible advantage that, once captured on film the observation can be reviewed and agreed interpretations hammered out, it just defers the complex analytical task of sense-making (p. 9).

I therefore took photographs and videos of art products throughout the 28 sessions of the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Part of this data was actually photos of metaphors which participants themselves used to express their interpretation of what they had learnt throughout the education programme. This data was used as an aid for studying the research questions.

On a critical note, the use of video-recording involved certain limitations relating to the agenda of the camera operator with regard to what is captured within the frame, and which extracts might be chosen for more in-depth analysis. Video recording captures sound as well as image, so the sound comprised additional data. In practice, the video recording enhanced the use of still images alone and thus the participants were involved both in capturing data and in reviewing it.

4.5.2. In-Depth, Semi-Structured Interviews

The second data collection tool in this study was the interview. The reason for choosing it was that this study sought to examine the integration of the self and professional development of the 'Lovecircles' trainees as expressed in their own words, combined with their interpretation of the visual data (photographs and videos). The purpose of the interview was to understand the perceptions of personal and professional changes the participants had undergone as an outcome of their participation in the 'Lovecircles' education programme and its impact on their educational approach to working with children with SEN. Woods (1996) adds another value to the interview, saying that it is not only an information-gathering tool but also a joint process of constructing meaning
of the occurrence in question, where participants both contribute to and are influenced by it.

The type of interview used in this study was an in-depth semi-structured interview (Fontana & Frey, 2000). It is more like a conversation than a formal, structured interview (Shkedi, 2003, 2012) and therefore offers more flexibility to be responsive to the interviewee. It is an open interview, allowing interviewees to speak freely without interruption, showing respect for everything they say. Moreover, the interview focused on a number of aspects of the occurrence through several questions initiated in advance, helping the interviewees to open up and express their attitudes and opinions. Furthermore, it facilitated receiving their input regarding the aspects that I deemed especially important and interesting (Dey, 1993).

I interviewed all 11 original participants after their graduation from the 'Lovecircles' education programme in order to understand their personal and professional development throughout the whole process. At the start of the interview, the aims of the interview and the research in general were explained without too many details, so as not to give them too much direction about what to say (Shkedi, 2003) to minimize social desirability. I conducted in-depth interviews with each of the 11 original participants. Each interview lasted between one and two hours. The length of each interview was spontaneously decided by the interviewee according to the information he or she could or wanted to give to the interviewer. Naturally enough, participants who gave more and richer information about their educational experiences tended to make their interviews longer. The length of the interviews is in line with studies that maintain that 90 minutes is the optimal period of time for an interview (Shkedi, 2003).

To avoid researcher bias, I tried to prevent 'social desirability' effects, which occur when participants want to portray themselves to the researcher in a favourable way. Hence, they try to guess the 'correct' answer or interpret the facial expressions of the researcher (Robson, 1993; Bryman, 2001). The way to resolve this, as Robson (1993) suggested, was to adopt a neutral position and not welcome or reinforce the interviewees by not being seen to be agreeing with them, or sharing similar views to them.

I tried to avoid social desirability effects by not being overtly friendly with the respondents and by not being judgmental about their responses (Bryman, 2004). When people know that they are being studied and observed, their natural reactions change.
Additionally, to reduce the amount of reactivity, I used my professional skills as an educator and art therapist and adopted the 'fly on the wall' strategy, according to which researchers position themselves and behave in such a way that their presence is gradually unnoticed.

Secondly, as the research used semi-structured interviews, this questioned the level of truthfulness of the responses, because of the social desirability effect. To avoid bias, I addressed this point at the outset of each interview, assuring the respondents that the data would be used for research purposes only. Moreover, I highlighted the significance of genuine data, to make the respondents aware of the importance of 'real' reactions and responses.

The participants were asked to reflect on their general experience as learners in the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Meaningful incidents and episodes concerning personal and professional changes that they have undergone were discussed and they were given the opportunity to share their thoughts, feelings, and dilemmas associated with these changes. The first two interviews (with Shanny and Eve) were conducted as a pilot and questions were amended for the remaining nine according to the research aims and questions leading towards enhancement of the comparability of the data.

The first questions were more specific with regard to the details of the programme such as encounters dedicated to specific issues/topics, to relax the participants by requiring a factual answer. The following questions were broader, thus providing more space for personal narrative that could generate information and allow for conceptualization. Questions were revised after I had studied the issue of the structure of questions in educational research interviews, in contrast to therapy interviews. Ultimately, I developed interview questions that integrated the spirit of interviews in both fields of education and therapy (Appendix 17).

Contrary to closed questions that call for short, even single-word answers, open-ended questions that guided the interviews are designed to elicit full answers based on the participants' knowledge and feelings. Open-ended questions also tend to be more objective and less leading than closed-ended questions. Data derived from open-ended questions come in the form of words, phrases, and sentences that have to be combined and simplified into a limited number of categories, to enable data analysis. This process unavoidably entails some loss of information, in addition to the bias of interpretation of
responses (Robson, 1993). To prevent loss of information and distortion of the data, the responses were copied into one computer file and the coding of the total responses was done by the text of the question. This procedure ensured reduced loss and distortion of the data.

The open-ended questions used in this study allowed participants to talk about their perceptions related to their development in their own words, free of constraints imposed by fixed-response questions that are generally seen in quantitative studies. Moreover, the phenomenology approach used in this study generates narratives from more than one source (interviews, diaries) to elicit truth from participant's perceptions.

All the interviews were recorded on videotape and then I transcribed them verbatim to written protocols. The transcription included listening to and recording non-verbal signals such as laughter, pauses, and filler noises (Shkedi, 2003). The recording and exact transcription of the interviews are based on the assumption that every word and even partial word uttered by the interviewees reflects their individual perspectives and feelings, so that converting them to other words might distort their original intent. I transcribed the interviews myself in order to become very thoroughly familiar with the data collected from the interviews. I was also aware of the nonverbal body language signified by a pause in the recording, which would not have been available to a transcriber.

Repeatedly listening to the recordings during the transcription of 'what' was said and noting the comments about 'how' it was said enabled me to get to know the data well enough for precise analysis later on. Noting the 'how' included marginalia about intonation, the 'music' of the words, the level of determination or hesitation, enthusiasm or lack thereof, and so forth. During the interviews, I also took field notes, which constituted part of the context of the interview and were later incorporated into the analysis thereof.

The questions for the interview were aimed at different aspects of the 'Lovecircles' education programme. An example of an interview schedule is included in Appendix 17. The questions in the interview followed quite naturally from the research objectives. The questions' objectives were drawn from the underlying assumptions about the important facts concerning the development the participants underwent and their interpretation of those developments via their educational approach to working within
inclusive contexts (Hannan, 2007). The research aims, the research questions and the conceptual framework informed the formulation of the questions for the interview. For example, Question 1 pertained to personal development, asking whether the participant could identify any meaningful experiences during the 'Lovecircles' education programme. I claim that this is potentially a leading question. Therefore a thorough process took place to pilot the most relevant way to frame questions relating to the research aims and focus.

The questions were tested on two of the 11 original participants for both clarity and validity. They were refined and changed to ensure collection of real data that would promote the aims of the study. (For example, the question 'can you tell me about your emotions you have encountered during the session on the inhibition theme?' was later refined to 'can you tell me about your experiences you have encountered during the session on the inhibition theme?'). It is worth noting that during the interviews, when the participants were presented with visual arts (photographs), this evoked associations that caused them to expand and even drift away. On these occasions, I had to re-focus them on the questions asked to ensure collection of data that could illuminate my study.

The questions in the interview consisted of nine open-ended questions. The questions were constructed as a multi-stage process (Shkedi, 2003) so as to allow participants a respectful enabling space so they could recall their experiences and share them. As emphasized by Shkedi (2003), the first part of the questions was more open, allowing the participants to structure their answers in a way that would be meaningful to them, and the second part presented more focused questions, meaning each stage in the interview had its own style.

The first part included different types of descriptive questions:

- Comprehensive description questions: Describe to me… Tell me about (Questions 4 and 5);
- Descriptive questions focused on more limited aspects of the experiences and positions: What happened in relation to a specific issue (Questions 2 and 3);
- Questions asking for examples: can you give me an example of the occurrence? Please describe a specific case (Questions 4 and 5).
o Experiential questions: Please describe experiences you had in this context? What happened to you? How did you feel during the occurrence? (Questions 6 and 7).

The second part comprised meaning-related questions, based on participants' experiences, where they had to clarify the meanings and logic underpinning their descriptions. This allowed for learning about the way in which the interviewees perceived and understood their experiences in the programme and how they served as grounds for their personal and professional development, later applying these experiences in the field. For example: Why? For what purpose? What was the intention? What was the reason? (Question 8). The third part consisted of a complementary question (Question 9). This question enabled the participants to relate to issues that they had not discussed during the interview to make them feel that their words are significant and interesting (Spradley, 1979; Shkedi, 2003) and to raise issues and themes that had not been covered during the rest of the interview.

Interviews are considered methods by which learners retrospectively conceptualise learning occurrences and episodes. They actually reflect on their experience as learners, while adopting a 'second order' report (Marton, 1978). When learners retain an accurate record of their relevant mental activity, their accounts are likely to depend, at least in part, on inferences and re-constructions derived from their own participative and implicit theories of the process involved (Nisbett & Wilson, 1977; Ericsson & Simon, 1984; White, 1989; Zeichner & Noffke, 2001).

Another part of the interview was connected to the method of visual analysis for the meaning of the photographs expressed by participants (Chiozzi, 1989; Harper, 2001). Therefore, this data collection was done by discussing the meaning of the chosen photographs with the participants, attempting to decipher their meaning according to the research questions (Harper, 2002).

Quail and Peavy (1994) advocate that participants' verbal descriptions of their experience through photographs of expressive art products concerning an event (for example their personal and professional development), can serve as a significant source of data for later systematic analysis. This enables the researcher to stay close to the lived experience by the participants for the purpose of them revealing its meaning. Hence, research questions referring to art activities done throughout the programme via their
photographs, along with verbal descriptions of the experience, contribute to the understanding of the participants' meaning of their experience. In this light the questions in the semi-structured interview do not focus on cause and effect but rather on personal dimension aspects.

**4.5.3. Diaries**

The third data collection tool in this study consisted of the participants' diaries, used as a method for developing their own self-expression skills. This was part of their assignments throughout the education programme. In this study, diaries facilitated an understanding of the nature of the self and professional identity development process of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Diaries are frequently used in qualitative research (Toms & Duff, 2002). They are 'natural', they contain personal meanings and understandings, and they are process-oriented. In a sense, they enable observing and interviewing by proxy.

Consequently, diaries are a purposeful tool for recording experiences and enhancing insights concerning the occurrences studied. Diaries, also called journals, logs (Day, 1993; McDonough and McDonough, 1997), or field notes (Diaz-Maggioli, 2004) are a personal account of events, usually written in a narrative manner. There is extensive literature on diary writing and diaries as a research tool. Jones, S. (2008b) assessed the significant value of diary writing as a research tool and indicated the limitations. She claims issues of objectivity and validity could be resolved by combining diary writing with other research methods.

Diaries have long been a source of data for biographers and literary scholars. More recently, the diary as a source of data has been adapted for use by psychologists, sociologists, health care researchers, market researchers, and information scientists (Toms & Duff, 2002). What differentiates the two user groups is the approach taken with regard to the use of diaries as a data collection method. While the former (biographers) rely on the diary as a personal journal that is independently composed, the latter (psychologists) have come to use diaries as a structured means of prompting individuals to record details of everyday life events as a research diary (Toms & Duff, 2002).
Use of diaries as a research tool is now well established (Schumann, 1980; Bailey, 1990; Jarvis, 1992; Jones S., 2008b). In any type of research where a person is trying to make sense of an experience, and where the personal of view is a variable in the research, diaries are called for (Somekh & Lewin, 2005). Diaries are a means to better understanding of practices. They allow the user to perform the reflection needed to reach personal insight, to learn from experience (Jones S., 2008b). The unstructured nature of the data collection via diaries might illustrate wide aspects of the experience perceived by participants, for example, cognitive, social, and emotional processes, allowing capture of further information than what is included as questions in a questionnaire. They are sometimes able to provide insight into phenomena that were not obvious nor predicted initially (Somekh & Lewin, 2005).

Hence, the diary as a tool of data collection cannot be seen as something new. However, interest in its usage in a research context has steadily increased throughout the 20th century and specific categories of research diaries have emerged (Johnson & Bytheway, 2001). The different types reflect the fact that diaries can contain different information, take different forms, and are used for different purposes (Toms & Duff, 2002).

The diaries in this research were part of the learning process – these were personal journey diaries where participants were asked to document the learnt contents and the processes they experienced afterwards. Participants knew the diaries were personal and would serve them as a tool for self-attuning through the programme, and they would be able to choose independently what they wanted to share with the group or not.

As for this research, the participants were given explanations regarding the meaning of a journey-diary as auxiliary means for understanding the process they have undergone in the course of their development. Those who wished could share the diary or parts of it. They cooperated willingly, as they had come to the programme seeking to find a different solution for their professional development and realized the significance and potential contribution of their participation in the current research.

The type of data that diarists are required to record can be as varied as the types of diaries themselves. What is typically common to the information that is sought is that it is of the kind that usually would not be recalled accurately, unless it is recorded immediately after the activity had taken place. For that reason, diaries can be used to encourage an immediacy of data recording that prevents inaccuracy and enables the
collection of a 'complete' picture. As such, those kinds of diary are typically very structured and cover a specific time period (Dillman, 2000). What has increasingly come to be acknowledged is that diaries can be put to a use beyond the collection of 'micro' data and can equally be applied to the collection of data about a process. As Toms and Duff (2002) note, "the diary can encapsulate a lengthy, mostly non-observable process" (p. 1236), i.e. diaries can go beyond 'counting' and 'collecting' to 'describing' and 'reflecting'.

The approach to the diaries was open, so that each participant was invited to find the way that was best for him or her to document the process and manage the diary verbally or visually. The goal of writing a diary was clarified with emphasis on the significance of the diary such as the importance of the characteristics of the contents, including processes they document for themselves and contribute to their development.

This method can be used with other more interactive methods, such as interviews that allow clarification and verification of patterns emerging from the diaries. The advantages of using diaries for data collection may help researchers as well as participants to understand their own learning processes. On the other hand, the limitation of using diaries for data collection is that the time that elapses between observations, behaviour, reflection, and completion of the diary may mean that participants cannot remember much about an experience or their reaction to it. The goal of writing the diary was the documentation of contents and processes. Writing was done during and between sessions, as reflection, a sort of "a personal encounter with self".

The diaries were thus an integral part of the studies in this programme. The participants had to fulfil the following instructions: (1) Document the processes that transpired during the sessions; (2) Write down their personal impression of the processes during the sessions, including emotions, feelings, thoughts, and insights; (3) Both documentation and impressions could be verbal or non-verbal, according to the participants' choice. The diaries were designed to document the participants' personal and professional voyage during the programme, express and create a personal space and a reflective tool of self-attention as well as serve as a basis for the end-of-programme assignment in addition to keeping a reflective dairy through the ‘Lovecircles’ programme.
The 'Lovecircles' tutor is not perceived as a teacher figure who assesses learning via grades, but rather relies on such qualities as support and listening during the process, a fact which is expressed both theoretically and practically, to develop the participants' authentic self-expression based on trusting interaction with the tutor, and grades are not part of the programme's approach or goals. Hence, issues of influential factors' influence on the expression of authentic feelings were discussed.

Diaries were chosen for data collection to develop an insight about the participants' interpretations that are not easily accessible by methods involving interaction with them. I decided to involve the participants in the design of the diary. Thus, the choice of format was left to each participant, since the approach and the format they choose may in itself be important information for informing their process of development.

I collected 11 diaries – one from each of the participants. One of the participants has dyslexia and preferred expressing himself in non-verbal forms. Interpretation of the diaries was done cautiously: the researcher needs to know the basis and motivation on which they were compiled. They are particularly strong when used in conjunction with other methods (Bloor & Wood, 2006). To validate the interpretation of their diary entries, it was triangulated with all other data that was collected and with participants commenting on the accuracy of my interpretations.

Writing and analysing my own research diary was an especially enriching experience for me. It enhanced my awareness of my personal and professional dimension, which has been transformed throughout the period of this research. Hence, I found it a powerful reflective tool leading to better understanding of both viewpoints—the participants’ and mine. Recording interviews on tape and videoing sessions were also helpful methods used in the research. The variety of tools sustained and enriched my understanding of the events studied in this research. Moreover, I realised that listening repeatedly to the videotapes and recordings was an efficient tool for me since I was sensitive to body language and voice intonation.

Diaries are an example of an in-depth application of a phenomenological research approach used in art therapy (Quail & Peavy, 1994). This approach leaves the observer-therapist and researcher open to describe the studied occurrences. Thus, findings are not presented as facts but offer an in-depth observation of the emerged experience, promoting discussion for wider understanding. Advocating an attitude of openness to
the possibilities, expressive therapy can contribute to theoretical perspectives of studied issues from other disciplines. Consequently it interrelates with other disciplines in a meaningful way by allowing the events to speak for themselves (McNiff, 1986).

Teaching based on intuition and insight decoded in diaries can provide understanding of learners' perceptions, leading to affective instruction (Jeffrey & Hadley, 2002). Diary studies require a lot of dedication because they are time consuming by nature and can become laborious. While writing a diary is less demanding than preparing and undertaking questionnaire research, it takes much longer than conventional research methods to interpret properly once it has been written up.

### 4.6. Research Design

The research period was from June 2006 through to June 2011:

- During the **first phase** of the study, June 2006-January 2009:
  - Diaries collected from participants.
  - Visual data collection
- During the **second phase** of the study, January 2009-June 2009:
  - Reflections of the researcher
  - Perusal of the literature
- During the **third phase** of the study, April 2009-May 2009:
  - First two in-depth, open-ended interviews conducted
- During the **fourth phase** of the study, June 2009-December, 2011:
  - Perusal of the literature
- During the **fifth phase** of the study, May 2010-June 2010
  - Eleven interviews conducted
- During the **sixth phase** of the study, July 2010-December 2011
  - Data analysis
  - Perusal of the literature

I read and re-read the narratives from the transcribed tape-recordings, making sense of the entire statement. Qualitative research emphasises the process of generating meaningful theories: it creates these theories by phases of discovery and subsequent test phases, while alternating and interacting in a 'spiral movement' (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). The 'spiral movement' is embodied in a sequence of data collection, which was carried out through six phases along four years of ethnographic fieldwork, incorporating inductive methodologies.
Since this study mainly engages in exploring and understanding the perspectives, actions, feelings, and attitudes of the participants, it was appropriate to use loosely structured methods at first. More structured methods of inquiry were used in the later phases (3-4) to study and understand the meanings and insights that emerged. Stronger generalisation claims could have been made then in terms of reliability. The six phases that focused upon the same research occurrence provided consistency and coherence to the study; the evidence of each phase had a bearing on the investigation in the subsequent phase. Figure 4.1 indicates the research phases that lasted from June 2006 to December 2011.

![Figure 4.1: Research phases](image)

The spiral figure demonstrates the 'emergent design' of the research phases and the development processes. The spiral on the left, has led to development of the 'Lovecircles' logo, on the right, as a symbol for the spiral and evolving development approach.
4.7. **Data Analysis Methods**

The analysis process has several aims: it enables the researcher to move from the field text to the research text; the process of analysis enables the researcher to give the research direction and decide how to proceed. Moreover, it allows the researcher to link the findings to the theory and then link these findings to those of other researchers (Gibton, 2002).

This process provides new perspectives, and analysis of interconnecting themes may provide useful insights. The depth afforded by qualitative analysis is believed by many researchers to be the best method for understanding the complexity of educational practice (Sabar-Ben Yehoshua, 1998, 2001; Shkedi, 2003, 2012). Qualitative analysis is also well suited for exploration of unanticipated results. Above all, it is concerned with finding meaning embedded within rich sources of information of complex data.

Methods of analysis in this study argue for consistency of a phenomenological, art-based, theoretical approach, considering its strengths and weaknesses to triangulate validity of findings. This study aims to explore the participants' perceptions, feelings and lived experiences, and as such, it is located within a phenomenology approach using a unique set of methods and procedures (Moustakas, 1994). According to Walsham (1993), there is no objective reality that can be uncovered by researchers and replicated by others, contrary to the positivist science approach.

The principles of phenomenological hermeneutics can provide an interpretive framework to examine the concrete nature of the art materials. The phenomenological attitude means staying open to new meanings being revealed; to never impose an interpretation as fact but to use interpretation to shed light and provide the possibility of understanding and the development of new meanings. In art therapy the artwork is considered as a text, and as such it can "speak" to us. In phenomenology the artwork is approached as ‘text’ with openness to both address and to be addressed by the art (Van Manen, 2002).

The phenomenological method fosters an attentive sense of wonder in the world and hermeneutic practice continually aims at open-ended interpretation, the recognition of bias, and the relating of part to whole and whole to part. Betensky (1995) wrote
“phenomenology offers an answer to a long needed unbiased approach to art therapy in all its spheres: theory, training, and professional practice” (p. 13).

The hermeneutic phenomenological method applied to art therapy considers both the art and art making as text and the writing as text. It holds that meaning will continually emerge and that there will always be the possibility of new meanings. The phenomenology of the art therapist is the ability to perceive and describe with openness and wonder, the ability to describe without explaining, judging, or making assumptions, the ability to look with intention and to consider everything in context and relationship, and to intuitively distil the essence. These are all important therapeutic qualities (Van Manen, 2002).

4.7.1. Methodological Steps Following the Phenomenological Approach

Data analysis consisted of methodological steps following the phenomenological approach (Cohen et al., 2003). Hence, the reader is presented with the description of the visual analysis process of the pictures and video (Section 4.7.2), the analysis process of the interviews and the diaries (Section 4.7.3), and a summary of data analysis methods and theoretical references’ interpretative approach (Table 4.2).

4.7.2. Visual Analysis

How were the pictures and video analysed?

- The audiotapes were transcribed verbatim by the researcher.
- The written transcripts were read several times to gain a sense of the whole.
- Following the method of Giorgi (1975, 1989), the transcripts were read and noted in the form of meaning units, every time a meaning concerning personal and professional development occurred. These were placed in categories of what the participants experienced and what enabled this experience.
- Procedures described by Wertz (1983) for reflecting on phenomenal descriptions were used to slow down and achieve wide perception of the data and to discover implicit and deeper meanings.
o Each photograph of an art product that the participant described was noted in order to study these experiences as a whole.

I became familiarised with these procedures and began exploring the data for levels of meaning (Giorgi, in Von Eckartsberg, 1986). The methodological procedures serve the main purpose of immersion in the data and not closing down on them too quickly.

The inherent complexities contained in the photographs of art products revealed their meaning through the participant's descriptions and leading to the ability to integrate coherent meanings.

Colaizzi's (1978) suggestion of extracting significant statements was used for each of the delimited areas above, and these were then clustered into themes under each category. Descriptions of the essential themes were written and rewritten, organised and reorganised several times, always being mindful of the whole experience (by returning to the transcripts). In this way, the thematic statements were viewed as being constituents of the whole experience. The constituents were also organised into the structure of the experience (what the participant experienced in the programme) and what enabled this experience.

Statements of the thematic constituents with descriptions by each participant as examples of a possible actualisation of an essential characteristic were written for each delimited area of experience. A formulated structure was then written for each participant's personal and professional experiences, the core principles enabling thesis development, and the impact on personal development within inclusion.

Data analysis was carried out over an extended period of time. This was not a linear process, although it is presented in this way. I continually returned to the original transcripts to ground my intuitions in the experience of the participants. This is an example of intuition through tuition (Bar-On, 2006), learning from the data through familiarisation with the material in more than an intellectual sense. The essential structure and coherence emerged from the data and the researcher. The process could not be rushed or drawn to a quick intellectual conclusion.

My decisions were based on a systematic but intuitive approach derived through extensive experience. Hence, the essential structures and essence of a participant's experience in expressive therapy were co-constituted by me as their tutor and influenced
by my training as an art therapist and the descriptive experience of the participants and
the way in which they were presented as interpreted by me as their tutor and as
researcher. Ulman (1987) mentioned that art therapists are aware that they can know in
different ways that, besides the logical, sequential, and rational, there is the intuitive,
holistic, and visual-spatial process.

Photographs taken of art outcomes during the 'Lovecircles' sessions were analysed for
their meaning to the participants (Chiozzi, 1989; Harper, 2001). This visual data was
analysed based on a photograph elicitation process (Prosser, 1998; Harper, 2002).
Harper (2002, p. 22) suggests "photo-elicitation mines deeper shafts of different
parts of the human consciousness than do words-alone interviews". However, while
analysing the photograph's meaning, I was aware that analysis of images raises complex
methodological and theoretical issues (Silverman, 1993). For example, the notion that
photographs are by nature ambiguous and do not in themselves convey meanings, was
taken into consideration throughout the data analysis. Moreover, using photographs as
an interview device needed careful reflection as Walker & Weidel (1985, p. 143)
explain:

...Ambiguity (of a photograph) can be turned to strength when it is used to
elicit responses or communicate complex messages... to get them
(interviewees) thinking and talking reflectively... what is important about the
picture is determined, in part at least, by what people say about it...
20).

As my background is in art therapy, visual tools such as photographs and drawings were
one of the means used for studying participants' perceptions while expressing their
emotions, thinking, and reflecting. Interpretations are based on a holistic-humanistic
expression of emotions via arts, philosophy, and theory (Kramer, 1979; Rubin, 1998;
Moon, 2007). Visual analysis of videos of the 'Lovecircles' education programme
provided the participants' best accounts. The combination of sound and vision produces
a three-dimensional experience that makes it easier for interpretation. Visual analysis is
considered a relevant method when dealing with 'sensitive' material, such as learning
and development, especially when the materials are related to practitioners (Derry,
2007). Therefore, analysing the participants' video recorded visual material led to
deeper understandings than interviews alone, because it provided knowledge of the
context in which the research transpired.
Moreover, thoughtful reflective dialogues that were video recorded fostered an active exchange of ideas about self and professional development and their impact on working with children with SEN based on the research questions (Hogan, 1997). In addition, it enabled me to see things that participants themselves were not aware of, or that they were unwilling to discuss (Patton, 1980).

Visual analysis of the participants' art works was performed based on my experience within the expressive therapy field in health and education (Kramer, 1979; Rubin, 1998; Moon, 2007). Moreover, my approach was based on the epistemological value of images in educational research (Paulston, 1996, 1999; Bogdan & Biklen, 1998), namely images and photographs (Margolis, 2000) embody the possibility of contributing, as art-based research, to the field of education (Weber & Mitchell, 1995; Mitchell & Weber, 1998; Diamond et al., 1999).

The analysis of photographs and video footage was not isolated from the environment. It was done in consideration of the context of the data collection: location and scenes throughout the programme. The photographs chosen by the participants were analysed for the purpose of finding meanings. As Margolis (2000) comments,

...Ripped free from context, photographs become free floating signifiers that appear to be little snippets of reality and can used to bolster or 'prove' a variety of contradictory theses (p. 5).

Analysis based on acknowledging the importance of the context of images, while analysing the data, is recognised by other scholars of visual culture (Miller, 1992; Chaplin, 1994; Elkins, 2000). Visual analysis procedures consisted of the participants' as well as my own interpretations and meanings as 'ways of seeing'. Moreover, interpretation of the data was performed based on my knowledge in the fields of holistic-humanistic philosophy of education, developmental social psychology, and expressive therapy (Buber, 1965; Rogers, 1971). Additionally, it was informed by my specialisation in research approaches, such as dynamic, phenomenological, and constructivist approaches that are in line with interpretation approaches common in the field of art therapy (Kramer, 1979; Rubin, 1998; Moon, 2007).

All encounters were videotaped and the pictures created by the participants during the encounters were taken by them or by staff members, as part of their studies about visual and expressive literacy – creating, expressing, and speaking via words and pictures.
Consequently, the integration of both fields of academic knowledge and practical experience—education and therapy—served as the main pillars that sustained my interpretation of the findings.

This included listening based on holistic humanistic principles (Rogers, 1980) empathetic listening, echo back, mirroring multi-dimensional attention to personal and professional dimensions, and using multi-dimensional tutoring styles, such as both verbal and non-verbal means. This integrative approach created for the participants an open atmosphere and space. As a result, they shared their perceptions concerning the experiences they underwent throughout the 'Lovecircles' education programme in an atmosphere free of criticism, judgment, and expectation (social desirability), i.e. in an authentic way.

The catalyst was the way they were supported emotionally on their way to developing tutoring skills. This approach constitutes a multi-dimensional space for participants to express themselves and, at the same time, for the researchers to identify a variety of aspects emerging from conversations as a means of examining their interpretation in a way that is most loyal to the data presented to them. The empathetic conversation (Shkedi, 2009) enables researchers to ask clarification questions. This is due to the fact that the interview is conducted as a dialogue in a pleasant atmosphere, so that researchers can intensify the accuracy of their interpretation of the data.

### 4.7.3. Interpretative Approach

**Analysis of the interviews and the diaries**

In the interviews, some of the questions pertained to photographs. I presented pictures of the works they had created and the experiences of the encounters. I asked them to choose what was significant for them and what they were willing to share through the pictures, with reference to their development in the course of the programme.

I analysed (appendices 2-4 & 18) their statements about the pictures as an integral part of the interview. Additionally, I chose pictures that demonstrated other angles of my interpretations. Following are details of the analysis process. The diaries also included reflective writing about the participants' experiences throughout the programme, including writing about works they had created, about which they chose to write.
In the interpretation process, I used the extensive knowledge and experience that I have accumulated as a teacher integrating creative approaches and as an integrative-holistic expressive therapist (for example using movement, art, photography, drama, and music). These professional skills that I had acquired facilitated attention to the data and their interpretation into verbal and non-verbal characteristics. Moreover, I integrated in the interpretation process knowledge from the field of movement therapy, which is based on principles and theories prevalent in this field including features such as respiration, movement styles, sequence, and intensity. These are concepts describing the patterns of human movement, which help us recognise implicit aspects and turn them into overt and conscious aspects (Chaiklin & Schamai, 1979; Levy et al., 1995; Naess, 1998; Payne, 2006). All these provided a response to possible criticism and increased reliability of the interpretation.

Another approach that served as a channel of interpretation was discourse and narrative analysis (Kupferberg and Green, 2001). Both approaches are suitable for teaching and literacy as well as for Expressive Therapy. The latter uses linguistic metaphors as a tool of attention and emotional expression in an indirect method, facilitating elimination of emotional blocks and acquiring communication skills. Metaphors are a tool/means associated with the field of pedagogy since they enable the development of abstract and creative thinking, using extensive vocabulary usage and rich language – based on the literacy approach (Blum-Kulka, 2005).

Furthermore, interpretation in this study was based on the participants' perceptions and interpretations. After becoming acquainted with them during the education programme, practicum, and data collection process, all 11 original participants were given the opportunity to verify and authenticate their data. The participants received the data prior to its analysis and were asked to authenticate, add, and even change them. This approach is supported by researchers (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 2001), who view this activity applied by researchers as a way to support and corroborate interpretation of the findings through their dialogue with participants.

Consequently, interpretation relies on aspects from two content areas – teaching and therapy, literacy and emotional expression – which are both my areas of specialisation. The tools used for the interpretation process manifested this integrative specialisation. This wide interpretation, on the one hand, led to caution and respect for the participants
and the truth of the collected data; while on the other hand, it entailed further observation of the rules of ethics (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 2001).

Five criteria guided the emergence of the themes: research aims, research questions, conceptual framework, frequency of appearance, and repetitiveness. Art and emotion were identified as core themes, as they emerged from the analysis.

A detailed example of the analysis of one video recording is supplied separately with this thesis. The video excerpts present significant issues of the 'Lovecircles' programme, such as a dialogue between a mentor and a participant showing how obstacles can become an empowering experience through art. The excerpt shows the nature of the interaction, which was based on listening to the participant’s feelings and the influence of the process on the development of the participant's listening to herself and the role of art as a means of identifying and conceptualizing one's emotions on the personal level as grounds for application on the professional level. This excerpt shows how during the encounter, participants are supported and accompanied in the framework of the group process. Developmental research focuses on the change and process of human development or aspects of behaviour such as professional practice in particular educational contexts; in this study, inclusion. I based the data analysis methods on knowledge and experience that I had accumulated as a teacher, integrating creative approaches and as an integrative-holistic expressive therapist (for example, movement, art, photography, drama, and music). All these data analysis methods provided a response to possible critique and increased reliability of the interpretation. Table 4.2 summarises the data analysis methods and the theoretical sources on which they are based.
Table 4.2: Data analysis methods and theoretical references

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data analysis methods</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interpretivism— in contrast to positivist science approach</td>
<td>Walsham, 1993.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourse and the narrative analysis – metaphors as a tool of attention and emotional expression</td>
<td>Kupferberg &amp; Green, 2001; Blum-Kulka, 2005.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metaphors within expressive therapy express oneself leading to personal fulfilment, emotional reparation and transformation</td>
<td>Malchiodi, 2005.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art as means of symbolic communication within art therapy, leading to insight; resolving conflicts; solving problems though positive perceptions changes. Integrating psychotherapy and the Arts, enhancement of awareness of the body sustains the exploration of relationships and communication with the self and with others</td>
<td>Halprin, 2002; Bartal &amp; Ne’eman, 1992.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative arts therapy field enriches the field of education integrating resources</td>
<td>Bartal &amp; Ne’eman, 1992.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.8. Ethical Issues

I considered ethical issues particularly in relation to human participants and potential psychological difficulties inherent in personal development work. Milgram's (1974) study was influential in helping researchers acknowledge that experimental procedures have the potential of harming participants both physically and psychologically. Thus, I have considered the possibility of varied emotions that might accompany the training.
and I carefully focused on not perceiving any particular emotions for assessment in this study.

Hence, the participants in the research were informed when enrolling in the training that it is a development process integrating professional development and personal dimensions. It focuses on emotions by using verbal and non-verbal modalities from the field of expressive art therapy, but it is not a therapy process. Thus, attending to and expressing emotions would be an integral part of the training and carefully contained for the sake of participants, following ethical rules within principles from both expressive therapy and education (Y.H.A.D, The Israeli Union of Expressive Therapy, Dec 28, 2008 – Appendix 1.b, Ethical Principles for Art Therapists American Art Therapy Association, Inc.), Ministry of Health, Regulation of Health Professions Practice Law (2008) and as approved by the ethics research committee of Anglia Ruskin University (ARU). Additionally, participants were informed that integrating attention to emotions within the training was designed to serve as a model for developing their skills of inclusive teaching, through experiential strategies for integrating the personal dimension of students with SEN.

To prevent a situation of coercion, it was made clear to the participants that in no way should they feel pressured to participate in the research and that they could withdraw at any time should they wish. This information about the 'Lovecircles' approach was presented to participants prior to their enrolment in the programme either at my lectures in educational settings and on the 'Lovecircles' website (Lovecircles.co.il). As my position of researcher was alongside my other roles as developer of and tutor of the programme, trained expressive therapist, and creative teacher, I did my utmost to be aware of this issue and critique my decisions throughout all research phases. An underlying assumption of the qualitative paradigm involves the relationships between researcher and the researched. The researcher is not seen as separate from the researched, but, to quote the famous Geertzian phrase, is “an animal suspended in webs of significance he himself has spun,” (Geertz, 1973, p. 5). Because as a researcher I was part of the reality I studied, it was impossible for me to remain neutral. Instead, my goal was to be aware and conscious of my biases and prejudices and to monitor them through the processes of data collection and analysis.
In accordance with ARU’s Ethics Review Checklist (see Appendix 1.a) and as a qualitative investigation, this study's approach raised a number of central ethical issues involving a qualitative researcher's dilemmas during research.

4.8.1. Informed Consent

The first ethical question is that of the informed consent of all participants to take part in this study. This consent seeks to ensure that each participant has properly assessed the advantages and disadvantages of participating and has consciously decided to do so (Howe & Dougherty, 1993). The informed consent safeguards the autonomy of participants. Behavioural research (Howe & Dougherty, 1993) justifies exposing participants to potentially risky situations by relying on the principle of informed consent, which requires that research participants be told about potential stressors prior to their participation. Thus, this information sustains participants in making a decision whether to expose themselves voluntarily to such risks for the sake of science.

Primary concerns are to minimise physical and psychological risk and to obtain informed consent from participants. Prior consent must be obtained from participants, their parents or other advocates. Ethical codes guide researchers in devising appropriate procedures for research for participants and respecting the confidentiality of their responses. Institutional Review Boards are instrumental in assisting researchers to adhere to ethical standards. Their informed consent to this study was given in writing by means of a consent form (see Appendix 1.a: Ethics Review Checklist) and approved by ARU's research ethics committees.

The consent form clarifies that participants could refuse to take part in this study and withdraw at any time by simply completing the withdrawal slip at the bottom of the consent form and forwarding it to the researcher. Furthermore, agreement to participate in this study did not compromise participants' legal rights as participants in the training programme. Participation in this study did not embody any physical or emotional risk. During the project an open door policy and professional support was provided. All the collected data would be used for this study only. Strict confidentiality and anonymity of the participants would be kept and access to the research results would be restricted to the researcher. I reassured the participants that the data would be stored in a locked
cabinet and that the digital data would be saved in a computer with access limited only to the researcher. As perceived by Habermas (1996), in order to discuss and learn about facts, events, opinions, interests, and perspectives of others it is necessary to create an atmosphere free of coercion or inequalities that would prompt individuals to acquiesce or be silent. This involvement develops the autonomy of individuals and is a learning process. Moreover, as the participants were my students, social desirability (Bryman, 2004) had to be taken in consideration as well.

The issue of informed consent raises questions regarding the requirement to provide participants with full and detailed information about the research. Various qualitative researchers in the field of psychology, for example, are divided in their opinions about this aspect of informed consent (Bar-On, 2006). Nevertheless, qualitative researchers in education tend to negate any kind of misleading or obfuscation of participants and argue in favour of providing full information about the research and its objectives (Lincoln & Guba, 1989).

Despite this strong stance, qualitative researchers in general and in education in particular actually find it hard to properly inform their participants. This is due to the nature of qualitative research in that it undergoes a process of development where, as was mentioned, the research questions, the execution of the research, and its limitations are shaped during the field work and in response to data collected. This means that the researcher is actually unable to provide a complete and detailed picture of the research at the outset (when the informed consent is needed) and thus cannot promise to act only within the framework of what was originally agreed upon (Dushnik & Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 2000). This issue accompanied me and guided my actions throughout the research process.

4.8.2. Privacy and Anonymity

An additional ethical issue of this study deals with my protection of the participants’ privacy. This problem arose because the nature of qualitative research exposes participants to the scrutiny of researchers who are not able to tell them in advance exactly what they will be looking at. Even when researchers are looking at a specific issue, they are interested in a variety of different aspects in order to capture the complexity of the topic. Moreover, qualitative researchers cannot make do with only
overt observation of participants, but also seek to learn about participants' attitudes, beliefs and their interpretations of their actions, all of which increase their exposure (Creswell, 1998).

My need for maximum exposure of everything connected to the occurrence under investigation actually contradicts the commitment to protect participants' privacy. This gives rise to the dilemma regarding the extent to which researchers should limit their access to information to safeguard participants' privacy. In other words, the dilemma is about the distinction between what is 'public' and what is 'private' (Dushnik & Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 2000).

In this study, I dealt with the dilemma of private versus public by maintaining the anonymity of participants, not divulging any detail that could expose their identity. Therefore, pseudonyms are used in the Table 4.1. But this anonymity of participants raises a new dilemma involving the quality of the research. Refraining from publication of any identifiable detail might undermine the 'thick description' of the research context and thus negatively impact its reliability (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998).

Anonymity in this study was an especially difficult issue since it is hard to describe the context of the occurrence under investigation without mentioning the exact name of the place where it takes place – the 'Lovecircles' centre. The use of visual data (videotapes of group work) might reveal identities. Therefore accommodation must be made when disseminating the research findings. A decision was made not to submit any visual data for assessment of the thesis that may reveal participants' identities.

4.8.3. Reciprocity and Partnership

Another important ethical issue that loomed large in this study involved one of the prominent features of qualitative research, namely the distance between me as the researcher and the participants, as well as the fact that the research is conducted 'with the participants' and not 'of the participants'. According to Sabar Ben-Yehoshua (1998), the researcher-participants dialogue regarding the meaning of the investigated reality and the way they interpret it, extends the ethics of qualitative research in the direction of reciprocity and partnership. Nevo (2001) goes even further, saying that teachers-mentors' contribution of authentic knowledge from the field and their expertise in the
practice of teaching is just as important to the research as the theoretical contribution of the researcher.

This situation of partnership in constructing the research creates a serious ethical dilemma concerning the ownership of the knowledge at the later stages of the research. Noddings (1986) raises the ethical question: "To whom does the research data belong if the data was constructed jointly by the researcher and the participants?" Researchers are divided in their positions on this issue. Some argue that the data belongs to the participants (for example Schwartz, 1993); while others believe that one can allow participants to restrict data collection and use, but allow the researcher exclusivity for summary and publication (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998; Glaser, 2000). I addressed this issue by sending the collected raw data to the participants, asking for their approval for the research aims (as stated in the invitation for participation in the research they had received prior to commencement).

The dilemma of ownership of research data raises yet another ethical question: "To whom does the researcher owe loyalty: to the participants or to the integrity of the research?" (Noddings, 1986). This dilemma stems from the fact that the researcher's commitment to the integrity of the research might lead to publication of a report that is harmful to participants, making them feel betrayed by the researcher (Noddings, 1986). Moreover, the loyalty dilemma leads to another question: "Should research conclusions that are likely to hurt the participants be drawn by researchers who are actually colleagues of the participants?" (Noddings, 1986). This issue may be compounded by the fact that participants paid fees in the expectation of positive outcomes for themselves. However, as people pay as well in colleges in Israel, I suppose it might not have an impact on their behaviour. Lincoln (1993) resolves this ethical dilemma saying that she considers the researcher's commitment to be an integration of the interpretations of participants and researcher, other interpretations, and the confrontation thereof. She stipulates that in this manner a researcher can contribute to the empowerment of participants and also ensure the validity and credibility of the research.

I concur with the approach of Lincoln (1993) regarding the dilemma of loyalty to participants as opposed to loyalty to the integrity of the study, finding it appropriate to combine the two and act according to this principle. This combination resolves the dilemma by providing a response to the two focal points of importance. But not only that, it might lead to a by-product of the research that actually empowers the
participants. It enables them to deal with difficulties in their work which emerge from the research and their exposure to those difficulties. Thus, it facilitates their professional growth.

4.9. Methodological Issues

In this study, the authority and 'lived experience' (Van Manen, 1990) of my own practice as a professional educational therapist should not be dismissed as merely 'participative'. Instead, it was an integral part of sharing thoughtful, critical reflections on that experience, as a way of developing a shared body of knowledge. To avoid bias caused by reliance on the 'human instrument', this study chose to adopt several strategies. Sanger (1996) recommended "qualitative research defends itself by invoking justificatory processes, such as triangulation...trustworthiness" (p. 178). Hence, the information and data collected by using different types of theoretical approaches and disciplines were triangulated to enrich evidence and reinforce validity. The validity is derived from the five-phase design, which is supported by various methods and tools and triangulation of multiple sources of evidence such as different points of view (the semi-structured interviews, the visual data, and the diaries) addressing personal and professional development dimensions (Mason, 1996) while using the same research questions.

Another strategy for enhancing 'credibility' and 'transferability' was the choice of the case study framework design for this study. The sampling of the cases requires in-depth data collection, involving multiple sources of information, which were rich in context (Creswell, 1998). Regarding the need for justifying strategies of sampling and choosing case studies, Patton (1980) argues that

...the validity, meaningfulness and the insights generated from qualitative inquiry have more to do with the information-richness of the cases selected and the observational/analytical capabilities of the researcher, than with sample size... (p. 185).

Furthermore, Patton (1980) contends that the researcher needs to exercise caution "not to over-generalise from purposeful samples, while maximising to the full the advantages of in-depth, purposeful sampling..." (p. 186).
4.9.1. Validity

The traditional paradigm perceives validation as a process of building a scientific argument that is theoretically and empirically based, supports the conclusions of the study and negates possible alternative explanations (Birnbaum, 1997). Conversely, according to Lincoln & Guba (2000), one method or a collection of methods is not the highway to ultimate knowledge. Validity in a qualitative study involves the question of "whether the researcher sees what he thinks he sees" (Kirk & Miller, 1986, in: Shkedi, 2003, p. 71). A valid explanation of an occurrence in question in a quantitative study is one that can be defended both empirically and theoretically (Dey, 1993).

Thus, the issue of empirical validity involves measurement tools that perform the measurement in a certain way during the research process and may change or be adjusted during the analysis. The findings are valid if they are properly based on the declared perspective of the researcher. The question of theoretical validity involves matching the empirical aspect. In qualitative research, the theoretical aspect develops throughout the research process until the final report is written. In this manner, validation means going back and forth between the theoretical perspective of the study and the data, the findings, and the conclusions (Dey, 1993).

With regard to the concept of validity, researchers distinguish between internal validity and external validity, also called generalisability. Lincoln & Guba (1985) suggested the term 'trustworthiness' instead of internal validity as a criterion for assessing the quality of the design and execution of a qualitative study. The issue of trust deals with the way researchers relate to data, its collection, analysis, and reporting; in other words, the extent to which one can rely on the reports of a study and its results. Validity is based on the researcher's awareness of the research processes and their transparency vis-à-vis outside readers. Hence, the researcher must strictly adhere to a process of several phases of analysis and keep all the documentation (Strauss & Corbin, 1994). In this study, the issue of validity was dealt with through a careful five-phase analysis, leading to a reconstruction of the research process.
4.9.2. Reliability

Reliability in the meaning of the traditional paradigm is the extent to which the research process achieves the same results when the study is repeated. In other words, reliability relates to the accuracy of the research results (Birnbaum, 1997). On the other hand, in qualitative research, it is not possible to refer to reliability in traditional terms since researchers in similar or even identical situations cannot be expected to obtain exactly the same results (Dey, 1993) since it is context-dependent and greatly grounded in the researcher's talents (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Consequently, Lincoln & Guba (1985) coined the term 'dependability'. This concept expresses the meaning of reliability in qualitative research.

Since qualitative research focuses on the researcher as the preferred research tool, it should be related to the reliability aspect in ways that are appropriate for this paradigm. The literature suggests several main ways: (1) creating a bank of research data that can be presented when necessary and which is available to researchers, enabling them to check the information sources for themselves (Shkedi, 2003, 2013); (2) preserving analysis of documents for each phase so that researchers can reconstruct the analysis processes and examine the investigation process in light of the methodological problems known to them (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994); (3) documenting the examination of other researchers' analysis (Yin, 1989); (4) checking the degree of consistency in the research (Miles & Huberman, 1994); (5) writing the final research report in such a way that it contains a sufficient number of quotations pertaining to the relevant issues, noting the circumstances of their collection and the context of the data for the research questions (Shkedi, 2003); and explaining in detail the processes of constructing the research (Peshkin, 2000). I have followed these precautions.

4.9.3. Generalisability

The significance of generalisability prevalent in traditional quantitative research is the ability to apply the results of the research to other contexts and other people (Birnbaum, 1997). Generalisability of this kind is not possible in qualitative research. Stake (1995) claims that the real essence of a case study is its particularity and not its generalisability. Researchers take a particular case and get to know it well, not how it is different from
other cases but rather what are its features and meanings. Stake (1995) talks about "naturalist generalisability" as opposed to formalistic generalisability. He uses this term to signify that readers should judge whether the findings of one case study can be applied to another group of people in whom they are interested—the issue of 'relatability'.

The meaning of this generalisability is not necessarily that the reader seeks to transfer the case to other situations, but rather that it is possible to relate to certain aspects of the case as having potential implications for other cases. At the same time, the researcher is obliged to support this process by providing a thick description of the background and of the occurrence investigated in the case study report. Thus, readers have enough information to assess the accord between the situation studied and the situation to which they are relating.

"Researchers can supply, at best, only the information about the participants. This could be the basis for judging generalisability of transfer to another context by future readers" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 217).

Generalisability is difficult to achieve in qualitative research. Nonetheless, this study used several strategies for increasing its generalisability (Shkedi, 2012), notably triangulation.

This study is concerned with a deep exploration of personal and professional development based on both dimensions. Therefore, the semi-structured interviews, visual data, and diaries focused on both dimensions. Corroborating the data collected using all the tools mentioned, strengthened the findings that emerged from previous phases. Furthermore, it can be concluded that the different angles by which the personal and professional dimensions were addressed, yielded an accurate, even multi-faceted picture, enhancing the validity and reliability of this study (Mason, 1996). The triangulation used in this study resulted in a rich and expansive description of the personal and professional dimension within professional development. Consequently, it can be said that the expansive description greatly supports the findings of triangulation.

Another claim for increasing the generalisability of this study is the rigour of the data analysis. The data was analysed according to the best theories of analysis and the interpretation of the findings was supported by extant knowledge of the personal and professional dimension in education in general and inclusion in particular. In
conclusion, this study does not claim full replicability because of the limitations of a qualitative research in this regard. However, if a similar setting is found, the study can be easily repeated.

Finally, the study was conducted within an Israeli informal educational framework and was rooted in the Israeli reality; therefore, it is true to this specific context. This implies that there is a gap between the formal declarative approach concerning professional education of teachers and the existing practice in Israel. More precisely, there is lack of enhancement and development of innovative educational approaches that integrate the personal dimension. However, the interpretation of the findings and the conclusions that emerged on its basis, offer possibilities to learn from this experience, basing further research on the theories that were constructed here. This might serve as scaffolding for further enhancement of integrating personal and professional dimension and, hence, widening the perception of professional development towards a more holistic and integrative nature. Although the research was conducted in an Israeli context, its universal contribution pertains to similar programmes to be implemented in other countries and other cultures.

Whilst generalisability is difficult to achieve in qualitative research, in accordance with the suggestions of the literature and according to the research approach presented here, reading this study might possibly lead to potential transferability for the readers to other possible contexts such as social studies and health.

This section of Chapter 4 critically discusses the qualitative features of the research and the considerations used to reinforce them against a background of relevant theoretical perspectives. This section also discusses the ethical issues that arose during the research and the way of coping with them as shown in the literature and in practice in this study.

### 4.10. Critical Reflection on Methodological Issues

A critique of the prominent aspects of this study’s strategy can also be found in the literature dealing with case studies. The main argument against the case study approach is that it does not enable sufficient theorisation or broad social generalisations (Harvey, 1990; Platt, 1992). Harvey (1990) attributes this limitation to the 'localness' of all case
studies of a specific case with all its particular conditions. Platt, on the other hand, states that:

"...much case study theorising has been conceptually confused, because too many different themes have been packed into the idea "case study" (Platt, 1992, p. 48).

Another aspect of the critique is that this approach attributes equal importance to the attitudes of researcher and participants during the research, assuming that every version is as valid as the others (Yosefun, 2002). Yet another critique claims that this approach does not relate to causal factors of actions originating outside the case under investigation such as macro socio-cultural or historical causes (Yosefun, 2002).

Regarding multiple-case studies, the comparison is among the cases that limit the richness of description of each case to reduce partial harms its quality (Stake, 1994). This is because the thickness of descriptions has implications for the internal validity of research (Day, 1993), as well as for its 'transferability' (naturalistic generalisability).

The critical aspects of the researcher's role are discussed below with regard to the involvement of the researcher when he/she studies a programme that he/she has developed. Themes cover the researcher's awareness of issues of validity and reliability in qualitative research and steps taken to minimize possible biases in congruence with the research goals and questions and the research literature pertaining to case studies and qualitative research methodology (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; Hammersley, 2000; Stake, 2000; Robson, 2002; Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 2001; Shkedi, 2003, 2013).

4.10.1. Critique of the Researcher's Role as Tutor

The 'Lovecircles' education programme was developed based on my 36 years of academic and practical experience in both education and therapy and was led by me—the researcher. Thus, the data analysis had to take into consideration the fact that, being the initiator of the programme and head tutor, could have biased the interpretation of the data. This consideration served as a guideline for data collection and analysis. Hence, varied methods were used for collecting two different perspectives for data analysis. The two perspectives (participants' and researcher's) were used to enhance the validity of the research. Moreover, a triangulation of data analysis was used.
Since the educators themselves paid for their participation in the programme, they could have been perceived as 'customers'. This was balanced by the fact that being together with the participants over a long period of time allowed me to study their perceptions by sharing the meaningful experiences they encountered in the programme (Rist, 1982) and thus to explore their meanings (Rachel, 1996). Moreover, the information the applicants received before starting the programme informed them about the approach of the programme, indicating that there is no failure or success assessment by the tutor, since this is a developmental programme focusing on individual needs, aims, procedures, and pace.

I am aware of my somewhat dominant personality. Yet, during the sessions, I did my utmost to give room to the participants' voices. I was trained as an expressive-dynamic group leader and have acquired many years of experience as a teacher and group leader. Hence I was able to develop skills and reflective-critique abilities based on humanistic principles. I used controlling aspects, such as respect for participants and their acceptance as human beings.

Being the researcher, tutor, and expert encompasses both strengths and weaknesses of 'expert validity' issues (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998, 2001). The data and methods of analysis were so diverse they could not be triangulated mainly on the verbal source of data. Therefore, I used photograph elicitation and expressive therapy data analysis methods. Given my design and emphasis on partnership in the research, I opted for expert validity, as this process would ensure the validity of my analysis.

I allowed participants to read their interview scripts based on the approach that it was their right to affirm/change/modify (or even withdraw their participation at any stage) (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998, 2001). This could offer an assessment regarding the validity of the analysis.

From my perspective as an expressive therapist and teacher, I could not avoid recalling my own emotions as well while wishing to integrate emotions and art-based ideas into practice. I was confronted with negative feelings such as rejection on behalf of the traditional education system (for example towards using art material and a 45-minute long lesson), which I found did not support the emotional or cognitive needs of students. In the school where I worked, I was also under pressure to follow the school's statistical success targets. I developed the 'Lovecircles' programme during my work at
school as a solution for pressures I had experienced. Therefore, I was aware of my own emotions in my role of researcher and the need to listen and respond to interviewees, but in a way that did not influence their answers.

As Shkedi (2012) clarifies, qualitative-constructivist researchers are an inseparable part of the investigation and they are involved as participant-observers, in-depth interviewers, or tutors of focus groups. Yet, at the same time, the researchers also separate themselves from the investigated situation to re-think the meanings of experiences ...*in order to understand the world of which you must become a part and, at the same time, stay separated from it, belonging and distinguished* (Patton, 1980, p. 121).

4.10.2. Insider Research and Validity

The term 'insider research' describes projects where researchers are directly involved in or connected to the research layout (Robson, 2002). This type of research contradicts traditional views of scientifically sound studies, in which researchers are 'objective outsiders' who explore subjects external to themselves (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). Researchers can be categorised as insiders in various ways. For example, professionals may conduct a study in their work setting—also called practitioner research (Robson, 2002). Researchers may be members of the community they are studying or they may become accepted members after spending some time within the community. Collaborative research where both researchers and participants actively conduct the research (Jarvis, 1999) exemplifies the 'blurring of boundaries' between researchers and researched, entailing allegations of invalidity.

Such boundaries are eliminated when researchers become the subject of study, as in personal narrative. With insider research, validity becomes much more problematic due to researchers' involvement with the subject of study. Positivists argue that following this involvement, researchers are no longer 'objective', leading to biased findings. Thus, from this essentially correspondent view of validity — whereby 'valid' or 'true' knowledge corresponds to an objective world — validity of insider research is undermined (Kvale, 1995). On the other hand, neo-positivists and anti-positivists claim that because complete objectivity is impossible, researchers' biases threaten validity or trustworthiness. This gave rise to the following questions:
Would my relationships with the participants have a negative impact on their behaviour so that they behave differently from their normal behaviour?

Would my tacit knowledge cause them to misinterpret data or make false assumptions?

Would my insider knowledge lead them to make assumptions and miss potentially important information?

Would my politics, loyalties, or hidden agendas lead to misrepresentations?

Would my moral/political/cultural standpoints cause them to subconsciously bias data?

In this light, awareness of these issues guided my research procedures as well as consultation with critical friends. Moreover, as an expressive art therapist I was aware of the transference (defined as a phenomenon characterized by unconscious redirection of feelings from one person to another, Webster, 1976) and projection procedures (defined as a psychological defense mechanism in which a person attributes his or her own characteristics to another person, American Psychological Association, 2009) and how they could be countered within all the research processes. Therefore I myself went under regular professional supervision, as the British Association of Dramatherapists requires, in the section relating to psychotherapy perspectives and psychodynamic “… understanding of theories of the unconscious, theories of the therapeutic relationship, the management of group process; unconscious processes including transference and counter-transference …” (https://vimeo.com/68339877) as well as the Israeli association of expressive creative arts requires that all practising therapists have themselves (the Israeli Association of Art Therapy, Y.H.A.T.).

Since the current research examined a programme that I had developed, I was faced with the issue of having to decrease possible bias. For that purpose I relied on the in-depth discussion presented by Shkedi (2003) with regard to validity and reliability in qualitative research.

Following is a description of the principles on which I relied and the way in which I acted.
**Characteristics of validity in qualitative research**

Measurements using unique personal or professional criteria are valid in the qualitative-constructivist research approach (Shkedi, 2003), since the assumption is that constructivist qualitative research comprises many perspectives on which a researcher can base measurements and none of them is initially incorrect or preferred. The question of the research validity does not depend on whether a specific criterion is legitimate but rather on honest exposure of the researcher's perspectives. This exposure allows researchers and readers to determine the validity of the measurement; that is, validity is related to the question, does the researcher see what he or she thinks he/she sees?

A valid explanation is such that can be defended properly both conceptually and empirically. In constructivist qualitative research, measurement criteria are determined during the research process and they may change, be adjusted, or modified in the process of analysis. As mentioned above, this study can always analyse the same phenomenon in different ways depending on the values of the researcher's area of interest. The research findings may be valid if they are properly based on the researcher's declared perspective.

Due to my awareness, I have adhered to this approach. I have made sure that the research process and its products are well grounded not only in terms of the appropriate use of data collection methods and analysis, but also that the research contentions would be highly probable. Also, I examined the research process regularly by rereading the data, listening to the interviews repeatedly, and watching the photos and videos, while keeping updated with the theories and research, reflecting in my diary, and checking the data and analysis procedures.

Another criterion suggested by Shkedi (2003) is that of theoretical validity, which is applied in qualitative-constructivist research differently from the way it is applied in quantitative positivist research. In the qualitative-constructivist approach, the theoretical aspect develops along with the research process and is repeatedly restructured until writing the final report and does not constitute an a priori statement. In the context of this theoretical criterion I acted with awareness throughout the research process.
Process of examining research validity

Shkedi (2003) maintained that the researcher’s awareness of his or her conceptual perspective may help avoid research mistakes, as researchers have no other way of examining validity except for ongoing personal interaction. We can never be fully convinced that we understand the cultural meanings of each researched phenomenon, but a sensitive field researcher equipped with theoretical orientation and good trustful long term relationships with the participants is the best research tool available (Kirk and Miller, 1986).

In my research I have been aware of this issue; I had come to the research with a rich theoretical bank and have continued to enrich it. I have acted wisely and sensitively with the participants I have come to know over time. In qualitative-constructivist research, the researcher must maintain a chain of evidence for each research stage, such as transcribing interviews, saving any relevant information, documents, and stages of analysis from the raw stage of collecting information to the different stages of analysis to the final findings and conclusions (Yin, 1981) therefore this awareness guided and reflected my research process.

Using the process of analysis in several stages helps researchers to defend themselves in the face of misleading forces, and to a certain extent, forces the researcher to question his or her own judgment. Saving documents at every stage allows the researcher to examine the extent to which he or she was true to the data obtained from the participants and identify the sources of their mistakes. It also opened up the possibility of participants reviewing analyses to verify or dispute interpretation of findings.

As a researcher who is aware of issues of validity and reliability (Shkedi, 2003), I have made every possible effort to minimize possible bias due to my being both the programme’s developer and researcher. I made sure to analyse the data in a number of stages, adhere to the interviewee’s statements and interpretations of the researched reality, and to critically examine the findings a number of times.

As the researcher of such a programme, it is important to be aware throughout the data analysis phase of the possibility of projection and transference on my part. Therefore, I took precautions to avoid any possible bias by adhering to the ethical code indicated by Shkedi (2011). Moreover, as stated above, I was under professional supervision in
which these issues of possible projection and transference would have been expected to appear during the data analysis process.

**Thick Description**

Another way to examine research validity is writing the final report as a thick description – a focused description or a thick theoretical description that includes information about the context, appropriate quotes of participants' statements, and an overt conceptual discussion. This way allows examining the extent to which the argument or the research conclusions are compelling. A good description has the potential of allowing the researcher to examine himself or herself once again, allow colleagues to respond critically, and then convince readers (or not) of the final report that the research process and conclusions are valid.

An additional process that allows for validation is use of triangulation, which means using a variety of sources of information to enhance the validity of findings. It has to be noted that the goal of triangulation in this context is to strengthen the research in its entirety, beyond the issue of collecting information (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; Stake, 2000).

**Characteristics of Reliability**

In constructivist qualitative research, another researcher cannot be expected to reconstruct in a similar or even identical manner exactly the same research findings. The basis for determining the reliability of research analysis is the open exposure of the researcher's conceptual perspective. Therefore, the researcher must reveal how the research was conducted and how decisions were made, so that the reader can judge the quality of research and examine the logic and reason behind of the importance of the researcher and his or her activities (Arksey & Knight, 1999). I followed these guidelines throughout the thesis and presented all the stages and procedures in the appendices.

Characteristics of constructivist qualitative research focusing on researchers as a preferred research tool challenge those who claim lack of reliability. When the research process is based on a researcher's unique personal perspective, how can they and others examine their own reliability?
Therefore, Shkedi (2003) presents a demand for formal overt stages of data collection and analysis. This process is based on the following three conditions: (1) Creating a database, which readers can view and examine at any time rather than just reading the final report; (2) preservation of analysed documents—a process that comprises a number of stages congruent with the research aims. Each stage of analysis is accompanied by its unique documents and protocols, to enable reconstruction of analysis processes and thus examine research reliability; (3) Presenting a chain of evidence in the final report, integrating quotes and contexts that pertain to the research questions and relevant issues, in a way that enables readers to identify the connection between the research process and the research questions. Hence, it is essential that the researcher provide a meticulous description of research methods.

In this light, I have worked as a researcher who is aware of all the issues presented above. I created a database, preserved the analysed documents, and present a chain of evidence in the final report.

Insider research encompasses many advantages. Some stipulate that insiders have extensive knowledge to which outsiders are not privy (Tedlock, 2000). It is argued that interviewees may feel more comfortable and freer to talk openly if they are familiar with researchers (Tierney, 1994). From an anti-positivist perspective, therefore, my position as an insider researcher has the potential for increasing validity due to the added richness, honesty, fidelity, and authenticity of the information obtained. Advocates (Sabar Ben-Yehoshua, 1998, 2001; Shkedi, 2003) of anti-positivism and anti-positivist qualitative research maintain that arguments against insider research are applicable to all types of research. For example, one can never guarantee participants' honesty and openness, and research is always coloured by our subjectivities.

Since it is impossible to achieve complete objectivity, I focused on minimising the impact of bias on the research process as discussed by Shkedi (2003). Hence, the aim was to conduct the research while taking into consideration its socially situated character as well as making my position vis-à-vis the research process transparent (Hammersley, 2000). By making the research process transparent and honest, I invite readers to construct their own perspectives, which 'are equally as valid as our own' (Cohen et al., 2004, p. 106).
4.10.3. Critique of Issues within Expressive Therapy

Qualitative inquiry has provided suitable approaches for Expressive Art Therapists to analyse and present research findings. It seems, however, that there is still a need to develop advanced research methods for enabling rigorous research, similar to the case of the present study, which aims at integrating the expressive art therapy field with the field of education. It is natural for an expressive art therapist/practitioner/researcher to use sensitivity, intuition, and creativity, combined with clinical knowledge and experience. Consequently, being an educator and therapist I have integrated both my fields of expertise within my researcher role.

As Eisner (2004) discusses, we approach human beings’ experiences as we experience the qualitative world through our sensory system. For Knowles et al. (2008), one of the strengths of arts-informed research is accessibility and the acknowledgement of individuals as “knowledge makers engaged in the act of knowledge advancement” (p. 60). Therefore, with regard to my integrative position (as an experienced educator and expressive art therapist and keeping up to date (practically and theoretically) this has equipped me with a wide perspective for the manipulation of data.

The research aimed to study my own practice and I was a participating member of the situation being studied. This type of research is supported by Winter & Munn-Giddings (2001) who maintain that this type of research is valuable as it encourages researchers to examine their own practices. Since "modern theories of knowledge emphasise that our knowledge exists as a set of ‘conjectures’ always awaiting possible refutation by future events, and that ‘rationality’ is a matter of our willingness to engage in a process of continuous learning” (Winter and Munn-Giddings, 2001, p.21), the present study integrates this principle at the centre of its processes.

Winter and Munn-Giddings (2001) claimed that the validity of inquiry that proceeds through continuously negotiating between different perspectives resides in the carefulness and rigour of this process, not merely in a claim to have made an accurate representation of reality (the main claim of both Positivism and naturalistic inquiry). In this light, the present research does not only attempt to portray practical developments accurately and to evaluate them soundly, but it also seeks validity in a further dimension – the openness of its communicative processes. This research has presented differing
views that have been fully expressed and the judgments that make up the inquiry have been open to scrutiny and debate. Thus, ‘validity’ of this research relies upon the way it seriously addresses the issues regarding the aims and goal of the research.

This chapter presented a critique of the conduct of this study. The following chapter presents the findings that emerged from this study.
CHAPTER 5 – FINDINGS

The findings are presented according to the research questions and objectives:

- Ascertaining similarities and differences in possible personal and professional development benefits and their inter-relationship between participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme.

- Identifying possible core principles for supporting personal and professional development of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme.

- Exploring the possible impact of the 'Lovecircles' education programme on the conduct of participants’ work with children with special educational needs (SEN).

To present a coherent and focused body of findings, data from five self-selecting participants out of the original group of 11 participants, presented in Table 5.1 below, is used to illustrate points emerging through the data gathering process. Data relating to all participants and the analysis thereof are presented in Appendices 2-14, and a transcript of interviews is in Appendix 22, and is cross-referenced throughout this chapter. At an advanced stage of the analysis and discussion of the emerging data, it became necessary to focus on these five participants, as a further goal emerged to understand the practicum stage and its methods of education (to be explored in later chapters).

The characteristics of this core group of five who completed both phases of the 'Lovecircles' programme nevertheless were representative of others in the original group of 11; Table 5.1 illustrates their background and aspirations from undertaking the course (compare with the rest of the original cohort in Chapter 4, Table 4.1). For ease of reading, and to help track the emergence of analytical frameworks in later chapters, their data has been utilized to illustrate responses that were in fact typical of others within the original group. Detailed case histories of the five students can be found in Appendix 20.
Table 5.1: Summary of exemplar starting points on entering the Lovecircles Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Background</th>
<th>Aspiration at the outset</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EVE</td>
<td>B.A. in Education, Counselling with no experience in the field of special needs</td>
<td>Wish to relieve emotional barriers so as to be able to apply the vast professional knowledge she had acquired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHANNY</td>
<td>B.A. in special education Animal-assisted therapy with experience in the field of special needs</td>
<td>To fulfil her professional potential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIRI</td>
<td>Academic studies within the framework of psychology &quot;Heike&quot; with experience in the field of special needs</td>
<td>Finding new ways, more successful and effective than those acquired thus far in the field of inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAYA</td>
<td>B.Ed. in special education Shiatsu and massage with experience in the field of special needs</td>
<td>Feeling that she needs inner personal empowerment so as to continue her work, and the need to innovate and develop so as to apply and her abilities in the field of inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YAFA</td>
<td>B.A. in behavioural sciences and drama-therapy with no experience in the field of special needs</td>
<td>Wish to develop in the personal dimension &quot;as a human being&quot; in addition to the technical aspect of acquiring tools. Wish to integrate fields of previous knowledge acquired in the fields of education and art therapy into the field of inclusion.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1. Findings Emerging from Research Question 1: Core Principles of the 'Lovecircles' Professional Development Programme

5.1.1. The Personal and Professional Dimension

All 11 participants attributed their personal and professional development to the tutor’s multi-dimensional attention to them and to their own multi-dimensional tutoring within the 'Lovecircles' programme.
Table 5.2: Findings relating to attention as the core principle of the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme (including 11 participants)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Attention to personal dimension (A)</th>
<th>Attention to professional dimension (B)</th>
<th>Metaphors</th>
<th>Visual aspects (photos)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme Core principles enabling participants' development</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tutors’ attention to participants Body-soul integration Tutor--participant relationships Tutors' personality</td>
<td>Art-integrated learning Teaching styles and methods Class organisation / climate</td>
<td>‘Like a rose in a lake with growth around’ ‘To embrace and gather to the heart’</td>
<td>The light in me illuminates pictures: a star a heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal development of participants in the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme</td>
<td>Emotional barriers elimination Developing through arts Adopting positive approach to life Personal empowerment Adopting an approach integrating body and soul Attention to participants Reference to others</td>
<td>Adopting a personal – procedural approach to participants’ development Collaborative learning in a group</td>
<td>‘Inside and outside’ ‘I broke down the fence’ ‘I opened a door to myself’</td>
<td>Eliminating barriers through arts / a cave A picture of the barrier / a pink cave</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Categories</td>
<td>Dimensions</td>
<td>Attention to personal dimension (A)</td>
<td>Attention to professional dimension (B)</td>
<td>Metaphors</td>
<td>Visual aspects (photos)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional development of participants in the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme</td>
<td>Professional development of participants in the 'LOVECIRCLES' Education Programme</td>
<td>Tutors’ participants relations</td>
<td>Adopting an inclusion approach for children with special needs Collaborative learning in a group Integrating body-soul aspects in teaching Adopting a positive approach in teaching Integrating emotional aspects in teaching Integrating experimental/experiential aspects in teaching Professional empowerment Art-integrated teaching Attention in teaching</td>
<td>‘My eyes opened’ ‘My view got a volume’</td>
<td>Perception/wide multi-dimensional view A picture of the device for the camera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants’ development as an applied area while working with children with special needs</td>
<td>Participants’ development as an applied area while working with children with special needs</td>
<td>Tutors’ participants relations</td>
<td>Art-integrated teaching Body-soul approach in teaching Adopting procedural approach to participants’ development Integrating emotional aspects in teaching Adopting positive approach Empowerment in teaching</td>
<td>‘The good, bad and ugly mutually nurture each other like the yin and yang’</td>
<td>Celebrating the personal creativity in the group A picture of a teacher and pupils/each one in their uniqueness in the group</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Multi-Dimensional Attention

All the original 11 participants in their interviews and diaries perceived the tutor’s attention to their personal dimension as the core principle influencing their development (Table 5.2): findings emerged from all participants, column A, purple). Most of them also perceived the integration of body-soul aspects and the tutor’s attitude towards them as a core principle for their development (Table 5.2): findings emerged from all participants, column A, blue). Conversely, only a few of the 11 original participants perceived the tutor’s attention as a core principle of their development (Table 5.2): findings emerged from all participants column A, light blue). The different perceptions of the tutor’s attention to the participants attest to the participants' unique needs and nature of the tutoring.

Two of the participants, Yafa and Miri, believed that their personal and professional development stemmed from all aspects of the tutors' attention, such as openness, expression of emotions, love, and tenderness – as mentioned by all the participants. Conversely, three other participants – Taya, Shanny, and Eve – did not indicate certain features in the tutors’ attention as contributing to their development (Appendix 2, Table A.2). The different way in which these participants perceived the features of attention and tutoring as affecting their development indicates two key foci of reference to the tutor’s attention. One focus of reference is the tutor’s attention to the personal dimension and the other is attention to the professional dimension. These two foci show that the participants perceived the tutor’s attention to be in accordance with their own personal and professional needs.

Attention to the Personal Dimension

All participants perceived two forms of the tutor’s attention to them: their personal development and their professional development. The tutor’s attention to the former in the programme is perceived as most indispensable for their development...[...]... this feeling of acceptance... wow! It has no price... [...]... within this special accepting framework ...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 24 line 757). The findings illustrated that all the participants perceived the tutor’s attention to their personal dimension as dominant for their development. Thus, it was conceptualised as the main
core principle theme of the 'Lovecircles' professional programme [see Appendix 2: Table A.1: From data collection to the findings].

The tutor’s attention as perceived by all participants was comprised of two types. Firstly, it was perceived as being multi-dimensional, based on their experience of the tutor-participant relationship throughout the education process. The participants conceptualised this as comprising features such as happiness:... [...] ... I noticed that... ‘the tutor’... had an interesting attention, I liked the conversation about colours, fabrics, ‘joie de vivre’ ... [...] ... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 8 line 244); openness and expression of emotions such as... [...] ... serenity calms me... [...] ...and sometimes makes me nervous... [...] ... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y/ page 4 line 119).

The attitude of the tutor towards the participants was perceived as an attitude of”’...giving out of love. ...(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 8 line 239) [...] ...in one word this work... [...] ... is done wholeheartedly... with a lot of heart and soul, a lot...[...]...” (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 227).

The tutor’s containment ability was described as well by a metaphor... [...] ... And the relationship established was ... [...] ... highly containing ... [...] ...What allowed this was your glance, the acceptance, inclusion, everything that was there. ... everything which was there... [...] ... (Taya / interview Appendix 22T / page 22 line 699).

"Envelop", a "lake", an "incubator" (Yafa / photo Y-1), "a dress" (Miri / photo M-2) symbolise a womb providing the core needs for development based on love, courage and caring relationship between a mother and child {"incubator" – supporting needs in sensitive and risky situation}, belief in {development} and initiative {such as mending a hole in a dress}. These metaphors might be understood as paying attention to the personal dimension and to communication with others (professional dimension), i.e. wrapped in an "envelop" and providing the needs for all greenery to grow hidden inside her.

Secondly, all the original 11 participants perceived that tutor-participant relationships were based on the tutor’s acknowledgement of each participant's uniqueness. This may indicate a relationship of reciprocity.
... [...]

...the experience of embracing who I am, providing a sense of confidence, freedom...[...]

...regardless of what I bring I think! ...[...](Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 228).

The fact that only a few of the original 11 participants mentioned all the features of the tutor’s attention to their personal dimension demonstrates both the complexity of perceiving the tutor’s attention and the differentiation embodied in the observation of this issue. Nevertheless, all of them perceived the tutor as having a wide and deep ability to attune to each individual.

Furthermore, the participants believed that the tutor’s characteristics, integrating personal and professional dimensions such as confidence and belief in the teaching method, tenderness and persistence, affected the way they were encouraged and directed towards their personal development.

... [...]... and I felt I could recreate myself! ...[...](Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 211).

**Attention to the Professional Dimension**

The tutor’s attention to the participants’ professional dimension was perceived as sensitivity to individual learning pace, acceptance and respect [see Appendix 2: From data collection to the findings, Table A.1].

The tutor was sensitive to the participants’ world ...[...]... allowing me in such a gentle and accepting way to undergo the process at the pace which I thought was right for me ...[...](Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 1 line 31).

The participants used metaphors expressing their perception of the tutor’s acceptance ... [...]... It filled some deprivation... some small hole. If we relate to attention like sewing a garment or baking a cake, this was another important stage... like being young children showing their father and mother who are excited about them...[...]... for a long time we have not experienced such acceptance... it was really something special for me...[...]...(Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 24 line 756 & page 25 line 806, & page 25 line 807).
Respect ... [...] as I said, but I will say it again! from my point of view it was the acceptance...[...]..., support,...[...]...the caress, the hug...[...]...(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 3-4 line 101).

Features of the tutor’s attention, (for example, tenderness and flexibility) were perceived by all the original 11 participants as indispensable for their development.

...[...]...I remember to what extent the tutor was meaningful: her tenderness, love and attention...[...]... (Taya / photo T-7 / Appendix 22T / page 21 line 665).

The tutor’s attention was perceived by the participants as powerful.

... [...]... this requires mental powers ... [...]... and inspiring optimism ... [...]...because only this will bring light...[...]... [...]... (Taya / interview Appendix 22T / page 22 line 700).

The tutor defined the boundaries of their task while listening and supporting the participants in a way that was an authentic role model.

...[...]... I can compare it now to the learning framework...[...]... the attention of the tutor, the caregiver – is critically in the framework dealing with mental and emotional issues...[...]... In spite of the exceptional professionalisation of...here the tenderness, pleasantness, [...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 369 ).

The tutor’s attention was thus one of the core principles themes affecting the personal development of the participants in a way that reflected also on their professional development. Miri expressed her perception of the tutor’s attention using the metaphor "cloth with a hole" (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 24 line 754 / photo M2) that had been sewn up, indicating that her tutoring impacted her development and enabled her to transfer development towards others' development as well (Miri / photo M-19).

...[...]...during the workshop the participants helped each other... there was an atmosphere of excitement and fun. We also managed to transfer the good, calm and serene feelings to the participants...[...]... (Shanny / diary Appendix 22S / page 17 line 548).
The tutor’s attention gave the participants a unique experience within the learning process, which some of them expressed by metaphors. For example:

... [...] flower [...] like a rose in a lake with greenery around [...] ... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 6 line 176).

**Integrative Attention to Participants**

The tutor’s attention was perceived by participants as stemming from both a personal and professional dimension. As stated above, attention based on the personal dimension included features such as openness, expression of emotions, love, and tenderness; attention based on the professional dimension was perceived as sensitivity to individual learning pace, acceptance, and respect. This approach refers to the tutor's role from a personal humanistic view of teaching that might be in contrast and conflict to traditional approaches based solely on a professional dimension, i.e., pedagogic skills and teaching strategies. These approaches are based on an education system of contradictory and competing elements.

All the original cohort of 11 participants considered the tutor's multi-dimensional and rich attention as one of the core principles of the programme. Hence, each of the features was perceived differently by the participants through their personal experience in the process of their education. This authentic expression was enabled due to the educational climate, which may also challenge educators with the need to confront even inconvenient opinions, accompanied by their own emotions and those of their students.

5.1.2. Multi-Dimensional Tutoring—Integration of Art within Experiential Group Learning

The nature of the tutoring as perceived by all the original 11 participants enabled multi-dimensional ways of attending to their needs. The tutoring was perceived as encompassing and integrating art and body-soul aspects, as well as organising a positive climate for learning. This integrative pedagogy was perceived by the participants as a core principle for their personal and professional development, unlike other places of
study and work focusing only on the cognitive aspects of learners and learning, such as achievement based on external standards.

Conversely, findings indicate that the participants perceived the multi-dimensional tutoring—namely the integration of teaching styles and methods—as facilitating reference to all dimensions – body, movement, emotion, thought and imagination.

...[...]...In every encounter there is diffusion into all kinds of things: movement, creation, music, guided imagery and only at the end is there time to gather them... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 6 line 198).

All the participants could express themselves in their own unique way and saw the multi-dimensional processes as a continuum that created an experience of wholeness following holistic, humanistic educational principles.

... [...]... 'Lovecircles' ... {Tutoring style} I am undergoing processes and more processes and finally, finally, finally I gather them for the presentation in the final "exhibition"... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 204).

Integration of the styles was characterised by flexibility, which had an impact on development and growth beyond acquiring knowledge as the end target. Multi-dimensional tutoring was perceived as based on using a discourse: most of the participants expressed the opinion that the tutoring integrated body-soul aspects and was indispensable for their development. For example: expressing emotions and body sensation, which brought about serenity and pleasantness.

... [...]... my attention to my body, what does it say to me and how do I act accordingly... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 2 line 52).

The tutoring, which integrated emotional and cognitive aspects, enabled expression of freedom and choice.

... [...]...I chose movement and emotions because I found material on the subject and felt it was the subject on which I wanted to work... [...]... (Shanny / diary Appendix 22S / end-of-course assignment / page 16 line 506).
5.1.3. **Summary: Findings Emerging from Research Question 1: Core Principles of the 'Lovecircles' Professional Development Programme**

**Multi-dimensional integrative attention – personal and professional dimensions**

The rich and diversified tutoring integrated teaching styles and methods, art, body-soul aspects, work environment, group climate, and experiential learning. It was perceived by all the original 11 participants as one of the core principles of the programme, which contributed to their development during the 'Lovecircles' education programme.

- The tutoring integrated art and participants perceived it as one of the core principle of the 'Lovecircles' education programme for the enhancement of their development.

- The tutoring integrated body-soul aspects and was considered indispensable for their development.

- The experiential learning integrated theory and practice as part of the tutor’s pedagogy.

This is in contrast to the traditional approach to teacher education based on one dimension and acquiring academic knowledge via a systematic pedagogic approach, and the postmodern approach that perceives good teachers based on their competency and achievement of skills.

Next, participants' development is described according to research questions 2 and 3: the personal dimension, the general-professional dimension, and the unique-professional dimension – when working with children with special needs.
5.2. Findings Emerging from Research Questions 2 & 3: Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme

5.2.1. Integration of Art—Elimination of Personal Emotional Barriers and Expressing Emotion through Metaphors

Art allowed the participants to eliminate cognitive barriers, such as perceptions and beliefs about themselves, developing authenticity and flow.

...[...]... I made something very associative and intuitive, letting my body talk without the head, talk to the stomach and the heart ... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 3 line 77).

The participants developed a new approach to art as a tool and way of expression.

...[...]... I allowed myself not to think, I devoted myself to the process ... I did not think about the meaning and I created ... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 3 line 75).

...[...]... much more room for creation and creativity in my life, either through painting or movement or any other thing... interest and pleasure from art-integrated experiential learning ...[...]...(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 2 line 53).

Integrating art in the learning process expanded attention to the personal dimension and revealed latent personal needs of the participants.

... [...]... at an advanced stage of the programme... [...]... green became a dominant colour in my life; also in my creations... the colour got a meaning beyond being just a colour... [...]...(Eve / photos E-1, E-2 / interview Appendix 22E / page 8 line 245 / page 8 line 242).

Art was a channel for the development of attention to wider dimensions.

... [...]... attention to pain {through creation}... provides an opportunity to go forward, the function of pain in a person's life! ...[...]... (Eve / interview / Appendix 22E / page 9 line 275 ).
Art facilitated developing the imagination as a means of attention to the personal dimension and as an opportunity for expressing personal issues.

...[...]... make it multi-dimensional, it was so flat like watching my own life, I understood how I could observe my life through the creations, movement and music...[...]... (Taya / interview /Appendix 22T / page 18 line 601).

All the participants experienced their personal development by removing the barriers.

...[...]... the green colour in almost every creation, green symbolises also growth of something new...blossoming, letting new things into my life...[...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 13 line 410).

All the original 11 participants perceived the removal of barriers as a dramatic stage of their personal development. They describe the difficulty to open up and the emotional relief after having removed the barriers.

...[...]... I felt a barrier to bring my barrier down...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 3 line 71).

...[...]... The process was slow... entering deep into the emotional experience... Every time I was surprised by the revelations... ... I became capable of listening better than before... [...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 358).

... [...]... Today I can speak about it, without pressure, fear, I can even laugh at it sometimes ... [...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 356).

...[...]... because of my voice I have never performed on stage, didn't speak into a microphone although I have organised endless events requiring such speaking. It seems that ... is one of my barriers! ...[...]... (Shanny / diary Appendix 22S / page 16 line 531).

... [...]... mist which surrounded me in various essential areas of my life... perhaps one friend who could listen? ...[...]... until the barriers are released... [...]... like a magnifying glass... [...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 13 line 408).

...[...]... ever since my childhood. Talking has always been difficult for me and very quickly my voice became hoarse...[...]... (Shanny / diary Appendix 22S / page 16 line 528).
The metaphor-rich language that the participants developed during the education programme constituted a means of describing their development in the personal dimension, the professional dimension and the integration thereof. The wide and extensive variety of metaphors used by the participants offered different options for conceptualising their professional development.

The rich array of metaphors illustrated by the findings focuses on aspects of the personal and professional dimension as well as on their integrated (Appendix 21, Table A.21). The metaphors expressed a wide range of emotions, from unpleasant to pleasant, exposing and conceptualising aspects of the participants' personal and professional development. These aspects included release of emotional barriers and promotion of high emotional expression capabilities (Appendix 21, Tables A.22 and A.23).

The metaphors expressed diverse topics, indicating the development of a unique differentiation and expression concept. They indicated the participants’ deep attention to dimensions of body, emotion, thought, and reflection, supported by the holistic-integrative perception of development (Appendix 21, Tables A.21-A.25).

...[...]... and the cake has turned my life from bi-dimensional to tri-dimensional which is something very basic and it gave my view a volume which it had lacked before...[...]... a combination of good and bad things, ...[...]... (Taya / interview Appendix 22T / page 18 line 604).

The participants' attention to their own personal-emotional dimension throughout the programme released their barriers of emotional expression (for example, fear of criticism and aggressiveness).

... [...]...I know that I have the power to break forward, I am like the phoenix, falling down to earth, accumulating power and soaring up into space ...[...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 10 line 324).

Release of emotional barriers enabled the participants to move from a sense of loneliness to self-acceptance as leverage for developing acceptance and empathetic communication with challenging figures in the peer group—communication which echoed relationships in their lives. The process of deep observation into themselves and others enabled participants to enhance their view of people (the self or others), making
it more holistic, less focused on the cognitive dimension, and comprising also dimensions of emotion, feelings, imagination, movement, art, and their combinations.

5.2.2. Expanding the Teacher-Pupil Relationship

All 11 original participants expanded their view of their relationship with their pupils with special educational needs (SEN). Some of them realised that this relationship should transcend only the teaching-learning relationship, becoming a deeper relationship based on a holistic view of pupils as developing people.

This is significant as it is in direct contrast to the medical model prevalent in Israel, whereby exceptional individuals should be "cured" and become "normal", based on a directive of systematic work methods, diagnosis, definitions, intervention, and results based on criteria. Thus, individuals' inner-being, emotions, and uniqueness are forgotten, risking isolation and alienation without consideration of the personal aspect of teaching

...[...]..first of all holism – the understanding that a person is not whole unless the process transpires at all layers. ... it was not spoken but experienced...[...]...(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 5 line 161).

...[...]... the 'Lovecircles' method developed my ability to communicate emotionally with both children and adults...[...]...(Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 352).

Instead, all original 11 participants developed a wide professional perception, focusing on promotion and support of and assistance to pupils' holistic development. Their extended perception was manifested by integrating attention to emotions as a means of developing an empathetic person as opposed to focusing on means, techniques and methods for promoting behavioural change. This is based on the perception of equal rights, equal opportunities, accepting differences, the key word being normalisation.

...[...]...this satisfaction with yourself and full confidence... usually we are afraid to expose ourselves and here we were not afraid! There was no apprehension...[...]...(Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 25 / line 800).
...[...]... awareness of listening to myself, to my personal voice... enabled me to use this knowledge, connecting them to their emotions, listening to the contents surfacing from their personal world...[...]...(Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 362).

The participants developed the ability to attend to their pupils and acknowledged the potential embodied in attention to the pupils' development. The issue of attention was connected to the knowledge that it is necessary to talk with pupils and that the dialogue with them is a tool of development and growth.

...[...]... the tutor gathers, hears and enables...[...]... gathering of each and every one and of the process which the group is undergoing, ...[...]... I allow myself to be very very exposed and sensitive...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 6 line 200).

All five participants of the core focus group developed an approach to teaching, focused on pupils' needs and uniqueness, and attention that they developed through teaching based on acknowledgement of the pupils' individual learning styles and expression. This contradicts the perception of the deficit medical model, in which pupils are not endowed with learner competences, capabilities, or maturity. Consequently, it was perceived that rewards like praise, activities, or prizes could to change their behaviour and standards.

...[...]... seeing the wide contexts where the children are, the atmosphere in class, the conditions, there are studies which corroborate...[...]... ...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 30 line 985).

...[...]... I was assisted by elements from the field of art in order to connect children to their personal world...[...]... he painted a huge sports field in which ...[...]... Projection to the field of studies helped him understand that the powers are embodied in him and he can use them in any field he wishes...[...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 380, 382 ).
5.2.3. Summary: Research Questions 2 & 3: Personal Development & Professional Development

Integration of art – elimination of emotional barriers and expressing emotion through metaphor:

- Art allowed the participants to eliminate cognitive barriers, such as perceptions and beliefs about themselves, developing authenticity and flow.
- The participants' attention to their own emotional-personal dimension throughout the programme released their barriers of emotional expression (for example, criticism and aggressiveness).
- Release of emotional barriers enabled the participants to move from a sense of loneliness to self-acceptance as leverage for developing acceptance and empathetic communication with challenging figures in the peer group—communication that echoed relationships in their lives.
- The metaphors indicated the participants’ deep attention to dimensions of body, emotion, thought, and reflection, supported by the holistic-integrative perception of development.
- The process of deep observation into themselves and others enabled participants to enhance their view of people (self or others), making it more holistic, less focused on the cognitive dimension, comprising also dimensions of emotion, feelings, imagination, movement, art, and combinations thereof.

Expanding the tutor-participant relationship

The participants expanded their view of their relationship with their pupils. Some of them realised that this relationship should transcend only the teaching-learning relationship, becoming a deeper relationship based on a holistic view of pupils as developing people.
5.3. Findings Emerging from Research Question 4: Is There Any Link between Personal and Professional Development?

This section presents the findings relating to Research Question 4.

5.3.1. Enhancing Reference to the Self in the Professional-General Dimension

Enhancing reference to the self in the professional-general dimension was based on integrating all awareness dimensions as a tool for professional development. The participants' personal and professional development was characterised by developing a positive attitude towards their work, promoting an inclusive approach. Upon graduation of the education programme, all 11 original participants expressed an overall professional empowerment. Seven out of the 11 participants' perception had been a positive approach based on "fun" rather than an approach stemming from "fear".

... [...]...I had an idea... I saw a picture that I am photographing them, all kinds of things associated with the lesson, with every photo. Every participant is writing the sentences she has taught her friends... and she is walking with something real!! which is also a record that she is a teacher!...[...]... this means turning it into leverage for learning. Simply great! Then we can organise an exhibition... simply fantastic! Instead of fear... of a test and dictation! What wonderful organic learning! ...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 25 line 814).

...[...]...the main innovations, compared to other courses which I have attended, are that here I was both a group member and a tutor, beyond the theoretical expansion of the topics emerging in the group...[...]... it was for the group members as well as for the tutor... materials facilitating the comprehension of the process of every individual in the group and of the group as a whole and of the tools we are using...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 1 line 6).

...[...]... I developed a perception of positive reality of looking at a glass half full, or to learn to focus on what exists and not on what is missing, lacking...[...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 384).
Seven out of the 11 original participants expressed a sense of higher professional confidence for tutoring, such as a greater ability to accept challenges, the wish to learn, and increased self-confidence.

...[...]...in 'Lovecircles' I underwent an initial process before undergoing a very significant process which is very helpful for me both as a person and as a tutor..., looking now at people, allowing them to bring themselves and accept that everything they bring is all right!... accept every objection ...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 109).

...[...]... generally speaking, the creations were something very very new which I have never experienced before. We, the tutors sat down and had the opportunity to paint how we felt at the end of the workshop...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 131).

...[...]...to be in the place of a tutor gave me a sense of greater confidence and an immediate and very supportive feedback (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 6 line 189).

The overall empowerment seemed to be the result of learning a variety of work tools and of working on all parts of consciousness. These approaches focused mainly on individuals as a whole personality, a bi-directional activity between individuals and society, and nurturing capabilities. The key word in this model is respect for the individual to develop a professional identity. Conversely, other models lack reference to additional teaching skills, responsibility, self-efficacy, or investing time in the individual as compared to attainments. This entails difficulties for and burden on teachers.

...[...]...here because we have experienced so many holistic things, This is something that I have never experienced anywhere else, integrating all the senses and layers of the body. ...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 5 line 158).

...[...]... take one thing from the experiences about which you want to work! Not from a place of weakness but of strength...[...]... (Eve / Appendix 22E / page 8 line 253).
Instead, all 11 of the original participants developed a positive attitude towards their work.

...[...]...I developed more patience, this is one of the outcomes! The ability to see the light in things...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 14 line 453).

...[...]...Is this encounter very meaningful in the continuum? Will the second part affect me more than the first part? ...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix15S / page 14 line 459).

...[...]...the effect of my worldview. Now after my exposure to contents and messages in the programme, there is obviously an impact at various levels in various fields...[...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 12 line 373).

...[...]...what I am saying about the diversity...[...]... the good, the bad and the ugly...[...]... the parts in me, everything!...[...]... allowing them to live together! Nurturing each other, like the symbol of the yin and yang...[...]... (Taya / interview Appendix 22T / page 23 line 723).

...[...]...another thing from my point of view as tutor is the deep understanding that not only the group undergoes a process but also the tutor... Consequently, a significant and powerful process is possible for both the group and the tutor...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 1 line 10).

Embracing the positive attitude towards teaching consisted of the ability to identify challenges regarding pupils with special educational needs (SEN) and working with them. The participants’ professional empowerment through the tutor’s attention seemed to be the key to their development of a positive attitude towards teaching. Developing such an attitude seemed to help the participants to adopt the containment approach, which integrates a variety of tools for successful inclusion of children with SEN in mainstream education (Sailor, 1991; Ainscow, 1999; UNESCO, 2008; Arnesen et al., 2009).

The findings show that all 11 original participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme became aware of holistic dimensions—body and soul emotions, cognition, and awareness.
...[...] ... the background, the investment, the multi-coloured experience, movement, directed imagination, music, were all very strong for me! These are tools with which I work. Today I can't work differently! I have taken the things and I do it ...[...] ... (Taya / interview Appendix 22T / page 21 line 676).

...[...] ... The 'Lovecircles' education programme allows its participants to obtain new perspectives about themselves and the people with whom they communicate (parents, children, staff members). I believe this is the first time since college (where I studied a little drama and group dynamics) that I trained myself in the field of pure emotional tools...[...]... (Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 391).

...[...] ...every time reminds me of the gap between Taya the professional and Taya the mother... I keep telling myself that I am trying to bring these things close together...[...]... (Taya / photo T-4 / Appendix 22T / page 20 line 647).

The integration of cognitive-theoretical and emotional aspects based on art processes in the group during the programme, enabled participants to focus on the development of the 'whole person'.

...[...] ... the process was through all the senses, was much fuller ...[...] ... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 5 line 153).

...[...] ...I gained tools for building activities from an entirely different point of view of workshops. ... they were proven a complete success in the field... I think that my perception of group tutoring has completely changed...[...]...developed more patience...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 18 line 575).

...[...] ... that is, if I could use these techniques in teaching... I would tell my pupils: "here are the notes; everyone will choose the note matching their mood!" And we start the lesson by: How are you today? I am fine! And then we talk during a lesson the subject of which is body and face parts... What an unfathomable source of expression!! ...[...] ... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 26 line 826).
5.3.2. Integrating Holistic Dimensions as a Tool for Professional Development

Ten out of eleven participants felt that they had learnt to effectively integrate emotions in their work. They learnt to express their feelings and accept other people's emotions through a discourse based on emotions.

...[...] ...I will never forget... being surprised by my response, saying: 'It pained me to know that he was unhappy'. This calmed him down. I think that my ability to relate to emotions began to develop there. It had already become part of me. But I felt there a new aspect of relationships with the children which I transferred to the class...[...]...
(Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 23 line 739).

Integrating emotions was facilitated using art:

...[...] the creations were generally something extremely new which I had never experienced. ...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 129).

The evidence shows that the professional development of most of the original 11 participants is characterised by a growing ability to integrate multi-disciplinary aspects in their teaching. For example: integrating emotions, body-soul aspects in activities based on experiential occurrences and integration of art.

...[...] ... in the 'Lovecircles' education programme I learnt that you don't always need to use words... that it really does not matter whether you are gifted and/or can paint ...[...]...wow... I already have no barriers! I understand how creativity is important for children! True, I have studied young age psychology and from there I also took ideas. But from you I have learnt! With you, experience in the game connected me to the playground in every kindergarten... that is how children learn... their learning is built on that...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 25 line 787).

...[...]... I am used to playing music, lighting a candle, using colour and materials almost in every lesson which deals with difficult topics. For example: Memorial Day or other contents...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 17 line 560).

All the original 11 participants developed a teaching method that integrated attention to the body alongside attention to the soul while using artistic work. The approach to the body-soul aspect seems to enable a holistic view of pupils.
...[...]

...The tools she received as well for listening to her own emotions, process them, release them from both body and soul, entailed a natural listening ability...[...](Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 396).

...[...]...the girl diagnosed as learning-disabled has undergone a meaningful change after receiving tools for penetrating her own personal world... using respiration in states of stress... At first I identified that the fear {which she experienced}... was manifested by dizziness in situations whereby she had difficulties to get inside...[...]...
Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 398) ... These tools increased her self-confidence... today there is a considerable improvement of her academic attainments, her social involvement...[...]...(Eve / diary Appendix 22E / page 12 line 402).

The participants enhanced their ability to integrate art in all areas of their work. They acknowledged the importance and potential of art in the personal and pedagogical development of the pupils.

...[...]

...for the first time I have met the empowerment of a simple drawing...[...]...
(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 129).

...[...]...when activating all the channels: seeing, hearing, feeling... a person can always get connected to one of them...[...]...
(Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 17 line 558).

...[...]...There is also that matter of body work, of art and guided imagery. Based on my experience I know these are places which allow once more to bypass thinking and then to the mind...Not directly to conceptualisations but first of all to experience, to feel... for the body this is something very holistic...[...]...
(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 5 line 146).

All the participants' perceptions of their professional development were expanded. It included a changed focus of learning through shared learning. The broader perception in the context of developing in a group comprises multi-disciplinary aspects: emotions, thoughts, and awareness.

...[...]...unlike another workshop where I remained as a tutor, I observed exercises and methods! I did not feel that I had undergone processes as a human being. I received
tools but not as a person, perhaps as a tutor I received more tools...[...]
(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 115).

...[...]
I received some mirror, reflection, that I am being accepted from all sides! In anger and happiness and there was room for both...[...]
to bring what I am feeling now...[...]
(Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 4 line 107).

[...]
reminds me of the people in the group that I really liked, particularly deep acquaintance with people who were actually strangers! ...[...]
with pains... with their barriers (Taya / photo T-4 / Appendix 22T / page 20 line 651).

...[...]
I see that I was very absorbed, listening to others who shared... in this workshop I learnt to concentrate on being present... in the past it was difficult for me to concentrate... very present! ...[...]
(Taya / interview / photo 5 & 6 / Appendix 22T / page 20 line 652).

All the participants felt that their professional development was considerably enhanced. Their perception of their professional development in the 'Lovecircles' education programme is characterised by a transition from a narrower to a broader perception of the profession. This perception focuses on the relationship between their personal and professional development as well as on the relationship between the personal and academic development of their pupils (children with special educational needs—SEN). Putting the emphasis during the programme on the integration of the full range of dimensions appeared to raise the participants' awareness of a humanistic-holistic and integrative approach to teaching. They developed an awareness of the impact of the relationship between their overall development and the pupils' holistic development towards positively including them in mainstream education.

The perception of all the 11 original participants matched a desired approach for including children with SEN, based on acceptance and empowerment. The process the participants had undergone in the group helped them to build a variety of work tools designed to develop their pupils with SEN (this will be discussed in depth in section 5.4.1). The participants' professional development stemmed from integrating all awareness dimensions and extending the tutor-participant relationship towards the personal dimension in addition to the general-professional dimension.
5.3.3. Personal-Professional Continuum of Development

Analysis of the findings that emerged from Research Question 4 yielded three main learner patterns. This was achieved by analysing the personal and professional dimensions and integration of both dimensions of the findings of each participant individually (based on the sub-categories of each dimension) and comparing to other participants’ findings. The various conditions that enabled the learners' development through the ‘Lovecircles’ programme gave rise to different learner patterns, according to particular characteristics and ingredients of the programme resulting from the tutor's differentiated attention to the participants’ needs and aspirations. As illustrated in Table 5.3 on p. 182, some participants developed mainly in the personal area, others developed mostly in the professional area, and a few developed in both areas. There is a developmental pattern emerging with implications for the pivotal role of the tutor. Table 5.3 explains how I arrived at this data by the typical patterns shown by Eve, Shanny, and Yafa.

*Left Column: FOCUS ON PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT- Example: Eve*

Analysing Eve's development indicated focusing on her *personal dimension* mainly being released of emotional barriers by using art and body-soul integration her own personal development. Throughout participation in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme, Eve's emotional understanding increased and she developed a sense of acceptance and self-esteem, entailing a sense of inter-personal trust. Eve became more confident when having to cope with her own personal difficulties leading to experiencing pleasure from implementing teamwork according to the ‘Lovecircles’ approach. Therefore, her emotional journey was understood as representing the learner's pattern, focused on personal development, which is manifested by her professional work. She described her pupil by features based on personal dimensions such as pleasure when she used art in her work with the pupil. Conversely, she did not indicate aspects from the professional dimension, e.g. using art as a didactic means. Eve's learning pattern, i.e. focusing on personal development, reflected upon her professional work.
In this light studying Eve's development suggests the specific tutoring strategies that can be used in order to support her professional development dimension leading towards the integration of both dimensions.

**Use of the Arts** – Using art as a tool for self-expression of emotions

**Group experience** – Developing attention to the learner's personal dimension as grounds for the development of his/her listening to the personal dimension of others in the group

**Ethos** – Personal development is the grounds for professional development and developing positive attitude towards work, leads to an inclusive approach

**Inter-personal considerations** – Extending relationship towards personal dimension

Respect the individual's self-confidence and strength as a base for developing professional identity.

*Left Column: FOCUS ON PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT Example: Shanny*

Shanny decided to join the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme since she felt she was not fulfilling her professional potential, though the environment perceives her to be a successful teacher. Therefore, Shanny experienced barriers to her advance professionally and in academia with increased frustration and dissatisfaction. This was manifested throughout the educational programme as Shanny focused on the aspect of her professional development.

Hence, studying Shanny's development suggests that following the specific tutoring strategies can be used in order to support imbedding of personal dimension along with professional dimension leading towards balancing and integrating both dimensions.

**Use of the Arts** – developing awareness of the contribution of art to the relief of emotional barriers as grounds for professional realization

**Group experience** – assisting to build a variety of work tools designed to develop pupils with SEN
Ethos – relieving emotional barriers is the grounds for professional development

Inter-personal considerations – body-soul aspect seems to enable a holistic view of pupils

Left Column FOCUS ON INTEGRATION OF PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT Example: Yafa

Yafa joined the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme in order to close the gap she felt in reference to the human aspect in all the professional programmes in which she studied. She graduated an academic programme in creative education in the formal as well as alternative education systems. Her professional journey integrated alternative and traditional approaches but she found out that they were both based on a didactic technique, whereas the personal dimension was not manifested in a balanced and integrated way with the professional dimension.

Studying Yafa's development throughout the ‘Lovecircles’ programme reveals she underwent processes that integrated both personal and professional dimensions. Yafa developed sensitivity and empathy for herself and for others leading towards enhancement of her teaching based on integrating emotions and empathy for individuals in the group processes via art.

Therefore, Yafa integrating development throughout ‘Lovecircles’ programme suggests the following strategic procedures:

Use of the Arts – recognition the role of various nonverbal modalities for personal and professional development

Group experience – facilitating the comprehension of the process of every individual in the group and of the group as a whole as well as of the tools used

Ethos – Integrating the personal and professional dimensions into professional development – grounds for integrative holistic professional development within inclusion
Inter-personal considerations – integrating all awareness dimensions develop confidence and increased self-confidence

Out of the 11 participants, only Yafa showed this pattern of development.

Table 5.3: Summary of 'Lovecircles' tutor strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main focus</th>
<th>Use of the Arts</th>
<th>Group experience</th>
<th>Ethos</th>
<th>Inter-personal considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FOCUS ON PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>Using art as a tool for self-expression of emotions</td>
<td>Developing attention to the learner's personal dimension as grounds for the development of his/her listening to the personal dimension of others in the group</td>
<td>Personal development is the grounds for professional development</td>
<td>Extending relationship towards personal dimension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example: Eve</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Developing positive attitude towards work, leads to an inclusive approach</td>
<td>Respect the individual's self-confidence and strength as a base for developing professional identity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Body-soul aspect seems to enable a holistic view of pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOCUS ON PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>Developing awareness of the contribution of art to the relief of emotional barriers as grounds for professional realization</td>
<td>Assisting to build a variety of work tools designed to develop pupils with SEN</td>
<td>Relieving emotional barriers is the grounds for professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example: Shanny</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Integrating all awareness dimensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOCUS ON INTEGRATION OF PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>Recognition the role of variety of nonverbal modalities for personal and professional development</td>
<td>Facilitating the comprehension of the process of every individual in the group and of the group as a whole and of the tools used</td>
<td>Integrating the personal and professional dimensions into professional development – grounds for integrative holistic professional development within inclusive contexts</td>
<td>Develop confidence and increased self-confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example: Yafa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3.4. Summary: Research Question 4: Is There Any Link between Personal and Professional Development?

Enhancing reference to the self in the professional-general dimension
The participants' professional development seemed to stem from integrating all awareness dimensions and expanding the tutor-participant relationship into their personal dimension in the general-professional dimension. Learning in the 'Lovecircles' education programme facilitated different types of learning. The various conditions that enabled learners' development yielded these learner patterns, each focusing on different characteristics and components of the programme. Finally, it appeared to be the tutor's differentiated attention and use of specific strategies that had emerged as a central finding of this study had in facilitating the three learner patterns.

5.4 Findings Emerging from Research Question 5 – How Might the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme Affect Their Work with Children with Special Needs?

5.4.1. Multi-Dimensional Attention and Multi-Dimensional Tutoring for Learners with SEN

Data collected in the field through direct work with children (see Table A.10 in Appendix 10, and Table 5.2 in the thesis) provide an evidence base for the participants' enhancement of reference to the self and to children with special educational needs (SEN). This development of the five participants (from the original cohort of 11) that proceeded to the practicum stage of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme was manifested by the development of a personal, emotional and empathetic attitude towards them. Furthermore, these participants created room for the pupils' expression, being attentive to them and to their personal world. The five participants learnt to integrate emotions in their communication with the pupils and even to relate to emotional aspects in their teaching-learning plans.

...[...]...I am able to accept the children ...and they really open up and learn and I am really grateful!...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 24 line 761).
...[...]... The acceptance experience in the group made me feel the need for accepting and empowering my pupils in any way possible...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 30 line 984).

All 5 of the participants, with the exception of one, developed the understanding that pupils' learning is a prolonged process. They also perceived teaching as consistent, flowing and spontaneous.

...[...]... children with SEN need a place allowing them to undergo an orderly process... to inquire, experiment and have empowering and reinforcing experiences... discover new sides in themselves... ...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 / line 235).

The 5 participants expressed confidence in assimilating the interactive relational approach that they developed in the programme, both on the level of understanding pupils' behaviour and of adapting the teaching method to this behaviour.

...[...]... ... L. became aware of the way he breathed and could talk about his fears. He started breathing properly and continued learning without any fear... I involved also the home-class teacher/the counsellor in the matter... [...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 31 line 1020).

As reported by 9 out of 11 the participants, they connected body-soul aspects.

...[...]...you are tired! You have worked! Just tired... you have to know when to stop...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 30 line 958).

...[...]... I think that my ability to relate to emotion has developed...[...]... it has probably become part of me! It was a new aspect of relationships with children which I transferred with me to class...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 23 line 740).

...[...]...seeing the light... seeing the pleasant parts in my life ...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 14 line 453, 455).
5.4.2. Emotional Pedagogy with Pupils with SEN – a relational approach

Enhancing reference to the personal dimension within the professional dimension led to containment of children with special educational needs (SEN) in practice by the 5 core participants. Their personal direct experiences and attention to their emotions throughout the programme seemed to enable the participants to connect emotions, a body-soul approach and art while teaching. This connection may have facilitated the introduction of emotional and body-soul aspects as well as the integration of art in their teaching in order to develop personal expression and enhance self-confidence, concentration and serenity of pupils with SEN.

The core 5 participants all believed that the integration of art in teaching is a tool and an intervention, rendering things easier for pupils with regard to self-judgment and development of their capabilities. Art thus was seen to promote pupils' acquaintance with themselves, empowering their self-perception and allowing them to build a dialogue with others.

...[...]... I have already envisioned myself working with children and parents and enjoying myself... [...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 13 line 404).

The 5 core participants adopted an approach to teaching based on emotion within their relationship as teacher and pupils with SEN: complete acceptance of these children, attention to their unique learning methods and building a personal learning curriculum that integrates multi-disciplinary aspects.

... [...]...In fact, in 'Lovecircles' they can express their creativity ... [...]... You talk about your creation, tell, speak about it and it helps you... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 8 line 237).

Adopting an emotion-based approach to teaching was characterised by acknowledging the unique "magic" of working with children with SEN: recognising the importance of exposing pupils’ strong points; adopting the 'whole person' approach for the pupils' empowerment; and the development of initiatives for working with parents of these children. These initiatives are all focused on personal empowerment, facilitated by encouraging emotional expression. The new emotion-based approach, developed and implemented by the 5 core participants during the practicum stage of the 'Lovecircles’
programme, was built upon empathy for and interest in the pupils' works. This new approach seemed to support them in building a personalised curriculum for them, and integrating experiential teaching methods grounded in holistic attention to the pupils' needs and emotions and also their own emotions as teachers in this context.

...[...] it is clear to me that emotional reference to the subject might provide difficulty-bypassing mechanisms, neutralising some of the pupils' emotional and cognitive damages ...[...]... (Shanny / interview Appendix 22S / page 17 line 564).

5.4.3. Art-Based Pedagogy within SEN

The 5 core participants indicated that in the course of the programme, they developed a concept of integrating art while teaching children with special educational needs. Integrating art helped them to promote their self-confidence, relieve frustrations and express themselves. Thus, they sensed that by integrating art they would be able to assist their pupils to empower themselves.

...[...]... I integrate art based on my experience in 'Lovecircles' ...[...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 234).

...[...]... In the past I communicated with myself and with the world mainly through the head. Today I find it easier to communicate through emotions... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 355) a different quality and better communication with both children and adults. ...[...]... (Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 362).

...[...]... I usually manifest my satisfaction with their progress... M. started believing in himself and, now, he disrupts the lesson only rarely and demonstrates concentration ability and great interest in learning...[...]... (Miri / interview Appendix 22M / page 31 line 1009).

...[...]...I see my ability to understand the children and my varied approaches to them. I have the possibility to combine several tools together in accordance with the children's needs and, thus, facilitate a process consisting of several layers. This process affects the children in several senses, enabling connection, empowerment and expansion of their capabilities... [...]... (Yafa / interview Appendix 22Y / page 7 line 230).
All 11 of the participants developed an approach to teaching, based on understanding pupils' needs and behaviours through body-soul aspects. Integrating body-soul aspects is manifested by their attention to the children’s emotions and movements simultaneously with thoughts. The integration is illustrated by them being attentive and offering activities that focus on the body-soul connection through art activities.

They considered that developing attention to the emotional dimensions of children with special educational needs allows them to develop in a released manner.

... [...]...connecting the children to their personal world and to their own emotions... releasing the energies which have been imprisoned for years in the body...[...]...(Eve / interview Appendix 22E / page 11 line 367).

**5.4.4. Differentiated Personal and Professional Development**

The five exemplar case studies illustrate a differentiated balance of personal and professional dimensions to development through the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Whilst their case histories are detailed in Appendix 20, they are summarized in Table 5.4 and expanded upon briefly below.

Studying the developmental themes within the personal and professional dimensions, based on the background narrative of each participant (as presented in detail below), revealed the core principles of 'Lovecircles' programme.

It is significant to take into consideration the fact that the participants by paying for their study in ‘Lovecircles’ programme could be considered as my customers. This might have an impact on their statement concerning their expectation from their participation in the programme.

Yet through my professional perception, I kept in mind this possibility, that their overt (for example in the interview) and latent statements (verbally through the sessions or via their art activities) were similar or reveal different meanings concerning their authentic needs. The rich variety of data sources – verbally and visually- enabled me to study their needs throughout the stages of the course.
Therefore, I leaned on my years of practical experience in assessment and therapy processes, including expertise in multi-dimensional reflection (personal and professional dimensions), which enabled me to critically reflect on how I reconcile this possible tension. This awareness could serve as scaffolding for dialogue between tutor and participants throughout the sessions and can hence enhance building authentic relationships, leading towards holistic development.

Table 5.4: Development through the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT</th>
<th>PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT</th>
<th>KEY 'Lovecircles' PRINCIPLE(S) EMERGING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EVE – personal focus</td>
<td>Developed self-awareness and expression</td>
<td>Overcame emotional barriers enabling successful actualization of professional capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHANNY – professional focus</td>
<td>Enhancement of self-perception, overcoming frustration leading to closing gap between personal and professional dimensions</td>
<td>Feeling of not exhausting own professional potential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIRI – personal-professional focus</td>
<td>Development of personal positive perception confident to self-express</td>
<td>Widening the perception of children with SEN leading to successful inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAYA – personal-professional focus</td>
<td>Developed multi-dimensional perception via art</td>
<td>Developed holistic self-acceptance and empathy leading to acceptance and respecting diversity. Developed awareness of the role of art for closing the gap between personal and professional development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YAFA – focus on integration of personal-professional</td>
<td>Developed self-holistic, attentive, associative and intuitive approach—not only a cognitive approach leading to unleash emotional barriers and self-expression via art</td>
<td>Developed tutoring perception based on attention to personal and professional dimension of learners via art within a group.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Eve –

Eve came to the 'Lovecircles' education programme after having acquired multi-disciplinary professional knowledge and skills – working in the police, obtaining a degree in education, colour therapy, rhythm-music for children, archaeology, psychology, advertising, art coaching, one brain, learning disabilities, counselling and therapy, therapy by means of people, talks, self-work, positive thinking. Eve believed she failed to actualise her professional capabilities, feeling a sense of emotional dissociation, which blocked her ability to materialise her extensive and long professional education.

Eve perceived her personal development as being at the centre of herself. She developed the ability to express her personal development via her painting for example by noticing how she drew her head (i.e. the size) and its meaning (i.e. the dominant role of cognitive aspects). Eve demonstrated her professional development by noticing that she moved towards allowing others to express themselves first and she developed an ability to listen to others and communicate emotionally with both children and adults.

Eve perceived professional development in SEN by realising the great importance of teaching children to communicate with their personal world, to listen to the wise personal voice in themselves. She developed understanding that this enabled them to communicate with themselves and the world from another place, in a more aware and open way.

Eve noticed that the core principle throughout the programme and to which the tutor gave her full attention, was emotion; for example via the conversation about issues concerning 'joie de vivre' (Appendix 22E, page 8 line 245). She found that art and movement were self-expression tools that enabled her to start noticing a pattern of movement (such as eight-shaped movements) and their hidden meaning (such as an element of infinity) and art figures (such as motto of the heart).
**Shanny**

Shanny has a degree in education and science teaching as well as extensive experience in being a home-class teacher at junior high school and 6 years with children with SEN. During her years of work she felt she was not fulfilling her potential, in spite of the interest, love and passion she experienced both in her area of knowledge and in her work with the pupils themselves. Consequently, she decided to join the 'Lovecircles' education programme.

Shanny felt a gap between the way the environment perceives her – a successful teacher with numerous skills – and the way she perceives herself. This gap led to professional barriers, manifested by her refusal to undertake professional challenges suggested to her, including in academia. These barriers evoked a sense of frustration and dissatisfaction. In the course of her development in the 'Lovecircles' education programme, Shanny managed to release emotional barriers. She shared with the group the fact that she has learning disabilities (in writing) and the emotions accompanying this, whose effects were hidden from her and blocked her professional development.

Shanny perceived her personal development as unleashing her barriers in order to express her voice (for example by performing on stage and speaking into a microphone, especially in such events that she herself organises). She developed awareness that professional development is related to unleashing personal barriers that might have been hidden in early childhood (for example difficulty of talking and the impact on voice function such as turning hoarse).

Shanny's professional work in SEN was manifested by understanding that those children benefit from the lessons in which emotions are introduced. She perceived emotions (for example sharing a variety of feelings in the group) and art (such as music and diversified materials for self-expression) as core principles for her development within the 'Lovecircles' programme.
Miri

Miri’s academic history was within the framework of psychology studies and early childhood and academic studies for teaching English to dyslexic children. She has accumulated 13 years of experience teaching children with special needs in mainstream classes. Miri decided to participate in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme since she felt disappointment in her academic studies, which she failed to see impact her students. She felt an urge to advance her practice for better succeeding in including those students in their classes. Her quest for fulfilling this aspiration was the reason she joined the ‘Lovecircles’ programme.

Miri perceived her personal development as being satisfied with herself and fully confident, without any fear to expose her own feelings within a group. She understood the core principle for her development as special acceptance of her emotions and conceptualised this understanding as sewing up a hole in a garment.

She defined her professional development as seeing the broader contexts, for example, the atmosphere in class. Miri expressed with gratitude her professional development in SEN as the ability to accept the children, leading to their openness and learning.

Miri expressed her personal development as developing the ability for a more multi-dimensional perception through creative outputs, movement and music. Miri defined the core principle for her development as accepting her emotions and establishing relationship based on full containment.

She perceived her professional development as developing self-acceptance and holistic integrative self-empathy. She understood her professional development in SEN as developing acceptance and respecting diversity. She perceived the role of Art for expressing her development as closing the gap between her personal and professional development.
**Taya**

Taya’s academic background is a B.Ed degree in special education, with 16 years of experience in teaching and seven years as an inclusion manager with learning disabled children. She has decided to join the ‘Lovecircles’ programme due to her dissatisfaction in her educational work. She felt that her academic background and years of experience were not fulfilling her inner belief in better possibilities for disabled children. Moreover, she encountered emotional dissatisfaction within her personal life and felt that she needed a change which might open new avenues. As she was on her sabbatical, she consulted with the Head of Special Education programmes on possibilities of professional development, and was referred to ‘Lovecircles’ as an new and alternative programme.

Taya expressed her personal development as developing the ability for a more multi-dimensional perception through creative output, movement, and music. Taya defined the core principle for her development as accepting her emotions and establishing relationships based on full containment.

She perceived her professional development as developing self-acceptance and holistic integrative self-empathy. She understood her professional development in SEN as developing acceptance and respecting diversity. She perceived the role of Art for expressing her development and closing the gap between her personal and professional development.

**Yafa**

Yafa has a degree in creative education in the field of drama therapy as well as experience in teaching and tutoring children, adolescents and adults in the formal and alternative education systems. Yafa attended the 'Lovecircles' education programme because she felt a lack of reference to the human aspect in all the wide array of professional programmes in which she had participated, although these programmes claimed to be alternative vis-à-vis traditional approaches.
She realised that the learning she had acquired prior to 'Lovecircles' focused on observing others and copying didactic techniques, without a connection to the personal essence of tutor to people in their development process. Throughout these studies Yafa reported alienation, coldness and dissociation from her personal world. These resulted in her closedness, sadness and disappointment in teaching and tutoring, in spite of her passion to teach, tutor, and be a partner to her development processes as well as to those of others.

Yafa expressed her personal development as developing a self-holistic, attentive, associative and intuitive approach—not only a cognitive approach. This development allowed her to unleash emotional barriers and express herself via art. Yafa perceived the tutors’ whole-hearted attendance to her emotions as the core principle of her development and art as a means of expressing herself within the group.

Yafa defined her professional development as tutoring based on attention to personal and professional dimensions of learners within a the group. She perceived her professional development in SEN as attending to their needs and emotions by reinforcing an experiential holistic process of self-discovery.

5.4.5. Summary: Research Question 5 – Professional Development in the Field of Children with Special Educational Needs (SEN)

*Multi-dimensional attention to and multi-dimensional tutoring of learners with SEN*

The 5 core participants proceeding to the practicum stage of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme developed a personal, emotional and empathetic attitude towards pupils with SEN, creating room for their expression as well as being attentive to them and their personal world. The participants learnt to integrate emotions in their communication with the pupils and to relate to emotional aspects in teaching-learning plans.

*Emotional pedagogy within SEN – a relational approach*

The five core participants implemented in their teaching an approach based on emotional awareness, which turned attention disorders into leverage for learning and
which considered the ensuing problems a challenge and an opportunity. The participants developed a teaching approach focused on establishing a relationship with pupils based on emotion: a relationship based on qualities of spontaneity, complete acceptance of the pupils, attention to their uniqueness, expressing interest and pleasure with regard to their creations. The participants believed that the relationship with pupils should be grounded in love, empathy and caring; in particular, they saw containment of pupils with special emotional needs is important.

**Art-based pedagogy within SEN**

Attention to the personal dimension, namely emotions, throughout the programme, enabled the participants to integrate emotional aspects into teaching pupils with special educational needs. Moreover, they developed a new perception; namely, a theoretical and practical understanding concerning the significant role of art in introducing emotions in education.

**5.5. Methodological Critique**

The research aimed to study my own practice because I was a participating member of the situation being studied. This type of research is supported by Winter & Munn-Giddings (2001) who maintain that this type of research is valuable as it encourages researchers to examine their own practices.

"Modern theories of knowledge emphasise that our knowledge exists as a set of ‘conjectures’ always awaiting possible refutation by future events, and that ‘rationality’ is a matter of our willingness to engage in a process of continuous learning”

(Winter and Munn-Giddings, 2001, p.21).

Therefore, the present study integrates this principle at the centre of its processes.

Winter and Munn-Giddings (2001) claimed that the validity of inquiry that proceeds through continuously negotiating between different perspectives resides in the
carefulness and rigour of this process, not merely in a claim to have made an accurate representation of reality (the main claim of both Positivism and Naturalistic inquiry).

In this light, the present research does not only attempt to portray practical developments accurately and to evaluate them soundly, but it also seeks validity in a further dimension – the openness of its communicative process. This research has presented differing views that have been fully expressed and the interpretations arising from the inquiry have been open to scrutiny and debate. Thus, the ‘validity’ of this research relies upon the way it seriously addresses the issues regarding the aims and goal of the research.

In this light, I have been aware of the possibility that my personal and professional narrative might impact the data analysis process. Therefore, throughout the research I have been under professional supervision. The supervision approach which I underwent matched my own philosophical perspective and paradigm of the integrative holistic humanistic approach.

I agree with Winter (2003) that though science offers at least the possibility of consensus on the definition of its terms, when it comes to analysing human experiences, even apparently ‘obvious’ concepts such as “emotions” and “development” are the focus of differing cultural, political, and ethical values. I was aware that as a researcher I might cling to the feelings, thoughts, desires, habits, views, beliefs, and impressions that arise at each stage of the research analysis, therefore the supervision I followed served as a practical guide, to balance the intellectual and the emotional aspects.

The extended process of developing the data analysis intensified the interpretation and the conceptualization process within each stage, enabling me to revisit the findings in an effort to improve them. This interpretive process enabled me to deepen the analysis of each stage, integrating my own perspective’s “voice” on the text as well as other participants’ “voices” (Bowen, 2006; Charmaz, 2000).

As researchers might end their studies with questions about the absolute ethicality of what they have carried out (Apter, 1996; Bar-On, 1996; Estroff, 1995; Josselson, 1996; Lieblich, 1996), the same as in my case, I feel I have been attentive to the challenging dilemmas of my research (MacIntyre, 1984; Nussbaum, 1986).
The subsections below indicate how I dealt with the issues raised in section 4.8.

5.5.1. Informed Consent and Coercion

This research followed the accepted rules of ethics in research that concerning the reception of informed consent from all participants. Each of the participants was willing to sign the consent form.

Ethical codes guided me to provide full information about the research and its objectives (Lincoln & Guba, 1989) so that the participants can see the advantages and disadvantages of participating and decide consciously to do so (Howe & Dougherty, 1993). The informed consent to this study was given in writing by means of a consent form (see Appendix 1.a: Ethics Review Checklist) and approved by ARU's research ethics committees.

5.5.2. Privacy and Anonymity

During the research, at every stage and aspect I acted ethically with regard to all human connections, safeguarding the privacy and honour of the participants with the aim of adding to the existing academic body of knowledge (Josselson, 2007).

The participants were promised anonymity and privacy, in writing, for the process of data analysis, findings, and report writing. Great care was taken to ensure there would be no possibility of identifying the participants.

I stored the data in a locked cabinet and saved the digital data on a computer with access limited only to me as the researcher. I created an atmosphere free of coercion or inequalities that would prompt individuals to acquiesce or be silent. This was significant due to the fact that participants were my students; therefore social desirability (Bryman, 2004) was taken into consideration as well.
5.5.3. Reciprocity and Partnership

The dilemma of ownership of research data raises an ethical question concerning the researcher’s loyalty to the participants and the integrity of the research (Noddings, 1986).

Although the participants paid fees for their training (as is customary for academic training in Israel), they were informed explicitly that the training has no success or failure issues; the focus was purely on each individual. Therefore, while they participated in the research, there was no question of any benefit (such as failure/success) besides explaining their potential contribution to the subject under scrutiny. It is clear that they understood this issue, as shown in the reasons they provided for wanting to undergo the training programme.

I leaned on Lincoln’s (1993) opinion that the researcher's commitment to the interpretation process emerges from both the perceptions of the participants and the researcher. Lincoln says that the researcher can contribute to the empowerment of participants while ensuring the validity and credibility of the research.

The participants received copies of all the data that they provided, thereby providing them with an opportunity to confirm the material they contributed. This allowed them additional verification of the data under study (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1995).

I was aware of the opinion that the researcher’s relationship with the participants might have exploitative connotations (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1995). I adopted an ethical attitude during the research, based on deep reflection about what it means to encounter and represent “otherness”. I conducted the research while adhering to Shlasky and Alpert’s (2007) approach, in that the aim of the researcher is not to exploit the information. Rather, as stated in the introductory chapter, I embarked on this research based on my holistic humanistic approach of giving a voice to professional development of educators (Leiblich, 2003).

I adhered to the basic ethical rules concerning the research, to tell the truth and avoid any risk of hurting the participants, while directing the research to moral aims. I considered these issues and consulted with colleagues when necessary. The professional supervision I received focused on emotional and cognitive reflection. All this was to
evaluate the ways in which I implemented the ethical rules so they will not become inhibition factors; rather, serve as the facilitating and guiding factor. Over and above this, I focused on reading research materials aligned with ethical issues, intending to raise my awareness and to acquire tools to explain the decisions which I undertook throughout the research, knowing that I could be criticised at any juncture (Shlasky & Alpert, 2007).

This research concurs with Hogarth’s (2001) claim that there is no research tool more sensitive than the researcher himself.

The researcher who studies the field and has years of experience and sensitivity has a great deal to contribute. Therefore, there is a debate over whether researchers participating in their own study (as in the present research) leads to bias (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). This is further exacerbated when the researcher is also the developer of the programme under study. As stated in the introduction, I have accumulated extensive experience in both the teaching and therapy fields and therefore I embarked on this study from a position of knowing the field in its theoretical and practical perspectives (Shkedi, 2011).

The Methodology chapter 4.8 indicates that I am aware of potential bias, and therefore I explicitly and accurately documented all stages, their validity, and coherency. I took significant steps to reduce bias (such as when collecting data), keeping a record of all the documents and data, interview scripts, photos and video recordings, in such a way that each stage is available for review within the constraints of privacy. I took special care to ensure that the data would stand up to a high standard of research.

Munn-Giddings et al. (2008) advocates that ‘researchers are expected to produce evidence for best practice and practitioners are required to implement it’ (Somekh & Lewin, 2005, p. 9); this challenges researchers to produce the evidence for practice change. Therefore an interventional approach of behalf of researchers appears to develop ‘innovative practices’ and has the potential to play a role in achieving the expected research goals (Somekh & Lewin, 2005, p. 9).
5.6. Conclusion

This chapter illustrated participants' development in three dimensions: the personal dimension, the general-professional dimension and the specific-professional dimension, namely for working with children with special educational needs (SEN). In all these dimensions, the development ensued from core principles of the Lovecircles education programme, as endorsed by the five case study participants from the original cohort of 11, that completed all stages of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme:

- The tutors' attention to the participants' personal and professional world;
- Intensive work with art;
- Creating a climate devoid of criticism and judgment;
- Containment and empowerment.

The combination of all these aspects as facilitated by the tutor during the programme led to the establishment of a supportive group embodying trust and acceptance, and the participants' development in the three dimensions – personal, professional and specific-professional. This resulted in better communication with oneself and others as well as building tools for self-expression and the promotion thereof.

Developing attention to the participants' personal and professional dimensions had an impact on the development of their ability to contain and nurture the development of children with special educational needs (SEN).

Despite its importance in the context of the applied aspect of the participants' development, the final practicum stage within the 'Lovecircles' programme was attributed less weight in the initial analysis of the data and the emerging findings. Yet, reflection on presentation of the findings regarding the participants' personal and professional development raised awareness of the need for focused thinking regarding the possible contribution of the study – both in understanding the participants' development during the practicum stage and the education method implemented with the children.

This critique led to the understanding that assessment of the practicum stage and education methods required the development of tools for that purpose and to support the
possible incorporation of a new Educator model approach within teacher education programmes. Hence it was necessary to focus the research on the participants' perception of their professional development – in particular, the five out of the original eleven participants who completed the second practicum stage and received additional training and guidance. The findings presented in this chapter enabled the design of an integrative developmental model for teacher education, based on a continuum of personal and professional needs towards an emotionally robust and sensitive inclusive teacher, with pointers for tutors to facilitate progression. This is explored further in the following chapters, sustained by the theories underpinning this research.
Chapter 6 – DISCUSSION

This chapter explores participants' development in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme in line with the aims of ‘Lovecircles’ and of this study. It considers the conspicuous findings as well as the emergence of three identified learner profile prototypes. The emerging narrative offers a new understanding of the way the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme might be a catalyst for professional development. Moreover, by studying the processes participants experienced, the subsequent contribution to their work in the field of special education may be apparent. The interpretations and evaluations are supported by links and insights into theoretical perspectives underpinning the conceptual framework of this study. Finally, it suggests a new interpretation of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme as a prototype ‘Educator model’ for future professional training programmes. This will be explored further in the next chapter.

The discussion is presented in the order of the research questions that were designed to investigate the impact of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme.

6.1. Research Question 1: Core Principles Leading to the Personal and Professional Development of Participants

6.1.1. Core Principles Emerging through the Research

Core principles of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme were the multi-dimensional tutor’s integrative attention to both personal and professional dimensions and the multi-dimensional art-integrated tutoring. Eliminating emotional barriers and expressing emotion through metaphors and expanding tutor-participant relationships enabled personal and professional development of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Enhancing reference to the self in the professional-general dimension and integrating awareness of holistic dimensions as a tool of professional development were found to be the link between personal and professional development.
These principles enabled the development of an Integrative Holistic Humanistic—IHH—approach to professional development based on emotional intelligence and art-based pedagogy within SEN. Table 6.1 summarises the clustering of the findings as they emerged.

### Table 6.1: Core principles for holistic professional development for working with learners with SEN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research objective 1: Core Principles</th>
<th>Multi-dimensional integrative attention – personal &amp; professional dimensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Multi-dimensional tutoring – integration of art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research objectives 2 &amp; 3: Personal development &amp; Professional development</td>
<td>Integration of art – eliminating emotional barriers and expressing emotion through metaphors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expanding tutor-participant relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research objective 4: The link between personal development &amp; professional development</td>
<td>Enhancing reference to the self in the professional-general dimension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Integrating holistic dimensions as a tool of professional development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research objective 5: Professional Development in SEN</td>
<td>Multi-dimensional attention to and multi-dimensional tutoring of learners with SEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emotional relational pedagogy for SEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Art-based pedagogy for SEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Developing an ethos of acceptance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An emerging model for Teacher Education</td>
<td>Integrative Holistic Humanistic—IHH—approach to professional development:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6.1.2. Multi-Dimensional Integrative Attention

Participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme related their personal and professional development to the unique core principles of the programme: multi-dimensional attention and multi-dimensional tutoring integrating art.
Attention to the Personal Dimension

In the personal dimension, the tutor’s attentiveness to the quality of relationships with participants included features such as openness, expression of emotions, love and tenderness, acceptance, containment and flexibility. This is demonstrated by verbal interpretation of art products chosen by the participants (such as the heart and rose metaphors discussed by Yafa in Appendix 2: Metaphors). According to most participants, they felt this integrated body-soul aspects, although they perceived it differently. Analysis of the above findings indicates that attention to the personal and professional dimension constitutes a basis for participants’ integrative-holistic development and is fundamental to educators – a view expounded by Buber (1923), Korthagen (2005), and Hargreaves, D. (2012).

Attention to the two dimensions—personal and professional—enables educators to develop a broad understanding of learners. This encompasses covert processes in the learners' world, which affect their perception and interpretation of reality as well as their behaviour. Attention to this inner dimension—emotion—is an important part of the education and practice of professionals in the fields of both therapy and education who use the Arts, for example drama movement and creative therapy (Moon, 2007; Pendzik, 2012), as well as teachers who practice interactive approaches (Chesner, 1995; Collis & Lacey, 1996).

Interactive teaching approaches within special education were developed during the 1980s as a result of dissatisfaction with behavioural approaches that did not include learners' emotional aspects, but rather focused only on changing overt behaviour (Chesner, 1995; Collis & Lacey, 1996; Korthagen, 2004). Interactive teaching approaches maintain that providing educators only with tools and techniques does not enhance learners' development – their deeper understanding—particularly pupils with SEN (Allender, 2001; Gilat, 2007). This approach is in line with the perception of this study, which stipulates teachers' personal development as a foundation for their professional development and the acquisition and implementation of interactive teaching tools and strategies.

These findings are sustained by the integration of psychological aspects within professional development, grounded in the humanistic approach as represented by
Buber (1947, 1958). Buber claims that traditional models of education lack mutuality within teacher-student relationships while it emphasises authoritative teachers. The perception that development is affected by the relationship between significant figures such as teachers and their attention is commonly encountered in therapeutic, psychological and psycho-analytical approaches as well as in philosophical methodologies (Hadot, 1997).

The model of the educator, according to Buber (1947, 1958), is a personal model characterised by spontaneity and authenticity of a 'whole person'. This is sustained as well in the Expressive Therapy fields focusing on the 'whole person' approach, highlighting the multi-dimensional aspect of each field and leading to a synthesis forming a new constructive model (Knill et al., 1995).

Thus, educators should be aware of the impact of their attention to and relationship with learners for the sake of their healthy and harmonious development; they should cultivate their own self-awareness. In his I-thou and I-it relationships, Buber (1947, 1958) refers to the ability to establish a relationship with pupils that may be seen as a dialogical relationship and can increase their awareness of the impact of this personal dimension (Epstein, 1998).

This approach is supported by psychological theory (Wideen et al., 1998) that rational and experiential thinking have a mutual and complex impact on cognitive, emotional and motivational aspects and are highly affected by the environment. Hence, psychologists (Gilat, 2007) claim that professional development should not focus only on theories about the emotional sides of educators' role but rather relate to this aspect in actual teaching situations in class. This is corroborated by the field of psychology (Rogers, 1980; Moustakas, 1981). Aloni (2005) highlights the hidden layers of teaching and professional development such as emotions, thoughts, awareness, and spirit.

**The Role of the Tutor**

In this sense, the literature dealing with psychological aspects in education discusses learning and teaching theories, cognitive development theories, motivation, learning disabilities and attention disorders (Piaget 1969; Bandura, 1977; Vygotsky, 1978; Ball,
There is ample theoretical literature on those topics that pertains to teacher education. Yet, this study suggests that there is limited literature engaging in psychological aspects associated with professional development. That is, making the shift from academic and cognitive dimensions towards a more practical dimension by integrating personal experiential aspects of those topics relating to situational knowledge (Gilat, 2007).

The tutor’s and participants’ active creativity within the ‘Lovecircles’ programme, as well as individual tutorials, developed attention to the personal and professional dimensions of the self. Based on the participants' own words, the conclusion drawn is that a professional development process, which does not integrate attention to the personal dimension, does not develop readiness and constant investment of extra effort is in order to successfully face challenges, such as working with children with special educational needs. On the other hand, attention to the personal dimension will empower educators and impact professional practice, as attested by those five participants featured in Chapter 5 who continued onto the practicum stage B of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme.

This study concurs with Hunt (1991) that the concept of 'inside-out learning' is a process of learning that begins with oneself by focusing on one’s experienced knowledge. That is, the implicit theories, metaphors, interests, desires and goals that guide experience. These findings are in line with Furlong & Maynard, (1995), who focus on aspects of professional development stemming from the psychology of educators' personal worlds, such as their beliefs and perceptions.

These findings also corroborate those of Kohn (1993) and Ryan & Deci, (2000) who advocate that learning spaces that emphasise extrinsic reward can propel intrinsically-motivated learning. Similarly, Kagan (1992) refers to development as involving the personal dimension—acquired knowledge, beliefs and perceptions. Moreover, I uphold that my interpretation of the findings can be sustained by the narrative approach focusing on beliefs, attention and perceptions concerning one's own development and practice. Kelchtermans & Vandenberge (1994) suggest that professional development is affected by past experiences. Furthermore, these findings are supported by theories of
'professional identity' stemming from the interpretative model (Kelchtermans & Vandenbergehe, 1994), grounded in two key elements: a. professional-self and b. subjective educational theory consisting of opinions and beliefs. Hence, the content and meaning is understood by relating to educators’ whole narrative including aspects from the personal dimension.

According to Day (1999), personal and professional processes consist of professional progression and regression, affected by psychological and social aspects as well as competences and emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1998). Moreover, Mayes (2001) stressed that educators’ beliefs about themselves are shaped and inhibited by their upbringing and professional development.

LeDoux (2000), Zull (2002), and Damasio (2003) point out the relationship between emotion and personal development based on research evidence from neuroscience. This demonstrates that reason and emotion are inextricably related in their effect on learning and memory. Recent emergence of cognitive neuroscience has highlighted the interaction of cognition with emotion (Ramachandran, 2003; Phelps, 2006; Peter & Walter; 2010). Studies of the human amygdala explored five topics: emotional learning; emotion and memory; emotion's influence on attention and perception; processing emotion in social stimuli; and changing emotional responses (Phelps, 2006). Thus, this might explain the impact of the tutor’s attention in this study on participants regarding their feelings that had enhanced their development within 'Lovecircles'.

**Implications for Teacher Education Programmes**

Focusing on psychological aspects within development highlights the impact of professional attention, relationships and emotions on professional development (Rodgers & Scott, 2008). Therefore, these findings concur with innovative research into professional development, pointing to the need for developing qualities such as flexibility, openness (Schecterman, 1991), listening to one's own narrative (Elkad-Lehman & Greensfield, 2008) and perceiving the role of emotions (Totterdell & Niven, 2012).
Vygotsky (1991) claimed that development of attention to learners highlights consideration of the effect of inter-personal exchange on intellectual development based on trust and co-operation. Oplatka (2008) claims that adults’ professional development benefit from attention to their unique needs, which facilitates their learning. Moreover, Kiezel's (2009) critique is also in line with findings of this study concerning the need to embed within professional development aspects such as educators' emotions and attitudes towards the learners, instead of traditional models of pedagogy that focus predominantly on expanding educators' knowledge and pedagogical skills.

Findings of this study concur with the trend since the 1990s and up to the beginning of the 21st century of focusing on educators' personal dimension and emphasis on aspects such as relationships in teaching (Hargreaves, A., 1998; Day, 2012; Oplatka, 2012). Consequently, the findings that relate to attention to the personal dimension illuminate the place of emotions in professional development and lend support to interactive pedagogy (Collis & Lacey, 1996; Hewett & Nind, 1998; Nind & Hewett, 2001; Hewett, 2006; Imray et al., 2010). These findings construct an emotional pedagogy that underscores the connection and impact of teacher-learner relationships and also the meaningful place of art as a tool and a means of teachers’ development and growth and hence also those of pupils.

To sum up, the tutor’s attention to the personal dimension is perceived as a central element for professional development within the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme.

**Attention to the Professional Dimension**

In the professional dimension, attention was perceived by participants as grounded in the tutor’s sensitivity to individual learning pace, acceptance, respect and encouragement based on acknowledgement of each participant's uniqueness. This illustrates that each participant focused on his or her own development process in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme and on the relationship and interactions with the tutor, feeling the tutor's reference according to their unique personal and professional needs.
The participants’ words illustrate that learning out of choice differs from learning that is dictated and focused on theoretical or technical-pedagogical aspects. For example, Shanny developed a teaching approach focused on freedom of choice, which enabled her to see the pleasant parts of her students.

The tutor’s attention to participants' professional dimension is grounded in an ecological approach that enhances the concept of collective autonomy and cooperation in the teaching environment, leading to quality and efficiency in teaching (Stengel, 2001). Attention to the professional dimension as found in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme is based on a holistic-humanistic perception of the ‘whole person’ (Maslow, 1968; Rogers, 1969). This stems from Buber’s (1947, 1958) approach to teaching and professional development concentrating on the development of identity, responsibility and love. The findings of this study suggest that the attention to professional development in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme concurs with other researchers focusing on ways of developing these qualities within teacher education (McKernan, 1991; Zeichner, 2001).

Thus, the ‘Lovecircles’ professional development programme is based on an integrative holistic-humanistic (IHH) approach, founded in an individual's processes of learning and emotional development and is linked to theories of multiple intelligences, creativity and emotional intelligence (Gardner, 1983, 1999; Gardner et al., 1990; Goleman, 1995, 1999; Craft et al., 2008). Consequently, the findings are supported by humanistic values such as respect, ethics, empathy and tolerance for diversity (Maslow, 1971; Rogers & Freiberg, 1994; Gardner, 1983,1999). Moreover, this process is sustained by art-based pedagogy (Jeffrey & Craft, 2001): focusing on creativity, promoting learners' cooperation and respect for other people's opinions, leading to the endorsement of art-based teaching programmes within education (Craft, 2005).

These findings are supported as well by studies into creativity within the Expressive Art Therapy field (Schimd, 2005). Research findings highlight the role and benefit of creative processes in the development of a 'whole person', considering even factors relating to the immune system (Stuckey & Nobel, 2010) as leverage for holistic—personal and professional—development. In this light they advocate enhancing the comprehension of the relationship between creative expression and healing for perceiving the healing power of the Arts. Thus, my interpretation of participants’
perception concerning the tutor's attention to the professional dimension is based on integrating the theories embraced here, sustaining my claim that attention to both dimensions leads to professional development.

The findings concerning attention to the professional dimension are grounded in the principles of interactive pedagogy (Collis & Lacey, 1996), such as expressing respect and sensitivity to learners, negotiating with them and establishing a conducive, motivating ethos. The views of Nind and Hewett (1988) also reflect findings from this study, namely perceiving learners as active and sharing control over their learning with their teachers. Hence, educators are attentive to learners' individual pace of learning and unique needs as well as fully respect their path of development within the context of education.

To sum up one can say that integrating aspects based on emotions constitutes leverage for professional development. Subsequently, moving from theory to practice draws on this prior attention to the professional dimension.

Multi-Dimensional-Integrative Attention to Participants

Continuing one's studies into the practicum stage is not a sufficient prerequisite for successful professional development, since aspects from the personal dimension might inhibit the professional development – as indicated in data relating to Shanny, whose development was defined as focused on her professional dimension. This approach stems from humanistic theories of self-development in the field of education that advocate the role of identity development (Elliott, 1993; Rodgers & Scott, 2008; Craft et al., 2008). In this light Hansen (1995) and Palmer (1998, 2007) raise the issue of teaching "from within identity and integrity of the teacher" (Hansen, 1995, p. 10) as a prerequisite for professional development leading to affective and effective practice.

These findings can be explained by the tutor’s personal attention integrated with professional attention, which creates a multi-dimensional path for participants through which emotions emerge, enabling development and learning. One conclusion that emerged is that accepting attention as well as appreciation of the personal dimension developed participants' ability and daring for self-expression in the external-professional
dimension – as seen in the development of Yafa. Integrating the dimensions became a basis for development in areas such as self-esteem and self-perception.

The literature supports this finding concerning the significant role of personal development within professional development. Some educational practitioners who engage with the importance of emotion in teaching argue that teaching must transcend the technical level towards authentic relations: "Good teaching cannot be reduced to technique; good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher" (Palmer, 1998, p. 10, 2007). Studies dealing with the affective dimension of teaching maintain that attention to learners enhances their progress (Oplatka, 2008). The psychology of the self emphasises the use of empathy and the development of empathic capabilities as the basis for forging social relations (Kohut, 1971; Bowles, 1981; Lupton, 1998; Bless, 2000). Once again the nature of tutoring should encompass emotion as well as both verbal and non-verbal modalities of expressing emotions.

To sum up, the tutors' multi-dimensional-integrative attention including emotional aspects to participants is perceived as a dominant element in inter-personal and intra-personal development in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme.

6.1.3. Multi-Dimensional Tutoring – Integration of the Arts within Experiential Group Learning

Multi-dimensional tutoring was defined by the participants as using a variety of teaching styles and methods that incorporated art in learning. They perceived this form of interactive pedagogy as the core reason for their personal and professional development. For example, Eve stated that despite exceptional professionalism, it was the tenderness and pleasant tutoring that had a significant impact.

All participants were educators who were interested in enriching their professional dimension—their practice—with children with special educational needs. The participants attributed their own and other participants’ development to creative experiences throughout the training. It follows that they perceived multi-dimensional tutoring as a core principle for their personal and professional development. This is evidenced by challenging events throughout the process, highlighting the significance of
multi-dimensional tutoring as integrating professional development and personal dimensions. For example, Shanny confronted the tutor saying she was not creative and preferred watching others using non-verbal approaches while expressing herself verbally. Her feelings of rejection were uncovered during the training. Hidden emotions of anger and frustration enabled her to perceive the impact of this on her behaviour. This led to the acknowledgement that art can broaden the tutoring style along with the verbal, bridging personal and professional dimensions.

The participants perceived art in the tutor’s pedagogy as facilitating reference to all dimensions – personal and professional. This understanding became the motivating factor towards successful completion of studies at the practicum stage of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme. Multi-dimensional tutoring through art demonstrated sensitivity to aspects that, in other learning institutions, were perceived as disabilities, disorders and distractions from studies. For example, Shanny stated (interview) that other institutions focus only on the cognitive aspects of learners and learning such as achievement based on external standards, which entailed feelings of alienation, rejection, and loneliness. Yafa (interview) recalled that in every encounter in the 'Lovecircles' programmes, a different variety of modalities was used to enable all participants to develop broad and deep attention to themselves through possible preferred modalities followed by reflection. Consequently, self-expression by means of a rich variety of teaching styles and methods accepts and respects diversity as uniqueness and leads to integration of the personal and professional dimensions. Using multi-modal approaches directly transfers as a principle for inclusive education contexts (DfEE and QCA, 1999).

This can be supported by psychoanalytic theories within the field of Expressive Therapy, which indicate the impact of unconscious emotional barriers on overt behaviour (Freud, 1967; Winnicot, 1965; Mitchell, 2003). Hence, self-encountering with emotional barriers through multi-dimensional tutoring (verbal and non-verbal), might unleash inhibiting emotions in the personal dimension towards more integrative development for the professional dimension.

The neuroscience literature powerfully supports this view (Cicchetti & Cohen, 2006), indicating that activity involving body movement to which mirror neurons are sensitive (Iverson, 1996; Damasio, 2003; Ramachandran, 2003; Peter and Walter, 2010) can lead
to openness and relaxation, which enhance cognitive abilities such as concentration essential for learning. Moreover, these findings show that hormones such as adrenalin and cortisol are variably secreted as a result of tension and pressure, prompting a pessimistic or optimistic approach when facing tasks such as learning (Fink, 1995, 2004; Morrison, 2004; Donnelly & Watkins, 2010).

This study found that the personal and professional dimensions were connected, becoming one holistic dimension, which promoted the ability to choose modes for authentic expression. These findings concur with researchers who advocate integration of professional and personal development (Hargreaves, A., 1998; Korthagen et al., 2005) and who stipulate that it is insufficient, for example, simply to learn theories of emotional aspects of educators' role. Educators need to relate to an experiential aspect in the education programme. As Hamachek (1999) says,

“...the more educators know about themselves - the private curriculum within - the more their personal decisions are likely to be about how to pave the way for better teaching...” (p. 209).

Furthermore, the literature indicates attention to both personal and professional dimensions is a prerequisite for the development of empathy that combines both cognitive and emotional aspects (Shkedi, 1998). Empathy based on the integration of these aspects develops independent, sociable and intellectual teachers and learners (Hoekstra & Korthagen, 2011; Oplatka, 2011). Teaching that affords extensive attention integrating emotional and cognitive aspects is not an easy competence and should be studied in theory and practice, just like any other art (Buber, 1962, 1965, 1980).

The above discussion underscores the development of educators' attentive skills for the integration of personal and professional dimensions within their practice, based on emotions such as empathy and caring. This should be acquired by the integration of theory and practice through experiential learning and reflection and not on theory alone.

To sum up, multi-dimensional tutoring is perceived in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme as a process that integrates the professional and personal world. According to participants, effective tutoring comprised teaching styles and methods that incorporated art and experiential learning in a group, as well as organisation and a condusive ethos for learning.
Using multiple teaching styles and methods embodied an open space for expression of emotions and development according to individual styles. This is evidenced by Yafa, whose words show that she perceived her development as a whole process, since there was attention to all dimensions through a wide variety of means. Content analysis of the collected data shows that art activity integrated within the programme constitutes a key component of experiential learning.

The phenomenological art therapy approach (Betensky, 1995, 2001) enriched the understanding of participants' personal and professional experiences throughout the ‘Lovecircles’ programme. The phenomenological approach emphasises the importance and validation of an individual’s experience, unleashing emotional barriers for self-authentic expression without expectation of social or cultural “normalisation” of one's own perceptions in order to achieve external goal (Betensky, 1995, 2001).

**Use of the Arts**

The dominant role participants attribute to art in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme emerged as a significant finding. Attention to the personal and professional dimension throughout the tutoring was facilitated by aspects from across the Arts – plastic art, movement, drama, storytelling and photography. Experiential engagement in the Arts and the availability, variety and multitude of art materials enabled participants to develop attention to their emotions, thoughts and awareness of themselves and others. This promoted deep attention to their personal dimension, for example overcoming emotional barriers, exposing the real self within the group and developing belief in their capability of unique, authentic and enjoyable self-expression. This extensive attention reduced participants' self-criticism and developed empathy for their own creativity and for that of others.

Activities through art also allowed participants to develop deep attention to the professional dimension. For example, developing a positive attitude towards art as a means of communication; an appreciation of flow and creativity in verbal and visual self-expression; as well as a positive, aesthetic and creative teaching approach based on diversity and uniqueness. The participants learnt to acknowledge the power of art for developing in both the personal and professional dimensions and for working with
children with SEN who may manifest a latent tendency for self-expression by using visual means.

The interpretation most participants gave can be sustained by theories of art (Moustakas, 1981; Craft, 2005) in the education field that indicate the value of art for both personal and professional dimensions of practitioners. For some participants (Yafa and Eve), due to their academic background in art or drama therapy, their responses are supported by theories that maintained that non-verbal creative modality of expression in the Arts is an interactive approach bearing the potential to empower unique individual needs (Laban, 1948; Sherborne, 1990; Peter and Walter, 2010) towards their holistic development. In this light the art-making process is an outward expression of an inward experience, which provides a phenomenological barometer of how the clients experience the world, solve problems and feel their self-among-others (Betensky, 1995, 2001).

In contrast to approaches based only on one modality, the inter-modal approach of ‘Lovecircles’ lends interpretation to perceiving their inter-relatedness as leading to personal and professional development (Knill et al., 1995). These findings illustrate development of a broad and integrative perception of work by using art. Developing awareness of emotions, thoughts and imagination by means of art during the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme enhanced the pleasure and love of touching art materials, promoted ability for self-expression and emotional flow and eliminated emotional barriers (Reseacher reflection I & II, see photos, supplied separately). This is supported by art therapy’s phenomenological theoretical approach that "offers a micro-world of experiences, safe risks and problems that can be solved, at first on the painting surface or with clay, then in everyday life” (Betensky, 1995, p. 13).

This understanding is related to a widening perception of professional development, and is supported by studies dealing with the use of linguistic-artistic means—metaphors and analogies, which enrich personal and professional language (Kupferberg & Green, 2001). This development is discussed in the professional literature, which highlights the meaningful contribution of art to people's encounter with themselves. Art is conceived here as developing attention to the personal dimension as a significant channel for self-expression, reflection and thorough acquaintance with the self, as well as the ability to identify with other people's emotions (Kupferberg & Green, 2001, 2005).
This is in line with Moustakas (1995) who indicates that moving from a description of art work to a metaphorical explanation and addressing the issues embedded in it, indicates a process of personal development and hence self-attention and expression. In this light I uphold that therapeutic work using the Arts can serve as a source of unleashing barriers not only when it is created, but also when it is perceived as recording one's own experiences. Hence, I suggest that there is a need to consider ways for developing a safe use of these therapeutic strategies in the hands of untrained professionals.

The fact that the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme enhanced the perception of using art as a means of development in the personal and professional dimension differs from perceptions that view art as a field by itself. According to the findings of this study, art is used to expand attention to dimensions of the self and to develop verbal and visual expressive skills. This concerns a broad view of art beyond knowledge and performance. Art is conceived here as a field that raises covert personal issues (Eisner, 2004). It also enables experience of additional learning modalities, beyond the verbal modality prevalent in the education system (Gardner, 1993, 1999).

Moreover, these findings concur with those of Peter (1995, 1998), who argues that art enhances emotional development as embodying the potential for integrating knowledge, skills and creativity. Therefore, art might widen educators’ awareness of the potential for combining modalities of teaching such as visual, kinaesthetic, senses, body language and imagery for enhancing their attention to pupils’ holistic needs. In this light the DfEE and QCA (1999) National Curriculum inclusion principles, highlighted varied teaching and learning styles and the need to personalize strategies to enable children to overcome barriers to learning (Chesner, 1995). Similarly, Smith’s (2001) approach supports the conclusion of this study concerning the contribution of art to the promotion of a deeper understanding of pupils and their development. Therefore, I claim there is a need to develop educators’ awareness of the varied possibilities of understanding art in order to prevent non-specialists from attributing meanings to their pupils’ art.

Expanding the participants' perception of art is described in studies of art and aesthetic education, advocating that the process of personal development stems from the integration of cognitive and emotional dimensions in the learning experience (Dewey, 1934; Bruner, 1963). The findings of this study, which emphasise the development of a
wide and integrative approach to art as a strategy within professional development, are grounded in this approach. It supports the view that subtlety encompassed in art develops individuals' creative and positive attitude to the environment, as opposed to approaches focusing on the performance-achievement aspect of art (Bachar & Globman, 2007).

Development of a broad perception of art as a means of integrating the personal and professional dimension, enhances the capability of being attentive to these dimensions in the learner too, with expression and authentic articulation providing a sense of wholeness and integrative well-being. Along these lines, the 'Lovecircles’ approach ethically does not imply that participants are trained as psychotherapists, namely to interpret meanings embedded in art for therapeutic aims. Nevertheless, the focus is on enhancement of personal awareness leading towards professional development.

Consequently, art enhances an active rather than a passive stance and obedience to autonomous and constructive behaviour. This is sustained by a perception from expressive therapy (McNiff, 1981) concerning individuals’ different expressive styles—visual, tactile and so forth. Based on the above, one can conclude that art facilitated the development of 'direct' communication with the personal dimension in the participants to this study. It helped bypass the effect of critical perception in childhood that can lead to barriers against art and create avoidance tendencies.

Thus, embedding art within professional development impacts personal development by eliminating barriers and inhibitions such as educators' perceptions, acceptance, and self-empathy and towards others. Integrating art within experiential learning can become a stimulus for the development of personal and professional development, as illustrated by the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme.

**Experiential Learning in Group Contexts**

Analysis of the findings also illustrated that experiential learning within a group enabled self-expression via other non-verbal modalities, such as dance and movement. For example, despite feeling depressed, Eve performed a dance in front of the group, which she stated expressed her sense of freedom and well-being. The conclusion drawn from
the nature of Eve's dance is that elimination of emotional barriers via art activities allows adoption of a more positive-optimistic approach to life as well as increased personal power, self-confidence and a sense of belonging to the group.

Moreover, experiential learning in the group developed a new concept of tutoring, from focusing on the delivery of knowledge to believing that emotions are an integral part of all stages and processes of professional development, teaching and learning. This new concept advocates that emotions unite all awareness dimensions of people and are a means of creating balance and harmony between their personal and professional world. This new concept of tutoring views emotions and the body-soul relationship as a strategy for personal and professional development, uniting emotions with body feelings.

Teacher development programmes need the integration of trainees’ personal dimension, their emotions and feelings as well as their entire personal world into their professional development (Allender, 2001; Eisner, 2004). Giving an opportunity to support and share experiences in a group enabled observation of the personal dimension (Evans, 2010). Integrating emotional aspects into participants’ professional development facilitated overcoming emotional barriers and encouraging authentic expression. This led to the acknowledgment that experiential learning, which involves emotions and feelings, extends learning, as opposed to learning which is focused only on the cognitive aspect.

Learning in a group throughout the programme using verbal and non-verbal activities, made the participants less judgmental and led to total acceptance of all group members and their opinions, emotions and creativity. The experiential-creative activity in the group developed participants’ sense of freedom, sense of belonging, camaraderie, agreeable learning, confidence and personal and professional empowerment. Learning in the group entailed release of the self and, with it, professional empowerment. This is corroborated by many researchers; for example, Osanloo (2007) argues that an approach stimulating the experience of personal freedom enhances acceptance of diversity and empowers learning and development in the professional dimension.

Likewise, Lewin (1948) viewed teaching as a cultural dimension in which he and teachers are members and partners. Sharing knowledge, emotions, attitudes, beliefs and customs creates the shared experience. Teachers grow through collaborative learning
and identification with tutors and colleagues, shaping a strong sense of 'we' which strengthens individuals' ego (Avraham, 1998). Similarly, the conclusion drawn from this study is that experiential creative learning in a group, integrating aspects from personal and external dimensions, allows integration of both dimensions as leverage for professional development.

\textit{Emotional Tutoring}

Professional development can be understood as evolving from personal development through the lens of a tutor’s attention to students’ uniqueness (Dewey, 1938; Schön, 1987; Vygotsky, 1991; Freire, 1985, 1986, 1995; Bronfenbrenner, 2001; Aloni, 2005; Palmer & Zajonc, 2010). In this light, this study claims that perceiving students’ uniqueness can be seen as a diamond, the glow of which increases with the honing of its edges. However, unlike diamonds, a students' personality is not reduced as a result of the honing process but rather keeps growing and growing (Inbar, 1997). This study sees the tools and strategy for supporting professional development as a process of a tutor who facilitates building based on known and pre-planned processes while integrating responsively personal and professional dimensions.

- Developing a broad perception of art as a means of integrating the personal and professional dimensions facilitates attention to these dimensions. Art enhances expression and authentic expression, which grants a sense of wholeness.
- Inclusive teaching of children with special educational needs is facilitated by using a wide variety of metaphors through experiential group experiences using the Arts, which becomes leverage for their acceptance through development of a more integrative perception – personal and professional.
- Experiential learning in a group encompasses aspects of the personal and external dimensions; this facilitates integration of the dimensions as leverage for professional development, combining aspects out of the personal dimensions into teaching.
Integrative professional development empowers the personal dimension and leads to professional empowerment. Tutoring is key to this, based on intra- and inter-personal acceptance and empathic attention.

The overall conclusion is that attention to the personal dimension enables self-expression via art; this develops acceptance of diversity as uniqueness and facilitates integration of the personal and professional dimensions. The ‘Lovecircles’ education programme is in line with the holistic principles and framework advocated by leading researchers and exponents in the field of professional training within an inclusive interactive approach (Chesner, 1995; Collis & Lacey, 1996) and training programmes that promote inclusive teaching using the Arts (Peter, 1995,1996; Peter & Walter, 2010).

The above discussion concludes that tutors' attention is the dominant factor affecting professional development. Moreover, teaching methods such as art, though secondary, play a significant role in professional development. These conclusions illustrate a perception that differs from that of the Teachers’ Standards in England (DfE, 2012). Hence, I argue, that the potential value of a holistic assessment of children has been replaced by a pendulum swing back towards a more traditional perception.

Teachers’ Standards in England (2003) previously pointed to interest in the assessment of emotional and social competence in schools. This change indicated a shift from focusing on antisocial and problematic behaviour towards the inclusion of positive attributes to sustain and support development. A survey (Weare and Gray, 2003) illustrates an increasing interest in assessment that integrates emotional and social competence. Doubts were voiced about the extent to which integrating emotional and social aspects within assessment are possible and therefore teachers advocated the need to be trained accordingly. This claim called for the voice of the child to be heard and thus to avoid controlling judgmental approaches towards and including emotional and social aspects in measuring the impact of interventions.

Instruments covering the quality of relationships are quite numerous, but there are only a few that aim to measure children’s emotional competence. None of the instruments (for example assessment), which assess emotional competence have been fully
evaluated in UK schools. The research project that led to the development of the Engagement Profile and Scale (DfE, 2012) involved evaluation across about 60 mainstream and specialist settings and across the age range. The most relevant instruments are still being developed (for example screening, profiling, and monitoring (Weare and Gray, 2003; Louis et al., 2010).

There are many more instruments for school age children it seems, than for pre-school children. The most common approach to assessment in Israel was profiling children with perceived ‘problems’, with a view to develop ways of supporting their development and as means of early assessment. However, it raised concerns about the way in which this process could label children and about the possible lack of facilities, time and resources to help the children diagnosed (Birnbaum, 2003, 2013, 2014). It was agreed that effective assessment required skilled observers, but that not all teachers want to develop these skills.

Several of the instruments within the ‘Lovecircles’ programme could be used for assessing the level of emotional or social competence of schools or classes. This was mentioned by some participants in this study as important in the context of assessing new programmes or interventions. However, they expressed concern that such measures have the potential to be used for ranking schools; it was agreed that this would be counter-productive.

6.2. Research Questions 2 & 3: Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme

6.2.1. Using the Arts – Overcoming Emotional Barriers through Metaphors

The Arts allowed participants to eliminate emotional barriers, such as feelings concerning perceptions and beliefs about themselves, developing authenticity and flow. The participants developed a new approach using the Arts as a tool and means for self-expression. Integrating the Arts in the learning process expanded their attention to the personal dimension and revealed their latent personal needs. The Arts were a channel for the development of attention to wider dimensions. They developed the imagination
and were an opportunity for expressing personal material. All participants perceived the removal of barriers as a dramatic stage of their personal development. They described the difficulty of opening up and the emotional relief after having removed the barriers.

The Arts permit verbal – metaphors—and non-verbal – plastic art, movement and drama – as means for expressing emotions. The metaphor-rich language, which the participants developed during the education programme, constituted a means for describing their holistic development. The rich array of metaphors used by participants offered different options for conceptualising their professional development, and focused on personal and professional dimensions as well as an integrated dimension. The metaphors expressed a wide scope of emotions ranging from unpleasant to pleasant, sometimes involving release of emotional barriers and highly charged emotional expression. The rich variety of emotions expressed were disappointment, despair, frustration, confusion, loneliness, helplessness, containment, acceptance, appreciation, love, caring, empathy, happiness, passion, fear, sorrow, alienation and loneliness, excitement, exhilaration and enthusiasm, happiness, love, caring and tenderness.

The metaphors expressed diverse topics, indicating the development of a unique self-expression (see Appendix 21: Tables A.21-25).

They indicated participants' deep attention to their body, emotion, thought and reflection, supported by their integrative holistic development. Elimination of emotional barriers led to adopting a positive attitude to life and embracing personal empowerment. It grew out of the ability to connect with their emotions, to their creative side, the vitality within the self. Non-verbal modalities of the Arts were perceived by participants as a springboard for their personal development. This led to a new understanding concerning the significant role of the Arts for emotional development and not only as a technical skill assessed by success or failure based on objective criteria.

These findings concur with Jung (1964), namely that metaphors can bridge between cognitive and emotional experiences, leading to introspective reflection and establishing inter- and intra-personal relationships. Hence, educators using metaphors with pupils can release barriers of expressing emotions (Watzlawick et al., 1974), allowing individual symbolic modalities expanding the self, teaching and learning and teacher-student relationships. In this light, using the Arts for overcoming emotional barriers
through metaphors along with positive creative imagery, have been the interest of the expressive therapy field (Moreno, 1923; Goodenough, 1926; Vick 2003). This has been sustained by research findings about art and the brain, concerning the improvement of the overall quality of life and perceptions of wellness (Malchiodi, 2005, Dokter, 2011).

The healing power of metaphors is found within the field of art therapy adopted by the psychoanalytic framework as an insight-oriented approach for developing a visual language, for the purpose of intra and inter communication, leading to multi-layers of meanings rather than a single interpretation. In this light metaphors are used for understanding one’s perceptions as well as assessment via created or chosen images (Malchiodi, 2013).

Furthermore, the findings of this study highlight findings of other researchers (Olshtein & Kupferberg, 1998; Kupferberg & Green, 2005), supporting the view that the use of metaphors helps educators to develop professionally while expressing their feelings freely (Goodwyser et al., 2006), through attributing meanings. Hence, it is a certain way of shaping reality (Gavish & Shimoni, 2006).

Consequently one can understand the presence of several central metaphors in the 'Lovecircles' education programme as milestones for personal and professional development. Specifically:

- The metaphors 'life cake', 'slices of cake' – conceptualised the self-acquaintance process.
- The metaphors 'barrier', 'dismantling it and turning it into leverage' – conceptualised the development of a wider perception of the self.
- The metaphors 'exhibition' and 'audience' (the group) – conceptualised the personal sharing in the group and expansion of the self-view.
- The metaphor 'photographer' – conceptualised the process of documentation and personal interpretation of the development process.

In this light, I uphold that expressing one's own feelings via metaphors serves participants as a safe and ethical professional developmental process so that metaphors can subsequently be used as educational and not as therapeutic practice. This potentially offers emotional protection to learners through exploring issues ‘one step removed’
Moreover, metaphors in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme facilitate the conceptualisation of participants’ personal and professional development process in an integrative and holistic way.

These findings are compatible with the current call for educators to express emotions (Oplatka, 2010; Hargreaves, D., 2012) and the claim that they have not been trained for that throughout their teacher education programme (Gilat, 2007). Thus, releasing emotional barriers in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme contributes to this relatively new issue. Releasing educators’ emotional barriers is significant for expressing emotions appropriately and effectively and for establishing relationships with students (Goleman, 1995). Releasing an emotional barrier, then, is supported by researchers who for the past 30 years have claimed that the role of emotion in education should be increased (Hochschild, 1983, 1990; Ashforth & Humphreys, 1993; Morris & Feldman, 1996).

Moreover, educational psychology and educational thought stipulate the significant role of emotions especially when teaching in inclusive classes (Bandura, 1977; Noddings, 1992; Vygotsky, 1997; Iran-Nejad, 2000). Hargreaves, A. (1998, 2005) attests that educators express their emotions while teaching, for example, sensitivity, passion with pleasure, creativity, motivation and happiness. Therefore the use of metaphors throughout a professional development programme might serve as a bridge for educators’ expression of feelings, leading towards the release of barriers against integrating emotions in their practice.

The conclusion is that releasing emotional barriers leads to professional development and serves as leverage for developing emotional pedagogy. Furthermore, art activities hold the potential for releasing emotional barriers through metaphors and non-verbal modalities for expression—plastic art, movement and drama. These activities set a foundation for expressing emotions and conceptualising thoughts.

6.2.2. Expanding the Educator-Participant Relationship

Analysis of participants’ language illustrates expanding perceptions concerning the educator-pupil relationship. The new wider perception shifts from focusing on teaching-
learning to becoming a deeper relationship based on a holistic view of the learner as a developing whole person. For example, Eve (interview Appendix 22E / page 10 line 336) believed that the tutor-participant communication during the programme was some meaningful 'type of parenthood' unlike the communication in her family, which was 'without containment'. The dissatisfaction displayed through Yafa’s use of language with the gap between her approach to teaching based on the personal dimension—‘teaching from within’—and the system's approach based on the professional dimension—achievement and efficiency—is reflected in other studies. Day (2005), Gilat (2007) and Hargreaves & Shirley (2011) all suggest that the system is not caring, attentive, and empathic to educators’ personal dimension, particularly when working with pupils with special needs.

Findings from this study concur with researchers advocating the need to embed psychological aspects, unconscious thinking and emotions in teaching (Epstein, 1998; Wideen et al., 1998). This approach challenges traditional positivist-behaviourist approaches focusing on aspects of overt behaviour and more didactic teaching methods. In line with these findings, Hargreaves, A. (1998) claims that in order to establish teacher-pupil relationships, it is necessary to integrate cognitive and emotional aspects, especially in the light of recent educational reforms in line with the “No Child Left Behind” Act (2001) in Israel and the UN Salamanca Conference (1994) and ensuing global commitment to inclusion. Similarly, Taylor (1998) specifies the need to establish relationships in teaching, based on trust and care which are conducive to sensitive relationships.

Moreover, findings are supported by interactive approaches within education that advocate pedagogy based on relationships that express respect, negotiation and sensitivity to learners as sharing control of the activity together with educators (Nind & Hewett, 1988, 1994, 2001). The role of professionals as ‘respondents’ rather than ‘initiators’ of social interactions might raise tensions between the perceptions of providers and learners, and between those of partners and decision-makers. According to Nind & Powell (1999), this mutual interaction is a way of operating rather than content that should be delivered. In this case, the professional’s role is to enhance the communicative potential of learners and assessment through rich interpretation rather than against a checklist, curriculum or predicted outcome.
Professional development therefore should focus on flexibility and awareness of ways for assisting learners and leading to development of interactions. This approach focuses on learners and not the professional personal dimension, such as variety of emotions accompanying this kind of extreme sensitive and intensive interaction. The conclusion derived from this section implies that integrating therapeutic aspects within professional training of educators, such as those existing within interactive approaches such as Intensive Interaction (Nind & Hewett, 1994, 2001) might lead towards an inclusive and participatory approach.

The significant contribution of the tutor-learner relationship, as findings of this study show, is grounded in the expanding literature dealing with education, psychology and neuroscience, highlighting the role of emotion for development and learning (LeDoux, 2000, 2003; Hargreaves, A., 2005; Isenbarger & Zembylas, 2006; Oplatka, 2011). Phelps (2006) suggests integrating this theoretical knowledge about personal and professional dimensions, particularly for working with children with special educational needs (Talmor et al., 2005; Peter & Walter, 2010).

Additionally, the findings shown, for example in Yafa’s voice concerning the relationship with educators, demonstrate free critique and a flow of expression of feelings sustained by theory of oppressed pedagogy (Freire 1985, 1986, 1995). I uphold that expression of feelings authentically via a metaphor-rich language (‘exposure’, ‘boundaries’, ‘spreading out’, ‘holding’ ‘gathering’) emerged through Expressive Art Therapy activities used in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme (Malchiodi, 2007) and should be incorporated therefore within teacher education programmes. The relationship between tutor and participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme was perceived as filled with empathy, leading to authentic integrated personal and professional development. Thus, these findings concur with the humanistic-holistic theory concerning development and learning (Dewey, 1915; Bruner, 1960; Maslow, 1968; Piaget, 1969; Rogers, 1971).

To sum up, the tutor-participant relationship that cultivates feelings is considered as leverage for professional development in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme. The findings indicate that participants' personal and professional development was facilitated by the tutor’s relationship, which incorporated multi-dimensional attention to both personal and professional dimensions. Consequently, the tutor’s attention and style
of tutoring were perceived as core principles of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme, as they affected the development of participants' attention to both these two dimensions.

Furthermore, these findings elucidate that attention to the personal dimension develops a perspective of seeing professional development as an active and complex process that bridges between the personal and professional dimension (Flores & Day, 1999; Oplatka, 2008; Korthagen, 2012). The approach focusing on attention to the personal dimension within professional development stems from the evolving perceptions towards more interactive teaching and learning styles and the change in perceptions of educators’ role – from delivery of knowledge to tutoring that is more responsive and overtly child-led (Lacey, C., 1977; Nias, 1989; Korthagen, 2005; Hargreaves, D., 2010, Day, 2012; Peter & Walter, 2010; Oplatka, 2013). As Hamachek (1999) conceptualised, the findings of this study demonstrate the ‘unifying dimensions of emotions’.

The overall conclusion is that integration of the personal and professional dimension develops educators' broader view on the importance of intra- and inter-personal factors as leverage for both affective and effective professional development.

6.3 Research Question 4: The Link between Personal & Professional Development

6.3.1 Enhancing Reference to the Self in the Professional-General Dimension

Analysing the participants’ use of language illustrates that they developed personal acceptance and empathy, enabling acquisition of new tools for developing awareness and improving life in a comprehensive way. For example, Shanny never spoke through a microphone on a stage, even though she had organised many ceremonies and events at school. She claimed that this resulted from an emotional inhibition of self-expression. During the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme she began acknowledging that professional development involved integrating processes that touched deep layers and included the personal dimension.

This development was enabled through confrontation (as experienced by Shanny, Taya and Yafa) with issues related to group activities that used art and entailed expression of
feelings such as anger. This process enabled the acknowledgement, in an advanced stage, of the link between negative reactions to self-expression through art due to their personal history of criticism. This dynamic attitude to behaviour can be interpreted as a link between the personal and professional dimension. This is sustained by developmental psychology (Winnicott, 1965; Freud, 1967), indicating the impact of a relationship and emotions with the caregiver. It also resonates with humanistic theories in education (Buber, 1965; Moustakas, 1981; Rogers, 1980) that indicate the significance of the relationship between educators and learners based on acceptance and empathy. Moreover, this is in accordance with psychoanalysis and creativity theories within the field of expressive therapy relating to the development of self-expression.

The participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme developed on different levels. They felt they could transfer the qualities acquired during the course to their professional stage (practicum), enabling their pupils to develop in a similar way. Thus, pupils would become aware of the development of emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1998) based on their emerging self-observation ability and the connection to developing acquaintance with others. Yafa indicated that her personal development affected her professional development since she acquired a 'completely different' self-perception ('view'). She described the impact of the personal development process she had undergone by repeating several times the term ‘to be hugged and contained'.

According to humanistic approaches both in education (Buber, 1965; Freud, 1967) and in expressive therapy (McNiff, 1981; Moon, 1995; Betensky, 2001), these terms indicate Yafa’s excitement and conceptualisation of her personal experience. The wide variety of emotions expressed by Yafa can also be understood as revealing her personal development prior to the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme. She expressed her emotions using a metaphor-rich language, which described actions of a dramatic and drastic nature, such as ‘engulfed and contained’ (Kupferberg & Green, 2005). This experience, based on the interpretation of participants’ words, also supports the views of Korthagen (2004) and Hargreaves, D. (2012), who claim that training should integrate the personal dimension. Therefore, this approach differs from other studies that do not attribute significance to the personal-emotional dimension as a basis for the professional dimension.
Embedding new approaches within professional development programmes may present practical challenges. For example, participating in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme enhanced awareness of the power of art for addressing emotional barriers to learning. However, Miri was aware of her school’s strict approach to financial issues and limited availability of art materials. Thus, she faced confrontation between two value systems—organisational based on economic versus holistic and humanistic based on emotional aspects. This is supported by theories such as Korthagen’s (2004) 'onion model', as opposed to reflection based on cognitive aspects (Schön, 1991).

From this perspective, reflection integrating emotional and cognitive aspects might enable educators to move from theory to embedding new ideas in educational practice. Incorporating emotions within training allows a space for reflection on issues other than acquiring knowledge, aiming to develop greater personal and social accountability – this has become a global issue since the attack on the Twin Towers on September 11, 2001. More humanistic professional training is important for policy makers too, wishing to promote social cohesion, as possible ways for indirectly integrating reform ideas in practice.

6.3.2. Integrating Holistic Dimensions within Professional Development

Based on the findings of this study, one can conclude that attention to the personal dimension led the participants to reflect more holistically on their development and in a way that would affect their future teaching. Participants made their 'silent' voice heard and expressed their dissatisfaction with their current practice, accompanied by feelings of sadness, frustration and disappointment. However, they developed strategies they could implement and their new perspective enabled them to critically reflect on processes of development (both for themselves and their pupils) that do not focus on the personal dimension.

This demonstrates that participants were looking for a response to the question that concerned them: how to implement the new perception they developed in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme in their work within the existing educational framework. The participants gave different answers: for example, innovating within the formal education system (Yafa, Shanny, Miri and Taya) or outside the system (Yafa,
Eve and Taya). One can conclude that the findings raised more complex and challenging questions: is it possible to embed the ‘Lovecircles’ approach in schools – and within initial inclusive teacher training? In what ways can it be taught? What might the possible contribution of the Arts be for promoting attention to and expression of trainees’ emotions?

I uphold that the reply to these critical issues might be found in the following emerging key pointers regarding the value of a more holistic approach to professional development, from a critical evaluation of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme:

- *Integrating the personal and professional dimension* develops educators' broader view of the importance of intra- and inter-personal factors – as leverage for well-being and effective holistic professional development.
- *Integrating cognitive, emotional and theoretical*, aspects within experiential group activities enables focusing on the development of a 'whole person' approach, through enhancing reference to the self in the professional-general dimension.
- *Integrating holistic dimensions within the tutor-participant relationship* is a tool of professional development that cultivates emotional awareness.
- *Integrating the Arts within professional development programmes* focusing on personal development based on emotion is a vehicle for moving theory into practice.

### 6.4. Research Question 5 – The Impact of the ‘Lovecircles’ Education Programme on Work with Children with Special Educational Needs (SEN)

#### 6.4.1. Multi-Dimensional Attention to and Multi-Dimensional Tutoring of Learners with SEN

Analysing participants’ perception concerning their professional development for inclusive practice demonstrates reference to the personal dimension – within themselves and in the experiential group work. Using the Arts enabled the development of a more empathic attitude towards pupils with SEN and planning provision for their self-
expression. Enhancement of participants' reference to the personal dimension in their professional practice led to greater emotional containment of children with SEN and integration of this into their teaching repertoire. For example, Miri perceived her professional development working with children with SEN as due to development of the ability to attend to and express emotions within herself as a scaffolding for attending to children's emotions while teaching.

This led to the emergence of an emotional pedagogy focusing on relationships and emotions as well as art-based approaches integrating educational and therapeutic aspects. Consequently, the findings can be conceptualised as a rationale for the significant role of the Arts via transferable expressive therapy techniques for introducing emotions into inclusive practice. This study concurs with the call to integrate aspects of Expressive Therapy (McNiff, 1981; Moon, 1995; Rubin, 2001) and therapeutic-psychological aspects in practice while working with pupils with special needs (Mittler, 2000; Chen, 2004). This process is designed to bridge the gap between the stated goals of inclusion and the actual practice in the educational context (Talmor et al., 2005). Mittler (2000) believes that inclusion is not a permanent, static situation but is rather a process and a way to be walked, every pupil being a flower on the way, which should be cultivated.

However, educators' actual training tends to focus on aspects of teaching and, hence, is assessed and measured according to their pupils' attainments (outcomes rather than processes). The danger with this is that educators may not regard their pupils as people but perceive them as a resource and tool for implementing the stated policy of the system. Moreover, conclusions drawn from this study are grounded in studies highlighting the impact and relationship of educators' emotions on their self-efficacy and positive attitudes towards inclusion (Gibbs, 2003; Korthagen, 2005). Likewise, other researchers, such as Mor (2003), Dionne et al., (2012) and MacFarlane & Woolfson (2013) indicate that educators’ own subjective perception and expectations predicted their attitude and hence their behaviour towards children with SEN in inclusive contexts. This discussion demonstrates the impact of the personal dimension and hence concurs with MacFarlane & Woolfson (2013), who suggested focusing on personal aspects, such as challenging beliefs.
Thus, reference to educators’ personal dimension within teacher education training should be an integral part of professional development and preparation for working in inclusive contexts.

- The above discussion leads to the understanding that attention to the personal dimension as presented in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme is grounded in the (albeit contested) theories of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983, 1993), and emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1996) and their integration. This understanding is in line with a controversial issue in professional development, namely finding an appropriate teaching approach for the twenty-first century (Quigney, 2010), especially in the light of the “No Child Left Behind” Act (2001) in Israel and the UN Salamanca Conference (1994) and ensuing global commitment to inclusion.

This raises the need for teacher education that focuses on becoming acquainted with unique learning styles and facilitates acceptance and inclusion of all pupils, leading to practical implementation of this legislation and learners' well-being. Findings of this study indicate that participants of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme developed a personalised pedagogy based on a range of multi-modal teaching and learning styles (Rayner, 2007).

To sum up, attention to the personal dimension incorporating cognitive and emotional intelligence enhances holistic professional development based on the 'whole person' approach, relevant for both inclusive mainstream and also for specialist contexts catering for children with more severe and complex special educational needs.

6.4.2. Emotional Pedagogy within SEN – Relational Pedagogy

The findings of this study show that teacher education programmes that integrate multi-disciplinary aspects lead to a new concept of teaching. That is, from a perception of teaching as delivery of knowledge to a perception of teaching as a multi-dimensional interaction between educators, knowledge and the students themselves. For example,
Miri felt this helped sew a ‘small cloth with a hole’ (Miri / interview / Appendix 22M / page 24, line 754) in her self-perception. The metaphor ‘a hole’ can be comprehended in two ways. One sense is a vacant empty place used for expressing loneliness and the other is sharp aching feelings, resulting from insults and criticism. The explanation that Miri gave to the ‘hole’ as a metaphor for her loneliness indicated she realised that her external behaviour stemmed from empathy and caring.

This demonstrates that aspects used in ‘Lovecircles’ from the field of Expressive Therapy emerged from the belief that all individuals have the capacity to develop self-attention and expression of their own narrative via creativity. Thus, Expressive Therapy aspects used within the programme enhanced personal growth and increased self-understanding, leading to emotional relief from overwhelming emotions of personal trauma. Moreover, it is likely to facilitate more integrated empathetic professional development for successful inclusive practice (Malchiodi, 1998, 2003).

The constructivist approach (Sagi & Regeve, 2002) corroborates the findings of this study, indicating that participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme did not perceive learning as delivery of knowledge but rather as a personal, multi-dimensional, unique and complex process. They transferred this perception to the professional dimension namely, no longer teaching by delivering knowledge but teaching as multi-dimensional communication. The participants developed a sensitivity to others as reference to the self, showing interest and empathy for others. In the professional dimension, participants’ development integrated expressing emotions to pupils and their creation of warmer inter-personal relationships.

A changing broader and more radical perception of the concept of disability (Mittler 2000) emerged, as attested by participants’ use of language. Enrolment in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme included a formal agreement concerning sensitive issues. Nevertheless, Shanny chose not to disclose her own learning disabilities at that point; subsequently she revealed this by developing greater empathy to herself as she overcame emotional barriers. This echoes theories (Allender, 2001; Hargreaves, D., 2012) that highlight the impact of covert emotions for professionals and the legacy of their own prior experiences within the education system.

Original perceptions of disability can be changed through experiential processes in teacher education programmes, as can be seen in the above example. Shanny’s
disclosure concerning her new perception indicated that she was able to move from a theoretical level to a practical one. In her own words, this was leverage for developing a new approach based on empathy with children with SEN, being more aware of the impact of the teacher-pupil relationship and of emotion-based pedagogy. This is supported as well by the Expressive Therapy field, referred to in the training, as integrating aspects from family therapy for conceptualising the impact of the personal dimension on professional development (Kwiatkowska, 1967, 1978).

The ‘Lovecircles’ model of emotion-based training defines the space where emotions can be embedded in the field of education. This is sustained by the theoretical approaches focusing on interaction with educators and therapists as meaningful caregivers (Buber, 1923; Winnicott, 1965) advocating balance, harmony, inter and intra-personal factors (Maslow, 1968).

Findings of this study illustrate a wider perception of development that emphasises the effects of the educator-pupil relationship. These findings are grounded in studies that show communication oriented towards a child’s well-being provides support and assistance when needed as well as another source of confidence. It enhances learning, inquiry and expanded horizons (Pianta & Steinberg, 1992). The findings also point out that participants developed holistic empathy for others/pupils, stemming from the integration of cognitive and emotional aspects during the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme (Maxwell, 2008). This perception encompassed openness and an ability to take part in the emotional processes of other peoples' worlds.

The processes in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme underscored aspects of reciprocity, which led to a unique tutor/trainee encounter without the hierarchy that is prevalent in education systems. This approach is in line with the perception of Noddings (2007), relating to the impact of caring-based teaching for development and learning. Studying participants’ development illustrates a deep perception of the concept 'empathy' and increased awareness of its importance when working with pupils. These understandings are supported by studies that explored the effects of teacher education with regard to relationships and found considerable influence on professional practice (Greenberg et al., 1995; Hamre & Pianta, 2001, 2005). Thus, the findings emphasise the need for a pedagogy based on emotions and on educator-learner relationships in teacher education programmes.
Relational pedagogy has its roots in interactive models of curriculum and pedagogy (Lacey, C., 1997). This approach focuses on empowerment through integrating active learning and social and communicative aspects, in contrast to the continuing popularity of didactic behaviouristic approaches that became prevalent during the 1980s. Likewise, Smith (1987), stipulated that professional development should integrate interactive aspects in teaching, for example, attention (Wells, 1986), reflection and intuitive processes. These aspects can serve as scaffolding for the development of children with SEN (Peter, 1995; Collis & Lacey, 1996; Nind 1999), as indicated in this study.

In this light, the findings concur too with approaches within the Expressive Therapy field, defined as sharing "an optimistic view of human nature and of the human condition, seeing people in a process of growth and development, with the potential to take responsibility for their fate" (Rubin, 2001, p. 119). A relational approach (Dalley, et al., 1993) and feminist approaches (Hogan, 1997) within the Expressive Therapy field also criticise the hierarchy in the client/therapist relationship for empowerment and development.

I am aware that my own personal narrative may have had an impact on development of my approach to life, acknowledging that my ethos of positivity and my optimistic nature might impact my role as a researcher throughout the research stages. Therefore, as stated above, I have been under professional supervision and also consulted with academic colleagues to help maintain the balance between my personal narrative and professional research role.

To sum up, teaching as a multi-dimensional approach based on emotional pedagogy and relationships is considered significant to the enhancement of professional development generally for the inclusive context, and with children with SEN in particular.

6.4.3. Developing Art-Based Pedagogy for Special Educational Needs (SEN)

Developing an art-integrated concept of working with children with SEN emerged as a central concept in participants' personal and professional development. This is manifested by Shanny's words, indicating the contribution – 'profit' – of integrating all the senses through reflection. Using the word 'profit' indicates both the emotional aspect – mental-emotional well-being – and measurable outcomes. Moreover, the word 'profit'
illustrates potential to enhance the sense of well-being of educators themselves working with pupils with SEN, evoking complex emotions that challenge educators' personal well-being and, thus, affects their work' (Day, 2012).

For example, Yafa (Appendix 22Y) indicated the development of her approach to working with pupils with SEN, emphasising the authentic relationship with pupils as a basis for teaching. Yafa stated that she integrated art based on her experience in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme, which opened communication channels that were sometimes blocked (interview). Eve (Appendix 22E) recalled a child with severe Attention Deficit Disorder who painted a huge sports field and projected onto this his feelings of strength. She felt this activity helped him understand the powers embodied within him and that he would be able to use them in any field he wished.

Participants displayed a perception that art-integrated teaching supports the holistic development of pupils with SEN. In the light of their experiences through art, participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ programme developed a teaching approach that integrated aspects from both the personal and professional dimensions. This approach promoted an accepting and non-judgmental ethos, focused on empowering capabilities and increasing personal confidence of included pupils.

Participants reported that they felt pleasure when touching art materials. This eliminated their barriers of self-expression accumulated as a result of past experiences, characterised by judgment and criticism of their expression through art. Findings of this study show that, through activities using art, participants managed to give visual expression to their personal and professional world associated with their experiences while working with pupils with SEN, as well as to eliminate barriers of conducting an emotional dialogue with them. Yafa found out that by using art, children with SEN can express their creativity and talk about their creation and this helps them profoundly (Yafa / interview/ Appendix 22Y).

The experiential group art activities were grounded in studies that emphasise the need for connecting theory in practice in educators’ professional development. This challenges the traditional view of training as acquisition of tools and pedagogical competences only (Newmann et al., 1995; UNESCO, 2008). It can be concluded that the balanced connection between theoretical and experiential aspects was facilitated
through experiences with a variety of teaching styles and methods, thus providing a response to the unique, personalised developmental and learning difficulties of pupils with SEN.

These findings are corroborated by studies that consider art as a means of emotional intra- and inter-personal communication, developing empathy and accompanied by enjoyment and excitement of using art materials as a positive and aesthetic approach to the environment (Langer, 1953; Moon, 2007). Furthermore, the findings indicated that, through art, participants underwent deep and complex processes of development in dimensions of the personal, professional-general and professional-specific with regard to children with special needs. These findings are in line with Dewey (1934), who maintained that art enhanced development of personal identity by the very experiential process.

Participants developed an accepting and empathic concept for working with children with SEN through the integration of art during the programme. This concept relies on the perception of difference as uniqueness and it is supported by the literature discussing the integration of art and expressive art therapy as relating to aspects of the personal and professional dimensions (Bruner, 1960, 1963; McNiff, 1981; Gardner, 1983, 1999; Rubin, 2001; Moon, 2007).

Moreover, findings concur with Prokoviev (1994), Peter (1998) and Chesner (2001) that integrating art, while working with children with SEN in the education field contains both educational and therapeutic aims. Consequently, it requires integration of principles from emotional art-based pedagogy. Integration of both types of pedagogy includes consistency, predictability and respect of timing and pace of learners, secure boundaries, expressing emotions through creative activities based on choice, freedom and autonomy and integrating a multi-disciplinary experiential learning process.

Findings of this study illustrate that participants managed to successfully implement an inclusive approach based on emotional pedagogy principles, such as attention and empathy. They achieved this through art-based pedagogy using varied and creative teaching methods during the programme. These findings are grounded in research findings (Peter, 1995; Hudson & Glomb, 1997; Peter and Walter, 2010), who profess implementing verbal and non-verbal approaches in order to develop skills of attuning to
learners' emotional state and their cognitive dimension – concentration and effective learning. The varied teaching styles allowed participants to become acquainted with themselves in a unique way and to develop empathy for a range of means of self-expression.

Thus, integration of both emotional and art-based pedagogy and expressive art therapy aspects, in addressing both affective and cognitive dimensions, becomes leverage for accepting and inclusive teaching of pupils with special needs.

6.4.4. Developing an Ethos of Acceptance

Findings of this study illustrate that participants developed a language that directly addresses emotions. Through this language a new dimension for contact with children with special educational needs (SEN) can be created, enabling them to communicate with themselves and with others. This finding can be explained through participants' backgrounds and use of metaphors.

The metaphors 'wholeness' and 'freedom' demonstrate the meaning Miri attributed to the development of emotional abilities. Miri said the teaching approach that she developed was based on expressing her satisfaction with the progress of children with SEN. She became aware of the impact the manifestation of her feelings had on the children’s confidence in their ability to succeed. This affected their self-belief, eliminated their disruptive behaviour and, in fact, enhanced their concentration ability and interest in learning.

Miri's new approach indicates that she has developed inclusive practice based on empowering learners via transferable techniques from the field of Expressive Art Therapy (Stor, 1983; McNiff, 1992; Reynolds et al., 2000). Miri’s new perception includes her ability to attune to the children's individual ways of looking and their need for physical touch for their relaxation and calmness. Expression through a variety of modalities such as art or play can pave ways for widening attention to learners with SEN and may be the primary form of communication in both therapy and education fields (Moon, 1995; Rubin, 2001).
Findings of this study are thus grounded in learning theories (Dewey, 1915, 1933) and a view of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983), while focusing on the holistic-humanistic development of tutors working with children with SEN through an approach that integrates personal and professional dimensions (Schramm, 2002) and includes multi-dimensional aspects, such as cognition and behaviour (Rayner, 2001, 2009). These approaches, which include pupils' personal dimensions, integrate aspects of body-soul relationship (Yannick, 2009), serenity and mental well-being (Heckman et al., 2006), transformative teaching (Gardner, 1991) and collaborative teaching (Sailor, 1991). It is based also on findings from brain science studies (Rosaen & Benn, 2006).

However, unlike ‘Lovecircles’, these other approaches do not consider the tutor’s personal dimension. Based on this, one can conclude that attuning to the personal dimension enhanced attention to others. (This applied particularly to Eve whose development was characterised by focusing on the personal aspects. See Chapter 5 – Findings – learner patterns, page 179).

This leads to the conclusion that understanding the contribution of acceptance and empathy is important. A description of a situation that transpired during Eve's participation in the 'Lovecircles’ education programme (diary – Appendix 22) showed her insight about the relationship between the personal-emotional dimension and professional capabilities, such as being empathic and supportive. One of the group members reacted emotionally to an experiential activity in pairs. When Eve was her partner during the experience, other participants supported her with great empathy, although Eve reacted in a cognitive way to the situation, stood on the side, and observed the occurrence.

Developing participants' inclusive approach was facilitated through personal and group processes that did not focus only on knowledge acquisition and techniques. These processes are based on the need for professional development programmes focusing on the teacher as a person in order to develop a teaching concept that is sensitive to the individual, as opposed to focusing only on the professional aspect (Ainscow, 1999).

Rayner (2007) advocates that educational research bears the potential and therefore contributes to understanding learner-performance and pedagogy based on individual learning styles. This approach matches the view according to which this study was
initiated, designed and developed. Hence, inquiring into the perception of participants in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme and the conditions that enabled their development, may help develop a new approach and practices.

The study by Ben-Yehuda and Lest (2004) also considers tutors' personal, psycho-social dimension and not only their professional training in inclusive teaching strategies as a prerequisite for successful inclusion. Like 'Lovecircles', their study is based on an approach integrating cognitive and emotional aspects (Feshbach, 1978); pupils' personal worlds (thoughts and emotions) and learning (background and relation with parents); tutors' personal dimension – sensitivity, giving and positive attention towards inclusion; and tutors' professional dimension – being capable of teaching pupils inclusively and collaborating with professionals (Moore & Esselman, 1992). Ryan and Deci (2000) emphasise attention to learners' unique needs and inclusive practice that attends to children’s emotions and not just their difficulties in the cognitive domain (Or-Noy, 2010).

In line with ‘Lovecircles’, other studies also highlight the effect of and relationship between a positive worldview and feelings of well-being for effectiveness, (for example, relaxation for increasing concentration), as opposed to focusing only on achievements and outcomes, which is characterised by stress and pressure and inhibits growth and learning (Seligman, 2000). Educators’ emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1999) and their abilities to navigate their own emotions underpin the development of a positive approach that supports, assists, and is empathic to the inclusion agenda (Gibbs, 2003; Eragur, 2009). The emotional self-efficacy developed by the participants is supported by researchers who suggest connecting psychology and education in a more direct manner (Erhard, 2003). Therefore, these findings once more support an approach to inclusive teacher education based on emotional pedagogy that highlights the significant role of the educator-learner relationship for their professional development.

Phenomenological data analysis methods facilitated focusing on the processes participants underwent during the 'Lovecircles' programme. For example, Eve unleashed emotional barriers enabling her to discuss hindering factors, difficulties and problems. These hindering factors were demonstrated as impacting on her approach and behaviour. Eve shared that the perception of the educator towards her behaviour was not critical but accepting and empathising. This acceptance of the educator made her
understand that her behaviour emerged from unleashed emotional memories of rejection and loneliness from childhood, which transformed into jealousy towards the engulfing emotions given to participants by the educator and group members. This understanding led to an awareness of the personal dimension and served as scaffolding for developing a new approach to herself and later on, to her students with SEN. Instead of criticising her students with SEN she was able to understand their overt behaviour, based on her own experience of hidden emotional difficulties and develop inclusive and caring teaching.

This interpretation was based on aspects from Expressive Art Therapy stemming from a phenomenological psychodynamic art-based approach (Rubin, 2001). This led to multi-dimensional understanding of participants’ perceptions concerning their development. Therefore, I uphold that interpretation based only on overt behaviour is a narrow approach hindering holistic humanistic perception. This example highlights that the different data sources and interpretation approaches used created the particular understanding leading towards the conclusion and contribution thereafter.

To sum up, personal and professional development are closely connected with inter and intra-personal processes. Attention to the personal dimension – unique personal needs – of educators during their process of development enhances their ability to listen to the personal dimension – unique needs – of pupils with SEN. Expanding attention to the personal dimension rather than focusing only on the professional dimension during the 'Lovecircles' programme develops educators' integrative-holistic view of themselves and of children with SEN, which serves as leverage for their overall inclusion in society and at school. This endorses the significant role of an emotional pedagogy in teacher education programmes.

Development processes and stages within teacher education programmes should therefore include

- Developing attention to the self-personal dimension and the personal dimension of others;
- Attention to the self-personal dimension and the personal-professional dimension of others in the peer group; and
Attention to the self-personal dimension and the personal-professional dimension of others working with children with special educational needs.

6.5. Conclusion – Towards an Integrative Holistic Humanistic (IHH) Approach to Professional Development

This study evaluated the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme in order to discover transferable principles and practices across professional training contexts. Unlike traditional professional training programmes, sessions in the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme did not perceive delivering theories and a list of strategies for teaching as the dominant aim. The main implication of this is that it is necessary to consolidate a new syllabus for teacher education programmes based on a clearer solid theoretical framework, which could preface active learning within each teaching session towards deeper understanding of themes and issues with emotion prominent. It should be clarified that, although the theoretical notion was salient in stage A of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme, it was revisited also in its advanced stages (B and C) (in line with Bruner’s (1960, 1963) spiralling curriculum) and was carefully evaluated.

The ‘Lovecircles’ programme was developed for improving practice within inclusive education. Participants should be able to apply their developing understanding to their practice and ultimately be able to respond spontaneously and intuitively in situations to the needs of both individuals and the group (Dreyfus, 1981; Peter & Walter, 2010), by drawing on tacit knowledge and prior experiences. Professional development programmes should facilitate reflection about the entirety of factors that affect teaching dimensions (Peter & Walter, 2010). This includes theoretical and pedagogical knowledge and the way this is applied in practice. This approach is corroborated by other leading researchers in the field of professional development (Zilberstein, 1991; Feiman-Nemser, 1998; Zilberstein & Katz, 1998) and the Expressive Art Therapy field (McNiff, 1981).

In this light, multi-dimensional aspects of reflection within the Expressive Art Therapy field offer an approach for integrating cognitive and emotional aspects rather than one dimension only, leading to deeper self-understanding. This highlights the potential
The contribution of the Expressive Art Therapy field for integrating the personal dimension into the professional development of educators by releasing emotional barriers via art modalities. This view is supported by other approaches towards the integrative role of emotion and its link to cognitive aspects and the impact of integrating personal and professional dimensions – beliefs, judgments and emotions – for consciously paving the course of life (Adolphs et al., 1998). Rather than dismiss the significance of emotion, on the contrary, this study highlights the need in teacher education to enhance an integrative approach towards cognition and the link with emotion and its impact on personal and professional development.

To sum up, sometimes even all the academic studies in the most prestigious institutions cannot release us from barriers inherent in us since childhood if we are unable to listen to ourselves through our emotions. Attention to emotions in our personal dimension empowers our self-perception in which we ground in fact the knowledge acquired in the professional field. Professional development of the case studies in this research project emerged as a cumulative process, consisting of developmental stages, plus an example of facilitated development – and apprenticeship approach – in the tradition of Vygotsky's (1987) holistic constructivist theory. It forms the basis of a new conceptualisation for teacher education, presented in the following chapter.
CHAPTER 7 – A NEW ‘EDUCATOR MODEL’ FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

This study advocates that the intermediate area between the fields of education and expressive therapy offers scope for an innovative approach for the professional development of inclusive educators. In this light, professional development programmes integrating aspects from both fields enhance awareness of the holistic development of the whole child. The integration of a wide range of theories from the fields of education and therapy provides a scaffolding framework for the development and utilisation of an inclusive approach from theory to practice. This study argues that the integrative approach of 'Lovecircles' enables educators to put a theoretical understanding of a holistic approach into practice.

Teachers' ability to attend to the personal dimension of learners—perceive the act of teaching through a variety of lenses and to interpret educational phenomena in different lights—prompts flexibility in interpretation of learners' overt behaviour. Therefore, practitioners may develop the ability to better meet learners ‘where they are’. This entails wide-ranging and in-depth development, integrating cognitive as well as emotional aspects. This differs from professional development programmes that tend to promote teaching processes such as reflection in and after action (Schön, 1983, 1987, 1991), which are focused more on cognitive aspects. I argue that the 'Lovecircles' programme focuses on integrating cognitive and emotional, sensory and tacit aspects of the teaching process that include reflection and based on inter- and intra-personal experiences.

Professional development in education and therapy in general and in SEN in particular is conceptualised through the lens of emotion and art in education vis-à-vis therapy. These theoretical lenses will serve for assessing the 'Lovecircles' education programme as these are the areas in which I was trained, which served as the framework of my practice. Issues concerning this understanding include questions about core issues of and borders between education and therapy, since emotions tend to be more accepted in the therapy field. This study claims that practitioners as well as researchers hitherto
have been focusing on emotions through the lens of the professional dimension – emotions in pedagogy and emotions of the learner.

However, this study focuses on the emotion of educators in their professional development training. Focusing on educators as an integral part of development becomes the leverage for embedding emotion in practice, especially towards inclusion of children with special educational needs (SEN). This new angle of approaching the issue of emotion in professional development might inform the education field in general and specifically the inclusion agenda, in particular in relation to the Israeli context and in the 21st century, where accountability issues are emerging globally.

7.1. 'Lovecircles' Integrative Approach

7.1.1. Origins and Principles

The 'Lovecircles' professional development emerged from the humanistic tradition in education, which perceived teaching as based on relationships, emotion, attention, empathy, patience, equality, art and creativity (Frankl, 1946; Buber, 1958; Rogers, 1961; Fromm, 1983; Maslow, 1998). Therefore, the humanistic approach to professional development comprises one anchor for the 'Lovecircles' programme and claims that technical approaches developed for working with children with SEN perceive professional skills based mostly on teaching strategies and consider the role of educators as based on their professional dimension (McKee & Witt, 1990; Beane, 1991; Bredeson, 1992; Osborne, 1993; Page, 1994; Eyre, 1997, 2000; Stoehr & Buckey, 1997; Avramidis & Bayliss, 1998; Goacher et al., 1998; Frederickson & Cline, 2002).

This study aims at highlighting that the acquisition of teaching techniques should be considered as an integral part of professional development along with development of the personal dimension i.e., emotion. This integration is believed to be a holistic-humanistic response to the increasing numbers of children surviving with complex medical needs and their inclusion in mainstream classes.

The learner support approach is the second educational theoretical anchor at the basis of the innovative 'Lovecircles' education programme. This theoretical anchor focuses on supporting students' emotional and cognitive needs. Hence, professional skills in the
learner support approach perceive teaching as based on strategies integrating emotions of children with learning material (Kubovi, 2008), with regard for family, cultural and ecological contexts (Elizur & Minuchin, 1992; Shriberg et al., 1997; Wengrower & Chaiklin, 2010).

The third educational approach that underpins the 'Lovecircles' professional development programme is **the educators’ approach** (Allender, 2001; Korthagen, 2005; Hargreaves, A., 2008; Oplatka, 2008; Rosenblum, 2010; Rosenblum et al., 2012). This approach regards educators’ self-development processes as fundamental for teaching, especially in the context of children with SEN. This approach relates to educators’ emotions emerging during their encounter with all children as well as those with SEN, affecting educators’ attitude towards inclusion. At the core of the educators’ approach lies the personal dimension, which is perceived as part of professional development and it is this that sustains the 'Lovecircles' education programme.

Thus, the themes that sustain the 'Lovecircles' education programme—holistic Humanism, learner support and focus on educators – reflect an integrative and 'big picture' concept in education (New Horizon Network for Learning, Ministry of Education, 2012). This educational concept highlights positive nurturing, stimulation and encouraging interaction and fully developing human capacities (Diamond, 2010). Moreover, this approach concurs with Clark’s (2010) claims that, previously, only cognitive skills—analytic and linear—were considered important. Based on recent data (LeDoux, 2003; Clark, 2010) though, the integration of all brain functions (analytic and gestalt processes of cognition, emotion, physical sensation and intuition) can better support learning and ensure success for every learner. Similarly, other researchers’ (Palmer & Zajonc, 2010) argument sustains this study’s perception that teaching and learning should honour the whole human being—mind, heart and spirit.

Nevertheless, I agree with Kozminsky and Kloir (2010) that abandoning traditional models of teaching and teacher education as well as promoting new role perceptions might lead to a sense of dissatisfaction, uncertainty and self-doubt. It might, though, serve a fertile soil for renewed debate about educators’ professional development and the forging of a new integrative model for professional development. In this light, the 'Lovecircles' approach joins researchers’ (Hyland 1994; Chappell 1996; Ecclestone, 1997) critique of the competency-based model of professional development as being
rigid and pedagogically wrong. This critique conceives the competency-based model of professional development as a fragment of educators’ role.

Other researchers (Keiny, 1994; Levine & Nevo, 1998) would advocate the 'Lovecircles' approach as an ecological approach, which is a further expansion and endorsement of its professional development concept. These researchers challenge a hierarchical approach in education. In this sense, Ben-Peretz et al. (1988), Levine & Nevo (1998), and Keiny (1994) advocate the shaping of educators’ strong sense of "we" and thus reinforce their personal ego (Avraham, 1998) and autonomy (Fraser 2011). Ethnographic-qualitative approaches are grounded in the concept of the empowered or "whole" teacher (Fullan & Hargreaves, A., 1996).

However, I argue that this ecological approach does not see educators’ experiential-emotional aspects as part of their professional development. In this sense even the ethnographic approach that highlights qualities such as empathy in teaching, focuses on the students' cognitive aspects. Therefore, I uphold that the ethnographic approach does not see teachers' experiential-emotional aspects as part of their professional development, and it indicates a need for this to be encapsulated within a staged framework, which articulates the role of the trainer within the facilitation of the professional development process.

7.1.2. Integrative 'Lovecircles' Tutor

The concept chosen in this study is tutoring and not mentoring as it emphasises the claim that professional development should integrate personal development as a necessary component. Tutoring embodies two concepts—attention and individual direct guidance—which refer to both the personal dimension and professional dimension. Tutoring facilitates discussion of an inquiry-led approach, perceiving educators’ attention to the personalised needs of each learner within the group.

The therapeutic educator – Corey’s (2001) existential therapy approach (May & Yalom, 2000) incorporates basic concepts and techniques from a number of other action-oriented therapies such as Adlerian therapy (Watts, 1999), reality therapy (Glasser, 2000), behaviour therapy (Blatner, 1996; Lazarus, 1997), rational emotive therapy
(Ellis, 1991), cognitive therapy (Alford & Beck, 1997) and feminist therapy (Corey, 2001). These are approaches of a therapeutic orientation, which focus on a central dominant feature such as thinking or behaviour as opposed to the integrative approach that underpins this study. According to Corey (2001), they should be integrated. He advocates the advantages of developing an integrative approach to counselling practice while revealing its potential problems.

According to Corey (2001), designing an integrative approach to counselling requires time, reflection and practice. Corey stipulates that, although recognising theories serves as a basis for creating, implementing and assessing, it is highly important for participants to attend experiential workshops since they enhance the development of openness to the personal dimension, leading to integration with the professional context. Moreover, he argues that before adopting ideas from various therapeutic models, it is most important to critically assess these ideas and apply them personally. Hence, he recommends that educators experiment with a number of different therapeutic techniques, yet avoid using these techniques in a rigid or cookbook method. Techniques are merely tools to assist practitioners to effectively reach learners and thus personalise them to fit the personal and professional dimension.

Developing one's own unique educator style leads to a process of developing one's own integrative approach. Corey (2001) perceives this process of integrating personal and professional dimensions as ‘the art of integrative counselling’. He maintains that integrating the personal and professional dimensions is essentially challenging. Hence, tutors should create their own unique way for integrating these two dimensions. Corey argues that there is no single specification for integrating the personal and professional dimensions and it needs to be personalised. The conclusion drawn from his words is that the process of building the integration is in the hands of the tutors when shaping their role.

Corey’s (2001) perception is in line with the perception of this study, which is grounded in a combination of existential, positivist, constructivist and phenomenological psychology approaches. These approaches underscore principles of personal and professional development such as: autonomy choice, positive approach to life circles and self-actualisation according to personal interpretation.
7.2. Towards a New Model for Teacher Education

This study upholds that inclusion as perceived in the light of developmental psychology (Piaget, 1969; Vygotsky, 1993) tends to focus on one dimension, namely cognitive development. It therefore neglects other significant aspects from a more humanistic viewpoint, such as relationships, ecological and cultural theoretical perspectives. This study advocates a shift of paradigm from focusing on children's intellectual development to perceiving them as whole and autonomous persons. According to this study then, inclusion is a matter of perceiving the integrative holistic needs of children – emotional and cognitive.

Moreover, this study concurs with researchers in the fields of professional practice based on children's rights (Jones P., 2008a; Jones & Walker, 2010), which advocate integrating an understanding of the fields of health, social care and welfare into the field of education in teachers’ practice and theory.

Educators’ professional development, as perceived nowadays, requires educators to express emotions on the one hand for enhancing empathy and respectful dialogue with students (Oplatka, 2010). However, teacher education programmes support educators’ claim (Allender, 2001; Gilat, 2007; Hargreaves, D., 2012) that this expectation is not cultivated throughout the teacher education process. This critical view reflects educators’ dilemmas regarding the expression of their emotions and their own personal and professional narratives in the context of teaching and learning.

From the standpoint of education and therapy, research studies (Rogers 1980; Moustakas, 1981) advocate integrating emotions in practice. Stipulating professionals' reference to the flow of their own emotions might facilitate conceptualisation processes of their thoughts. That is, listening to emotions promotes, in fact, cognition—in this sense, individuals' ability to recognise themselves, direct their deeds according to a meaningful objective assume responsibility and love others. This attitude is not critical but rather accepting, enabling development and self-actualisation.

As a result, it affects the quality, wellness and effectiveness of the relationship with them. This contradicts approaches that separate emotions from cognition and those that
consider emotions as a disruption of perception and thinking processes (Iverson, 1996; Ramachandran, 2003; Phelps, 2006; Peter & Walter, 2010). The 'Lovecircles' approach focuses on educators’ personal dimension as an integrative part in their professional development.

7.2.1. Staged Models of Professional Development

Generally speaking, there are two approaches to teachers' development (Evans, 2010). One is the traditional approach that focuses on theoretical and empirical pedagogical knowledge (Laczko-Kerr & Berliner, 2002). The second is the alternative approach to educators’ development (Furlong & Oancea, 2005; Webb et al., 2004), which emphasises further aspects, for example collaboration, support and shared experiences as dominant elements of professional development (Cohen-Vogel & Smith, 2007). According to this approach, teaching is perceived as a humanistic profession, based on a broad general education. Conversely, the traditional approach highlights teaching as an academic area of knowledge (Hoffman & Niederland, 2010). These two contrasting perceptions of teaching are at the basis of the debate about the figure of the "good" or "worthy" educator (Korthagen, 2005), which is the concern of this study.

The traditional approach in education focuses on learning and improving performance in specific skills based on school regulations society-related aspects and the economy. Ethical aspects and intellectual involvement are perceived as the core values and principles of this traditional approach. Thus, traditional models of teacher education are based on the staged acquisition of pedagogical skills and strategies such as showing, demonstrating, exemplifying, role modelling and underpinning theoretical knowledge. The concomitant approach to professional development is based on cognitive behaviour as opposed to alternative approaches based on additional aspects: emotional, social, artistic and spiritual.

Alternative staged models of professional development highlight the need for a more holistic view of the educator, as proposed in the following models: the 4-stage learning circle (Kolb & Fry, 1975), pre-service stage (Lacey, C., 1977), five stages of skill acquisition model (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 1980; 1986), the inclusive teacher (Peter, 2005, 2013; Peter & Walter, 2010) and personal experience combined with knowledge
towards developing individual teaching styles and reflection that integrates the personal dimension (Ben-Peretz et al., 1988; Feiman-Nemser, 1998); also the development of educators' inner perception of the professional role (Furlong & Maynard, 1995; Day, 1999; Oplatka, 2011).

The more holistic approach to professional development in 'Lovecircles' contradicts the traditional approach to teacher education and professional development that focuses on one dimension—accumulating pedagogical skills and knowledge. It also highlights the need for perceiving professional development in stages, but using a model that emphasises the sequence of inner processes that educators undergo. This directly opposes the traditional positivist approach that does not consider the environmental context as part of educators’ growth (Dick & Carey, 1996). Boshuisen et al., (2004) stipulate that the personal dimension of educators rather than the length of their experience as professionals is much more essential for the development of expertise.

However, a staged perception of teacher development, whether traditional or holistic, is not without issues. Firstly, professional development of teachers is necessarily complex and secondly there is much more to the way teachers develop than merely the stages they undergo. Elliott's (1991) perception of developing educational programmes accords with this study's approach to evaluation of the 'Lovecircles' educational programme. This study integrates theory and practice in order to improve practice while producing knowledge. According to Elliott (1991), innovative professional development education programmes have to include transformative possibilities for both teachers and teacher educators in academia, which may even inform curricula and policy development.

Hoshmand & Polkinghorne (1992) present the relationship between psychological science and professional practice in the light of postmodern changes in perspectives focusing on knowledge. They propose that positivist science, which has dominated the traditional interpretation of scientist–practitioner training, is considered from a constructivist point of view to be only one possible foundation of psychological knowledge. These researchers focus on mutuality of science and practice, suggesting an evolving framework for understanding the epistemology of practice based on cognitive psychology (Hoshmand & Polkinghorne, 1992).
Other researchers in the field of educators’ professional development (Finsterwald et al., 2013) also focus on educators' knowledge and cognitive aspects. Even when they indicate aspects from the personal dimension such as belief, motivation and cooperation, there is no reference to emotion at all. So formalising the rigorous approach to professional development in the 'Lovecircles' programme will provide a staged approach that addresses this gap in consideration of progression in the emotional dimension of practitioners.

### 7.2.2 Relevant Pedagogical Knowledge, Skills, and Understanding

As a result of findings of the final report conducted by Day and Smethem, (2009), recommendations were made to focus on integrating the aims of addressing disadvantaged communities in the professional development of educators. This goes beyond expertise and requires acquisition of a range of other strategies too – a view shared by this study. In Britain, Ofsted (2014) advocates that trainee teachers should become integrally involved with challenging contexts, through placements in schools requiring improvement. In-service teachers may benefit from participating in continuing professional development (CPD) sessions such as 'Lovecircles' to increase their awareness of the unique needs of learners from disadvantaged communities for promoting their motivation, engagement and attainment.

This approach is in contrast with findings in Israel concerning the "New Horizon" reform (Ministry of Education, 2012). Teachers specified that their professional needs are not fulfilled, as the schools' needs are the focus for decision-making concerning their professional development. Hence, this situation leads to feelings of discomfort and frustration. The significance of the "New Horizon" Report (Ministry of Education, 2012) resides in its reference to themes, which is the core issue of this study and the relevance of the 'Lovecircles' approach as CPD for in-service teachers as well as those in training. Namely, these issues are relationships and the need for building trust between colleagues, parents and children and the positive consequences for enhancing pupils’ attainments and the impact on the community.

According to Rayner (2007) a further challenge that this study strives to address is a need to develop pedagogical practice sustained by theory for addressing the unique
needs of students within increasingly diverse mainstream educational contexts. Similarly, Evans & Graff (2006) argue that there is a need for a wider study of personal individual learning differences, which includes features such as gender, personality, intelligence and abilities, self-reference, cognitive styles, learning styles and motivation/attitude formation.

Rayner (2007) advocates educational research itself embodies the potential and therefore, the contribution to understanding learner performance and pedagogy is based on individual learning style. This approach matches the standpoint from which this study was initiated, designed and developed. Hence, inquiring into the perceptions of participants in the 'Lovecircles' education programme and the core principles that enabled their development may help develop a new approach to both teacher education and inclusive practices.

The theoretical framework of this study aims to present the particular role of Emotion in both personal and professional development in the light of a holistic 'whole person' approach. Hence, approaches that integrate cognition and emotion serve as the theoretical basis for this study. Rayner & Riding (1997) present their quest for valuing diversity at the end of their cognition and learning-centred approach to the psychology of individual difference. Unlike them, this study focuses also on the role of emotion in learning and its integration with cognition, and emerged from my practice in the fields of both education and therapy.

### 7.2.3. Developing Situational Understanding

This study concurs with the view that teacher education programmes should strive to define core principles at different stages of professional development. Peter & Walter (2010) highlight the usefulness of the developmental framework of Dreyfus (1981) in identifying progression in acquisition of the mental capacities for occupational situational understanding—the ability of a professional to respond effectively and instantaneously in the moment by drawing on tacit knowledge and prior experience. Peter (2013) expanded this into a more comprehensive five-stage developmental model for inclusive teachers by integrating also emotional sustaining systems of their
professional journey based on humanistic approaches to mentoring and tutoring in teacher training.

According to Dreyfus and Dreyfus’ (1980) staged model, rule-following and skill acquisition constitute the desirable basis for generic professional development and occupational situational understanding. They identified five skill levels (see Table 7.1): novice, advanced beginner, competent, proficient and expert. The expert practitioner will intuitively draw instantaneously on tacit knowledge and prior experiences to act judiciously and intuitively in the moment. The aim and targets of the Dreyfus model are: (a) to provide a non-behavioural means of assessing and supporting progress in the development of skills or competencies; and (b) to provide a definition of an acceptable level for the assessment of competence or capability.

The Dreyfus model of skill acquisition (Table 7.1) outlines five discrete stages through which one must pass on the journey from novice to expert. The model shows that quite a few changes occur as one makes progress from novice to expert, with key ‘gateway’ abilities enabling progress to the next level. People do not just "know more" or gain skills; rather they experience fundamental differences in perceiving the world, approaching problem-solving and the mental models they form and use.

Each stage of the Dreyfus (1981) generic model of professional competence highlights significant change in one key area, which could provide the basis for targeting professional development. This model was used originally by Peter (1995) for developing a framework for analysing the professional development of educators at different stages of inclusive drama teaching (see Appendix 15): applying the Dreyfus (1981) model to drama education provided the basis for studying educators' training needs in inclusive drama teaching. This enhanced understanding and assessment of the development of educators’ situational understanding by targeting specific priority key areas at different stages of educators’ development. It was subsequently applied to movement education in inclusive contexts (Peter & Walter 2010) and then more holistically as a generic model for the development of the inclusive teacher (Peter, 2013).
Table 7.1: Novice-to-expert scale (1), adapted from Dreyfus (1981)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>How knowledge is addressed</th>
<th>Recognition of relevance</th>
<th>How context is assessed</th>
<th>Decision-making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Novice</td>
<td>Rigid adherence to taught rules or plans</td>
<td>Without reference to context</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Little situational perception</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No discretionary judgment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>Guidelines for action based on attributes or aspects (aspects are global</td>
<td></td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Analytically</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>beginner</td>
<td>characteristics of situations recognizable only after some prior experience)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Situational perception still limited</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All attributes and aspects are treated separately and attributed equal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>importance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>Coping with crowdedness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Now sees actions at least partially in terms of longer-term goals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conscious, deliberate planning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Standardised and routine procedures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Sees situations holistically rather than in terms of aspects</td>
<td>In context</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Holistically</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sees what is most important in a situation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Perceives deviations from normal patterns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Decision-making less laboured</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Uses maxims for guidance, whose meanings vary according to the situation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Expert</td>
<td>No longer relies on rules, guidelines or maxims</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Intuitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Intuitive grasp of situations based on deep tacit understanding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Analytic approaches used only in novel situations or when problems occur</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Vision of what is possible</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
However, Eraut (2004) points out that Dreyfus and Dreyfus (1986) do not really explain how transformation through the developmental stages actually occurs, offering only occasional references to theoretical learning or the development of fluency on standard tasks. This study agrees with Kinchina and Cabotb (2010) who claim that no acknowledgement is given to the part played by tutors in supporting them in their development from novice to expert. Research by Peter (2013) with trainee teachers in special schools contributes towards this, by highlighting the focus for mentoring support needed at each stage of development and of strategies to facilitate this. However, teacher educators need to raise their awareness concerning other kinds of complementary knowledge structures that also contribute to expertise.

7.2.4. Developing Expertise in Inclusive Teaching

Boshuisen et al. (2004) maintained that the nature of professional development in education can benefit from insights gained from the vast existing research on expertise. The Dreyfus model (1981) led to arguments among leading researchers in the field of professional development who discuss development by stages (Elliott, 1991, 2010; Hargreaves, D., 2010; Kinchina & Cabotb, 2010). Kinchina and Cabotb (2010), claim that there is a need to shift the focus from a dominant overemphasis on either knowledge or performance.

I uphold that the Dreyfus model (1981) might contribute delineation of dimensions of the developing practitioner and clustering in levels. Kinchina and Cabotb (2010) also contribute to this study’s approach by indicating the need for a wider perspective on ‘expertise’, by integrating the personal dimension within professional development. Professional development that aims at integrating both dimensions echoes the call for full attention to the holistic unique needs of children and all learners (Rayner, 2007), including their personal narrative voice, family and social aspects beyond learning aspects (Kinchina & Cabotb, 2010).

Focusing only on either knowledge or performance does not allow a view that encompasses various disciplines. Concentrating on the manipulation of knowledge structures provides a focus for dialogue between subject experts (who have an integrated understanding of their specialist domain) and educational developers who
may support the development of curriculum tools to facilitate the transitions between the linear and non-linear approach to professional development.

Kinchina & Cabotb (2010) hope, then, to encourage researchers to further study and develop this subject. Accordingly, this study considers the holistic development of the learner as well as the connection and impact of the environment and the dialogue on professional development. I advocate that this approach is significant for professional development of educators working within inclusive contexts for widening their perception of their pupils with SEN through the integration of their own personal and professional dimensions.

Critics of Dreyfus (1981) argued that learning theory should be the means that supports knowledge acquired by teachers in order to understand this knowledge and thus promote reflection processes (Schwab, 1970; Elliott, 2010). Elliott (2010) concurs with Dreyfus (1981) however, that theories constitute only a partial contribution to situational understanding. Relying on theories might be risky if they undergo a process of abstraction and the complexity of solving practical situational problems is eliminated.

Elliott's (2012) fundamental view of the potential value of Dreyfus’ (1981) model is in line with this study's approach, in that he underscores the need for developing teachers' wider perspectives by gathering information from all factors associated with a learning situation. In his opinion, attention to the variety of voices entails a reliable understanding of a situation through discourse between all the elements. Moreover, they can illuminate and increase the understanding of features that have not traditionally been taken into consideration.

The term ‘reflexive’ (Elliott, 2006; Zeichner & Liston, 2011) enables educators to develop a more coherent interpretation of their situations. This process might develop educators' ability as reflective practitioners (Schön, 1983) to attend to children’s personal, familial and social aspects, not only to their learning disabilities or abilities, which may support a more holistic and personalised inclusive approach. Peter (1995) interpreted Dreyfus’ (1981) developmental model to identify current and target skills for becoming a spontaneous inclusive drama teacher and the focus for reflection that would be pivotal to progress at each stage. A similar framework interpreted for the integrative holistic 'Lovecircles' programme could help pin-point pivotal foci to support trainers in
personalising their humanistic tutoring of educators at different stages of their development.

Through 'Lovecircles', this study has integrated the perceptions and opinions expressed by various researchers on teachers’ professional development. Elliott (2012) maintains that the approach presented by the Dreyfus (1981) model focuses on the rational aspect. According to him, as in this study's approach, room should be given to the acquisition of teachers' intuitive knowledge earlier in their development, not just as a characteristic of the ‘expert’.

Furthermore, there is a difference when teachers view components of a problematic situation in the light of a specific a-priori goal and therefore choose to implement a strategic decision vis-à-vis certain behaviour. Elliott (2010) stipulates that, according to Dreyfus (1981), decisions about strategy can be rational and stem from analytical consideration of alternatives or eventually result from implications of certain reflective processes that become intuitive. That is, Dreyfus (1981) used the issue of situational understanding analysis in order to develop a five-stage model of development. Elliott (2012) wonders whether the process must comprise all these five stages. Both approaches have been considered as guidelines for the construction of the 'Lovecircles' ‘Educator’ professional development model.

7.2.5. Holistic Reflection as a Developmental Process

Reflective teaching is the mechanism by which educators can further their own professional development. Professional training within education highlights reflection as an essential feature of training programmes. The Dreyfus model (1981) potentially highlights the key components on which to reflect, as illustrated by Peter (1995) in her model to support professional development in inclusive drama teaching. Over time, retrospective reflection-on-action becomes rapid reflection-in-action (Schön, 1983, 1987). Through the lens of a Vygotskyian perspective, the Dreyfus (1981) model offers an awareness of the next milestones in professional development and a direction therefore for mentors to scaffold development and extend the practitioner (Peter, 2013).

The reflection process in 'Lovecircles' has developed from a cognitive-view-base towards integrating other aspects such as emotional understanding and its contribution
to the process (Korthagen, 2012). This has opened the gate for the contribution of Expressive Therapy with art processes and products as reflecting and mirroring the self, decision, problem solving and removing barriers for development (McNiff, 1981). In this light, the role of the tutor, according to this study’s approach, in supporting the reflective process, is to attend to participants’ personal emotions in response to their internal and/or external perception of reality and then analyse it with them explicitly.

Therefore, this research study highlights reflection based on multi-dimensional—integration of emotional—aspects rather than solely on the cognitive dimension. The perceptions that view professional development as a process emphasise that teachers' constant reflection leads to broader personal and professional growth (Middlewood et al., 2005), which comprises inner and ethical aspects and emotional, social and intellectual involvement (Day, 2004). This study concurs with researchers who argue that although today there is an understanding about the contribution of developmental processes in professional development, inquiry and reflection processes of teachers themselves are still focused on the professional knowledge dimension (Schön, 1983, 1987; Tabachnic & Zeichner, 1998; Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 1999).

I agree with the argument that we lack an education professional development model that focuses on reflection, self-inquiry, use of poetry and metaphors, and writing a personal view that promotes integration of emotion and cognitive reflection (Zumwalt & Craig, 2005). This study is in line with the approach of Zeichner (2001) who underscores that using personal strategies, for example narrative and inter-personal writing in inquiry-led practices, enhances teachers' personal dimension. Early Years practice in England has evolved a process of educators writing 'learning stories’ of young children based on observation of their holistic development.

Moreover, some researchers stipulate that inquiry and reflection promote among teachers a new, broad and empowering professional perception of researchers and educators who express their voice as opposed to a knowledge delivery (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 1999). I maintain that, in addition, this approach develops teachers' active involvement in teaching and enhances an approach that promotes collaborative learning, acknowledged as significant also to the professional development of teachers who work with children with special needs in the United States (Henson, 2001). Thus, this study believes that an approach to professional development based on reflection of teachers'
knowledge building is different from those where reflection comprises focusing on learners themselves, their beliefs, perceptions, hopes and fears (Ben-Peretz et al., 1988).

Focusing on teachers' personal development stems from expanding the perception of their professional role as promoting, supporting and facilitating pupils' overall development. This perception calls for research like this study and for the development of education programmes whereby self-inquiry, experiential-experimental learning and integration of emotions contribute to the overall development of teachers as people (Korthagen, 2004).

7.2.6. Conclusion

Approaches that highlight the awareness of situational understanding of the 'here and now' in teachers' work (Epstein, 1998) are grounded in psychological processes as well as in rational and experiential thinking, which is partly subconscious and highly related to emotions (Wideen et al., 1998). This approach enables teachers to develop a perception of professional development and teaching according to a 'whole person' approach (Korthagen, 2005; Hargreaves, D., 2012) based on holistic-humanistic theories which see development itself as an inclusive process into a social world.

Furthermore, Elliott (2010) acknowledged that pre-service teachers do not have to acquire all specific theoretical and practical knowledge necessary for teaching before they step into the classroom, because in their practical work they will develop these capabilities. In this sense, the professional development process is dynamic, evolves internally and is based on the teachers' acquired practical knowledge and experience. In this context, Hargreaves & Shirley (2011) argue that there is another option for comprehending situational understanding – recipe knowledge. They concur with Elliott's (2010) critique of the developmental stages in Dreyfus' (1981) model, claiming that development is more complex and it comprises progression within as well as between segments. Moreover, he stipulates that the model should consider the important point raised by Elliott (2010), namely progression requires elements of unlearning and relearning.
It is argued, then, that in fact meaningful learning transpires not in academia but rather in the practical work that allows teachers to acquire experience of particularly unusual situations. It also facilitates developing intuitive inner knowledge, which efficiently serves teachers in the understanding of and effective behaviour in challenging situations. In this respect, based on my extensive experience in the field, I claim that accumulating a variety of experiences is a crucial factor for developing flexibility and informed intuition especially in inclusive educational contexts.

Thus, this study engages in this debate by critically examining the 'Lovecircles' education programme for educators working within inclusive contexts, focusing on practice sustained by theory. In so doing, 'Lovecircles' is perceived as a template for a new model of professional development that draws on therapeutic principles and strategies. It will focus on the educator’s emotional learning journey as integral to becoming an inclusive holistic and fulfilled teacher.

7.3. ‘Educator Model’ for Professional Development

Teachers' ability to perceive principles inhibiting and enhancing learning, including the personal dimension—emotional aspects—integrates their proficiency with those skills of therapists. This ability is based on understanding the relationship between inter- and intra-aspects on the learning context. These aspects constitute an intermediate area between therapy and education, with the 'Lovecircles' programme operating on principles from both. This learning journey needs to be articulated within a developmental framework to facilitate progression. Therefore, this study utilised Peter’s (1995) and Peter & Water's (2010) adaptation of Dreyfus' (1981, in Elliott, 1991) five-stage model of occupational competence and situational understanding, which highlights the development of four mental capacities—teaching dimensions—for becoming an inclusive teacher. Table 7.2 shows these capacities, interpreted for the 'Lovecircles’ more holistic integrative approach.
Table 7.2: Teaching dimensions for Integrative Holistic-Humanistic Pedagogy (IHHP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Component recognition</th>
<th>Salience recognition</th>
<th>Whole situation recognition</th>
<th>Decision making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A model for effective movement teaching (Peter &amp; Walter, 2008)</td>
<td>Theory and pedagogy of emotions in education</td>
<td>Recognition of learning opportunities in practice</td>
<td>Planning in respect of contextual considerations</td>
<td>Intervention possibilities embedding emotional pedagogy and art-based pedagogy in education vis-à-vis art therapy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In seeking to illuminate an educator’s emotional learning journey, and the associated tutoring mechanisms and processes in the 'Lovecircles' programme that facilitated change, data from the five case studies explored in earlier chapters was revisited. Through applying the model of Peter (1995) and Peter & Walter (2010), which is grounded in the model of professional development from beginner to expert stage (as conceived originally by Dreyfus, 1981), its use as an analytical tool revealed that the five case studies coincidentally exemplified characteristics of educators at different stages of development within the 'Lovecircles' programme.

The tool also exposed that tutoring throughout the 'Lovecircles' training had intuitively focused on key aspects at each respective stage of the programme (according to the 1981 Dreyfus model), which were pivotal for facilitating their progression – as befitted my ‘expert’ status. Moreover, a new on-line training resource for professionals working with children with severe and complex needs is also based on this developmental model from novice to expert, with four levels of engagement, and revisiting of learning themes at each level in a spiralling framework (Wells et al., 2012).

Based on Dreyfus' (1981) original model, Elliott (1991) set out a key for indicating the focus of development in each of the five stages. Peter (1995) applied this strategy to her model of developing situational understanding for professional competence (Table
This has enabled me, as well, to reveal a key focus of development at each stage in order to progress to the next stage (Table 7.2.2.), leading to characterising 'Lovecircles' participants’ professional development in Integrative Humanistic Holistic pedagogy, towards conceptualisation of the ‘Lovecircles’ model and indicating its innovative implications (Table 7.3). Table 7.2.2 presents the main focus of each stage of the teacher's personal and professional development in the field of inclusion.

**Table 7.2.1: The Dreyfus Model (1981): Developing Situational Understanding as a Model for Professional Competence – Applied To Teaching (Peter, 1995)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Situational Understanding</th>
<th>Component Recognition</th>
<th>Salience Recognition</th>
<th>Whole-Situation Recognition</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effective Teaching (Peter 1995)</td>
<td>Understanding of Theory &amp; Pedagogy</td>
<td>Responding to Learning Opportunities</td>
<td>Contextual Factors</td>
<td>Teaching Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novice</td>
<td>Non-situational</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced beginner</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Analytical</td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Holistic</td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Holistic</td>
<td>Intuitive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7.2.2: An Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy model for development of professional situational understanding within inclusion based on Dreyfus’ model (1981) applied for teaching Peter (1995).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional situational understanding</th>
<th>Background</th>
<th>Component Recognition</th>
<th>Salience Recognition</th>
<th>Whole-Situation Recognition</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘Lovecircles’</td>
<td>1. Attention to emotions</td>
<td>2. Use of art for Self-expression</td>
<td>3. Special education field</td>
<td>Understanding theory</td>
<td>Responding to learning opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novice-PROFESSIONAL</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Emotional</td>
<td>Emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced Beginner-PROFESSIONAL</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Rational</td>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL-A</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Rational</td>
<td>Rational Emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proficient PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL-B</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Absent</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Rational Emotional</td>
<td>Rational Emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert PERSONAL &amp; PROFESSIONAL</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Present/Absent</td>
<td>Present</td>
<td>Rational Emotional</td>
<td>Rational Emotional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.3.1. A Staged Model to Support Professional Development in Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy (IHHP)

Table 7.2.2 depicts five stages of personal and professional development of learners based on the 'Lovecircles' holistic integrative pedagogy model. Each personal and professional development stage includes a key that provides the learner and tutor with a picture of the level of development and potential guidance for the continued development process. The main keys focus on the emotional, rational, holistic and integrative holistic intuitive aspects. The staged model shows how it is possible to develop the teacher's professionalism to an intuitive level. Thus, in fact, this model responds to the criticism on the Dreyfus (1981) model, which does not explain how to advance the teacher's professionalism to the intuitive stage.

Examples are presented to characterise the developing educator, with a focus on their background in the field of special educational needs, art and listening and expressing feelings through art.

1. **Novice – PERSONAL**

May have a background in special education and the field of applied/rehabilitative art but with no experience of art as a means of self-expression of feelings, and no experience in listening and expressing feelings. Such a learner's professional conduct includes understanding theory, responding to learning opportunities, contextual factors and teaching strategies (in Table 7.2.2, 4-7). This behaviour is characterized as emotional.

2. **Advanced Beginner – PROFESSIONAL**

May have limited background in special education and the field of art as a means of self-expression of feelings, and minimal experience in listening and expressing feelings – a learner's professional conduct includes understanding theory, responding to learning opportunities, contextual factors and teaching strategies (Table 7.2.2, 4-7). This behaviour is characterized as rational.
3. Competent PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL –A

May have background in special education but no background in the field of art as means of self-expression of feelings and with no experience in attuning to the personal dimension. Such a learner's professional conduct includes understanding theory, responding to learning opportunities, contextual factors and teaching strategies (4-7 in Table 7.2.2). This behaviour is characterized as rational-emotional.

4. Proficient – PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL –B

May have a background in special education but limited background in the field of art as means of self-expression of feelings and with limited experience at attuning to the personal dimension. Such a learner's professional conduct includes understanding theory and responding to learning opportunities (4-5 in Table 7.2.2). This behaviour is characterized as holistic.

5. Expert – PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL

With background in special education and experience at attuning and expressing feelings through drama but with no/limited experience at expressing feelings through art. Such a learner's professional conduct includes understanding theory and responding to learning opportunities (4-5 in Table 7.2.2). This behaviour is characterized as emotional-rational. Regarding article 6 the professional conduct is characterized as holistic and regarding article 7 – integrative, holistic intuitive.

The following section presents the five case studies and illustrates characteristics of professionals within the Educator model. This has been achieved through revisiting the analysis of their development according to the characteristics of the personal and professional dimensions described in Section 5.5.4. This is summarised in Table 7.3.
**Table 7.3: Characteristics of ‘Lovecircles’ participants: professional development in Integrative Humanistic Holistic pedagogy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Understanding of Theory &amp; Pedagogy</th>
<th>Recognition of Learning Opportunities</th>
<th>Recognition of Contextual Factors</th>
<th>Ability to Make Appropriate Lovecircles Interventions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>NEWCOMER - Personal</strong></td>
<td>Plans lesson based on ‘Lovecircles’ core principles addressing personal dimension</td>
<td>Uses the ‘Lovecircles’ core principles in lesson plans</td>
<td>Awareness of individual differences of self-expression and modalities</td>
<td>Draws on expression through art, and group activities based on the ‘Lovecircles’ training programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eve</td>
<td>Plans integrative activities throughout the lesson</td>
<td>Awareness of attention to personal dimension as the catalyst for students’ learning</td>
<td>Awareness of institutional approach to innovations based on attention to the personal dimension</td>
<td>Integrates practice within the personal-circle format based on the ‘Lovecircles’ approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ADVANCED BEGINNER Personal – professional A</strong></td>
<td>Incorporates experimental learning objectives in lesson planning</td>
<td>Responds to challenging situations in order to develop children’s attention to personal dimension and expression incorporating art</td>
<td>Perceives latent inhibited emotions of children and staff</td>
<td>Adjusts activities to concentrate attention on personal dimension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanny</td>
<td>Organises experimental activities within the lesson</td>
<td>Attempts to introduce integrative – holistic activities for individuals and groups in order to respond to challenging events</td>
<td>Aware of challenges in the teaching context and in individuals with SEN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personal – professional B</strong></td>
<td>Lesson plan focuses on students’ interests on topics in the curriculum and devises activities to address children’s SEN</td>
<td>Attends to ‘personal dimension’ approach based on respect and empathy</td>
<td>Attends to Children’s ‘personal dimension’ as leading to social and academic achievements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miri</td>
<td>Uses appropriate ‘Lovecircles’ concepts with a clear theoretical grasp</td>
<td>Uses encouragement towards experimentation and the exploration of attitudes</td>
<td>Develops the ‘Lovecircles’ programme to be included in the curriculum topics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNDERSTANDING OF THEORY &amp; PEDAGOGY</td>
<td>RECOGNITION OF LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES</td>
<td>RECOGNITION OF CONTEXTUAL FACTORS</td>
<td>ABILITY TO MAKE APPROPRIATE LOVECIRCLES INTERVENTIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROFICIENT</td>
<td>Taya</td>
<td>Lesson structure addresses differentiated integrative holistic objectives for the full range of SEN needs</td>
<td>Initiates learning opportunities that lead to children’s exploration, negotiation, discussion and collaboration to achieve the presentation of personal dimension within the group process</td>
<td>Understands and promotes the significance of personal dimension based on the ‘Lovecircles’ approach for children’s holistic self-actualisation – whether emotional, social or academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Confident understanding of the ‘Lovecircles’ approach process and its necessity</td>
<td>Uses a variety of approaches to address individual SEN needs within the group</td>
<td>Integrates the ‘Lovecircles’ approach and strategies across the curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXPERT</td>
<td>Yafa</td>
<td>Secure theoretical understanding of theories and pedagogy for integrative holistic education</td>
<td>Recognises challenging situations in order to implement the ‘Lovecircles’ approach across the curriculum</td>
<td>Readily appraises circumstantial factors that impact on the ‘Lovecircles’ teaching context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>Sound principles for using the ‘Lovecircles’ approach with children with SEN in specialist and inclusive contexts</td>
<td>Uses the ‘Lovecircles’ approach flexibly to meet needs of individuals with SEN and of groups</td>
<td>Recognises the potential of ‘Lovecircles’ in the wider context (school and beyond)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Eve – Newcomer-personal to Advanced Beginner

Eve had a professional background in art, having studied rehabilitation and jewellery-making. (Table A.19, Appendix 19). However, she came to the 'Lovecircles' education programme without any prior experience in attuning to the personal dimension and so her development was characterised as a learner focused on personal development.

Theoretical understanding – On the theoretical level, Eve presented understanding of how to plan a session based on 'Lovecircles' core principles, such as addressing the personal dimension and deploying integrative activities.

Learning opportunities – She recognised learning opportunities as they arose and developed awareness of attention to the personal dimension as the catalyst for students’ learning.

Contextual factors – Eve recognised contextual factors impacting on the context and developed awareness of her institution’s approach to innovations based on attention to her own personal dimension. She developed awareness of individual differences of self-expression and modalities.

Teaching strategies – Eve developed an ability to make appropriate 'Lovecircles' interventions. She drew on expression through art that she had experienced in training and led group activities within the personal-circle format based on the 'Lovecircles' approach.

Eve developed an ability to adjust activities by concentrating on attention to the personal dimension. At the end of the programme, Eve had progressed from the first stage of professional development – newcomer-personal – to becoming an emergent Advanced Beginner.

- Tutoring – focused on attention to her needs for developing spaces for attention to herself as well as awareness of issues of intra- and inter-personal relations and understanding the effect of relationships on her functioning in her personal and professional life cycles.
Commentary – critique of Eve's tutoring indicates that she was deemed to need to focus on her personal development before attending training activities that focus on professional development.

Conclusions – professional knowledge acquired for the purpose of working with children with special education needs cannot be implemented if educators have their own emotional barriers that prevent attention to the personal dimension.

_shanny_ – _newcomer to advanced beginner: personal–professional – _a_

Shanny joined the 'Lovecircles' education programme without any background in _art_ (Table A.19, Appendix 19) or attention to the _personal dimension_. Her development is characterised as a learner focused on professional development. At the end of the programme she reached an Advanced-Beginner stage.

_Theoretical understanding_ – From her theoretical understanding, Shanny incorporated _experimental learning_ objectives in lesson planning and challenging events. She developed an ability to organise experimental activities in lessons.

_Leaرنینگ opportunities_ – Shanny developed an ability to reflect on integrative holistic projects of individual students, staff and groups and to consider innovative approaches to overcome challenges. She developed recognition of learning opportunities and responding to challenging situations in order to develop children’s _attention to personal dimension and expression incorporating art_. Shanny’s development indicates her attempt to introduce integrative-holistic activities for individuals and groups in order to respond to challenging events.

_Contextual factors_ – Her recognition of contextual factors was manifested via her perception of latent inhibited _emotions_ of children and staff. Shanny became aware of challenges in the teaching context and individuals with SEN.

_Teaching strategies_ – Shanny developed an ability to make appropriate 'Lovecircles' interventions. Her professional development indicated her ability to apply activities incorporating _art_ based on previous experience throughout the training. Her reflection on integrative holistic projects of individual students, staff and groups developed and she started to consider innovative approaches to overcome challenges.
Tutoring – focused on respect and timing of personal pace and her needs for development in the personal-emotional dimension (Collis & Lacey, 1996).

Commentary – Shanny experienced emotional barriers of attention and self-expression through art. She focused on her professional development as a means of developing her professionalism as a teacher.

Conclusions – Here is a need for a preparatory stage in experiential art in order to develop trust and flow in using art as a means of attention and emotional expression. That means that by drawing attention to the personal dimension, art can shift from using it with a behavioural-rehabilitating agenda to using art with therapeutic aspects. It can constitute a channel for attention to emotional expression, focused on a dynamic process as opposed to art focused on products or outcomes (Peter, 1998; Peter & Walter, 2010).

*Miri – Advanced beginner to Competent: Personal-professional – B*

Miri also came to the education programme without any background in art (Table A.19, Appendix 19), but had experience in teaching children with special educational needs (SEN). At the end of the programme she reached the competent stage and her development was characterised as a learner focused on the personal-professional aspect.

Theoretical understanding – Miri developed theoretical understanding of lesson planning focusing on students’ interests, on topics in the curriculum and devised activities to address children’s SEN. She used appropriate 'Lovecircles' concepts with a clear theoretical grasp.

Learning opportunities – Miri developed recognition of learning opportunities by attending to the ‘personal dimension’. Her approach was based on respect and empathy and she encouraged experimentation and the exploration of ideas.

Contextual factors – Miri attended to children’s ‘personal dimension’ as influencing their social and academic achievements.
Teaching strategies – Miri developed an ability to include 'Lovecircles' principles in curriculum topics. Miri showed an ability to make appropriate 'Lovecircles' interventions. She could assess children’s individual integrative holistic expression and used integrative multi-dimensional modalities. Miri drew on previous experience when considering possible strategies.

- Tutoring – Miri specialised in the teaching of pupils with SEN and has a background in psychology but with no experience either in attention to the emotional dimension of herself and others or in art. The tutor relied on her knowledge of psychology and the exciting experience of realising the power of art in developing personal creation as a channel for attention to emotions. Miri saw the bridge between developing creativity, using art for self-expression of emotions about the learning process and developed curricula integrating attention to the individual and self-expression.

- Commentary — a balanced integration was made between her personal and professional background and needs. Miri continued her development of authentic art and implemented her personal and professional insights at school.

- Conclusions – Miri’s development highlights the importance of awareness of the contribution of art to overcoming personal creative barriers and for promoting creativity in others. Developing personal awareness through experiential learning bridges theoretical knowledge of concepts such as creativity. Creative thinking grounded in psychology and education facilitates personal creativity through art, attention to emotions and the relationship between creativity and authenticity. This is applicable to children with SEN for whom verbal expression is not always possible, hence, implementing art might be a space for them to express themselves and, thus, facilitate their inclusion in a learning environment in class and school. This outlet might generate a change in self-image, entailing a change in anti-social and avoidance behaviours. The implication of this in practice is that teachers can use art as a tool for revealing personal capabilities in class – an operational principle for inclusion (DfEE and QCA, 1999).
Taya – Competent to Proficient: Personal–Professional

Taya also joined the 'Lovecircles' education programme without any background in art (Table A.19, Appendix 19) or in attention to the personal dimension. However, she has experience in promoting teaching and holistic therapy. Her development is characterised as a learner focused on the personal-professional aspect.

Theoretical understanding – Taya showed confident theoretical understanding of the 'Lovecircles' approach and her lesson planning structure addressed differentiated integrative holistic objectives for the full range of needs of her pupils with SEN.

Learning opportunities – Taya initiated learning opportunities that led to children’s exploration, negotiation, discussion and collaboration. She thus incorporated the personal dimension within the group process using a variety of approaches to address and respond to individual holistic SEN and their emerging needs.

Contextual factors – Taya understood and promoted the significance of the personal dimension based on the 'Lovecircles' approach for children’s holistic self-actualisation – whether emotional, social or academic.

Teaching strategies – Taya showed an ability to make appropriate 'Lovecircles' interventions. Taya recognised and assessed children’s individual needs based on the 'Lovecircles' approach in a variety of contexts. She consciously applied multi-dimensional 'Lovecircles' strategies and approaches to meet creative additional needs across the curriculum.

- Tutoring – Taya specialised in promoting teaching and holistic therapy but had no background in art (Table A.19, Appendix 19) or attention to emotions. The tutoring focused on elimination of emotional barriers of self-expression as well as developing a trust in art as a means of expression and attention to oneself and to others.

- Commentary – Her experience and background in the teaching of pupils with SEN and working in the field of holistic therapy constituted a basis of empathy, developmental difficulties and focused thinking about response to the unique needs of individuals, though with an academic-professional focus. Nevertheless,
this background was the foundation of her professional development. Following the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme, she developed in the field of nature-therapy, continuing to work with pupils with special educational needs as a home-teacher of a small class and implementing the 'Lovecircles' approach.

Conclusion – the encounter between self-attention and background in therapeutic areas such as holistic therapy and promoting inclusive teaching develops trust and confidence in working with children with SEN, as well as the capability to attune to pupils themselves. In retrospect, what enabled Taya’s personal and professional development was the space she experienced to attend to her need for unique pace to eliminate her own barriers. Furthermore, understanding art components, such as material, shape, variety and combination thereof as a means of conducting a dialogue between professionals and students, is stable scaffolding for personal and professional development. Previous knowledge serves as a didactic means of developing curricula with therapeutic aspects, namely pedagogical knowledge could be a bridge for comprehending concepts in the therapeutic field. Taya learned to apply principles from the world of therapeutic pedagogy to the field of emotional pedagogy.

**Yafa – Proficient to Expert: Integrating Personal & Professional dimensions**

Yafa studied drama-therapy prior to the 'Lovecircles' education programme and so was experienced in attention to the personal dimension and therapeutic aspect. Although she had no background in visual art, her background in drama-therapy was a basis for her holistic development. Her drama-therapy studies made her face attention to herself and develop trust in non-verbal channels as a tool for self-expression. She acknowledged the contribution of attention to the personal dimensions of self and others. Her development is characterised by learning to integrate personal and professional development. At the end of the education programme she reached the Expert stage.

*Theoretical understanding* – Yafa developed theoretical understanding of theories and pedagogy for integrative holistic education. She developed sound principles for using the 'Lovecircles' approach with children with SEN in specialist and inclusive contexts.
**Learning opportunities** – Yafa recognised learning opportunities in challenging situations in order to implement the 'Lovecircles' approach across the curriculum. Yafa used the flexibility of the 'Lovecircles' approach to meet the needs of individuals and groups. She identified personalised holistic needs in unfamiliar diverse contexts.

**Contextual factors** – Yafa developed recognition of contextual factors and readily appraised circumstantial factors that impacted on the 'Lovecircles' teaching context. She recognised the potential of 'Lovecircles' within the wider context (school and beyond).

**Teaching strategies** – Yafa developed an ability to make appropriate 'Lovecircles' interventions. She intuitively used multi-dimensional strategies and identified specific and holistic interventions based on the 'Lovecircles' approach in unfamiliar diverse contexts.

- **Tutoring** – The tutoring integrated her background, personal and professional experience, in a way that promoted and developed the prerequisites with which she came, allowing her to integrate the personal and professional dimension in her narrative. The holistic tutoring that focused on personal pace, unique ways of expression, and acceptance of all aspects, helped Yafa to eliminate her emotional barriers associated with art. The metaphor of hands, which she had painted, remained hanging at the 'Lovecircles' centre for a long time, constituting a way of sharing with students the way she passed, from emotional barrier to self-expression through art. It enabled her to implement the approach in her work with children and adolescents with SEN.

- **Commentary** – Yafa's background, using a non-verbal channel / drama therapy, had developed attention and expression of her emotions through dramatic means. This constituted her base for using visual art which, until now, had been a taboo for her. However, attending the 'Lovecircles' education programme allowed Yafa to release herself from these taboos, which had been part of her since childhood, preventing her from developing in the field of visual art. Moreover, it enabled her to turn it into a bridge between her personal and professional dimensions. Today, Yafa implements art in her work with children and adolescents with SEN as well as children at risk.
Conclusion – attention to emotions through art facilitates elimination of emotional barriers and creation of a bridge designed to establish empathetic relationships with pupils. Using art creates a bridge for pupils to eliminate their emotional barriers for the purpose of actualising their unique capabilities so that their inclusion in class is achieved in an effective way with regard to their well-being.

Table 7.4 depicts the tutoring process and conduct of the 'Lovecircles' programme. This developmental table identifies starting points, target abilities, key tutoring strategies, and the focus for reflection. This developmental table refers to mentoring professionals in the process of their development in inclusive drama teaching (Peter 1995). Peter (1995) identified how to facilitate movement from one stage to the next, with a view to supporting both the professional and the tutor in identifying the key ‘next step’ and the processes for how to get there – reflection by the professional and tutoring strategies to signpost development. This is based on the Vygotskian (1978) principle of articulating the ‘zone of proximal development’ to be bridged at each stage, as informed by the highlighted pivotal skill-set in Dreyfus’ (1981) original model. This developmental table (Table 7.4) indicates the differences between the stages of the foci for reflection, but unlike Peter's original (1995) model, my model offers an additional column that highlights the explicit key strategies that the tutor could use towards the eventual ability to intuitively integrate personal and professional dimensions in practice.
### Table 7.4: A model to support professional development in Integrative Holistic Humanistic Pedagogy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(A) STARTING ABILITY</th>
<th>(B) PRIORITY TARGET ABILITY</th>
<th>Priority Target Skill (C) FOCI FOR REFLECTION</th>
<th>(D) KEY TUTORING STRATEGIES Assessment Ability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Newcomer</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of attention to personal dimension as the catalyst for students learning</td>
<td>Ability to integrate art activities for development of attention to personal dimension,</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Developing ability to listen to self in the group and expressing the personal dimension via arts. To release emotional barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advanced beginner</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to incorporate experimental learning objectives in lesson planning;</td>
<td>Ability to incorporate art-for developing children’s attention to personal dimension &amp;expression</td>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>Develop ability to use art for revealing personal capabilities within inclusive contexts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Competent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to plan lesson addressing children’s SEN based on 'Lovecircles' concepts and theoretical understanding</td>
<td>Ability to integrate multi-dimensional modalities for self-development and assessment</td>
<td>Personal-professional A (general)</td>
<td>Ability to use integrative multi-dimensional modalities for assessment facilitating inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proficient</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to addresses integrative holistic objectives for SEN needs</td>
<td>Ability to apply principles from the world of therapeutic pedagogy to the field of emotional pedagogy.</td>
<td>Personal-professional B (specific)</td>
<td>Develop ability promote inclusive teaching via therapeutic &amp;emotional pedagogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Expert</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledging the role of self-attention via a non-verbal channel &amp; as a tool for self-expression within inclusive contexts</td>
<td>Ability to attend to emotions via art as facilitating elimination of emotional barriers &amp; empathetic relationships with pupils with SEN.</td>
<td>Integration of personal and professional in practice</td>
<td>Ability to intuitively integrate personal and professional dimensions in practice within inclusive contexts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In summary, the development of the teacher's integrative, holistic and intuitive professional ability for working in inclusive contexts, includes both explicit and implicit components depending on the teacher's experience at attuning to his or her own feelings and use of the Arts as a tool for expressing emotions, and their prior experience with children with special educational needs.

It appears that the more components in the teacher's personal and professional narrative—attunement to self-feelings, background in the Arts for expressing feelings and experience in special education—develops the teacher's ability to see the whole picture and provide solutions for the students that are based both on personal and professional knowledge.

7.3.2. Educators’ Personal Development through Attention to Their Needs

The approach focusing on the development of educators themselves, contrary to the approach focusing on acquiring knowledge, highlights the significance of attending to educators’ personal needs throughout their professional development. This accords with Vygotsky’s (1991) view that advocated the development of educators' attention to pupils takes into consideration the effect of inter-personal exchange on intellectual development by establishing an atmosphere of trust and co-operation central to learning. According to Habermas (1996), the way to reach a true understanding of people’s needs and interests is by sharing their attitudes and beliefs. No one should be excluded and all should have equal opportunities for including their interpretation of needs and wants (Habermas, 1996). Critical theory holds out the promise of enabling one to think of society as a vast school.

Moreover, Shkedi (2012) argues that besides knowledge, employing personal narratives and focusing on one's own interests, opinions and life experience could allow educators to discard traditional beliefs and attitudes, such as the skills needed for directive teaching to influence others; instead, the development of self-belief in the need to be a leader, a creator, or even an innovator. In this sense, Oplatka, (2008) refers to the pre-service stage of educators as adults wishing to develop professionally. Hence, he advocates that they might benefit from attention to their unique needs, namely apprehensions and attitudes towards their self-perception as learners. This kind of
attention to pre-service educators’ needs might facilitate their holistic organisation for learning and reduced learning-oriented apprehension.

Furthermore, this study suggests that educators have the opportunity to express and share conflicts that they encounter throughout their work, without prejudice or fear that this may be judged and become professionally compromising. They might thereby develop a teaching approach based on group interaction of ideas and thoughts exchange, participation and expression of the personal voice in the lesson, as well as assignments that lead to intellectual challenges. In this light, integrating the personal dimension within professional development might enhance development of collegiality and participatory approaches towards successful inclusion.

Therefore, I constructed a tool (Table 7.5) illustrating the development of attention to personal and professional dimensions.
Table 7.5 demonstrates that educators’ professional dimension (outer triangle: B-1, B-2, B-3) evolves from the development of the educators’ personal dimension (inner triangle: A-1, A-2, A-3). This is two-phase process of personal and professional development.
Stage A (vertical plane) focuses on development of the personal dimension and stage B (horizontal plane) focuses on development of the professional dimension. This is a staged and evolving process demonstrating the integrative holistic process that occurs by developing attention to both personal and professional dimensions.

Moreover, in each stage educators focus attention on body and soul, emotions, and cognition, using verbal, art and metaphors for self-expression. Attention to these aspects reflects the integrative holistic approach of the new Educator model focusing on the personal towards the professional dimension.

Thus, this tool (Table 7.5.) shows how integrating attention to emotions on both personal and professional dimensions leads towards integrative holistic development of educators. The contribution of this tool is that it illustrates the complex nature of the process by which educators can develop awareness of and provide holistic attention to their pupils with and without SEN.

7.3.3. Educators’ Personal Development for Children with Special Educational Needs

This study suggests, in accordance with Keiny (2006), an innovative reading on life, grounded in the dialectic relation between people and the environment, replacing the existing traditional framework, which is based on alienated technology. Furthermore, the ecological philosophy in education (Keiny, 2006) advocates that development is dynamic and evolving in the community of practice; through experiencing educational values in all life-circles, with professional development as part of personal development.

Keiny’s (2006) approach views the connection between theory and practice and between body and mind, acknowledging people as a whole. This critical stance offers a broader perception of the education system by shifting the focus from a view that it is an alien (external) entity with educators as a ‘cog’ controlled by external forces, to educators being perceived as capable of assuming responsibility and affecting reality.
In this view, 'Lovecircles' is the template for an innovative approach that claims shifting the focus from teaching, knowledge and teaching strategies to the teachers themselves and their professional development as a more extensive concept of teachers' role. It concentrates on teachers' personal growth as a basis and leverage for their professional development. Focusing on teachers' personal growth results from an extended perception of their professional role as promoting, supporting and assisting students' overall development. This concept invoked research and development of education curricula through inquiry of the self, experimental and experiential learning and integration of emotion designed to improve teachers' overall development as a person (Korthagen, 2004).

Moreover, this study suggests that expanding the perception of professional development ensues from the field of psychology, which refers to theoretical and practical aspects of teaching and professional identity development. Psychology opens a space for seeing the hidden layers of teaching and educators' professional development. This is a counter to prevalent traditional positivist-behaviourist approaches that emphasise aspects of overt behaviour in the acquisition of knowledge and achievements as well as the use of teaching methods. Psychological aspects underscore professional development, touching educators as learning and teaching people – their feelings, emotions, thoughts, awareness and spirit – rather than merely as a resource of knowledge and the delivery thereof.

This study claims there is a need to focus on aspects of educators' professional development as associated with the psychology of educators' inner world such as beliefs and perceptions comprising the development of educators' role perception (Kelchtermans & Vandenberghae, 1994; Furlong & Maynard, 1995). Moreover, this approach of integrating personal and professional dimensions relies upon the understanding that professional processes consist of progression and regression and are affected by psychological and social aspects as well as their competences and emotional intelligence (Day, 1999).

Additionally, the constructivist (Kupferberg & Olstein, 2005) and narrative (Spector-Marzel, 2008) approaches emphasise the reorganisation of the self, based on direction and self-control, promoting it to personal empowerment and a sense of independence. Hence, considering psychological aspects of educators’ development aims to evoke
awareness of their professional identity and of the contexts, relations and emotions that build the entirety of their identities (Rodgers & Scott, 2008). Reference to educators as people having opinions and expressing themselves in their growth process underscores that constructing a professional identity is grounded in interrelations between educators’ inner (personal narratives and emotions) and external forces. These forces are involved in educators’ professional identity construction.

This study advocates that the intermediate area between the fields of education and expressive therapy offers an innovative approach for professional development of educators for working in inclusive contexts.

### 7.3.4. Integrative Aspects of Educators’ Professional and Personal Development

This study refers to research into professional development stemming from theories of self-development in the field of education and exploring the role of identity development (Elliott, 1993; Rodgers & Scott, 2008). These theories aim to demonstrate the contribution of self-development for professionals who undergo these processes throughout their training. This serves as the foundation for presenting this study’s approach concerning the integration of personal development within professional development for teaching in inclusive contexts.

Personal development is crucial for meeting the needs of professionals working with children with special educational needs (SEN) in a rapidly changing society (O’Hanlon, 1995). This approach to training might facilitate the process of personality identification within the professional role and the development of values such as autonomy, self-consciousness and self-reflection of professionals in education (Berger and Thorn, 2010). Hence, it became necessary to develop educators’ attention to pupils’ interpersonal aspects through means such as dialogue (Blum-Kulka, 1997), which transcend the learning dimension.

The personal dimension is an integrative part of professional development. The Educator model thus perceives necessary knowledge, skills and understanding for inclusive education as comprising:
• Acknowledgement that affective teaching enables effective learning.

• Identification of learners’ special needs within life circles leads to effective teaching.

• Consideration of children as a whole and their relationship with their environment sustained by theoretical perspectives.

• Intervention based on actively facilitating inclusion as a celebration of diversity.

• Enhancement of a sense of self-efficacy and self-understanding leads to development of concern and empathy.

• Integration of therapeutic-psychological aspects in practice enhances educators’ emotions and sense of self-efficacy leading to positive attitudes towards included children.

• Acknowledgment of the impact of and relationship between prior experience and knowledge leads to empowerment of the personal potential of each and every student.

• Development of higher level of educators' self-understanding enhances the ability to see the other and respond more empathetically.

• Promotion of the belief that inclusion is a process and way for cultivating each student.

• Reduced criticism towards expressing emotions leading to avoidance of attending to ‘unpleasant’ emotions and defining them as ‘negative’ or ‘positive’ emotions instead of respecting a whole range of emotions as channels for human expression.

• Attention to natural and authentic emotions that might release emotional barriers.

• Consideration of the significant role of individual psychological biographies, besides pedagogical beliefs.
- Enhancement of a positive approach to life and focusing more on challenging beliefs.

### 7.4. Conclusion

This study perceives that professional development programmes focusing on personality might enhance the development of skills such as acceptance and empathy. These skills are necessary for meeting the diverse needs of children with special needs based on a holistic and humanistic approach. Data concerning professionals' reactions towards the implementation of new programmes within their daily practice, in the light of shifts in educational approaches, manifest feelings of dissonance within the personality of professionals (Day, 1999), as well as their attitude towards pupils and colleagues. Studies of educators’ development in both mainstream and special education engage nowadays in the dilemma of what constitutes effective teaching (Quigney, 2010). Nevertheless, they still tend to focus on the methods by which knowledge can be acquired and on the attainment of teaching strategies (Lave & Wenger, 1991).

Instead, this study emphasises the need for professional development programmes to be grounded in a new perspective on teaching through an innovative Educator model. The discussion here aimed to enhance the comprehension of the correlation between educators’ personal and professional development and the pedagogical concepts of their professional development. Furthermore, the discussion focused on adapting this developmental programme to the dynamic, knowledge-rich world, equipping educators for the strains and challenges of a culturally diverse and inclusive society (Bronfenbrenner, 2001; Darling-Hammond & Bransford, 2005).
Chapter 8 – Conclusions and Recommendations

This study strives to address the relevance of the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme to potential users. It originated through my practice in education and therapy, and aimed to examine how educators developed professionally through the 'Lovecircles' approach. The research was conducted by a practitioner-researcher, and conclusions offer suggestions for best practice and policy. Policy discussions about the future of initial teacher education tend to focus on organisational scenarios. Conversely, this study attempts to outline a curriculum theory for teacher education. In this vein, I argue for a partnership between higher education and schools and critique the trend towards locating initial teacher education entirely in the school system, as it is important to provide room for each teacher's integrative personal and professional development. This is illustrated through this study, as a template for training for work in the field, especially in inclusive contexts.

8.1. Effectiveness of the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme

**Initial Conclusions**

Evidence collected for this study reinforced the view that professional development emerges as a result of the integration of the personal dimension, with attention to this as a core principle for the 'Lovecircles' education programme. This integrative process draws on emotional pedagogy, art-based pedagogy and Expressive Art Therapy as the context in which professional and personal aspects are facilitated. Thus, this study contributes to theoretical knowledge in the domain of emotion-based education and therapeutic use of the Arts with children with special educational needs (SEN). The following paragraphs summarise the conclusions as they relate to the original research questions that guided this study.
8.1.1. Research Question 1: What Should Constitute the Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme?

The fundamental principles emerging from this study with regard to the 'Lovecircles' education programme illustrated a strong reliance on personalised attention from the tutor. The findings relating to the personal dimension highlighted the place of emotions in professional development, advocating interactive teaching approaches. These findings build an emotional pedagogy and use techniques from Expressive Art Therapy, which underscore the connection and impact of teacher-learner relationships as well as the meaningful place of art as a tool and means of teachers' development and growth and subsequently that of pupils. The findings showed that the tutors’ attention to the personal dimension is perceived as a central element for professional development in the 'Lovecircles' education programme. Moreover, it can be said that integrating aspects based on emotion constitutes leverage for professional development.

Developing close attention to the personal and professional dimensions through art in particular develops expression and authentic articulation, providing a sense of wholeness and integrative well-being in the participants. In this view, art celebrates difference and uniqueness and thus eliminates barriers and inhibitions, such as educators' perception, acceptance and self-empathy of themselves and of others.

8.1.2 Research Questions 2 & 3: What Might Be the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme?

The main conclusion relating to the personal and professional development within the 'Lovecircles' education programme is that releasing emotional barriers leads to professional development and serves as leverage for developing emotional pedagogy. Furthermore, art activities and transferable therapeutic strategies from expressive art therapy hold the potential for releasing emotional barriers through verbal and non-verbal modalities of expression: metaphors, plastic art, movement and drama. These activities establish a foundation for expressing emotions and conceptualising thoughts.
8.1.3. Research Question 4: What Might Be the Link between Personal Development and Professional Development?

The main conclusion relating to the effect of the 'Lovecircles' education programme on the practice of the participants working with children with SEN is that integration of personal and professional dimensions develops educators' broad view of the intra- and inter-personal – as leverage for affective and effective integrative professional development. This, in turn, will enhance reference to the self and attunement and empathy towards children with SEN, thus enhancing the participants' work in inclusive and specialist contexts.

8.1.4 Research Question 5: How Might the Personal and Professional Development of Participants in the 'Lovecircles' Education Programme Affect Their Work with Children with Special Educational Needs?

The findings that emerged from the data collected for this study reinforce the view that attention to the personal dimension incorporating cognitive and emotional intelligence, enhances holistic teacher development based on a 'whole person' approach. This might pave the way both in general inclusive teacher education programmes and specific professional development courses in SEN. Regarding teaching as a multi-dimensional approach based on emotional pedagogy and relationships is perceived as significant to the enhancement of professional development in general and within the field of SEN in particular.

The evidence shows that attention to the personal dimension – the unique personal needs – of educators during their process of development enhances their ability to listen to the personal dimension of pupils with SEN. Unlike traditional approaches in teacher education that focus solely on the professional dimension (acquisition of pedagogical skills and knowledge), developing educators' integrative-holistic view of themselves and of children with SEN then serves as leverage for enhancing their overall inclusion in school and wider society.
8.2. Educator Model – Implications for Practice

This study enabled me to evaluate the 'Lovecircles' programme using research tools that focused on scrutinising the structure, content and tutoring, and ways of developing this approach. The aim and focus was to inform the role of emotion in professional development programmes for inclusive contexts. The methodology led to deeper understanding of the core principles, and identification of three main types of development pattern: personal, professional-general and professional-specific. This may influence both initial teacher education and continuing professional development courses—there are programmes in Israel based on similar approaches that incorporate therapeutic aspects with groups, for example "Sahchaf" (2007, 2009).

I presented a key question emerging from my study: "Who will educate the educators?" at an international conference in Israel "Changing reality 2013". On that stage I critiqued the ‘cut and paste’ formulaic traditional approach and suggested the personalised tailor-made instead, by indicating there are different learner types in teacher education as well. This means that teachers engaged in professional development should not be assessed only on cognitive aspects, but rather holistically to include their developing emotional dimension, as a scaffold for developing participatory and inclusive orientations.

I advocate that professional development programmes should promote interactive teaching approaches for inclusive contexts using therapeutic aspects and procedures that integrate the personal dimension, based on acknowledgement of the contribution of non-verbal modalities to development and learning. Implementing courses within teacher education based on the Educator model would clearly have practical considerations. These aspects include the duration of the programme, the size of the group, the physical setting such as suitable room and art materials used, and the integration with an institution’s other timetabled courses.

The original 'Lovecircles' education programme (2001) was based on experiential-personal development as the foundation for professional development. However, as seen by the findings that emerged from this study, the theoretical aspects were not initially the main focus of the research. This has necessitated subsequently re-thinking the teaching content and strategies of the 'Lovecircles' education programme, and
regarding it as the prototype for developing a more theoretically robust Educator model for future courses based on the same principles.

The main question became in what way the programme could be adapted to academic requirements. An additional question that has emerged is whether participants can understand and reflect critically on the basis of their work and so rigorously defend it in practice. This is particularly important today, for example, when colleges are committed to the new requirements of the Israeli Council of Higher Education in order to win recognition for their M.Ed. studies, according to new regulations of the Council for Higher Education (November 21, 2006, No. 1084/10 regarding guidelines for teacher training in higher education institutions in Israel (as amended on January 29th, 2008 and July 1st, 2008) – the "Ariav Layout".

The decision of the Council for Higher Education regarding the development of an integrative framework for teaching No. 2006/8, Section 6 p. 9 discusses focusing on vital core contents and cultural and moral aspects of the educator's work, including references to the teacher-pupil relationship and ways of improving teaching processes for pupils with SEN and diverse cultural backgrounds. Hence, the integration of the 'Lovecircles' programme presented in this research may contribute to implementing the Council’s recommendations.

The need for enhancing the pedagogical contribution of the ‘Lovecircles’ programme has arisen as a result of demands to respond to decision-makers regarding its potential contribution from an economic aspect as well. This is due to the fact that educational institutions face competition between them and need to adhere to regulations of the Council for Higher Education.

Consequently, it became necessary to expand the aspect of theoretical anchors while adapting them to the objectives of courses in Israeli colleges. The 'Lovecircles' education programme integrated two areas – teaching and expressive therapy. Hence, it developed into an innovative approach (the Educator model) evolving from the synthesis of the two fields, based on emotion and art-based pedagogy. This innovation has facilitated the development of a new syllabus in several very differing courses: a "Class Management/Organisation" course within the framework of an Applied Behaviour Analysis Programme; "Integrating Emotions in School Leadership"; and
"Integrative Holistic Assessment" courses within the New Horizon reform (Ministry of Education, 2012); "Integrating Emotional Aspects in Teaching – Teaching Strategies" for mainstream teachers working with children with SEN included in mainstream schools.

Findings from this study focused originally on the personal dimension, stemming from participants’ personal and professional narrative. The findings expressed a voice of dissatisfaction from a range of participants’ professional backgrounds with regard to the system's approach as well as methods of assessing them and their work. The re-thinking process led to an option that, although the programme had constituted a place for expressing their personal voice, dissatisfaction with the system made them feel that attention and acceptance of the personal dimension focused less on didactic, pedagogical and theoretical aspects.

Hence, following this study, it becomes necessary to think about ways in which we could bridge between the perceptions in order to enhance the integration of teachers' personal dimension and professional development within the system's perception (Hargreaves, A., 1998, 2005, 2011; Mittler, 2000; Allender, 2001; Korthagen, 2005, 2010, 2012; Oplatka, 2008; Palmer & Zajonc, 2010; Hoekstra & Korthagen, 2011; Oplatka, 2011; Day, 2012; Hargreaves, D., 2012).

Based on the above, one of the subjects developed in the new syllabus was indeed the metaphor of bridge (described in Appendix 18, Figure A.1), through which trainees are encouraged to see two points of view as a tool of emotional pedagogy. For example, cases whereby it is necessary to apply teacher-pupil mediation within the framework of subjects, for example: conducting discussion/discourse/dialogue as a class management/organisation tool as a response to challenging situations.

Moreover, developing these new syllabi has increased the need for expanding theoretical content that was not studied in the original programme. This expansion required the researcher to enrich my knowledge and join teachers’ learning communities (MOFET Institute, Israel) and professional learning groups integrating theory and practice in relevant areas (for example, class management/organisation).

The end-of-course project of the new 'Lovecircles' education programme is focused on and assessed by the principles, concepts and topics of 'Lovecircles' defined in this study.
The new Educator model concentrates on developing new approaches, ways and applied tools in the community, not only for individual pupils but for the whole class and school, as a bridge for promoting emotionality in education.

Looking ahead, further developments need to address the following:

1. Educating teachers to include emotion management in their practice;
2. Inculcating emotional communication skills among current teachers in order to improve their teaching practices;
3. Inculcating leadership skills among teachers and head teachers coupled with emotional self-awareness aimed at coping with social and educational challenges;
4. Accompanying and supporting teachers and head teachers in leading educational change that carries with it emotional implications.

### 8.3 Implications for the Wider Policy Context of Teacher Education

Teacher education definitions have undergone processes of change from focusing on knowledge and learners' attainments towards an alternative and wider approach focusing on teachers and their transformative possibilities and accountability for developing awareness of self-efficacy (Gibbs, 2003; Korthagen, 2005). The ‘Lovecircles’ approach advocates the integration of ‘notion of the person' and emotion within teacher education programmes and practice. This study argues that one of the many challenges for understanding teachers' professional development relates to their preparation to meet aspirations and requirements of teaching in schools that are increasingly diverse (Hewitt 2014, in foreword to Morewood, 2014).

Moreover, an updated look at teacher education concerns in the context of each country—for example, North America versus Europe, Southeast Asia or the Middle East (Kaur, 2012)—indicate issues such as cultural/racial/sexual orientation, difference and inequities and inclusive practices within disability. These issues were studied through the lens of social justice and equity framework, voicing a critique of other perspectives, such as developmental psychology.
8.4. Implications for Research

The majority of researchers in social contexts use a qualitative approach based on narrative, while fewer use a quantitative approach, leading to an invitation to consider openness of applying complementary use of the two approaches. This study indicates the contribution encompassed in the integration of methodological aspects from the field of art therapy (tools for data collection, analysis and discussion) in qualitative research of education as a means of understanding and assessing professional development in the field of inclusion. Moreover, this study offers another methodological perspective on qualitative research by enriching the understanding and assessment of professional training processes of educators, based on experiential learning through the Arts. Hence, this study reinforced the perception of the contribution of methodological tools from the field of Art Therapy to the assessment of experiential teaching-learning processes through the Arts. All these enhance teachers' perception of themselves and, as a result, of their learners.

Hence, in spite of critique from different ideological positions, there is a new tendency towards comprehensive teacher education programmes focusing on equity and social justice. This tendency highlights the aims and focus of this study, namely inclusion of children with SEN in mainstream education. This comprehensive approach to teacher education is in line with my aim as a critical researcher and expert in the fields of education and therapy—to enhance initiatives that pave the way for a more participatory and inclusive education system, leading towards a more just and harmonious society and not merely ‘inclusion’ as a misleading slogan in teacher education.

Therefore looking ahead, further research needs to:

1. Encourage research of teacher emotions in Israel, both for in-service and pre-service teachers;

2. Create theoretical-empirical knowledge based on teacher emotions.

Significant dilemmas regarding teachers' professional development have been addressed in this study. Yet, in order to further develop emotional awareness and art-based
pedagogies, further research is suggested concerning the relationship between emotion and learning.

- The means to promote emotional communication in the classroom.
- The factors facilitating and inhibiting displays of emotion among teachers.
- How the head-teacher’s role in promoting emotional practices in teaching can be further developed.
- How factors affecting opportunities for emotional development in schools can be further developed and the roles of teachers and head teachers.
- How the lack of regard for emotional development and management of this can be addressed in the era of accountability.
- Training methods for increasing teachers' emotional self-awareness.
- The role of expressive art therapy in inclusive educational contexts.

### 8.5. Contribution to Knowledge

On the theoretical level, this study contributed to knowledge by bridging the gap in the area of professional development in emotion and in using art, and developed a new IHHP (Integrative Holistic-Humanistic Pedagogy). Moreover, the study offered a new Educator model based on the 'Lovecircles' original programme for teachers' personal-professional development, incorporating attention to emotions and art. In addition, this study added to knowledge by offering a model that conceptualised the integration of education and therapy as a tutoring strategy in teachers' professional development in SEN.

On the practical level, the conclusion of this study might serve as an important practical strategy for informing policy, future practice and research, that 'Lovecircles' is a robust holistic-humanistic programme. Moreover, the 'Lovecircles' education programme has been acknowledged as self-contained and, therefore, whilst approaches are beginning to be harnessed within initial teacher education in Israel, it is still available on a
consultancy basis. It can therefore serve as a possible response to the bigger cause of Humanistic models for professional training in inclusive practice.

Conclusions from this study attest that developmental frameworks and mentoring strategies from 'Lovecircles' could be harnessed to provide a more holistic approach for national teacher education courses. Thus, it has a wider relevance for professional training in general aiming at development of the 21st century educator. The 'Lovecircles' model might, then, help to promote the practice of inclusive practitioners for the increasingly diverse classroom in mainstream and specialist contexts.

Furthermore, conclusions from this study might bring about additional tools and strategies for professional development and teaching, which encourage emotional expression and discourse. Developing applied tools for the integration of emotional aspects in professional development might provide a response to demands from educators today to integrate both emotional and cognitive aspects. Developing new approaches and applied tools of professional development, in line with new reforms in Israel such as the Inclusion Act (1998) and the 'New Horizon' Educational Reform (Ministry of Education, 2009), might change policy-makers' perception of professional development prevalent today in mainstream and special education. This, in turn, might influence policy in relation to teacher education in SEN more widely in other global contexts.
Epilogue

Reflecting on my doctoral journey I would like to say that I learnt about my passion to share my knowledge, vision and expertise with other colleague-researchers as well as practitioners. During the years of working on my research and thesis I learnt about my ability to persist and persevere, I acquired new tools in research methodology. I simply learnt how to look at the world from a multi-dimensional perspective and from the point of view of a researcher, in addition to that of a field expert.

I have strengthened my understanding of the contribution of the combination and balance of my roles as tutor and a researcher. Therefore, I concur, along with McNamee (2002):

"[i]t is not uncommon for research by in-service professionals to investigate their own professional context. The option of ignoring the nexus of other roles is not possible; one cannot decide to disregard one's identity as a professional engaged in that context" (pp.136-137).

The fact that I was both researcher and facilitator of the programme that I had developed enhanced my sense of the contribution of a multi-dimensional personal and professional approach as an answer to the balance required in this state of multiple roles. This balance, as expressed in the current research, maintains that a researcher engaging in topics that are close to him/her or to the participants (such as the encounter with the personal dimension and feelings in this research) ought to develop one's personal dimension, which includes awareness, sensitivity and skill.

The questions I asked already in the beginning of this research journey have intensified as the research progressed, and raised such issues as what is the connection between my being a qualitative researcher and a therapist? What is the role of the research tools I have acquired? As mentioned, the feeling that a researcher ought to develop sensitivity and a humane approach to both his/her own and the participants' personal aspects, in addition to developing reflective skills and self-awareness. This perception has increased with the processes of personal development that I have undergone and many years of experience in both roles as therapist and teacher.
Balancing the multiple roles was enabled due to the perception I have adopted with regard to educational research. This perception agrees with the opinion of Shkedi (2003), who says that conducting research while ignoring the complexity of learning and teaching in natural surroundings may create a gap between theory and practice. Moreover, since the goal of qualitative research is to examine different interpretations of the same reality, observations of the individual from a variety of angles, helps the research process. Therefore, the research has enhanced my perception of the researcher's identity and roles in the research process as linked to the research topic, and in fact, located within a specific set of values, from whence the researcher observes and interprets. As a researcher I acted with self-awareness with regard to my subjective attitudes and values, realizing that qualitative methodologies expose the researchers to such challenges as excessive subjectivity.

Throughout this research journey, my role as the programme developer and researcher has caused me to address issues of qualitative reliability and validity (Shkedi, 2003) and make every possible effort to decrease bias and increase research validity and reliability. I have tried to be sensitive and interpret the reality while adhering to the interviewees' statements and points of view rather than force my attitudes on the research findings.

Nonetheless, there are significant advantages such as a holistic perspective and identification with the participants (who are often part of the same group as the researcher), which increases the applicability of research to educational practice.

In doing so, I turned myself from a field expert into a researcher and strengthened my academic discourse on controversial issues related to inclusion. Conducting my study made it possible to discover my personal voice as a researcher. Presenting my research in conferences and improving the ‘Lovecircles’ education programme enabled me to connect with people, educators and therapists. I improved my theoretical knowledge and developed my practical knowledge. As a qualitative researcher in my own field of practice, I used interpretation and reflection skills as meta-constructive strategies in order to understand my participants’ view. Additionally the context of the research, in addition to my participants’ personal and professional backgrounds, provided rich data that facilitated the process of analysis.
Now I hope that the circles that were opened while conducting the study will create ripples of knowledge and will contribute to the acknowledgement of emotions as a solid element within education processes as well as take the lead in understanding, explaining and interpreting learning in the challenges of the 21st century within the context of inclusion. Additionally, it is my hope that discussions will be created around emotion among educators and expressive therapists, teacher and therapists, educators and education developers, thus contributing to the establishment of the pivotal place that emotion deserves in the education arenas.

"Imagination is more important than knowledge. Knowledge is limited; but imagination encircles the world"

Albert Einstein

www.quotationbyauthor.com/19/2/2013
REFERENCES


Bloor, M., & Wood, F., 2006. *Keywords in Qualitative Methods*. DOI:http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781849209403


Evans, C., & Graff, M., 2006. Exploring style: Enhancing the capacity to learn? Selection of papers from the 12th Annual European Learning Styles Information Network Conference, held in June 2007 at the School of Computer Sciences and Statistics, University of Dublin, Trinity College.

Eyiah, J. K., 2004. Case for Making Art a Core Subject of the Teacher Education Reform Program. Feature Article, CET.


Gidron, A., 2009. Active Educational Collaboration – a Narrative of Teacher Education. EBOOK. Tel Aviv: MOFET Institute. [Hebrew]

Gidron, A., & Barak, Y., 2007. “Sahchaf” Active Educational Collaboration – A Narrative of Teacher Education. Tel Aviv: MOFET Institute, School for Research and Development of Programmes for Training Teaching Practitioners in Colleges & Jerusalem: Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport, Government of Israel, Pedagogical Secretariat, Experiments and Initiatives Section. [Hebrew]


Giorgi, A., 1989. A Phenomenological Approach to Psychological Research. Talk presented at the University of Victoria, Victoria, BC.


Hativa, N., 2003. *Classroom Teaching Processes*. Tel Aviv: Academy Faculty Development. [Hebrew]


Hoffman, A., & Niederland, D., 2010. Teachers' Figure in the Mirror of Teacher Education: A Historical View. Dapim – Magazine for Reflection and Research in Education. [Hebrew]


James, W., 1884. What is an Emotion? *Mind*, 9, pp. 188–205.


Keiny, S., 1994. Teachers; professional development as a dialogue between school and University. From Theory to Practice in Curriculum Planning, 9, pp. 25-37.


Laczko-Kerr, I., & Berliner, D. C., 2002. The Effectiveness of ‘Teach for America’ and Other Under-certified Teachers on Student Academic Achievement: A Case of Harmful Public Policy. Education Policy Analysis Archives, 10 (37).


Lerner, R., & Berger, R., 2009. Intervention with creative means in a state of existential threat. In NATAL - Israel Trauma Center for Victims of Terror & War, “Colors of the Soul” on the use of Art Therapy for Trauma Treatment. Israel: NATAL.


Oplatka, I., 2011. Service providers or educators? Hed Hachinuch, 80 (1), pp. 46-49. [Hebrew]

Oplatka, I., 2012. The Image of Desired Graduate as a Figure in society. Readings in Society, Technology and Science – Ort Israel, No. 14 (In Hebrew)


Shlasky, S., & Alpert, B., 2007. Ways of Writing Qualitative Research from Deconstruction of Reality to its Construction as a Text. MOFET Institute, Tel Aviv. [Hebrew]


Stor, A. 1983. *The Dynamics of the Creation*. Tel Aviv: Sifriyat Hapoalim. [Hebrew]


Talmor, R., Riter, S., & Feigin, 2005. The Burnout of Teachers in Classes where Students with Special Needs are Included. *Dapim*, 39, pp. 10-34. [Hebrew]

Career, and Vocational Education, Center of Education and Training for Employment, College of Education, the Ohio State University.

Te One, S., 2007. Peer-reviewed paper defining rights: Children’s rights in theory and in practice. *He Kurpu The WORD.*


Toms, E. G., & Duff, W., 2002. I spent 1 1/2 hours sifting through one large box....: Diaries as information behaviour of the archives user: Lessons learned. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, 53(14), pp. 1232-1238.


BIBLIOGRAPHY


